

MAKING WE THE PEOPLE

What does it mean to say that it is "We the People" who "ordain and establish" a constitution? Who are those sovereign people, and how can they do so?

Interweaving history and theory, constitutional scholar Chaihark Hahm and political theorist Sung Ho Kim attempt to answer these perennial questions by revisiting the constitutional politics of postwar Japan and Korea. Together, these experiences demonstrate the infeasibility of the conventional assumption that there is a clearly bounded sovereign "people" prior to constitution-making that stands apart from both outside influence and troubled historical legacies. The authors argue that "We the People" only emerges through a deeply transformative politics of constitutional founding and, as such, a democratic constitution and its putative author are mutually constitutive. Highly original and genuinely multidisciplinary, this book will be of interest to democratic theorists, scholars of comparative constitutionalism as well as observers of ongoing constitutional debates in Japan and Korea.

Chaihark Hahm is Professor of Constitutional Law at Yonsei University Law School (Seoul, Korea) and an editorial board member of *I*•CON: *International Journal of Constitutional Law*. He holds law degrees from Yale, Columbia, and Harvard

Sung Ho Kim is Professor of Political Science and Director of the Social Science Research Institute at Yonsei University (Seoul, Korea). He is the author of *Max Weber's Politics of Civil Society*, which was also published by Cambridge University Press.





COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLICY

Series Editors

Tom Ginsburg, *University of Chicago* Zachary Elkins, *University of Texas at Austin* Ran Hirschl, *University of Toronto*

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

Volumes in the Series

Comparative Constitutional Design edited by Tom Ginsburg (2012)

 $Consequential\ Courts: \ Judicial\ Roles\ in\ Global\ Perspective\ edited\ by\ Diana\ Kapiszewski,\ Gordon\ Silverstein,\ and\ Robert\ A.\ Kagan\ (2013)$

Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions edited by Denis J. Galligan and Mila Versteeg (2013)

Presidential Legislation in India: The Law and Practice of Ordinances by Shubhankar Dam $_{\rm (2014)}$

Constitutions in Authoritarian Regimes edited by Tom Ginsburg and Alberto Simpser (2014)

Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia edited by Susan H. Williams (2014)

Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century edited by Albert Chen (2014)

Constitutions and Religious Freedom by Frank Cross (2015)

Reputation and Judicial Tactics: A Theory of National and International Courts by Shai Dothan $({\tt 2015})$

International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements: A General Theory with Evidence from the European Union by Clifford Carrubba and Matthew Gabel (2015)

Magna Carta and its Modern Legacy edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton (2015)
Unstable Constitutionalism edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla (2015)

Radical Deprivation on Trial by Cesar Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco (2015)





Making We the People

DEMOCRATIC CONSTITUTIONAL FOUNDING IN POSTWAR JAPAN AND SOUTH KOREA

CHAIHARK HAHM and SUNG HO KIM

Yonsei University





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107018822

© Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Hahm, Chaihark, 1963- author.

Making we the people: democratic constitutional founding in postwar Japan and South Korea / Chaihark Hahm, Yonsei University, Seoul; Sung Ho Kim, Yonsei University, Seoul.

pages cm. – (Comparative constitutional law and policy)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-01882-2 (hardback)

- 1. Constitutional history Japan. 2. Constitutional history South Korea.
- I. Kim, Sung Ho, 1966- author. II. Title.

KNC527.H358 2015

342.519502'9-dc23 2015020956

ISBN 978-1-107-01882-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Tai Young Hahm (1873–1964) and Rin Suh Kim (1894–1964)

Patriots for the Nation
Pastors to the People
Founders of the Republic





Contents

Acknowledgments	page xi
Introduction	1
1 The Unbearable Lightness of the People	13
Charisma and Its Discontents	13
External Others: "Autonomy Syndrome"	17
Past Legacies: "tabula rasa Syndrome"	32
People's Boundaries: "We the People" Unbounded	44
Popular Sovereignty, Constitutional Founding, and	
People-Making	64
2 War and Peace	66
Overbearing Outsiders	66
Japan's Farewell to Arms	69
Korea's Tale of Two Cities	96
Present at the Creation	125
3 The Ghost of Empire Past	128
Unmasterable Pasts	128
The Japanese Emperor's New Clothes	130
The Once and Future Republic of Korea	162
Revolutions and Restorations	193
4 A Room of One's Own	197
Shifting Boundaries	197
Seeing Like an Empire	199
Dismembering the Japanese Empire	223

ix



x Contents	
Dividing the Korean Peninsula Impositions, Legacies, and "We the People"	244 272
Conclusion	275
Note on Romanization and Sources	287
Bibliography	289
Glossary	305
Index	309



Acknowledgments

The origins of this book can be traced back to a long, late-evening conversation with the late Il-Young Kim and Chulwoo Lee sometime in 2008. As the topic of our discussion shifted freely from history and culture to politics and law, we at one point asked ourselves who "We the People" – the putative authors of a democratic constitution – really are, especially in a context defined by strong ethnic nationalism. What would be a definition of the people that is both historically accurate and normatively attractive? That evening's question proved to be the beginning of a long journey that has come to a close with the completion of this book.

It was, however, not until we took our sabbatical leaves, both in 2009–2010, that we were able to embark on the project in earnest. Once settled in at the Harvard-Yenching Institute (HYI) and The Hague Institute for the Internationalization of Law (HiiL)/The Netherlands Institute for Advanced Study (NIAS), respectively, we started sharing ideas and drafts across the Atlantic. Upon returning to Seoul, we were ready to engage in serious writing, only to find our efforts hampered by our teaching, administrative, and other responsibilities. We found out the hard way that a sabbatical year is better used to finish a book project rather than to start one. It has thus taken many more years than we had anticipated before our reflections on that evening's question finally coalesced into the book as it stands now. Along this long journey, we have incurred many debts.

We have benefited from various conversations and correspondences with numerous friends and colleagues regarding different versions of the ideas contained in this book. We thank William Alford, Sung-joon Cho, Bruce Cumings, Carter Eckert, David Gerber, Andrew Gordon, Ran Hirschl, Ken Ishida, Jonathan Kang, Chikako Kashiwazaki, the late Il-Young Kim, Keigo Komamura, Chulwoo Lee, Hans Lindahl, Barak Medina, Bert van Roermund, Rogers Smith, Thio Li-ann, Mark Tushnet, Joseph Weiler, and Jiunn-rong Yeh.



xii

Acknowledgments

We especially would like to note our gratitude to Tom Ginsburg who invited us to contribute to the Cambridge series on Comparative Constitutional Law and Policy, and to Gary Jacobsohn for years of encouragement and friendship. Needless to add, any fault that this book may contain is entirely our own.

At various stages, different parts of this book were presented at conferences, workshops, and public lectures. To list them in chronological order: National University of Singapore, Harvard-Yenching Institute, 2010 Annual Meeting of the Law and Society Association (Chicago), University of Texas at Austin, the Netherlands Institute for Advanced Studies, 2011 Annual Meeting of the Association for Asian Studies (Honolulu), Asan Institute for Policy Studies (Seoul), East Asia Institute (Seoul), Yonsei University, Seoul National University, Korea University, Keio Gijuku University (Tokyo), Chicago-Kent College of Law, the University of Chicago Law School, City University of Hong Kong, and Harvard Law School. We thank all who shared their comments with us at these venues.

The Asan Institute for Policy Studies and its president, Chaibong Hahm, deserve our special gratitude for providing the research grant that was indispensable for the successful completion of this book. Without his support and abiding interest, our ideas would not have seen the light of day. We are also thankful to the Asan Institute for enabling us to organize an international workshop in 2011 around the main theme of our book. This was in fact a follow-up on a previous workshop in 2010, for which we are much obliged to Elizabeth Perry of HYI, Sam Muller and David Raič of HiiL, and Wim Blockmans and Jos Hooghuis of NIAS. In addition, the research and writing of this book were greatly facilitated by the logistical support provided by Jinsoo Han, Misato Ido, Sang Joon Kim, and Seok-choon Lew. The expert assistance of Hee Kyoung You, the law librarian at Yonsei, is much appreciated as well.

We are pleased to acknowledge the input and feedback from all the students who attended our graduate seminars at Yonsei, where we were able to test our ideas and arguments in their early stages. We hope they find resonance of their voices in this final product. Research assistance from our graduate students was invaluable especially during the final stage of book writing. Among them, we thank June Mee Jung, Hyun Kim, Seokwon Kim, Sunghan Kim, Shuto Nakamura, Sun-myung Oh, Yoon Keun Oh, and Sohee Whang.

Our greatest debt, of course, is to our families whose unfailing support and boundless patience made it possible for us to indulge in what must have seemed like a never-ending project. Chaihark is especially grateful to his wife, Jumi, for replenishing his soul on a daily basis. For the same reason and in so many different ways, Sung Ho owes much, simply too much, to his daughter, Minjin.