

FRENCH LIBERALISM FROM Montesquieu to the present day

There is an enduring assumption that the French have never been and will never be *liberal*. As with all clichés, this one contains a grain of truth, but it also overlooks an important school of thought that has been a constant presence in French intellectual and political culture for nearly three centuries: French political liberalism. In this collaborative volume, a distinguished group of philosophers, political theorists and intellectual historians uncover this unjustly neglected tradition. The chapters examine the nature and distinctiveness of French liberalism, providing a comprehensive treatment of major themes including French liberalism's relationship with republicanism, Protestantism, utilitarianism and the human rights tradition. Individual chapters are devoted to Montesquieu, Tocqueville, Aron, Lefort and Gauchet, as well as to some lesser-known, yet important, thinkers, including several political economists and French-style 'neoliberals'. *French Liberalism* is essential reading for all those interested in the history of political thought.

RAF GEENENS is a postdoctoral researcher at the Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium, where he also lectures on ethics and the history of natural law. His research, as a member of the Leuven-based research group RIPPLE, concerns contemporary models of democracy as well as the history of continental political philosophy. He is the co-editor of *Reading Tocqueville. From Oracle to Actor* (2007) and *Does Truth Matter? Democracy and Public Space* (2009), and is preparing a monograph on contemporary French philosopher Claude Lefort.

HELENA ROSENBLATT is Professor of History at the Graduate Center of the City University of New York, where she teaches European Intellectual History. A specialist in French political thought, with a strong interest in religion, she is the author of *Rousseau and Geneva: From the First Discourse to the Social Contract* (1997) and *Liberal Values: Benjamin Constant and the Politics of Religion* (2008) and the editor of *The Cambridge Companion to Constant* (2009) and Rousseau's *Second Discourse* (2010). Her current research project is a history of liberalism. In 2010 Professor Rosenblatt won the Benjamin Constant Prize offered by the Institut Benjamin Constant in Lausanne, Switzerland.





FRENCH LIBERALISM FROM MONTESQUIEU TO THE PRESENT DAY

EDITED BY
RAF GEENENS
HELENA ROSENBLATT





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107017436

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-01743-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Acknowledgements I French liberalism, an overlooked tradition? Raf Geenens and Helena Rosenblatt PART I IN SEARCH OF A LOST LIBERALISM 2 Two liberal traditions Larry Siedentop
Raf Geenens and Helena Rosenblatt PART I IN SEARCH OF A LOST LIBERALISM 2 Two liberal traditions Larry Siedentop
2 Two liberal traditions In Larry Siedentop
Larry Siedentop
TI 1 1 1 CF 1.11 11
3 The unity, diversity and paradoxes of French liberalism <i>Lucien Jaume</i> 30
PART II THE FRENCH LIBERAL CONCEPTION OF LIBERTY: LOYAL TO ITS REPUBLICAN ROOTS?
4 Was Montesquieu liberal? <i>The Spirit of the Laws</i> in the history of liberalism 5 <i>Céline Spector</i>
5 The importance of republican liberty in French liberalism Andrew Jainchill 7
6 Rethinking liberalism and terror Stephen Holmes
PART III THE FORMATIVE ERA: LIBERAL DEALINGS WITH KEY ISSUES IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY FRANCE
7 On the need for a Protestant Reformation: Constant, Sismondi, Guizot and Laboulaye Helena Rosenblatt

v



vi	Contents	
8	'Anti-Benthamism': utilitarianism and the French liberal tradition Cheryl B. Welch	134
9	Tocqueville: liberalism and imperialism <i>Alan S. Kahan</i>	152
PAR	RT IV ECONOMIC LIBERALISM À LA FRANÇAISE	
Ю	War, trade and empire: the dilemmas of French liberal political economy, 1780–1816 Richard Whatmore	169
II	Competition and knowledge: French political economy as a science of government Philippe Steiner	192
12	Is there a French neoliberalism? Serge Audier	208
	RT V AT THE DAWN OF MASS DEMOCRACY: REASSESSIE ROLE OF COLLECTIVE INSTITUTIONS	ING
13	The 'sociological turn' in French liberal thought William Logue	233
14	The 'illiberalism' of French liberalism: the individual and the state in the thought of Blanc, Dupont-White and Durkheim Jean-Fabien Spitz	252
PAR	RT VI THE TWENTIETH CENTURY AND BEYOND	
15	Raymond Aron and the tradition of political moderation in France Aurelian Craiutu	271
16	The politics of individual rights: Marcel Gauchet and Claude Lefort Samuel Moyn	291
Inde	ex	311



Contributors

- SERGE AUDIER is maître de conferences in moral philosophy and politics at the University of Paris IV-Sorbonne and a member of the Institut universitaire de France. He has published extensively on French liberalism, including, Tocqueville retrouvé. Genèse et enjeux du renouveau tocquevillien français (2004), Raymond Aron, la démocratie conflictuelle (2004), Le socialisme libéral (2005), La pensée solidariste. Aux sources du modèle social républicain (2010), and Néo-Libéralisme(s). Une archéologie intellectuelle (2012).
- AURELIAN CRAIUTU is Associate Professor of Political Science at Indiana University, Bloomington. He also serves as the director of the Tocqueville programme at Indiana University, and is associate editor of the European Journal of Political Theory. He is the author of several books including Liberalism under Siege: The Political Thought of the French Doctrinaires (2003) (CHOICE Outstanding Academic Title Award), and Le centre introuvable: la pensée politique des doctrinaires sous la Restauration (2006). A Virtue for Courageous Minds: Moderation in French Political Thought is forthcoming in 2011.
- RAF GEENENS is a postdoctoral researcher in Political Philosophy at the Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium. He has co-edited a volume on Alexis de Tocqueville, *Reading Tocqueville: From Oracle to Actor* (2007) and a volume on contemporary theories of democracy, *Does Truth Matter? Democracy and Public Space* (2009). He is the author of a forthcoming book on Claude Lefort, *Being Democratic. On Claude Lefort's Political Philosophy*.
- STEPHEN HOLMES is Walter E. Meyer Professor of Law at New York University. He has taught at Yale, Princeton, the University of Chicago and Harvard, and has written widely on the history of European liberalism. His numerous publications include *Benjamin Constant and*



viii

Notes on contributors

the Making of Modern Liberalism (1984), The Anatomy of Antiliberalism (1993) and Passions and Constraint: The Theory of Liberal Democracy (1995).

- ANDREW JAINCHILL is Associate Professor of History at Queen's University, Canada. He is the author of *Reimagining Politics after the Terror: The Republican Origins of French Liberalism* (2008), as well as articles and essays in *French Historical Studies, Modern Intellectual History* and the *Journal of Modern History*. He is currently working on the origins of revolutionary republicanism and concepts of sovereignty in the eighteenth century.
- LUCIEN JAUME is Professor of Political Thought at Sciences Po, Paris. He is the author of *L'individu effacé ou le paradoxe du libéralisme français* (1997), *Le discours jacobin et la démocratie* (1989) and *Tocqueville: les sources aristocratiques de la liberté* (2008), which recently received the Guizot Prize of the Académie française. He is also one of the supervisors of new scholarly editions of both Benjamin Constant's and Mme de Staël's complete writings.
- ALAN S. KAHAN has taught at the University of Chicago, Rice University and Florida International University. He currently teaches at Sciences Po and at the American Graduate School in Paris. He is the author of Aristocratic Liberalism: The Social and Political Thought of Jacob Burckhardt, John Stuart Mill and Alexis de Tocqueville (1992); Liberalism in Nineteenth-Century Europe: The Political Culture of Limited Suffrage (2003); and Alexis de Tocqueville (2009). He has translated Tocqueville's The Old Regime and the Revolution (2001), and co-edited The Tocqueville Reader (2002). He is currently working on a book about the relationship between religion and democracy and translating Benjamin Constant's Commentary on Filangieri's Work.
- WILLIAM LOGUE is Professor Emeritus of History at Northern Illinois University. His work focuses on the history of French political thought. He is the author of *Charles Renouvier: Philosopher of Liberty* (1993); *Léon Blum: The Formative Years, 1872–1914* (1973); and *From Philosophy to Sociology: The Evolution of French Liberalism, 1870–1914* (1983).
- SAMUEL MOYN is Professor of History at Columbia University. He specializes in the history of continental political thought, and more specifically in twentieth-century French thought. He is the author of *Origins*



Notes on contributors

of the Other: Emmanuel Levinas Between Revelation and Ethics (2005), A Holocaust Controversy: The Treblinka Affair in Postwar France (2005), and of a recent book on human rights, The Last Utopia: Human Rights in History (2010).

ix

- HELENA ROSENBLATT is Professor of History at the Graduate Center of the City University of New York. She is a specialist in the history of French liberalism, and more specifically in the work of Benjamin Constant. Her publications include Rousseau and Geneva: From the First Discourse to The Social Contract, 1749–1762 (1997) and Liberal Values: Benjamin Constant and the Politics of Religion (2008). She is also the editor of the Cambridge Companion to Constant (2009).
- LARRY SIEDENTOP is an Emeritus Fellow of Keble College, Oxford, and was for many years Faculty Lecturer in Political Thought at the University of Oxford. An expert in French liberalism, his works include *Tocqueville* (1994) and *Democracy in Europe* (2001). He is also the editor of Guizot's *History of Civilization in Europe* (1997), and is an occasional contributor to the *Financial Times*.
- CÉLINE SPECTOR is Professor at the University of Bordeaux 3. She has also lectured at the École normale supérieure and Stanford University. A well-known Montesquieu scholar, she has written numerous articles on Montesquieu, edited several anthologies, and has authored two books: *Montesquieu. Pouvoirs, richesses et sociétés* (2004) and *Montesquieu et l'émergence de l'économie politique* (2006). She has also written a number of articles on Rousseau, and is currently preparing a book on Rousseau.
- JEAN-FABIEN SPITZ is Professor of Political Philosophy at the University of Paris I. His research interests include theories of republicanism, the work of John Locke, and the history of French political liberalism. He is the author of several books, including *La liberté politique: essai de généalogie conceptuelle* (1995), *L'amour de l'égalité: essai sur la critique de l'égalitarisme républicain en France*, 1770–1830 (2000), *John Locke et les fondements de la liberté moderne* (2001), and *Le moment républicain en France* (2005).
- PHILIPPE STEINER is Professor of Sociology at the University of Paris IV-Sorbonne and senior member of the Institut Universitaire de France. He is a member of the team editing the *Œuvres complètes de Jean-Baptiste Say*. His research is mainly devoted to the history of



Notes on contributors

Х

the social sciences and economic sociology, and his recent publications include *La transplantation d'organes: un commerce nouveau entre les êtres humains* (2010); *Durkheim and the Birth of Economic Sociology* (2011); and 'Les rémunerations obscènes', *Revue de MAUSS permanente*, 7 (2011).

CHERYL B. WELCH is Senior Lecturer and Director of Undergraduate Studies in the Department of Government at Harvard University. She is the author of *Liberty and Utility: The French Idéologues and the Transformation of Liberalism* (1984) and *De Tocqueville* (2001). She is also the editor of the *Cambridge Companion to Tocqueville* (2006) and an editor of *La revue Tocqueville/The Tocqueville Review*. The author of numerous articles on French and British political thought, liberalism and democracy, she is currently working on a book on moral discourse in international relations in the early nineteenth century.

RICHARD WHATMORE is Reader in Intellectual History at the University of Sussex. His research focuses on French, British and Swiss political and economic thought during the eighteenth and early nineteenth century. His publications include *Republicanism and the French Revolution: An Intellectual History of Jean-Baptiste Say's Political Economy* (2000).



Acknowledgements

The editors of this book would like to acknowledge and thank all those individuals and institutions who made our project possible. It began as a valedictory conference for philosopher André Van de Putte at the Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium, organized under the logistic and intellectual auspices of the research group RIPPLE (Research in Political Philosophy Leuven). We would like to express our gratitude to everyone involved in the organization of that conference, and in particular to Kristof Nijssens. Funding, both for the conference and for subsequent work on this book, was generously provided by the Research Foundation Flanders, the K. U. Leuven's Institute of Philosophy, the K. U. Leuven Research Fund, the Joseph Van de Wiele Foundation and l'Ambassade de France en Belgique. For copyright permissions we are grateful to Ellipses and to Oxford University Press. Darian Meacham deserves our special thanks for skilfully steering this book around many practical and linguistic hurdles. We would also like to recognize Michael Breslin for translating into English the texts by Lucien Jaume, Céline Spector, Jean-Fabien Spitz and Serge Audier. Unless otherwise indicated, all translations of cited material in these chapters are the translator's. In all the other chapters, unless otherwise indicated, all translations of cited material are the author's or our own. At Cambridge University Press, we are grateful to Richard Fisher for his encouragement and support. Finally, we owe a special debt to Antoon Braeckman, without whose inspiration and tireless efforts this collection of essays would never have seen the light. Throughout the book's production process we have been extremely happy to count on Antoon's input and support. Last but not least, we would like to thank all those colleagues who contributed essays to this volume and with whom it has been a pleasure to work.