Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01937-9 - Plagiarism in Latin Literature Scott McGill Index More information

Index

Adaeus 147–148, 150, 154–155, 156, 157, 158, 159 Adelphoe see Terence *aemulatio*/productive change 50, 156–158 improving sources as a recognized goal in translation/imitation 156, 207 psychological in character 156 as synonym for *imitari* 188 Aeneid (Virgil) 170, 172-173, 205 and Homer 193-195, 204-206 Varius editor 214 Afranius, Lucius 127-128 Compitalia 198 Albinus, Rufius 127-128, 174 defence of Virgil see Macrobius Alexander the Great 45 Alexandria 36-37, 44, 45 alieni usurpatio 9, 199–200 allusions 166, 197 Apollinaris, Sidonius 222 Aristophanes of Byzantium 36-37, 44-45 Artemon 158–159, 160–161, 161–162 Astronomica (Manilius) 57-60 demonstrating Manilius' originality 57-58, 59-60, 220 derivativeness and plagiarism 59-60 notion of plagiarism 58-59 Atticus 1-2 attribution attributed works the norm in Latin literary culture 17–18 implying property 200, 202 plays belonging to authors as attributed works 124 of sententiae 67 Augustus 57, 218–220 addressed in De architectura 35, 38, 41, 44-45 ordering Cassius' death 211 Palatine library 26, 44 promoting the standing of specialists 43 resembling Ptolemy 44

triumph 44 defeat of Anthony and Cleopatra 44-45 Virgil and Augustus 217-220 Vitruvius' relationship with Augustus 43-45 Ausonius 9, 12, 13–16, 91 authorship creativity/originality, and 19-20, 21-22, 39, 40-41, 50-51 plagiarism as means of claiming 2-3, 11-12, 13-16, 22-24 recognized in Roman antiquity 16-17, 67, 83, 124, 149, 151, 152, 199, 200 Avitus, Quintus Octavius 178–179, 183 Bavius 185 booksellers/book trade 11-12 booksellers' ownership of material text 16, 82-83 booksellers' right of usus 16, 83 Brutus see Cicero Cassius of Parma 211 Catullus 47, 77 Cicero 1-3, 18-19, 190 Brutus 2-3, 19, 22, 24, 165 conceptualizing plagiarism as stealing/intent to deceive 2-3 distinguishing legitimate imitation from stealing 2-3, 6, 165 letter to Atticus joking about plagiarism 1-2 naming sources 51 ownership of content of work as author 16, 83 rhetoric 60, 61, 62 Verrines 168–169 circulation oral and textual 6, 16–17 see also publication Clodius, Servius 38 Codex Salmasianus 217–218 Colax (Menander) 126–127, 130–131, 131–132 Colax (Naevius) 123, 134

236

Colax (Plautus) 123, 134 comedy see under Greece; see Terence Commorientes (Plautus) 136-138 Compitalia (Afranius) 198 Controversiae see Seneca the Elder copyright and plagiarism 10-12, 36 and commercial book trade 11-12 De architectura see Vitruvius Diphilus Synapothescontes 136–138, 139 Donatus, Aelius 117, 118, 119, 210-211 Donatus auctus 218–220 Donatus, Tiberius Claudius 183, 184, 212, 213-214 Dorus the Bookseller 83 Eclogues (Virgil) 210-211, 215-216 not forgeries 210 Egypt Augustus' defeat of Anthony and Cleopatra 44-45 plagiarism 36–37 Ptolemy see Ptolemy Ennius 2-3, 165 Eugraphius 118, 119, 131 Eunuchus see Terence Eunuchus (Menander) 121, 122, 130–131 Eusebius 7, 29 Eustathius 193–195, 196–197, 204 Evangelus 185, 186 exempla/exemplarity 68-69 see also imitatio/imitation Faustus, Perellius 178-179, 183 Fidentius see Martial forgery 81, 94 compared to plagiarism 3-4, 210 Eclogues not forgeries 210 Fortunatus, Venantius 8 fructus legendi 187–189 *furtum* 8–9, 10 manifestum furtum designating theft caught in the act 95 meaning "plagiarism" 49-50, 58-59, 94, 116, 123, 136–137, 138, 141 Fuscus, Arellius 147–151, 154–158, 160, 167, 207 exposure to plagiarism accusation 147–151 imitating lines of Virgil 163-164 response to accusation 154-158, 162-163 authorial intention 155, 160 translation and plagiarism 156-158, 207 value of Fuscus promoted 156

Gallio, Junius 164–167 friendship with Ovid 165, 166

Index

friendship with Seneca the Elder 164 Gellius, Aulus 180–181 Georgics (Virgil) 58-59, 210 ghostwriting 100, 140-143 and plagiarism 14, 140-141 Greece Old and New Comedy 6, 7, 116, 118 plagiarism 6-7 evidence 6, 7, 20 migrating from Greece to Rome 7, 116 terms for plagiarism 6-7 Hieria, Plotia 212, 213–214 Historia naturalis (Pliny the Elder) 46-56 close repetition in research as plagiarism 25 demonstrating Pliny's scholarly effort and research 53-55 flattering Titus and demonstrating devotion 47-48, 55-56 giving Pliny's sources 25-26, 48-49, 51-53, 55 notion of plagiarism 50-53 plagiarists' failure to cite sources 25-26, 49-50, 52-53 promoting Pliny's historical objectivity 47 promoting Pliny's virtues and authority 46-47, 48, 51, 52-56, 220 Homer 38, 57, 179, 193-195, 204-206 Iliad 217 Little Iliad 216 Odyssey 217 Phocais 216 as victim of plagiarism 216-217 Horace 7, 26-27, 185, 211, 215 Iliad (Homer) 217 imitatio/imitation 2-3, 6, 9 allusions 166, 197 audiences not always assuming imitatio 195 concealing sources a facet of imitatio 196-197 cultural norm of imitatio 6, 68-69, 188, 189, 191–192, 197 imitating across borders of rhetorical prose/ poetry 163-164 improving a source a recognized goal in imitation 156 legitimate imitation 2-3, 21-22 proper approach to imitatio 39, 62-63, 71, 204-207, 208-209 exempla/exemplarity, importance of 68-69 and fructus legendi 187–189 hiding sources 22-24, 25-26, 40, 41, 63, 71, 162, 165-166, 193-196 inert following of models 40, 50-51, 59-60, 71 measuring imitation against its source 207-208

Index

and plagiarism 159–160, 165, 166–167, 189–190, 196-197 distancing from plagiarism by enlisting *imitatio* as cultural norm 189 plagiarism different from a poor version of imitation 27-28 plagiarism used metaphorically to highlight similarity 26-27 productive imitation loosely defined 21-22 proper approach to imitatio 39, 62-63, 71, 204-207, 208-209 legitimate imitation 2-3, 21-22 reach of *imitatio* not universal in Latin poetry 166–167 research 24-26 citations 25-26, 41, 51-52 close repetition in research as plagiarism 25, 50-51 contestability of research methods 40 and imitation 25, 27–28, 40 legitimate research practices 71 plagiarism different from a poor version of research 27-28 role in Latin literature 19-20, 21, 198-199 Institutio (Priscian) 69-73 legitimate research practices and plagiarism 71 promoting virtues of Priscian's text 70, 72-73, using plagiarism to explain shortcomings/preempt criticism 70-72 using plagiarism to present favorably as an author 72-73 intentions of authors innocence and lack of intention to deceive 129–130, 131–132, 155, 157, 160, 161–163, 165 biographical details 147, 160, 161-163, 167, 176, 197 critical authority/insight through friendship 165 intentional fallacy 22-24 interpreting intentions and prejudice/ perception 24, 34, 147, 174-175, 196-197 linking intention to *aemulatio* as a cultural norm 156, 157 means of identifying plagiarism 24, 34, 155–156, 157, 166–167, 172 invective and personal attack 6, 28, 33-34 Jefferson, Thomas 222 Laelius, Gaius 136-137, 141, 142

Latro, Marcus Porcius 158–163 friendship with Seneca the Elder 158, 162, 171 Hellenophobia as biographical detail 161, 162 leading declaimer 171 237

Seneca's denial of his plagiarism 158, 160-163 unfounded allegations that Silo plagiarized his sententia 167–17 Laverna, "goddess of thieves" 9 Lenaeus 33–34, 38 Little Iliad (Homer) 216 Livy 48 Lucilius 200 Luscius Lanuvinus see Terence Macrobius 9, 174, 179-181; see also Saturnalia Maecenas 163–164, 214 Maevius 185 Manilius, Marcus 69 Astronomica 57–60 demonstrating Manilius' originality 57-58, 59-60, 220 derivativeness and plagiarism 59-60 notion of plagiarism 58-59 imitating earlier writers 58 Martial 8-9, 215 accusations and genre of epigram 76–85 Fidentinus 74-76, 78-82, 83-84, 85-93 legal imagery/legalisms 88-89, 95, 96, 97 literary marketplace 104, 105-106 meta-poetry stylistic irony 97-98 through choice of meter 97, 101-102 patronage 85–93 Quintianus 86-87 Paulus 74, 82-83 "performed I" 78–79, 91–93, 98–99, 106–107, 109–110, 220–221 plagiarism accusations and self-promotion 77-78, 92, 98-99, 103-104, 106-107, 109–110 plagiarism accusations as entertainment 7, 75-76, 89-90, 91-92, 98, 103, 110-111 revealing cultural assumptions 1-2, 16 plagiarism as threat to authorial identity 77-78, 81 plagiarius 8-9, 88-89 satiric first-person persona 78-79 use of stable irony 83-84, 87, 95 wholesale plagiarism of epigrams 83-84, 94-95, 105 Menander 7, 117, 127-128, 131 accusations that Afranius plagiarized his work 198 Colax 126-127, 130-131, 131-132 Eunuchus 121, 122, 130–131 modern definitions of plagiarism 1-3, 9, 36 analogous to identity theft 3-4, 11-12

and ancient Rome 4

238

Naevius 2-3 allegations of Terence's reuse of work 123–125, 126-127, 129, 131-132 Colax 123, 134 Ennius borrowing from 165 Odyssey (Homer) 217 open literary tradition and plagiarism see under Macrobius Ovid 149 and Etna 200–201 friendship with Gallio 165, 166 intention to imitate 163-167 allusions to Virgil adding value 166 handling of Virgil and denial of plagiarism 164, 166-167 Ovid's intentions clear and accessible 165, 166 leading poet of generation after Virgil 164 Medea 164 Remedia Amoris 184 ownership alieni usurpatio, concept of texts as property inhering in 9, 199, 202 author's ownership of content of work 16, 19-20, 36, 83 moral right maintained to have authorship recognized 16, 83 plays belonging to authors as attributed works 124 respect for author's proprietary claim 16-17, 199 textual ownership coexisting with textual openness 39 violation of textual property 49 booksellers' ownership of material text 16, 82-83 imitation as part of common property rights of published works 199-200 moral and legal rights 11-12 private intellectual property 199-200 published works as part of general storehouse open to imitators 199-200 private ownership making plagiarism possible 200 symbolic ownership 199 of sententiae 67, 149, 151, 152 usus and fructus, concept of texts as property inhering in 199 see also publication Paullus, L. Aemilius 140, 142–143 Pedianus, Asconius 8, 29, 179, 180-181, 205, 206-207

penalties for plagiarism 10

Index

disapproval and shaming 15, 38, 89, 183 divorce 38 exile from Egypt 37 harm to reputation 125-126, 133 Phocais (Homer) 216 Phormio see Terence plagiarism aesthetic grounds/insufficient change 10, 11, 20-22, 25, 50, 191-193 and authorship 2-3, 11-12, 13-16, 22-24 and authorial/literary value 20-21, 28-29 and credit 1–2, 3, 5, 9, 10, 11, 14, 22, 28 and copyright 10 culpable not criminal 10, 11-12 forgery compared 3-4, 210 ghostwriting compared 14, 140-141 and imitation see imitatio/imitation and intentions see intentions of authors as a mistaken critical construct 147, 174-175, 184 moral character 11 and open literary tradition see under Macrobius penalties for plagiarism see penalties for plagiarism as pragmatic phenomenon 5 to gain undeserved credit 3, 5 and research see research terms for describing plagiarism Greek 6-7 Latin 2-3, 8-9 and translation see translation and plagiarism use of plagiarism metaphorically 26-27 wholesale see wholesale plagiarism Plautus 116–117 allegations of reuse of work 123–125, 126–127, 129, 131–132 Colax 123, 134 Commorientes 136–138 and Terence's Adelphoe 136-140 and Terence's *Eunuchus* 123–125, 126–127, 129, 131-132, 134 Pliny the Elder 25–26, 30, 59, 69 death 46 Historia naturalis 46–56 close repetition in research as plagiarism 25 demonstrating his scholarly effort and research 53-55 flattering Titus and demonstrating devotion 47-48, 55-56 listing his sources 25-26, 48-49, 51-53, 55 notion of plagiarism 50-53 plagiarists' failure to cite sources 25-26, 49-50, 52-53 promoting his historical objectivity 47

promoting his virtues and authority 46-47, 48, 51, 52-56, 220 Pliny the Younger 83, 104 Pompey the Great 33 Porphyry 6-7, 29, 211, 212 Priscian Institutio 69-73 legitimate research practices and plagiarism 71 promoting virtues of text/author 70, 72-73, 220 using plagiarism to explain shortcomings/ pre-empt criticism 70-72 property see ownership Ptolemy 36-37, 44-45 publication circulation of written texts as bulwark against plagiarism 104 fraudulent publication 79-80 loss of control over material after publication 12-13, 77, 80-81 nature of publication in ancient Rome 12-13, 71 published works part of the general storehouse open to imitators 199-200, 201-202 unpublished works at risk of plagiarism 104 Quintianus see under Martial Remedia Amoris (Ovid) 184 research 24-26 citations 25-26, 41, 51-52 close repetition in research as plagiarism 25, 50-51 contestability of research methods 40 and imitation 25, 27-28, 40 legitimate research practices 71 plagiarism different from a poor version of research 27-28 rhetoric/oratory 60-61, 69 Cicero 60, 61, 62 colores/"spin" or "complexion" 60 controversiae 60, 158, 159 decline in rhetoric 61, 65 development of rhetorical schools/ declamation, opportunities from 149-150 competition and accusations of plagiarism 150, 151, 170

divisiones/main lines of argument 60 plagiarism allegations part of declamatory culture 153 rhetorical epigrams *see also under* Seneca rhetorical theory 41–42

Sallust 33–34, 155, 156 *Saturnalia* (Macrobius) 8, 127–128

Index

239 cultural values in 181-182, 186, 189, 191-192, 197, 198–199, 208–209 date 179–181 defense of Virgil 179 ad hominem arguments 183-187 and biography of Virgil/Asconius 179 imitation v. plagiarism 189–190, 197, 203–209 accusers failing to consider imitation as norm 187–189 Virgil and failed imitation 191–193 improvement/added value 204–207 intentions 193-197 open literary tradition 198-202 synkrisis 207–208 Virgil's canonicity 178-209 and authorial/literary value 181-182, 186, 196-197, 202-203, 207-209 Scipio Aemilianus, P. Cornelius 140-143 Seneca the Elder 69, 149, 220 as accuser 61–65, 153–154 and Cassius Severus 151-152 and promotion of his text 65-66, 146 and rhetorical decline 61 Controversiae 60-61, 69, 153, 168 denials of plagiarism 146, 147–158 ad hominem defense 173-174, 175-176 and authorial/literary value 147, 150, 156, 162, 170, 176-177 biographical interpretation/intentions 147, 160, 162-163, 167 imitation and plagiarism 159–160 translation and plagiarism 163–156 friendship with Latro 158, 162, 171 memory 149, 169 sententiae/rhetorical epigrams 60, 153 attribution of sententiae 67, 149 protecting sententiae from plagiarism 66-69 reuse of sententiae 61-65, 149-150, 151-153, 156, 163-156, 170-171 as symbolic currency 149–150 symbolic ownership of sententiae 67, 149, 151, 152 as source on literary history and thought 146-147, 154 as source on spread of plagiarism charges 153–154 Suasoriae 60-61, 153, 168 Seneca the Younger 16, 83 on plagiarism 200 on imitation and open literary tradition 200-202 Servius 180–181, 185, 211–214, 215–216 Severus, Cassius 151-152 Severus, Cornelius 200-201

Silo, Abronius 167–177

240

Silo, Abronius (cont.) reuse of Latro's sententia 167-168 example of acceptable/commendable borrowing to Seneca 172-173 Seneca's rejection of plagiarism accusation against Silo 169, 173–176 and Virgil 170, 178 Statute of Anne (1709) 10-11 Suasoriae see Seneca the Elder Suetonian-Donatan biography of Virgil 8, 178-179, 180-181, 184, 205, 206-207, 213-214 Suetonius 33, 38, 58, 136-137, 141, 178-179 sumere 2–3, 9 surripere 2-3, 8-9, 194-195 Symmachus 12–16 Synapothescontes (Diphilus) 136–138, 139 synkrisis 207–208 Terence Adelphoe 19, 136–138 ad hominem defense 184 crowd being placed as judges creating goodwill 144-145 ghostwriting by aristocracy, allegations of 140-143 ghostwriting and plagiarism 140-141 'new' play 126–127, 133–134, 136–138, 141, 143–144 plagiarism accusation 136-138 and Plautus 136–140 prologue advertising play 143-144, 145 same formula for plagiarism as in Eunuchus 138-139 and Scipio Aemilianus 140–143 Andria 119 Eunuchus accusation of deceit by incorporation of characters 124-125 ad hominem defense 174, 175, 184 answering criticisms in prologue 19, 115-116, 119, 121, 129-136, 161 authorial intention and plagiarism 129-130, 131–132, 133–134, 136 contaminatio v. plagiarism 130-131 financial gain and plagiarism, 126 links between plagiarism allegation and content of play 128-129 'new' play 126–127, 131–132, 137–139 optioned for the games 122, 125-126 ownership of script 124 prologue as advertisement 136 prologue as entertainment 116-117 stock characters and plagiarism 128, 134-135, 136 success 128

Index

Turpio delivering prologues 116 Greek backdrop for plagiarism accusations 126-127 Roman history of plagiarism before Terence 126-127 Hecyra 115, 128 later reference to plagiarism in Roman comedy 127-128 Luscius Lanuvinus ad hominem responses to him 174 doubts whether conflict with Terence historical fact 118, 119–120 identified as the critic 115-116, 117 said to lead other critics 136 Phormio 116, 129 reuse of material 19, 116, 161 Thucydides 155, 156 Thyestes (Varius claiming) allegedly Cassius of Parma's 211 allegedly Virgil's 210–211, 213–214, 214–215, 216 Titus addressed in Historia naturalis 46-48, 55-56 prominence and power 46-47 transferre 9 translation and plagiarism 163-156, 207 aemulatio/improving a source as a recognized goal in translation 156 loose notion of identity in translation 157 Turpio, Ambivius 116, 125-126, 133 usus/usus fructus 188 booksellers' right of usus 16, 83 usus and fructus, concept of texts as property inhering in 199 Varius, Lucius 211, 212, 215 plagiarizing Cassius 211 plagiarizing Virgil 210–214, 215–216 Varus, Quintus Attius 211, 212 Verrines (Cicero) 168-169 Vespasian 46-47 Virgil 50, 51 and Abronius Silo 170, 178 accusations of plagiarism 8, 58-59, 174, 178-179, 180-181 accusers 183-187 Aeneid 170, 172–173, 205 Varius editor 214 alleged relationship with Varius' wife 211–214 defense of Virgil see Macrobius ensuring survival of earlier works through imitation 202-203 Fuscus imitating lines 163-164 Georgics 58-59, 210 reworking by Ovid

Index

241

allusions to Virgil adding value 166 handling of Virgil and denial of plagiarism 164, 166–167 upright character 213–214 as victim of plagiarism 210–215 Varius 210–214, 215–216 epigram on Augustus 217–220 Vitruvius 26, 59, 69 advertising qualities as an author and architect 41–43, 45, 46–47, 56, 220 relationship with Augustus 43–45 anxiety over status in Roman society 43 comparing himself with Aristophanes 45 *De architectura* content and purposes 35 comparing himself with Dinocrates 45 prologues 35

wholesale plagiarism 12–19, 40, 94–95, 105