

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations

Edited by David Cunniff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO

DESCARTES' *MEDITATIONS*

Descartes' enormously influential *Meditations* seeks to prove a number of theses: that God is a necessary existent; that our minds are equipped to track truth and avoid error; that the external world exists and provides us with information to preserve our embodiment; and that minds are immaterial substances. The work is a treasure-trove of views and arguments, but there are controversies about the details of the arguments and about how we are supposed to unpack the views themselves. This *Companion* offers a rich collection of new perspectives on the *Meditations*, showing how the work is structured literally as a meditation and how it fits into Descartes' larger philosophical system. Topics include Descartes' views on philosophical method, knowledge, skepticism, God, the nature of mind, free will, and the differences between reflective and embodied life. The volume will be valuable to those studying Descartes and early modern philosophy more generally.

DAVID CUNNING is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Iowa. He is the author of *Argument and Persuasion in Descartes' Meditations* (2010) and *Cavendish* (forthcoming).

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations
Edited by David Cunniff
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations

Edited by David Cunniff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF
CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS

ABELARD *Edited by* JEFFREY E. BROWER *and*

KEVIN GUILFOY

ADORNO *Edited by* THOMAS HUHN

ANCIENT SCEPTICISM *Edited by* RICHARD BETT

ANSELM *Edited by* BRIAN DAVIES *and* BRIAN LEFTOW

AQUINAS *Edited by* NORMAN KRETZMANN *and*

ELEONORE STUMP

ARABIC PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* PETER ADAMSON
and RICHARD C. TAYLOR

HANNAH ARENDT *Edited by* DANA VILLA

ARISTOTLE *Edited by* JONATHAN BARNES

ARISTOTLE'S POLITICS *Edited by*

MARGUERITE DESLAURIERS *and* PIERRE DESTREE

ATHEISM *Edited by* MICHAEL MARTIN

AUGUSTINE *Edited by* ELEONORE STUMP *and*

NORMAN KRETZMANN

BACON *Edited by* MARKKU PELTONEN

BERKELEY *Edited by* KENNETH P. WINKLER

BOETHIUS *Edited by* JOHN MARENBO

BRENTANO *Edited by* DALE JACQUETTE

CARNAP *Edited by* MICHAEL FRIEDMAN *and*

RICHARD CREATH

CONSTANT *Edited by* HELENA ROSENBLATT

CRITICAL THEORY *Edited by* FRED RUSH

DARWIN 2nd Edition *Edited by* JONATHAN HODGE *and*

GREGORY RADICK

SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR *Edited by* CLAUDIA CARD

DELEUZE *Edited by* DANIEL W. SMITH *and*

HENRY SOMERS-HALL

DESCARTES *Edited by* JOHN COTTINGHAM

DESCARTES' MEDITATIONS *Edited by* DAVID CUNNING

DEWEY *Edited by* MOLLY COCHRAN

DUNS SCOTUS *Edited by* THOMAS WILLIAMS

EARLY GREEK PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* A. A. LONG

EARLY MODERN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by*

DONALD RUTHERFORD

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations

Edited by David Cunniff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

EPICUREANISM *Edited by* JAMES WARREN
 EXISTENTIALISM *Edited by* STEVEN CROWELL
 FEMINISM IN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by*
 MIRANDA FRICKER *and* JENNIFER HORNSBY
 FOUCAULT 2nd Edition *Edited by* GARY GUTTING
 FREGE *Edited by* TOM RICKETTS *and* MICHAEL POTTER
 FREUD *Edited by* JEROME NEU
 GADAMER *Edited by* ROBERT J. DOSTAL
 GALEN *Edited by* R. J. HANKINSON
 GALILEO *Edited by* PETER MACHAMER
 GERMAN IDEALISM *Edited by* KARL AMERIKS
 GREEK AND ROMAN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by*
 DAVID SEDLEY
 HABERMAS *Edited by* STEPHEN K. WHITE
 HAYEK *Edited by* EDWARD FESER
 HEGEL *Edited by* FREDERICK C. BEISER
 HEGEL AND NINETEENTH-CENTURY
 PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* FREDERICK C. BEISER
 HEIDEGGER 2nd Edition *Edited by* CHARLES GUIGNON
 HOBBS *Edited by* TOM SORELL
 HOBBS'S *LEVIATHAN* *Edited by*
 PATRICIA SPRINGBORG
 HUME 2nd Edition *Edited by* DAVID FATE NORTON *and*
 JACQUELINE TAYLOR
 HUSSERL *Edited by* BARRY SMITH *and* DAVID
 WOODRUFF SMITH
 WILLIAM JAMES *Edited by* RUTH ANNA PUTNAM
 KANT *Edited by* PAUL GUYER
 KANT AND MODERN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by*
 PAUL GUYER
 KANT'S *CRITIQUE OF PURE REASON* *Edited by*
 PAUL GUYER
 KEYNES *Edited by* ROGER E. BACKHOUSE *and* BRADLEY
 W. BATEMAN
 KIERKEGAARD *Edited by* ALASTAIR HANNAY *and*
 GORDON DANIEL MARINO
 LEIBNIZ *Edited by* NICHOLAS JOLLEY
 LEVINAS *Edited by* SIMON CRITCHLEY *and*
 ROBERT BERNASCONI

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations

Edited by David Cunning

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

- LOCKE *Edited by* VERE CHAPPELL
 LOCKE'S *ESSAY CONCERNING HUMAN*
UNDERSTANDING *Edited by* LEX NEWMAN
 LOGICAL EMPIRICISM *Edited by* ALAN RICHARDSON
and THOMAS UEBEL
 MAIMONIDES *Edited by* KENNETH SEESKIN
 MALEBRANCHE *Edited by* STEVEN NADLER
 MARX *Edited by* TERRELL CARVER
 MEDIEVAL JEWISH PHILOSOPHY *Edited by*
 DANIEL H. FRANK *and* OLIVER LEAMAN
 MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* A. S. MCGRADIE
 MERLEAU-PONTY *Edited by* TAYLOR CARMAN *and*
 MARK B. N. HANSEN
 MILL *Edited by* JOHN SKORUPSKI
 MONTAIGNE *Edited by* ULLRICH LANGER
 NEWTON *Edited by* I. BERNARD COHEN *and*
 GEORGE E. SMITH
 NIETZSCHE *Edited by* BERND MAGNUS *and*
 KATHLEEN HIGGINS
 NOZICK'S *ANARCHY, STATE AND UTOPIA*
Edited by RALF BADER *and* JOHN MEADOWCROFT
 OAKESHOTT *Edited by* EFRAIM PODOKSIK
 OCKHAM *Edited by* PAUL VINCENT SPADE
 THE *ORIGIN OF SPECIES* *Edited by* MICHAEL RUSE
 AND ROBERT J. RICHARDS
 PASCAL *Edited by* NICHOLAS HAMMOND
 PEIRCE *Edited by* CHERYL MISAK
 PHILO *Edited by* ADAM KAMESAR
 THE PHILOSOPHY OF BIOLOGY *Edited by* DAVID
 L. HULL *and* MICHAEL RUSE
 PIAGET *Edited by* ULRICH MÜLLER, JEREMY
 I. M. CARPENDALE *and* LESLIE SMITH
 PLATO *Edited by* RICHARD KRAUT
 PLATO'S *REPUBLIC* *Edited by* G. R. F. FERRARI
 PLOTINUS *Edited by* LLOYD P. GERSON
 PRAGMATISM *Edited by* ALAN MALACHOWSKI
 QUINE *Edited by* ROGER F. GIBSON JR.
 RAWLS *Edited by* SAMUEL FREEMAN

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations
Edited by David Cunniff
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

RENAISSANCE PHILOSOPHY *Edited by*
JAMES HANKINS
THOMAS REID *Edited by* TERENCE CUNEO *and*
RENÉ VAN WOUDEBERG
ROUSSEAU *Edited by* PATRICK RILEY
BERTRAND RUSSELL *Edited by* NICHOLAS GRIFFIN
SARTRE *Edited by* CHRISTINA HOWELLS
SCHOPENHAUER *Edited by* CHRISTOPHER JANAWAY
THE SCOTTISH ENLIGHTENMENT *Edited by*
ALEXANDER BROADIE
ADAM SMITH *Edited by* KNUD HAAKONSSON
SOCRATES *Edited by* DONALD MORRISON
SPINOZA *Edited by* DON GARRETT
SPINOZA'S *ETHICS* *Edited by* OLLI KOISTINEN
THE STOICS *Edited by* BRAD INWOOD
LEO STRAUSS *Edited by* STEVEN B. SMITH
TOCQUEVILLE *Edited by* CHERYL B. WELCH
UTILITARIANISM *Edited by* BEN EGGLESTON *and*
DALE MILLER
VIRTUE ETHICS *Edited by* DANIEL C. RUSSELL
WITTGENSTEIN *Edited by* HANS SLUGA *and*
DAVID STERN

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations

Edited by David Cunning

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Cambridge Companion to
DESCARTES'
MEDITATIONS

Edited by David Cunning

University of Iowa



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations
Edited by David Cunning
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107630482

© Cambridge University Press, 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The Cambridge companion to Descartes' Meditations / edited by David Cunning, University of Iowa.

pages cm. – (Cambridge companions to philosophy)

ISBN 978-1-107-01860-0 (hardback)

1. Descartes, René, 1596–1650. Meditationes de prima philosophia.

2. Methodology. 3. First philosophy. 4. God – Proof, Ontological. I. Cunning, David.

BI854.C35 2014

194–dc23

2013028934

ISBN 978-1-107-01860-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-63048-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations

Edited by David Cunniff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

In memory of
Annette Baier (1929–2012)
and
Paul Hoffman (1952–2010)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations
Edited by David Cunniff
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CONTENTS

	<i>List of contributors</i>	<i>page</i> xiii
	<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xvii
	<i>Abbreviations and translations</i>	xviii
	Introduction	
	DAVID CUNNING	I
1	The methodology of the <i>Meditations</i> : tradition and innovation	
	CHRISTIA MERCER	23
2	The First Meditation: skeptical doubt and certainty	
	CHARLES LARMORE	48
3	The First Meditation: divine omnipotence, necessary truths, and the possibility of radical deception	
	DAVID CUNNING	68
4	The Second Meditation and the nature of the human mind	
	LILLI ALANEN	88
5	The Second Meditation: unimaginable bodies and insensible minds	
	KATHERINE J. MORRIS	107
6	The Third Meditation: causal arguments for God's existence	
	LAWRENCE NOLAN	127

xii	Contents	
7	The Third Meditation on objective being: representation and intentional content AMY SCHMITTER	149
8	The Fourth Meditation: Descartes' theodicy <i>avant la lettre</i> THOMAS M. LENNON	168
9	The Fourth Meditation: Descartes and libertarian freedom CECILIA WEE	186
10	The Fifth Meditation: Descartes' doctrine of true and immutable natures TAD M. SCHMALTZ	205
11	The Fifth Meditation: externality and true and immutable natures OLLI KOISTINEN	223
12	The Sixth Meditation: Descartes and the embodied self DEBORAH BROWN	240
13	Sensory perception of bodies: Meditation 6.5 ALISON SIMMONS	258
14	Descartes' dualism and its relation to Spinoza's metaphysics ALAN NELSON	277
15	The <i>Meditations</i> and Descartes' considered conception of God ANNETTE BAIER	299
	<i>Bibliography</i>	306
	<i>Index</i>	319

CONTRIBUTORS

LILLI ALANEN is Professor Emerita of Philosophy at the University of Uppsala. She specializes in the history of modern philosophy with a focus on epistemology, metaphysics, philosophy of mind, and moral psychology. In addition to numerous articles, she is the author of *Descartes's Concept of Mind* (Harvard, 2003) and is the co-editor of *Feminist Reflections on the History of Philosophy* (Kluwer, 2004).

ANNETTE BAIER (1929–2012) was Professor Emerita of Philosophy at the University of Pittsburgh. She wrote seven books, including *Postures of the Mind* (University of Minnesota Press, 1985), *A Progress of Sentiments: Reflections on Hume's Treatise* (Harvard, 1991), and *Reflections on How We Live* (Oxford, 2008). Her interests were extremely wide-ranging and included moral philosophy, feminism, and philosophy of mind. She also served as President of the Eastern Division of the American Philosophical Association.

DEBORAH BROWN is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Queensland. Her primary research interests are in early modern philosophy, metaphysics, and philosophy of mind. In addition to numerous articles, she is the author of *Descartes and the Passionate Mind* (Cambridge, 2006).

DAVID CUNNING is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Iowa. His research focuses on early modern philosophy and in particular on metaphysics, epistemology, the history of conceptions of mind and body, and the pedagogical methods of rationalism. He is the author of *Argument and Persuasion in Descartes' Meditations* (Oxford, 2010).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations

Edited by David Cunning

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv List of contributors

OLLI KOISTINEN is Professor of Theoretical Philosophy at the University of Turku. His primary interests are in early modern philosophy, metaphysics, and philosophy of action. He is editor of *The Cambridge Companion to Spinoza's Ethics* (Cambridge, 2009), co-editor of *Spinoza: Metaphysical Themes* (Oxford, 2002), and author of *Action and Agent* (Acta Philosophica Fennica, 2001).

CHARLES LARMORE is the W. Duncan MacMillan Family Professor in the Humanities at Brown University. He has published on such topics as the foundations of political liberalism, the nature of the self, and the nature of moral judgment, and he has also written extensively on issues in seventeenth-century philosophy and on German Idealism. He is the co-author of two books and the sole author of eight, including *Patterns of Moral Complexity* (Cambridge, 1987), *Les pratiques du moi* (PUF, 2004), *The Autonomy of Morality* (Cambridge, 2008), and *Vernunft und Subjektivität* (Suhrkamp, 2012).

THOMAS M. LENNON is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy at the University of Western Ontario. His books include *The Plain Truth: Descartes, Huet, and Skepticism* (Brill, 2008), *Reading Bayle* (Toronto, 1999), and *The Battle of the Gods and Giants: The Legacies of Descartes and Gassendi, 1655–1715* (Princeton, 1993). He has published extensively on the views and arguments of the philosophers of the early modern period and on the context and climate in which those views and arguments appear.

CHRISTIA MERCER is Gustave M. Berne Professor of Philosophy at Columbia University. Her primary research area is history of modern philosophy, with a special focus on early modern Platonism, history of science, metaphysics, and philosophical method. In addition to many articles, she is the author of *Leibniz's Metaphysics: Its Origin and Development* (Cambridge, 2001) and co-editor of *Early Modern Philosophy: Mind, Matter, and Mechanism* (Cambridge, 2005). She is the North American Editor of *Archiv für Geschichte der Philosophie* and general editor of the book series, *Oxford Philosophical Concepts*.

KATHERINE J. MORRIS is Fellow in Philosophy at Mansfield College, Oxford University. She has published numerous articles on Descartes, Sartre, Merleau-Ponty, and Wittgenstein, and is the co-author of

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations

Edited by David Cunning

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of contributors

xv

Descartes' Dualism (Routledge, 2002) and the author of *Sartre* (Blackwell, 2008) and *Starting with Merleau-Ponty* (Continuum 2012). She is also the editor of *Sartre on the Body* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2010).

ALAN NELSON is Professor of Philosophy at the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill. His publications focus on early modern philosophers and especially on Descartes.

LAWRENCE NOLAN is Professor of Philosophy at California State University, Long Beach. His research emphases are early modern philosophy, metaphysics, and philosophy of religion. In addition to authoring numerous articles, he is the editor of *Primary and Secondary Qualities: The Historical and Ongoing Debate* (Oxford, 2011) and *The Cambridge Descartes Lexicon* (Cambridge, forthcoming).

TAD M. SCHMALTZ is Professor of Philosophy and James B. and Grace J. Nelson Fellow at the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor. He has published on various topics in early modern philosophy. His books include *Descartes on Causation* (Oxford, 2008), *Radical Cartesianism: The French Reception of Descartes* (Cambridge, 2002), and *Malebranche's Theory of the Soul: A Cartesian Interpretation* (Oxford, 1996). He is also the editor of *Receptions of Descartes* (Routledge, 2005), and co-editor of the *Historical Dictionary of Descartes and Cartesian Philosophy* (Scarecrow, 2003) and *Integrating History and Philosophy of Science* (Springer, 2011).

AMY SCHMITTER is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Alberta. Her primary research interests include history of early modern philosophy, philosophy of art, history of the emotions, and feminist approaches to the history of philosophy.

ALISON SIMMONS is Samuel H. Wolcott Professor of Philosophy at Harvard University. Her research is focused on early modern philosophy, and in particular conceptions of mind and the human being. She also has interests in medieval philosophy and philosophy of psychology. She has published numerous articles and is the editor of the forthcoming volume on consciousness as part of the series Oxford Philosophical Concepts.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01860-0 - The Cambridge Companion to Descartes' Meditations

Edited by David Cunning

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xvi List of contributors

CECILIA WEE is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the National University of Singapore. Her research interests are in early modern philosophy, with an emphasis on Descartes, and also classical Confucianism and environmental ethics. In addition to her many articles she is the author of *Material Falsity and Error in Descartes' Meditations* (Routledge, 2006).

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to Annette Baier, Lilli Alanen, Deborah Brown, Olli Koistinen, Charles Larmore, Tom Lennon, Christia Mercer, Katherine Morris, Alan Nelson, Lawrence Nolan, Tad Schmaltz, Amy Schmitter, Alison Simmons, and Cecilia Wee. I am grateful to each of them for all their hard work in generating papers for this volume and for coming up with such interesting interpretations and arguments.

I would like to thank Andrew Dyck, Hilary Gaskin, and Anna Lowe for their generous editorial assistance. I am also grateful to two of my graduate students, Seth Jones and Kristopher Phillips, for reading drafts of specific papers and providing very helpful feedback.

I would like to thank Naomi Greyser and Mira Grey Cuning, and also my dad, Robert Cuning. Naomi and Mira were supportive at every step of this project, and Naomi's editorial suggestions were, as always, exemplary. I have been very lucky to be able to discuss important philosophical issues with Robert in recent years. It has been an honor to share ideas with him.

And I would like to make a very personal expression of gratitude to the late Paul Hoffman for all of his help and support when I was a student in the 1990s. Paul made time. As a faculty member myself now, I have a better sense of what this involved, and to be honest I don't quite know how he did it. He made time to meet for Latin translation, to read drafts of papers, to give comments, and to talk things through, all the while being a first-rate historian and philosopher and a committed human being. He serves as an inspiration and a model.

ABBREVIATIONS AND TRANSLATIONS

Unless otherwise indicated, the chapters in this volume use the translations from volumes I and II of *The Philosophical Writings of Descartes*, edited by John Cottingham, Robert Stoothoff, and Dugald Murdoch, and *The Philosophical Writings of Descartes, Volume III: The Correspondence*, edited by Cottingham, Stoothoff, Murdoch, and Anthony Kenny. All three volumes are published by Cambridge University Press (1985, 1984, and 1991). These volumes are referred to as 'CSM 1', 'CSM 2', and 'CSMK', respectively.

References to Descartes' writings in their original language are from *Oeuvres de Descartes*, Volumes I-XI, ed. Charles Adam and Paul Tannery, Paris: Librairie Philosophique J. Vrin (1996). These are abbreviated 'AT', followed by the volume number and page.

The following abbreviations are used for titles of Descartes' works.

<i>Meditations</i>	<i>Meditations on First Philosophy</i>
<i>First (or Second...) Replies</i>	<i>First (or Second...) Set of Replies</i>
"Synopsis of the <i>Meditations</i> "	"Synopsis of the following six <i>Meditations</i> "
<i>Principles</i>	<i>Principles of Philosophy</i>
<i>Passions</i>	<i>The Passions of the Soul</i>
<i>Discourse</i>	<i>Discourse on the Method of Rightly Conducting one's Reason and Seeking the Truth in the Sciences</i>