ENVIRONMENTAL DISCOURSES IN PUBLIC AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

This collection of essays examines the development and application of environmental laws and the relationship between public laws and international law. Notions of good governance, transparency and fairness in decision-making are analysed within the area of the law perceived as having the greatest potential to address today's global environmental concerns. International trends, such as free trade and environmental markets, are also observed to be infiltrating national laws.

Together, the essays illustrate the idea that in the context of environmental problems being dynamic and environmental changes appearing sudden, laws become difficult to design and effect. Typically, they are also devised within a conflicted setting. It is in this changeable and discordant context that environmental discourses such as precaution, justice, risk, equity, security, citizenship and markets contribute to legal responses, present legal opportunities or hinder progress.

BRAD JESSUP teaches and researches at the Australian National University across the disciplines of law and geography.

KIM RUBENSTEIN is the Director of the Centre for International and Public Law at the ANU College of Law and the inaugural Convenor of the ANU Gender Institute at the Australian National University, Canberra.

CONNECTING INTERNATIONAL LAW WITH PUBLIC LAW

This series of books flows from workshops bringing public and international lawyers and public and international policy-makers together for interdisciplinary discussion on selected topics and themes. It aims to broaden both public and international laws' understanding of how these two areas intersect. Until now, international and public law have mainly overlapped in discussions on how international law is implemented domestically. This series is unique in consciously bringing together public and international lawyers to consider and engage in each other's scholarship.

General editors

Professor Kim Rubenstein, Australian National University Professor Thomas Pogge, Yale University

Books in the series

Incentives for Global Public Health: Patent Law and Access to Essential Medicines, edited by Thomas Pogge, Matthew Rimmer and Kim Rubenstein

Sanctions, Accountability and Governance in a Globalised World, edited by Jeremy Farrall and Kim Rubenstein

Environmental Discourses in Public and International Law, edited by Brad Jessup and Kim Rubenstein

ENVIRONMENTAL DISCOURSES IN PUBLIC AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

Edited by BRAD JESSUP and KIM RUBENSTEIN



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107019423

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Environmental discourses in public and international law / edited by Brad Jessup and Kim Rubenstein. p. cm. – (Connecting international law with public law) ISBN 978-1-107-01942-3 (Hardback) 1. Environmental law, International–Congresses. I. Jessup, Brad, 1978– II. Rubenstein, Kim. K3584.8.E578 2012 344.04'6-dc23 2011040524

ISBN 978-1-107-01942-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

Contributors x Series editors' preface xix Editors' preface xxi

Introduction: using discourse theory to untangle public and international environmental law 1

BRAD JESSUP AND KIM RUBENSTEIN

PART I Theories and rights as discourses in environmental law 21

- Justice for future generations: environment discourses, international law and climate change 23
 PETER LAWRENCE
- The journey of environmental justice through public and international law 47
 BRAD JESSUP
- The political discourse of land stewardship reframed as a statutory duty 71
 MARK SHEPHEARD AND PAUL MARTIN
- Dephysicalisation and entitlement: legal and cultural discourses of place as property
 NICOLE GRAHAM

viii

CONTENTS

PART II Discourses in environmental decisions 121

- 5 Perspectives on discourse in international environmental law: expert knowledge and challenges to deliberative democracy 123
 JAYE ELLIS
- Getting to yes: structuring and disciplining arguments for and against transgenic agricultural products in European Union authorisations 143
 BETTINA LANGE
- Nuclear narratives, environmental discourse and UK energy policy and legislation, 1970–2008 170
 ELIZABETH ROUGH

PART III Environmental discourses in legal institutions 193

- 8 International courts and sustainable development: using old tools to shape a new discourse 195 TIM STEPHENS
- 9 The discourse of environmental security in the ASEAN context 218
 KHENG-LIAN KOH
- Public participation in transboundary environmental impact assessment: closing the gap between international and public law? 238
 SIMON MARSDEN

PART IV Discourses in climate law 261

- 11 Climate change: limits discourses at the interface of international law and environmental law 263 LEE GODDEN
- The national interest or good international citizenship? Australia and its approach to international and public climate law 286
 RIVER CORDES-HOLLAND

	CONTENTS
12	
13	The Asia-Pacific Partnership: a deepened market liberal model for the international climate regime? 308
	JEFFREY MCGEE AND ROS TAPLIN
14	Global gazing: viewing markets through the lens of emissions trading discourses 331 SANJA BOGOJEVIĆ
	PART V Discourses in the commons 353
15	Polar opposites: environmental discourses and management in Antarctica and the Arctic 355
	DONALD R. ROTHWELL
16	Heritage discourses 375
	BEN BOER AND STEFAN GRUBER
17	Environmental principles and social change in the ocean dumping regime: a case study of the disposal of carbon dioxide into the seabed 399
	AFSHIN AKHTARKHAVARI
18	Environmental discourses in the ocean commons: the case of ocean fertilisation 420
	JULIA MAYO-RAMSAY
	Concluding remarks: discourse versus strategy 436
	Bibliography 448 Index 515

ix

CONTRIBUTORS

Editors

BRAD JESSUP is a Teaching Fellow with the Australian Centre for Environmental Law and the ANU College of Law, at the Australian National University. He has Honours degrees in law and science from Monash University and a Master's of Philosophy in geography from the University of Cambridge, and is admitted to practise in Australia. Brad teaches and researches across the disciplines of law and geography, taking critical and cross-jurisdictional approaches to his work. His Ph.D. research explores concepts of environmental and ecological justice in environmental law. Brad has also recently researched and published on the regulation of marine protected areas across jurisdictional boundaries, on public environmental law reform and transnational environmental discourses in wind energy disputes.

PROFESSOR KIM RUBENSTEIN is Professor and Director of the Centre for International and Public Law in the ANU College of Law at the Australian National University and inaugural Convenor of the ANU Gender Institute. A graduate of the University of Melbourne and Harvard University, Kim's current research projects are at the cutting edge of the intersection between public and international law. Her public law work spans constitutional and administrative law, and also includes her expertise in citizenship law. Her international law work focuses on the status of nationality. Her book, *Australian Citizenship Law in Context* (2002) represents the foundation of her continued scholarly work, looking at the disjuncture between the exclusive legal notion and the more inclusive normative understanding of citizenship.

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xi

Other contributors

DR AFSHIN AKHTARKHAVARI researches and writes on international law and politics. He is the author of *Global Governance of the Environment: Environmental Principles and Change in International Law and Politics* (2011) and co-author of *International Law: Cases and Materials with Australian Perspectives* (Cambridge University Press, 2010). Afshin is the Deputy Head of School (Academic) at Griffith Law School where he continues to work on a variety of internationalisation strategies including curricular initiatives. Afshin is preparing a book examining the nature of environmental governance through dispute settlement bodies, including investment and commercial arbitration, and other public dispute settlement bodies like the International Court of Justice, the Law of the Sea Tribunal and the Dispute Settlement of the World Trade Organization.

PROFESSOR BEN BOER is Emeritus Professor of Environmental Law in the Australian Centre for Climate and Environmental Law at the Sydney Law School. He teaches in the areas of international environmental law, Asian and Pacific environmental law and heritage law. He is co-chair of the IUCN World Commission on Protected Areas and Commission on Environmental Law Specialist Group on Protected Areas Law and Policy. Ben is a co-author, with Graeme Wiffen, of *Heritage Law in Australia* (2006) and the chief editor of *Sustainability Law after Rio* (2011). His current primary research focus is on protected areas law. He was the New Zealand Law Foundation Distinguished Visiting Fellow in 2011.

SANJA BOGOJEVIĆ is a lecturer in EU and Environmental Law at Lund University. Her doctoral research is concerned with the regulation of common resources, more precisely emissions trading schemes, and the way in which these are furthered and understood in environmental law scholarship. Sanja studied for a D.Phil. in Law at Corpus Christi College, Oxford. She has previously been appointed research visitor to the Max Planck Institute for Collective Goods in Bonn and a doctoral Hauser Global Fellow at NYU Law School.

RIVER CORDES-HOLLAND is a Ph.D. candidate at the ANU College of Law. He holds an LL.B. (Hons) and a University Medal in Law from the ANU. He has taught international law and tort law and has published on the international human rights implications of climate change and

xii

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

domestic regulation measures to mitigate climate change. River's Ph.D. thesis examines the notion of good international citizenship and the Australian Rudd Labor government's engagement with international climate law. River's research included a field trip to the UN Climate Change Conference in Copenhagen, 2009.

DR JAYE ELLIS is an associate professor in the Faculty of Law and School of Environment at McGill University. She teaches and conducts research in the fields of international environmental law, public international law and global environmental politics. Jaye's current research projects focus on principles of environmental law such as precaution and sustainable development and on intersections among science, law and politics. Her recent publications include 'Sustainable Development and Fragmentation in International Society' in Duncan French (ed.), *Global Justice and Sustainable Development* (2010) 57; and 'Sustainable Development as a Legal Principle: A Rhetorical Analysis' in Hélène Ruiz Fabri, Rüdiger Wolfrum and Jana Gogolin (eds.), *Selected Proceedings of the European Society of International Law*, Vol. II (2010) 642.

PROFESSOR LEE GODDEN is the Director of the Centre for Resources, Energy and Environmental Law, at Melbourne Law School, The University of Melbourne. Lee's research interests include environmental law, natural resources law, property law and indigenous peoples' land law. Engagement with the theoretical and the grounded aspects of law is a hallmark of her research, which draws on her interdisciplinary background in law and geography. Lee's current research projects include examining environmental governance under climate change with a focus on emissions trading, water law and energy regulation. Her recent publications include: *Environmental Law: Scientific, Policy and Regulatory Dimensions* (2010), co-authored with Jacqueline Peel, and the co-edited collection *Property and the Law in Energy and Natural Resources* (2010).

DR NICOLE GRAHAM is a senior lecturer with the Faculty of Law at the University of Technology Sydney. She holds a B.A. (Hons) and a University Medal in cultural studies, an LL.B. (Hons) and a Postgraduate Certificate in Higher Education from Macquarie University. Nicole received a Ph.D. in law from the University of Sydney for her dissertation 'Lawscape: Paradigm and Place in Australian Property Law'. Nicole has received awards for her teaching and has taught in law, cultural studies and

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xiii

environmental management programmes. Her research is concerned with the relationship between property and the environment in modern law and culture and is the subject of her book *Lawscape: Property, Environment, Law* (2011).

STEFAN GRUBER is a Ph.D. candidate at Sydney Law School at the University of Sydney. He is a legal practitioner and member of the Chamber of Lawyers, Frankfurt am Main. Stefan was educated at the Universities of Sydney, Frankfurt, Mainz, and at Harvard Law School, and holds degrees in law, philosophy and political science. His doctoral research focuses on the conservation of cultural heritage in China and explores the need for more decisive legal and political action in that area. Stefan is a member of the editorial board of the *Harvard Asia Pacific Review* and the Director of Research and Development of the Association of Pacific Rim Universities Doctoral Students Network. He has published in the areas of cultural heritage law, international environmental law, just war theory and international relations.

PROFESSOR KHENG-LIAN KOH is Emeritus Professor in the Faculty of Law at the National University of Singapore (NUS), and is the Director and one of the founders of the Asia-Pacific Centre for Environmental Law. Kheng-Lian served as the IUCN Commission on Environmental Law Regional Vice Chair for South and East Asia, and was a member of its Steering Committee from 1996 to 2004. She teaches environmental law at the NUS. Kheng-Lian has been a visiting professor at the Universidad Metropolitana de Mexico and the Richardson School of Law, Hawaii. From 1980 to 1986 she served as a legal officer in the secretariat of the United Nations Commission on International Trade Law in Vienna.

DR BETTINA LANGE is a university lecturer in law and regulation at the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, Oxford University. A graduate of Warwick University, UK, she is currently working on a research project that examines the invocation of emotion discourses in European Union regulation of transgenic agriculture. She is also working with Dr Alexiadou, Keele University, UK, on a project that analyses the deployment of soft modes of governance, such as the Open Method of Co-ordination, for achieving convergence of education policies in the European Union. Her recent book *Implementing EU Pollution Control: Law and Integration* (2008) explores from a discourse analytical

xiv

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

perspective the contribution of environmental 'law in action' to EU integration.

PETER LAWRENCE is a senior lecturer at the University of Tasmania Law School. Peter led a number of Australian delegations to international environment treaty negotiations during a posting to the Australian Mission to the United Nations with the Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. He has published extensively in the field of international environmental law. Peter's current research interests include climate justice and climate change and technology transfer. Peter is currently working on a book *Justice for Future Generations: Climate Change and International Law* (forthcoming). In 2011 he was an ANU visiting fellow, delivered a Wilhelm Merton Centre lecture at J. W. Goethe University of Frankfurt and a guest lecture at the Smith School of Enterprise and the Environment, University of Oxford.

DR SIMON MARSDEN is an associate professor at Flinders Law School and holds a B.A. (Hons) in Politics (York), LL.M. in Environmental Law (Aberdeen) and a Ph.D. (Tasmania). He is qualified to practise as a solicitor in England and a legal practitioner in Australia. Simon specialises in strategic and transboundary approaches to environmental impact assessment, and the relationship between legal systems. Simon's publications include: *Strategic Environmental Assessment in Australasia* (2002, edited with Stephen Dovers), *Strategic Environmental Assessment in International and European Law* (2008) and *Transboundary Environmental Impact Assessment in the European Union* (2011, edited with Timo Koivurova). Simon has worked as an academic in Ireland, England, Australia and Hong Kong and a legal adviser at the Environment Agency of England and Wales.

PROFESSOR PAUL MARTIN is the Director of the Australian Centre for Agriculture and Law at the University of New England. Paul oversees the Centre's science-informed law and policy research, with its particular emphasis on rural sustainability. Prior to this role Paul was the chair of regional catchment management organisations and of listed and private corporations. He was also a senior visiting fellow at the Australian Graduate School of Management for twenty years, responsible for a range of programmes in both law and entrepreneurship. Paul has authored books and studies on taxation, natural resources and negotiation, including *Sustainability Strategy* (2006) with Miriam Verbeek.

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

JULIA MAYO-RAMSAY is a barrister and solicitor of the Supreme Court of New South Wales and a Ph.D. candidate with the Institute of Marine and Ocean Studies at the University of Tasmania. Julia's Ph.D. research is focused on assessing the environmental and legal implications of climate change and climate mitigation measures on the oceans, in particular ocean fertilisation. Her other research interests include law of the sea, fisheries law and biodiversity of the oceans. Julia holds bachelor degrees in Legal and Justice Studies (Southern Cross University) and Law (University of New England), a Master's of Applied Science (Hawkesbury) and a Master's of Laws (ANU).

DR JEFFREY MCGEE is a senior lecturer in the School of Law at the University of Newcastle, Australia. He has a degree in Law from the Australian National University, a Master's degree in Environmental Studies from the University of Newcastle and a Ph.D. in Environment and Geography from Macquarie University, Sydney. Jeff teaches environmental law and public international law at the University of Newcastle. His research centres on the use of interpretative policy analysis to examine interaction between UN and non-UN agreements within the international climate regime.

PROFESSOR THOMAS POGGE is Leitner Professor of Philosophy and International Affairs at Yale, Professorial Fellow at the ANU Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics, and a research director at the Oslo University Centre for the Study of Mind in Nature. Focused on Kant and in moral and political philosophy, his publications include *Politics as Usual* (2010), *World Poverty and Human Rights* (2nd edn, 2008), *John Rawls: His Life and Theory of Justice* (2007), *Freedom from Poverty as a Human Right* (edited, 2007), and *Global Justice/Global Ethics* (co-edited, 2008). Thomas is editor for social and political philosophy for the *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* and a member of the Norwegian Academy of Science.

PROFESSOR DONALD R. ROTHWELL is Professor of International Law with the ANU College of Law at the Australian National University. His major areas of research include the law of the sea, the law of the polar regions and the application of international law within Australia. Between 2005 and 2009 he provided advice to the International Fund for Animal Welfare in their campaign to halt Japan's 'scientific' whaling

XV

xvi

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

programme in the Southern Ocean. His most recent book is *The International Law of the Sea* (2010) with Dr Tim Stephens.

ELIZABETH ROUGH is a Ph.D. student in the Department of Geography at the University of Cambridge. Her doctoral research examines the development of nuclear energy policy in the UK since the 1950s, with a specific focus on accounting for periods of stability and change in policy. The research for her contribution to this volume was generously funded by the Economic and Social Research Council, the Smuts Memorial Fund and the International Alliance of Research Universities.

DR MARK SHEPHEARD has research interests concerning problems of multiple and competing meaning and environmental stewardship obligations in farming. Mark's Ph.D. research at the University of New England investigated the practical implications for farming of civil duties being reinterpreted to incorporate environmental protection and sustainability obligations. Mark has received an Australian Endeavour Research Fellowship to Lincoln University in New Zealand (2010), and a visiting fellowship from the Swiss National Science Foundation to the University of Lucerne (2011). Both have been used to further his research on water stewardship obligations. Prior to his doctoral research, Mark was involved with sustainability and natural resource management research at the CSIRO and he worked for several state government natural resource management agencies.

DR TIM STEPHENS is a senior lecturer with the Sydney Law School at the University of Sydney. Tim is an international lawyer and human geographer. He holds a B.A. and LL.B. (both with Honours) from the University of Sydney, an M.Phil. in Geography from the University of Cambridge, and a Ph.D. in Law from the University of Sydney. Tim's research is focused on public international law, and in particular the law of the sea and international environmental law. His recent publications include *International Courts and Environmental Protection* (2009), the first comprehensive treatment of the role of international courts in addressing environmental disputes, and *The International Law of the Sea* (with Professor Donald R. Rothwell, 2010).

PROFESSOR ROS TAPLIN is Professor of Environmental Management and Program Director with the Institute of Sustainable Development and Architecture at Bond University. Ros has over twenty years' research and

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xvii

consulting experience in international and domestic environmental management and climate change policy. Her work has focused on sustainable energy, air quality, carbon reporting, environmental reporting, corporate responsibility and sustainability, new environmental policy instruments, environmental impact assessment, voluntary environmental agreements, sustainable cities and coastal management. Ros currently teaches in the environmental and carbon management programmes at Bond and her present research centres on international and domestic climate change issues.

SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

The idea for this series began in June 2005, when Kim Rubenstein applied for the position of Professor and Director of the Centre for International and Public Law at the ANU College of Law. The Centre is recognised as the leading Australian academic centre bringing together public lawyers (constitutional and administrative law broadly, but also specific areas of government regulation) and international lawyers from around the world. Established in 1990 with its inaugural director Professor Philip Alston, the impact of the Centre and its work can be seen further at law.anu.edu.au/cipl/.

In discussing with the law faculty ideas for the Centre's direction, Kim raised the concept which underpins this series. Each volume flows from workshops bringing public and international lawyers and public and international policy experts together for interdisciplinary discussion on selected topics and themes. The workshops attract both established scholars and outstanding early scholars. At each of the workshops participants address specific questions and issues developing each other's understandings and knowledge about public and international law and policy and the links between the disciplines as they intersect with the chosen subject. These papers are discussed and reviewed at the workshop collaboratively, then after the workshop the papers are finalised for the final editing phase for the overall manuscript.

The series seeks to broaden understanding of how public law and international law intersect. Until now, international and public law have mainly overlapped in discussions on how international law is implemented domestically. While there is scholarship developing in the area of global administrative law, and some scholars have touched upon the principles relevant to both disciplines, the publications to date contain only a subset of the concept underpinning this series. It is unique in consciously bringing together public and international lawyers to consider and engage in each other's scholarship.

xix

XX

SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

Beyond the first topic of sanctions, the other four topics draw from the research themes underpinning the International Alliance of Research Universities (IARU) which is made up of ANU, Berkeley, Cambridge, University of Copenhagen, ETH Zurich, National University of Singapore, Oxford, Peking University, University of Tokyo and Yale. The topics include volumes on Health (Volume 2) Environment (Volume 3), Movement of People (Volume 4) and Security (Volume 5).

The IARU has also supported the funding of participants from the IARU in some instances so that they can attend in person at ANU. This does not preclude non-IARU academics from participating, as will be seen in the rich array of participants in the first three volumes.

After the first successful workshop was complete, Professor Rubenstein contacted Professor Thomas Pogge to co-host the second workshop and in addition to doing that, he has enthusiastically joined with Professor Rubenstein as a joint series editor. His contributions to each volume are an expression of his cosmopolitan outlook, which is a theme engaged with throughout the series.

> Kim Rubenstein and Thomas Pogge

EDITORS' PREFACE

As explained in the Series Editors' Preface, this series is a result of workshops bringing together public and international lawyers. From the second volume onwards, the topics revolve around the International Association of Research Universities (IARU) thematic research topics. When Kim Rubenstein began thinking about organising the third workshop around the theme of the environment, she was encouraged to contact her ANU colleague Brad Jessup in the Australian Centre for Environmental Law. Brad responded enthusiastically and work began to brainstorm the call for papers.

This third workshop, 'Environmental Discourses in Public and International Law', was inspired by interesting interdisciplinary work on discourse theory which enabled us to bring together a rich array of public and international lawyers with geographers and scientists and political theorists. The workshop explored how dominant environmental thought and action had been placed within public and international law, providing excellent material for the themes the series is exploring.

Our workshop took place on 13–15 August 2009 at the Australian National University. The twenty-one paper presenters and a further fourteen participants, who had read all the papers, enjoyed vigorous discussion, engaging fully with each other and the material. We were delighted that we had participants from five IARU universities: ANU, Cambridge, University of Copenhagen, National University of Singapore and Oxford.

We thank Professor Simon Bronitt, then Director of ANU's National Europe Centre, for providing us with a dynamic venue. We thank James Prest from the ANU College of Law, Tom Baxter from the University of Tasmania, and Laura Nielsen from the University of Copenhagen for presenting stimulating papers at the workshop even though they were unable to contribute to the resulting book. Tim Bonyhady, Stella Chu, Jan Cristofani, John Dryzek, Elinor Jean, Radha Govil, Alison McLennan, Rebecca Monson, Andrew Ross, Erika Techera, Fanny

xxi

xxii

EDITORS' PREFACE

Thornton, Petrina Schiavi, Hayley Stephenson and Scott Wyatt participated in discussions and we thank them for their valuable contributions to the workshop.

We are grateful to the IARU universities' support through Cambridge University for Elizabeth Rough's travel to the workshop, Oxford University for Sanja Bogojević and Bettina Lange's travel, the University of Copenhagen for Laura Nielsen's travel, National University of Singapore for Kheng-Lian Koh's travel and the ANU Vice Chancellor's Travel Fund for Jaye Ellis's participation.

The event was ably organised by the ANU College of Law Outreach and Administrative Support Team and in particular Sarah Hull. ANU law student Ali Clare worked with us reviewing the papers on style matters and we thank her and Glenda Waddell from the ANU College of Law for their assistance in putting this volume together. We also thank the sixteen anonymous reviewers whose critiques of the papers strengthened the chapters in this collection.

The staff at Cambridge University Press, especially Finola O'Sullivan, have been enthusiastic in supporting this series and Lynn Aitchison as copy-editor has been excellent.

Finally, we would like to thank our colleagues in the Centre for International and Public Law and the Australian Centre for Environmental Law in the ANU College of Law and our respective families and friends for their support and inspiration in all that we do.

> Brad Jessup and Kim Rubenstein January 2011