

MODERN BRIBERY LAW

The Bribery Act 2010 is the most significant reform of UK bribery law in a century. This critical analysis offers an explanation of the Act, makes comparisons with similar legislation in other jurisdictions and provides a critical commentary, from both a UK and a US perspective, on the collapse of the distinction between public and private sector bribery. Drawing on their academic and practical experience, the contributors also analyse the prospects for enforcement and the difficulties facing lawyers seeking asset recovery following the laundering of the proceeds of bribery. Broader international perspectives are provided via comparisons with the law in Hong Kong, the United States and Italy, together with broader analysis of the application of the law in relation to EU anti-corruption initiatives, international development and the arms trade.

JEREMY HORDER is Edmund-Davies Professor of Criminal Law at King's College London. He was a Law Commissioner for England and Wales from 2005 to 2010.

PETER ALLDRIDGE is Drapers' Professor of Law at Queen Mary, University of London.

MODERN BRIBERY LAW

Comparative Perspectives

Edited by
JEREMY HORDER
and
PETER ALLDRIDGE



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-01873-0 — Modern Bribery Law: Comparative Perspectives
 Edited by Jeremy Horder, Peter Alldridge
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107018730

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2013

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Modern bribery law : comparative perspectives/edited by Jeremy Horder and Peter Alldridge.
 pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-01873-0

1. Bribery—Great Britain.

I. Horder, Jeremy, editor of compilation. II. Alldridge, Peter, editor of compilation.

KD8045.M63 2013

345.41'02323—dc23

2012040138

ISBN 978-1-107-01873-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>List of contributors</i>	vii
<i>Table of cases</i>	ix
<i>Table of statutes and international instruments</i>	xiii
Introduction	1
PART I Bribery law: between public wrongdoing and private advantage-taking	11
1 Reformulating bribery: a legal critique of the Bribery Act 2010	13
BOB SULLIVAN	
2 Official and commercial bribery: should they be distinguished?	39
STUART P. GREEN	
3 Countering corrupting conflicts of interest: the example of Hong Kong	66
DAVID C. DONALD	
PART II Bribery without borders: tackling corruption in the EU and beyond	95
4 Bribery in Italy: an outlook on present laws and perspectives on reform	97
ROBERTO GUERRINI AND DARIO GUIDI	
5 Development, business integrity and the UK Bribery Act 2010	128
INDIRA CARR	

- 6 The aims and limits of European Union anti-corruption law** 160
VALSAMIS MITSILEGAS
- 7 Deterring bribery: law, regulation and the export trade** 196
JEREMY HORDER
- PART III Ill-gotten gains: the challenge of prosecution, enforcement and asset recovery** 217
- 8 Bribery and the changing pattern of criminal prosecution** 219
PETER ALLDRIDGE
- 9 Bribery and corruption: the UK framework for enforcement** 251
CHARLIE MONTEITH
- 10 Prosecuting bribery in Hong Kong's human rights environment** 267
SIMON N. M. YOUNG
- 11 Is the UNCAC an effective deterrent to grand corruption?** 293
TIM DANIEL AND JAMES MATON
- Bibliography* 328
Index 350

CONTRIBUTORS

PETER ALLDRIDGE is Drapers' Professor of Law at Queen Mary, University of London.

INDIRA CARR is Professor of Law at the University of Surrey, and Visiting Professor at University College London.

TIM DANIEL is a Partner at Edwards Wildman Palmer UK LLP.

DAVID C. DONALD is Professor of Law and Director of the Centre for Financial Regulation and Economic Development at the Chinese University of Hong Kong.

STUART P. GREEN is Distinguished Professor of Law at Rutgers Law School, Newark.

ROBERTO GUERRINI is a Professor of Law and Head of Department at the University of Siena.

DARIO GUIDI is a Research Fellow at the University of Siena.

JEREMY HORDER was a Law Commissioner for England and Wales, from 2005 to 2010. He is currently Edmund-Davies Professor of Criminal Law at the Dickson Poon School of Law, King's College London.

JAMES MATON is a Partner at Edwards Wildman Palmer UK LLP.

VALSAMIS MITSILEGAS is Professor of European Criminal Law, Director of the Criminal Justice Centre, and Head of the Department of Law at Queen Mary, University of London.

CHARLIE MONTEITH is Counsel in the global White Collar group at White & Case LLP. Prior to joining White & Case, he was Head of Legal and Operational Assurance at the UK Serious Fraud Office.

BOB SULLIVAN is Emeritus Professor of Law at University College London.

SIMON N. M. YOUNG is Professor and Director, Centre for Comparative and Public Law, Faculty of Law, University of Hong Kong.

TABLE OF CASES

Canada

Canadian Dredge & Dock Ltd v. The Queen (1985) 19 CCC (3d) 1 (SCC) 148

Hong Kong

- Attorney General v. Hui Kin-Hong* [1995] 1 HKCLR 227 78
Ng Ka Ling v. Director of Immigration (1999) 2 HKCFAR 4 282
Ching Kwok Yin v. HKSAR (2000) 3 HKCFAR 387 276
Secretary for Justice v. Lam Tat Ming (2000) 3 HKCFAR 168 284
Wong Pui Sham v. HKSAR (2000) 3 HKCFAR 449 277, 278
Yu Chee Yin v. Commissioner of ICAC [2001] 2 HKC 91 (CFI), [2001] 4 HKC 532 (CFI) 279
HKSAR v. Lee Ming Tee (2003) 6 HKCFAR 336 275
HKSAR v. Lau Wai Tim, unreported, CACC 152/2003, 4 March 2004 (CA) 275
Sin Kam Wah v. HKSAR (2005) 8 HKCFAR 192 269
HKSAR v. Chan Kau Tai [2006] 1 HKLRD 400 (CA) 275
Koo Sze Yiu v. Chief Executive of HKSAR (2006) 9 HKCFAR 441 270
Leung Kwok Hung v. Chief Executive of HKSAR [2006] HKEC 239 (CFI), aff'd [2006] HKEC 816 (CA) 270
HKSAR v. Lee Wing Kan [2007] 3 HKC 368, 67 (CA) 274
Lee Wing Kan v. HKSAR FAMC 28/2007, 18 September 2007, CFAAC 274
Z v. HKSAR (2007) 10 HKCFAR 183 289
P v. Commissioner of ICAC (2007) 10 HKCFAR 293 285
HKSAR v. Ng Po On (2008) 11 HKCFAR 91 285, 286
Peter Gerardus van Weerdenburg v. HKSAR, unreported, FACC 9/2010, 27 July 2011 (CFA) 284
HKSAR v. Egan (2010) 13 HKCFAR 314 276
HKSAR v. Ying Jim Ming Jimmy, unreported, HCMA432/2009, 6 May 2010 (CFI) 275
HKSAR v. Tse Tat Fung, unreported, CACC 167/2008, 13 May 2010 (CA) 284
HKSAR v. Shum Chiu [2011] 2 HKLRD 746 (CA) 273
HKSAR v. Wong Hung Ki [2011] 1 HKLRD 183 (CA), FACC 9/2010, 27 July 2011 (CFA) 273, 275
Vivien Fan v. HKSAR, unreported, FACC 6/2010, 15 July 2011 (CFA) 277

Italy

- Cass. pen., sez., 25 March 1999, Di Pinto, *Cass pen*, 2000 110
 Cass. pen., sez., 5 September 2002, Rossi, *Riv pen*, 2003 110
 Cass. pen., sez. VI, sez. I, 27 October 2003, No. 4177, 2005 108
 Cass. pen., sez. VI, 4 May 2006, No. 33435, *Cass pen*, 2006 108
 Cass. pen., sez. VI, 15 May 2008, No. 34417, *Cass pen*, 2009 109
 C. App. Milano, 20 November 2008, No. 3359, *Guida dir*, 2009, 14 109
 Cass. pen., sez. VI, 15 July 2008, No. 46065, *CED Cass*, 2008 110
 Cass. pen., sez. VI, 14 May 2009, No. 30762, *Ced Cass*, 2009 109
 Cass. pen., sez. VI, 18 June 2010, No. 24656, *Guida dir*, 2010, 43 109
 Cass. pen., sez. VI, 18 June 2010, No. 24656, *Cass pen*, 2011 111
 Cass. pen., sez. VI, 2 March 2010, No. 20502, in *Ced Cass*, 2010 108
 Trib. Milano, Ufficio G.i.p., 27 April 2004, *Soc*, 2004 122
 Trib. Milano, Ufficio G.i.p., 20 September 2004, *Corr merito*, 2005 122

Switzerland

- Swiss Federal Court Decision, 1A.215/2004/col, 7 February 2005 300

United Kingdom

- Aberdeen Railway Co. v. Blaikie Brothers* (1854) 1 Macq 461 (HL Sc) 71
Salomon v. Salomon [1897] AC 22 30
Lennards' Carrying Co. Ltd v. Asiatic Petroleum Co. [1915] AC 502 148
Gilford Motor Company v. Horne [1933] Ch 935 30
R. v. Lindley [1957] CLR 321 37
R. v. Smith [1960] 2 QB 423 24, 37
R. v. Calland [1967] CLR 236 24, 37
R. v. Turner [1970] 2 QB 321 231, 247
Tesco Supermarkets Ltd v. Natrass [1972] AC 153 (HL) 31, 148, 222
Trendtex Trading Corp v. Central Bank of Nigeria [1977] QB 529 297
R. v. Grice (1978) 66 Cr App R 167 231
R. v. Wellburn [1979] 69 Cr App R 254 37
R. v. Wise [1979] RTR 57 231
Lonhro Ltd v. Shell Petroleum Co. Ltd [1980] 1 WLR 627 (HL) 30, 33
Adams v. Cape Industries [1990] Ch 433 30
R. v. Director of Serious Fraud Office, ex parte Smith [1993] AC 1 223
R. v. Scarlett [1993] 4 All ER 629 (CA) 22
R. v. Kearley (No. 2) [1994] 2 AC 414 244
R. v. Owino (1996) 2 Cr App R 128 (CA) 22
Brannigan v. Davison [1997] AC 238 240
A.P., M.P. and T.P. v. Switzerland (1998) 26 EHRR 541 245

TABLE OF CASES

xi

- R. v. Martin (David)* [2000] 2 Cr App R 42 (CA) 22
R (On the application of Abacha) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (No. 2) [2001] EWHC Admin 787 300
Attorney General's Reference (No. 1 of 2004) 1 WLR 2111 233
R. v. Silcock & Levin [2004] EWCA Crim 408, [2004] 2 Cr App R (S) 323 245
R. v. Simpson [2004] QB 118 233
R. v. Underwood [2004] EWCA Crim 2256 238
Kensington International v. Congo [2005] EWHC 2684 (Comm) 30
R. v. Goodyear (Karl) [2005] EWCA Crim 888 233, 247
Christian v. R. [2006] 2 AC 400 21
R. (On the Application of Director of Assets Recovery Agency) v. Cecilia Obialo [2006] EWHC 2876 244
R. v. Saik [2006] UKHL 18, [2007] 1 AC 18 25
McKinnon v. Government of the USA and another [2007] EWHC 762 (Admin) 247
McKinnon v. Government of the United States [2008] UKHL 59 247
R. (On the Application of Ahsan) v. Director of Public Prosecutions, Ahsan v. Government of the United States of America and another, Tajik v. Government of the United States of America and another [2008] EWHC 666 225
R. (On the Application of Corner House Research and Others) v. Director of the Serious Fraud Office [2008] EWHC 1354 (Admin), [2008] UKHL 60, [2009] 1 AC 756 227, 235
R. v. Tumukunde & Tobiasen, unreported, 2008 7, 260
R. v. Whittle [2008] EWCA Crim 2560 234, 235
R v. BAE Systems plc [2010] EW Misc 16 235, 236, 238, 239
R. v. Dougall [2010] EWCA Crim 1048 237
R. v. Innospec Ltd [2010] EW Misc 7, [2010] CLR 665 7, 204, 219, 223–5, 235, 237–42, 249, 265
R. v. Dougall [2011] 1 Cr App R (S) 37 7, 226
R. v. Mabey & Johnson Ltd [2011] UKSC 9 7, 205, 209, 248
R. v. Messent [2011] EWCA Crim 644 7, 226
R. v. Munir Patel, unreported, 18 November 2011 7, 261
R. v. St Regis Paper Co. Ltd [2011] EWCA Crim 2527 222
SOCA v. Agidi [2011] EWHC 175 (QB) 244
The Chief Officer, Customs and Excise, Immigration and Nationality Service v. Garnet Investments Ltd, Guernsey Court of Appeal (File No. 432), 6 July 2011 317, 318

United States

- United States v. Perrin*, 444 US 37 (1979) 43, 46
Dixon v. United States, 465 US 482, 496 (1984) 41, 61–2
United States v. Blondek, 741 F Supp 116, 119–20 (ND Tex. 1990) 42
Cooke v. Oolie, 1997 WL 367034 (Del.Ch., 23 June 1997) 78
Skilling v. United States, 561 US, 554 F 3d529 (2010) 44

EU cases

- Case C-11/00 *Commission v. European Central Bank* ECR [2003] I-7417 162
Case C-15/00 *Commission v. European Investment Bank* ECR [2003] I-7281 162
Case T-193/04 *Tillack v. Commission* ECR [2006] II-3995 188
Case C-303/05, *Advocaten voor de Wereld VZW v. Leden van de Ministerraad*, ECR [2007] I-3633 174
Case T-48/05 *Franchet and Byk v. Commission* ECR [2008] II-01585 188
Joined Cases F-5/05 and F-7/05, *Violetti and Schmit v. Commission*, ECR judgment, 28 April 2009, nyr 188
Case T-261/09P *Commission v. Violetti and Schmit*, judgment, 20 May 2010 188

TABLE OF STATUTES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS

France

Code de procédure pénale 325
 Code pénal 324

Italy

Codice dei contratti pubblici, d.lgs. No. 163, 2006 101
 D.lgs. No. 61, 11 April 2002 119
 D.lgs. No. 74, 10 March 2000 120
 D.lgs. No. 150, 27 October 2009 101
 Italian Charter of Sanctioning Responsibility of Legal Entities (Corporate and Unincorporated), d.lgs. No. 231/01 121, 122, 123
 Law No. 300, 29 September 2000 121
 Law No. 86, 1990 106, 113
 Law on Administrative Procedure, 7 August 1990 101
 Rocco Code 1930 100, 106–7

Hong Kong

Annotated Ordinances of Hong Kong (Cap. 32), Companies Ordinance 78
 Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China, adopted 4 July 1990, entered into force 1 July 1997 88
 Hong Kong Bill of Rights Ordinance (Cap. 383) 270–1, 287–8
 Independent Commission Against Corruption Ordinance (Cap. 204), originally Ord. 7 of 1974, in force 15 February 1974 70, 267–8
 Independent Police Complaints Council Ordinance (Cap. 604), entered into force 1 June 2009 279
 Interception of Communications Ordinance (Cap. 532), originally Ord. 109 of 1997 271
 Interception of Communications and Surveillance Ordinance (Cap. 589), originally Ord. 20 of 2006 (ICSO) 271
 Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap. 201), originally Ord. 102 of 1970, entered into force 14 May 1971 70, 267

xiv TABLE OF STATUTES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS

Saudi Arabia

Foreign Investment Act 2000 20

United Kingdom

Anti-terrorism, Crime and Security Act 2001 6, 26, 32, 148–9
 Asylum and Immigration Act 1996 198
 Bribery Act 2010 1–9, 13–38, 40, 46–9, 55, 58, 67, 77, 128–59, 196–218, 219,
 223–7, 242, 251, 261–2, 267, 292, 293
 Companies Act 1985 206, 236–7
 Companies Act 2006 72, 78
 Corporate Manslaughter and Corporate Homicide Act 2007 28, 202
 Criminal Jurisdiction Act 1802 3
 Criminal Justice Act 1987 221, 254–5
 Criminal Justice Act 1993 33
 Criminal Justice Act 2003 29, 220, 232, 234, 245
 Criminal Justice and Public Order Act 1994 232–3
 Criminal Justice and Terrorism Act 1998 33
 Criminal Justice (International Co-operation) Act 1990 (Enforcement of Overseas
 Forfeiture Orders) (Scotland) Order 2005 252
 Criminal Law Act 1977 25, 309
 Criminal Procedure and Investigations Act 1996 232
 Criminal Procedure Rules 2011 (SI 2011 No. 1709) 221, 229–30
 Export Control Act 2002 209–12
 Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 207
 Fraud Act 2006 207–8, 253, 265
 Health and Safety at Work Act 1974 202
 Immigration, Asylum and Nationality Act 2006 198
 Insolvency Act 1986 207
 Intelligence Services Act 1994 35–6
 Magistrates' Court Act 1980 232
 Parliamentary Standards Act 2009 208, 215
 Police and Criminal Evidence Act 1984 255
 Prevention of Corruption Act 1906 13, 47, 223
 Prevention of Corruption Act 1916 13, 47, 76
 Proceeds of Crime Act 2002 243–6, 261, 309
 Proceeds of Crime Act 2002 (External Requests and Orders) Order 2005 252
 Prosecution of Offences Act 1985 223
 Public Bodies Corrupt Practices Act 1889 47
 Public Interest Disclosure Act 1998 155–6
 Regulatory Enforcement and Sanctions Act 2008 203
 Serious Crime Act 2007 207, 254

TABLE OF STATUTES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS XV

Serious Organised Crime and Police Act 2005	247, 289
Sexual Offences Act 2003	4
State Immunity Act 1978	297
Theft Act 1968	253

United States

18 USC § 201 (1962)	40–1
18 USC § 1954 (1971)	45
18 USC § 666 (1984)	41
18 USC § 224 (2008)	45
27 USC § 205(c) (2009)	45
29 USC § 186 (1947)	45
49 USC § 11907 (2000)	45
Anti-Kickback Act 41 USC §§ 51–58 (1986)	43
Anti-Racketeering Act 1934	41
Bank loans, 18 USC §§ 212–14 (2005)	45
Dodd–Frank Wall Street Reform and Consumer Protection Act, Pub. L. No. 111-203, § 922 (2010), to be codified at 15 USC 78a <i>et seq.</i>	74
Foreign Corrupt Practices Act 15 USC §§ 78m, 78dd and 78ff (1977)	6, 32, 41–3, 60–2, 140–2, 208–9
Hobbs Act, 18 USC § 1951 (1946)	41–4, 62
Honest Service, 18 USC § 1346 (2000)	44
International Anti-Bribery Act 1998	42
Mail Fraud, 18 USC § 1341 (2000)	44
Model Penal Code § 240.1	45
NY Penal Law, §§ 180.00, 180.05	46
Omnibus Trade and Competitiveness Act (OTCA) 1988	141–2
Racketeering Influenced and Corrupt Organizations Act (RICO), 18 USC § 1962 <i>et seq.</i> (1970)	44–5
Texas Penal Code § 32.43	45
Travel Act 18 USC § 1952 (1961)	43
Wire Fraud, 18 USC § 1343 (2000)	44

EU legislation

Commission Decision OJ 1999 No. L136, 31 May 1999	162–3
Convention OJ 1995 No. C316, 27 November 1995	163
Convention OJ 1997 No. C195, 25 June 1997	171–3
Council Decision OJ 2006 No. L354, 14 December 2006	177
Council Decision OJ 2008 No. L287/1, 29 October 2008	192
Council Directive OJ 1991 No. L166, 28 June 1991	167
Council Framework Decision 2002/584 OJ 2002 No. L190, 18 July 2002	174

xvi TABLE OF STATUTES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS

Council Framework Decision 2003/568 OJ 2003 No. L192, 31 July 2003	165–7
Council Regulation (Euratom, EC) No. 2185/96, 1996	162
Council Regulation OJ 1996 No. L292, 15 November 1996	162
Directive 2001/97 OJ 2001 No. L344, 28 December 2001	168
Directive 2004/18 OJ 2004 No. L134, 30 April 2004	169–70, 264
Directive 2005/60 OJ 2005 No. L309, 25 November 2005	168
Directive 2011/36/EU, OJ 2011 No. L101, 15 April 2011	186
Joint Action 98/742 OJ 1998 No. L358, 31 December 1998	165
Protocol OJ 1996 No. C13, 23 October 1996	163
Regulation (EC) No. 1073 OJ 1999 No. L136, 31 May 1999	162–3
Report OJ 1998 No. C991, 15 December 1998	172
Second Protocol OJ 1997 No. C221, 19 July 1997	164

International instruments

African Union Convention of Preventing and Combating Corruption 2003 (AU Convention) 2003	143, 182
Council of Europe Civil Law Convention on Corruption (COE Civil Law Convention), Strasbourg, 4 November 1999, STE No. 174	143
Council of Europe Criminal Law Convention on Corruption (COE Criminal Convention), Strasbourg, 27 January 1999, STE No. 173	252
Intergovernmental Working Group on the Problem of Corrupt Practices, UNGA Resolution No. 3514 (XXX), 15 December 1975	298
International Legal Instrument Against Corruption, UNGA Resolution No. 55/61, 4 December 2000	298
Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), Convention on the Bribery of Foreign Public Officials in International Business Transactions (1999)	7–8, 26, 35, 69, 121, 140–1, 148, 168, 172, 226, 242, 251
Organisation of American States Inter-American Convention against Corruption (OAS Convention) 1996	143
Resolution on the role of the UNCAC Implementation Working Group (IWG), COPC Resolution 4/4 on International Cooperation in Asset Recovery CAC/COSP/2011/ L.5/Rev.2	294–5
United Nations Convention against Corruption (UNCAC) (2005)	69, 142–3, 150, 252, 293–327
UN Convention against Transnational Organised Crime 2003 (the Palermo Convention, or UNTOC)	298