

More Information

Index

abortion, 95 criminal process response to, 126 and protection of morals and society, death of patients and, 69 DPP's prosecution policy on, 127 105 and protection of women, 101 medical manslaughter and, 69 criminal law and, 96, 195 mitigating motive in, 127 debates on, 95 motives in, 126, 128 decriminalisation of, 109 relatives in, 148 early medical, 100, 104 Attard, Gracie. See Attard, Jodie historical prohibitions on, 102 Attard, Jodie, 164, 167, 168, 172, 177, in Canada, 96, 109 228 in England, 114 Attard, Mary, 70, 164, 168, 172, 174, 176, in UK, 96 late-term, 100 Attard, Rosie. See Attard, Mary legal moralism and, 189 attempted murder, 128 autonomy, 42, 237. See also beneficence; mental health and, 104 proper medical treatment and, 99 justice; nonmaleficence; patient protection of future children and, 106 autonomy sanctity of life and, 84, 118 bioethics and, 219, 222 therapeutic, 102 body and, 38-9 Abortion Act 1967, 30, 99, 116, 194 criminal law and, 40, 239 Abortion Law Reform Association, 27, criminalisation principle and, 224 29 death and, 68 actus reus, 134, 135, 150 definitions of, 237 Adams, John Bodkin, 3, 30, 33-4, 138 medicalisation and, 47 alcohol consumption, 107 negative autonomy, 153 Alder Hey Children's Hospital, 55 of pregnant women, 115 amputation, 43 positive, 153 analgesics, 145 principled, 238 Anatomy Act 1832, 24, 38, 57 responsibility and, 205 anatomy theatres, 3, 21 avoidance of harm principle, 226 Anderson, Joel, 193 Anderson, Robert, 55 Barber-Surgeons Company, 17 apothecaries Barilan, Y. Michael, 208 practice before 1858, 16, 17 barristers, 214, 215 appropriate consent, 57 battery, 43 Beauchamp, Thomas, 195, 196, 197, 198, Arthur, Leonard, 33 Ashcroft, Richard, 183 219, 221, 224, 231, 245 Ashworth, Andrew, 1, 76, 234, 246, 261 Beck, Ulrich, 11, 262 assisted suicide. See also death of patient; Bedford, Sybille, 30, 138 euthanasia; killing Beggars' Opera, The (Gay), 18 benign conspiracy, 148 beneficence, 230. See also autonomy; character responsibility in, 128 justice; nonmaleficence

284



Index 285

bioethics and, 219 Callahan, Daniel, 196 body integrity identity disorder and, 231 Canada, decriminalisation of abortion in, criminal law and, 233 euthanasia and, 232 Canadian Charter of Rights, 109 justice and, 233 canon law, 16 moral duty of, 231 capacity responsibility, 206 nonmaleficence and, 231 case law, 2 respect for persons and, 231 case presentations, 214 rule of law and, 248 causation, 135 benign conspiracy, 148 causes célèbres, 25 Adams Bodkin, 30 Bentham, Jeremy, 187 bioethics, 183 Arthur, Leonard, 33 acceptance of, 196 Bourne, Aleck, 26 criminal law and, 4, 10, 185, 250, 256 Censors, 17, 18, 19 criminal process and, 256 Chambers, Tod, 214 criminalisation principle and, 252 character responsibility, 128 doctrine of double effect and, 145 Charon, Rita, 210, 222 emergence of, 184 Cherish Life, 101 Childress, James, 195, 196, 197, 198, 219, interpretative construction in, 213 liberalism and, 11, 182, 252 221, 224, 231, 245 Christman, John, 192 medical ethics and, 183 circumcision, 49, 51 medicine and, 10 moral philosophy and, 181, 186 Clouser, K. Danner, 221, 222, 245 principlism in, 219 Code of Hammurabi, 16 responsibility in, 199 Coffe, Linda, 95 shift from medical ethics to, 183 Coggon, John, 42, 122, 192, 205, 253 uncertainty and, 251 College of Physicians, 18, 21, 22 Commission on Assisted Dying, 67, 88, bioethics mediation, 258 Bland, Tony, 70, 152, 154, 176, 257 162, 259 common morality, 195 body, 38 autonomy and, 38-9 communicable diseases, threat of, 199 integrity, 42 concoctions, 102 medical assaults on, 40 conflict of duty, 167 ownership of, 52 Congenital Disabilities (Civil Liability) Act patient autonomy and, 41 1976, 108 proper medical treatment or care for, 45 conjoined twins self and, 38-9 stillborn or tumour, 174 self-determination and, 42 designated for death, 168 body integrity identity disorder (BIID), conjoined twins, separation of, 163 231, 253 conflict of duty and, 167 body parts criminal law and, 2 organ trafficking in, 61 criminal process and, 165 ownership of, 52 doctrine of double effect and, 169 retention of, 55 Gracie and Rosie Attard, 164 sale of, 39, 53 immunity and, 169 body snatching, 23 legal defence of necessity and, 166 Bourne, Aleck, 3, 26, 70, 95, 99, 257 monstrous birth in, 172 Brady, Ian, 41 narrative framework for, 210 Brave New World, 8 rejected defences and, 169 Bridgeman, Jo, 157 self-defence and, 166 Bristol Royal Infirmary, 183 very unique case and, 168 British Medical Journal, 28 withdrawal of life support and, 176 British Pregnancy Advisory Service, 104 contraception, 84 Brookes, Barbara, 28 cosmetic surgery, 48 Byrne, Charles, 23 Cox, Nigel, 1, 70, 79, 140



criminal law, 2. See also rule of law	responsibility for medical error in, 75
abortion and, 96	sanctity of life and, 67, 83
and withdrawal of life-sustaining	serious but not wrong, 82
treatment, 152	serious medical errors and, 72
as moral and retributive system, 188	serious wrongs and, 71
autonomy and, 239	defendant, 215
beneficence and, 233	Dellapenna, Joseph, 28, 106
bioethics and, 10, 250, 256	deontology, 187
certainty and, 251	depression, abortion and, 104
charades and prosceniums in, 159	Devlin, Lord, 189, 226
defensive model of, 223	diamorphine, 76, 141
deontology and, 187	Dignitas, 8, 150, 151
doctrine of double effect and, 137, 145	dignity, 222
legal moralism and, 189	dihydrocodeine, 34, 35
liberalism and, 11, 182, 252	Director of Public Prosecutions (DPP), 7,
medical deaths and, 66	8, 69, 88, 130, 149, 151, 161
medical exemption in, 261	disgust test, 190
medicine and, 10	dissection
moral philosophy and, 183	anatomy theatres and, 21
morality and, 191	body snatching and, 23
natural law and, 187	burial and, 22
patient autonomy and, 40	crime and, 21
political liberalism and, 193	history of, 20
response to medical problems, 1	no property rule, 24
responsibility in, 199	of convicted criminals, 22
role in medicine and bioethics, 4	doctors
utilitarianism and, 187	criminal law and, 5
criminal process, 3, 255	moral responsibility of, 207
before 1858, 16	practise before 1858, 16
bioethics and, 256	responsibilities of, 205
conjoined twins and, 165	doctor's defence, 137
medicalisation and, 260-3	doctrine of double effect (DDE), 135, 169
pervasive influence of, 4	bioethics and, 145
criminal responsibility, 125	criminal law and, 137, 145
criminalisation, principles of, 223, 252	doctor's defence and, 137
nonmaleficence and, 224	ending of life and, 135, 145
Crown Prosecution Service (CPS), 7, 69,	palliative care and, 145
73, 74, 149, 161, 215	Donne, John, 90
culpability, 229	Dorries, Nadine, 30, 103
culture, 259	
culture, 239	Down's Children Association, 33
Dan Cahan Main 220	Down's syndrome, 33, 34
Dan-Cohen, Meir, 229	Draper, Heather, 205
De Human Corporis Fabrica (Vesalius), 21	Duff, R. Anthony, 134, 192, 197
death of patient, 66. See also assisted	Dworkin, Ronald, 89, 90, 91, 121, 190,
suicide; euthanasia	211
assisted suicide and, 69	
autonomy and, 68	early medical abortion (EMA), 100, 104
criminal law and, 66	Easing the Passing, 30
criminal liability for negligence in, 70	Edinburgh Guild of Surgeons, 22
gross negligence in, 77	ending of life. See also assisted suicide;
harm short of, 80	euthanasia; killing; medical
medical manslaughter and, 69, 72, 77	manslaughter
medical practice and, 66	causation, 135
moral luck and game of chance in, 79	with compassion, 126
recklessness in, 77	criminal responsibility for, 125



doctrine of double effect and, 135, 145	Goff, Lord, 185, 261
intention in, 133	Goodin, Robert, 191
motivation for, 125	Gray, David, 76
England, abortion laws in, 114	Griffiths, Danielle, 74, 81
Erin, Charles, 222	gross negligence, 77
European Convention on Human Rights,	criminal liability for, 70
64, 80, 251 Furanean Court of Human Bights 80, 107	informed consent and, 43
European Court of Human Rights, 80, 107	gross negligence manslaughter, 71, 79
Euth Society of America, 173	horm 103
euthanasia. See also assisted suicide; ending	harm, 193
of life; killing; voluntary active	ambiguity in concept of, 225
euthanasia (VAE)	criminal law and, 226
beneficence and, 232	direct, 225
criminal law and, 84	in nonnormative sense, 224
criminal process's response to, 126 Glanville Williams on, 84	in normative sense, 224 risk of, 229
inviolability of life and, 85	short of death, 80
involuntary, 84	to patients, 80
John Keown on, 85	harm principle, 224 criminalisation principle and, 224
legal moralism and, 189 of disabled children, 173	
	culpability and responsibility, 229
sanctity of life and, 84 those who end life in, 88	medical practice and, 227 Health and Safety at Work Act 1974,
	72
voluntary active, 146, 148, 153, 225	herbs, 102
family law, 2	heroin, 131, 138
Feinberg, Joel, 224, 227, 228	Hippocratic Oath, 231
Fellowship of Surgeons, 17	Hobbes, Thomas, 166
female circumcision, 49, 197	homosexuality, criminal law on, 182
Female Genital Mutilation Act 2003, 49	Hope, Lord, 108
Ferner, Robin, 73, 74	Horder, Jeremy, 127
fetal alcohol syndrome, 107	Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act
feticide, unintentional, 106	1990, 6, 192
fetus. See also abortion	Human Fertilisation and Embryology
in utero injuries to, 107	Authority, 200
legal personality of, 97, 115	Human Organs Transplant Act 1989, 54,
legal status of, 95	61
maternal autonomy and, 115	Human Tissue Act 1961, 25, 55, 60
moral status of, 115	Human Tissue Act 2004, 6, 53, 56, 57, 61,
unintentional homicide of, 106	63
Finlay, Ilora, 87	Human Tissue Authority, 61
Finnis, John, 188	Hunter, John, 23
Fischer, John, 200	Hunter, William, 23, 24
formal medical ethics, 181	Huntington's disease, 151
Fuller, Lon, 249, 250	
, ,	immoral behaviour, 189, 190
gang rape, 28	immunity, 169
Gavigan, Shelley, 105	Infant Life (Preservation) Act 1929,
Gay, John, 18	107
General Medical Council (GMC), 16, 19,	infanticide, 84
53	informed consent, 44
Gert, Bernard, 221, 222, 245	Inglis, Frances, 131, 148
Gilderdale, Kay, 130, 132–3, 148	Inglis, Thomas, 131, 132
Gillon, Raanan, 221, 226, 246, 248	integrity, 222
Glover, Jonathan, 201	intention, 133, 146



interiorisation, 208	morality of aspiration and, 249
interpretation, theatre of, 209	morality of duty and, 249
audience, 214	Leache, Tegan, 101
bioethics vs. medical ethics, 210	legal moralism, 189, 190
case presentations, 214	legal person, 207
criminal law and, 210	legal responsibility, 201
interpretative construction in, 212	legislature, 215
interpretive community, 214	lethal injection, 131
narrative framework in, 210	Leviathan (Hobbes), 166
thought experiments in, 214	liberal justice, 245
interpretative construction, 212	liberalism, 11
interpretive community, 214	as connection between criminal law and
inviolability of life, 83, 85, 124	bioethics, 192
Irwin, Michael, 151	bioethics and, 182, 252
Islam, 119	criminal law and, 182, 252
	principlism and, 221
Jackson, Emily, 84, 85	rule of law and, 247
James IV, King, of Scotland, 22	Liddell, George, 141
Jareborg, Nils, 223	life support, withdrawal of, 176
Jones, David, 119, 120, 121	life-sustaining treatment, withdrawal of,
Jonsen, Albert, 220	152–9
Judaism, 119	logical scientific thinking, 209
judges, 214, 215	London College of Physicians, 16–17
jury, 214	Lord Ellenborough's Act of 1803, 102
justice, 219, 245. See also autonomy;	
beneficence; nonmaleficence	Macaulay, Lord, 234
beneficence and, 233	mala in se crime, 191
criminalisation principle and, 224	mala praxis, 17
rule of law and, 248	mala prohibita crime, 191–2
	Malleson, Joan, 26, 28
Kant, Immanuel, 220	Manchester conjoined twins, 70, 163–78.
Kelman, Mark, 146, 212, 213	See also conjoined twins
Keown, John, 27, 28, 29, 83, 85, 119,	manslaughter, 72
121	criminal law and, 5, 203
killing. See also assisted suicide; ending of	death of patient and, 69
life; euthanasia; medical	gross negligence and, 77
manslaughter	recklessness and, 77
causation, 135	Mason, J. Kenyon, 108
criminal responsibility, 125	maternal autonomy, 115
doctrine of double effect, 135	McCall Smith, Alexander, 74, 75, 77,
intention, 133	160
motivation for, 125	McDowell, Sarah, 73, 74
with compassion, 126	McEwan, Jenny, 163, 256
	McGee, Andrew, 160
Lacey, Nicola, 134, 146, 149, 192, 195,	media, 215
201, 203, 204, 223, 234, 252	Medical Act 1858, 16
Laurie, Graeme, 108	medical assaults, 40
law as integrity, 211	battery, 43
Law Commission, 149, 261, 263	bodily integrity, 42
law, inner morality of, 250	female circumcision, 49
law, rule of, 247	male circumcision, 51
beneficence and, 248	proper medical treatment or care and,
definition of, 248	45
guiding aspiration of, 250	rhetoric, 41
inner morality of, 250	medical errors, responsibility for, 75
justice and, 248	medical ethicists, 213



medical ethics, 15	of aspiration, 249
bioethics and, 183	of duty, 249
formal, 181	political liberalism and, 195
semiformal, 181	morals, protection of, 105
medical exemption, 261-3	Morgentaler, Henry, 95, 109
medical law, 15	morning after pill, 100
developments in, 2	morphine, 130, 138, 141
medical manslaughter, 72-80	Morrell, Edith, 30
criminal law and, 5, 203	motives, 125
death of patient and, 69	Mullock, Alexandra, 127
gross negligence and, 77	murder
recklessness and, 77	criminal law and, 5
medical politics, 11, 262	Edith Morrell case, 30
Medical Practitioners Tribunal Service	John Pearson case, 33
(MPTS), 20	Murder Act of 1752, 22, 23, 24
medical treatment	Mustill, Lord, 107, 157
abortion and, 99	
doctors' defence and, 260-3	Naffine, Ngaire, 207
medical assaults and, 45	narrative ethics, 222
medicalisation, 260-3	narrative thinking, 209
medicine, 259	natural law, 187
bioethics and, 10, 183-7, 195-216,	necessity, legal defence of, 166
218–23	negative autonomy, 153
criminal law and, 4, 10, 181-3,	negligence, 77
187–216, 217–54	criminal liability for, 70
politics of, 11, 262	informed consent and, 43
regulation before 1858, 16, 262	NHS Retained Organ Commission,
mens rea, 134, 135, 150	56
Mental Capacity Act 2005, 72, 81	Nicklinson, Tony, 126, 257
mental health, abortion and, 104	no property rule and corpses, 24
Mental Health Act 1983, 72, 81	nonmaleficence, 219, 224. See also
mercy killing	autonomy; beneficence; justice
relatives as assistors in, 125, 130–3,	Norrie, Alan, 128, 192, 247
148-51	Nuffield Council on Bioethics, 263
Merrett, Jamie, 81	Nuremberg trials, 184
Merry, Alan, 74, 75, 77	5 ,
methadone, 238	Offences Against the Person Act 1861, 27
midwives, 102	43, 72, 82, 99, 101, 114, 232
mifepristone, 104	offences, categories of, 191
migration, 199	Office of the Health Professions
Mill, John Stuart, 226, 228, 229	Adjudicator (OHPA), 20
Miola, José, 155, 181	O'Neill, Onora, 67, 91, 238
Montgomery, Jonathan, 90	opioids, 145
Moore, Michael, 191, 207	organ retention, 55
moral indignation, 189	organ selling, 39, 53
moral luck, 73	organ trafficking, 61
moral philosophy, 187	Otlowski, Margaret, 151
bioethics and, 181	, 5 ,
criminal law and, 183	pain relief, patient's death and, 128
deontology, 187	palliative care, 145
utilitarianism, 187	patient autonomy, 42, 237
moral responsibility, 207	bioethics and, 219, 222
moral right, 224	body and, 38–9
moral sentiment, 11	criminal law and, 40, 239
morality, 189	criminalisation principle and, 224
criminal law and, 191	death and, 68
,	



patient autonomy (cont.)	relatives facilitating assisted suicide abroad
definitions of, 237	(RFASA), 150
medicalisation and, 47	Renaissance, 21
negative, 153	Report on Homosexual Offences and
of pregnant women, 115	Prostitution, 226
positive, 153	Republic, The, 10
principled, 238	responsibility
responsibility and, 205	capacity, 206
patients, responsibilities of, 205	contemporary social practice and, 203
Pearson, John, 34	definition of, 199
Percival, Thomas, 105	harm principle and, 229
Persak, Nina, 229	in bioethics and criminal law, 199
persistent vegetative state (PVS), 4, 152,	in medical practice, 200, 201, 203
154	legal, 201
pharmakon, 10	liberal societies and, 200
Philosophical Medical Ethics, 33	moral, 201, 207
physicians	narrative framework for, 209
criminal law and, 5	of agents, 203
moral responsibility of, 207	patient autonomy and, 205
practise before 1858, 16	patients', 205
responsibilities of, 205	refusal to take, 200
Plato, 10	social meaning of, 203
political liberalism, 11, 197	theatre of interpretation and, 209
common morality and, 195	restorative justice, 247
criminal law and, 193	retributive justice, 247
positive autonomy, 153	reverence for life, 89, 90, 124
Posner, Richard, 197	Richardson, Ruth, 25
potassium chloride, 128, 140	Roman Catholic Church, 16, 84, 119
Powers, Madison, 184	Rose, William, 18
pregnant women	Roth, Paul, 28
attack on, 106	Royal Colleges, 200
autonomy, 115	RU486, 101
claims over body, 98	rule of law, 247. See also criminal law
in utero injuries to fetus, 107	beneficence and, 248
proper medical treatment,	definition of, 248
99	guiding aspiration of, 250
Price, David, 39	inner morality of, 250
principled autonomy, 238	justice and, 248
principlism, 219	morality of aspiration and, 249
procedural justice, 247	morality of duty and, 249
proportionality, 248	
public health, 199	sanctity of life, 83
public sentiment, 259	abortion and, 118
Purdy, Debbie, 8	Glanville Williams on, 84
	John Keown on, 85
Quacks' Charter, 17	Sanctity of Life and the Criminal Law, The
Quick, Oliver, 192	(Glanville Williams), 2, 68
	Sanders, Andrew, 74, 81
rape, 227	Sawday, Jonathan, 21
Ravizza, Mark, 200	Schiavo, Terri, 3
Rawls, John, 196, 198	Schweitzer, Albert, 89
recklessness, 77, 82	science fiction, 8
Redfern, Michael, 55	self-abortion, 101
Redfern Report, 55	self-determination, 42
Reformation, 16	semiformal medical ethics, 181



More Information

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01825-9 — Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Margaret Brazier , Suzanne Ost Index

Index 291

serial killer, 5, 41 thought experiments, of bioethicists and sexual morality, and abortion, 105 philosophers, 214 Sexual Offences Act 1967, 226 Tur, Richard, 147 sexual promiscuity, and abortion, 106 Turner, Anne, 8, 213 Turoldo, Fabrizio, 208 Shelp, Earl, 231 Shiner, Roger, 194 Tuskegee syphilis experiment, 184 Shipman, Harold, 5 Simmonds, Nigel, 250 Unrelated Live Transplant Authority, 54 Sorell, Tom, 205 Usher, Alan, 35 Special Crimes and Counter Terrorist utilitarianism, 187 Division (SCCTD), 69 St. Mary's Hospital London, 27 Van Velzen, Dick, 56 Star Chamber, 18 vasectomy, 47 Stephen, James Fitzjames, 226 Vera Drake (film), 95 suicide, assisted. See also euthanasia Vesalius, Andreas, 21 benign conspiracy, 148 vincristine, 73 character responsibility in, 128 vitalism, 86 criminal process' response to, 126 voluntary active euthanasia (VAE), 146, death of patient and, 69 148, 153, 225. See also euthanasia DPP's prosecution policy on, 127 Von Hagens, Gunther, 3 vulnerability, 222 medical manslaughter and, 69 mitigating motive in, 127 motives in, 126, 128 Walters, Julie, 8 relatives in, 148 Weddington, Sarah, 95 welfare principle, 224, 234 suicide, decriminalisation of, 41 Suicide Act 1961, 41 Wells, Celia, 192 surgeons, 17 wilful neglect, 97 Williams, Garrath, 200 practise before 1858, 16 Sykes, Nigel, 145 Williams, Glanville, 2, 68, 84, 119, 155, 172 Tadros, Victor, 203 Williams, Glenys, 155 Tauber, Alfred, 205 witnesses, 215 television drama, 8 Wolf, Susan, 185, 199 theatre, 7 Wolfenden Committee, 226 anatomy as, 3, 21 women components of, 8 attack on, 106 distortion from, 10, 257 autonomy of, 115, 245 ending of life and, 161 claims over body, 98 of interpretation, 209 in utero injuries to fetus, 107 proper medical treatment of, 99 relevance of, 7 television drama, 8 protection of, 101 therapeutic abortion, 102 Thomson, Judith, 98 zone of indeterminate application, and

end-of-life cases, 160

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

Thorns, Andrew, 145