

Inequality, Grievances, and Civil War

This book argues that political and economic inequalities following group lines generate grievances that can motivate civil war. The theoretical approach highlights ethnonationalism and how linkages between group identities and inequalities spur mobilization and resort to violence. Although contemporary research on civil war has largely dismissed grievances as irrelevant, emphasizing instead the role of opportunities, the authors show that many alleged nonresults for grievances stem from atheoretical measures, typically based on individualist data. The authors develop new indicators of political and economic exclusion at the group level and demonstrate how these exert strong effects on the risk of civil war. They provide new analyses of the effects of transnational ethnic links and the duration of civil wars and extended case discussions illustrating causal mechanisms.

Lars-Erik Cederman is Professor of International Conflict Research at the Center for Comparative and International Studies at ETH Zürich. He is the author of *Emergent Actors in World Politics* (1997), the editor of *Constructing Europe's Identity* (2001), and the co-editor of *New Systems Theories of World Politics* (2010). He is the winner of the 2012 and 2002 American Political Science Association's Heinz I. Eulau Awards, the 2000 Furniss Book Award, and the Horace H. Rackham Dissertation Award from the University of Michigan.

Kristian Skrede Gleditsch is Professor in the Department of Government, University of Essex, and a Research Associate at the Peace Research Institute Oslo (PRIO). He is the author of *All International Politics Is Local* (2002) and *Spatial Regression Models* (2008) as well as numerous journal articles. He is the winner of the 2012 American Political Science Association's Heinz I. Eulau Award, the 2011 International Association for Conflict Management outstanding article in the field award, the 2007 Karl Deutsch Award from the International Studies Association, and the 2000 American Political Science Association's Helen Dwight Reid Award.

Halvard Buhaug is Research Professor at the Peace Research Institute Oslo and Professor of Political Science at the Norwegian University of Science and Technology. He received the 2006 Royal Norwegian Society of Sciences and Letters award for excellent research by young scholars in human sciences. Recent academic publications include articles in the Journal of Conflict Resolution, Global Environmental Change, International Security, International Organization, and Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the USA.





Cambridge Studies in Contentious Politics

Editors

Mark Beissinger Princeton University

Jack A. Goldstone George Mason University

Michael Hanagan Vassar College

Doug McAdam Stanford University and Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences

Sarah A. Soule Stanford University

Suzanne Staggenborg University of Pittsburgh

Sidney Tarrow Cornell University

Charles Tilly (d. 2008) Columbia University

Elisabeth J. Wood Yale University

Deborah Yashar Princeton University

Ronald Aminzade et al., Silence and Voice in the Study of Contentious Politics

Javier Auyero, Routine Politics and Violence in Argentina: The Gray Zone of State Power

W. Lance Bennett and Alexandra Segerberg, The Logic of Connective Action: Digital Media and the Personalization of Contentious Politics

Clifford Bob, The Marketing of Rebellion: Insurgents, Media, and International Activism

Charles Brockett, Political Movements and Violence in Central America Valerie Bunce and Sharon Wolchik, Defeating Authoritarian Leaders in Postcommunist Countries

Lars-Erik Cederman, Kristian Skrede Gleditsch, and Halvard Buhaug, Inequality, Grievances, and Civil War

Christian Davenport, Media Bias, Perspective, and State Repression

Gerald F. Davis, Doug McAdam, W. Richard Scott, and Mayer N. Zald, Social Movements and Organization Theory

Donatella della Porta, Clandestine Political Violence

Todd A. Eisenstadt, Politics, Identity, and Mexico's Indigenous Rights Movements

Daniel Q. Gillion, The Political Power of Protest: Minority Activism and Shifts in Public Policy

Jack A. Goldstone, editor, States, Parties, and Social Movements Tamara Kay, NAFTA and the Politics of Labor Transnationalism

Continued after the Index





Inequality, Grievances, and Civil War

LARS-ERIK CEDERMAN

Center for Comparative and International Studies, ETH Zürich

KRISTIAN SKREDE GLEDITSCH

University of Essex and Peace Research Institute Oslo

HALVARD BUHAUG

Peace Research Institute Oslo





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107603042

© Lars-Erik Cederman, Kristian Skrede Gleditsch, and Halvard Buhaug 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Cederman, Lars-Erik, 1963-

Inequality, grievances, and civil war / Lars-Erik Cederman, Center for Comparative and International Studies, ETH Zürich; Kristian Skrede Gleditsch, University of Essex and Peace Research Institute Oslo; Halvard Buhaug, Peace Research Institute Oslo.

pages cm. – (Cambridge studies in contentious politics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-01742-9 (hardback) - ISBN 978-1-107-60304-2 (pbk.)

Civil war – Social aspects.
 Equality.
 Human rights.
 Gleditsch, Kristian Skrede,
 II. Buhaug, Halvard, 1972– III. Title.

JC491.C374 2013

303.6'4-dc23 2013001656

ISBN 978-1-107-01742-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-60304-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Tables	page viii
Figures	ix
Preface	xi
1. Introduction	I
PART I: THEORIES AND CONCEPTS	
2. Inequality and Grievances in the Civil War Literature	II
3. From Horizontal Inequality to Civil War via Grievance	es 30
PART II: EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS OF CIVIL WAR ONSET	
4. Political Exclusion and Civil War	57
5. Economic Inequality and Civil War	93
6. Transborder Ethnic Kin and Civil War	119
7. Country-Level Inequalities and Civil War	143
PART III: BEYOND CIVIL WAR ONSET	
8. The Duration and Outcome of Civil Wars	171
9. Conclusions for Theory and Policy	205
References	227
Index	251

vii



Tables

Comparing excluded and included groups' conflict	
propensities	page 71
Ethnic groups' conflict propensity by power-access	
category	72
Political horizontal inequality and group-level onset of civil	
war, 1946–2009	73
Economic horizontal inequality and group-level onset of	
civil war, 1991–2009	108
TEK and group-level onset of civil war, 1946–2009	132
Mean sample values by conflict outcome, 1991–2009	154
Logit model of civil war onset, 1991–2009	155
Multinomial logit models of civil war onset, 1991–2009	157
High horizontal inequality in 1999 and civil war onset,	
2000–9	161
High horizontal inequality in 2009 without conflict,	
1991–2009	164
Summary of findings	165
	175
Cox proportional hazard regression estimates of	
termination, 1946–2009	194
Multinomial logit by outcome type (to conflict	
	197
1 1	
	203
• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	206
•	
shares of the population in 2009	221
	propensities Ethnic groups' conflict propensity by power-access category Political horizontal inequality and group-level onset of civil war, 1946–2009 Economic horizontal inequality and group-level onset of civil war, 1991–2009 TEK and group-level onset of civil war, 1946–2009 Mean sample values by conflict outcome, 1991–2009 Logit model of civil war onset, 1991–2009 Multinomial logit models of civil war onset, 1991–2009 High horizontal inequality in 1999 and civil war onset, 2000–9 High horizontal inequality in 2009 without conflict, 1991–2009 Summary of findings Approaches to civil war dynamics/duration Cox proportional hazard regression estimates of termination, 1946–2009

viii



Figures

3.1.	The causal path from inequalities to onset through	
	grievances	page 36
3.2.	The causal path from horizontal inequalities to grievances	37
	The causal path from grievances to civil war onset	44
3.4.	Grievance-based mechanism as spurious explanation	51
3.5.	Grievances bypassed through reverse causation	52
4.I.	The polity model with included and excluded groups	59
4.2.	Comparing the effect of power access status on civil war	
	onset	75
4.3.	Comparing the effect on civil war onset for EPR categories	76
4.4.	The effect of status reversals on the probability of civil war	
	onset	77
4.5.	Conflict propensity of included and excluded groups as a	
	function of their relative size	78
4.6.	Conflict propensity as a function of the number of the	
	group's previous conflict onsets	79
5.1.	G-Econ cells for Yugoslavia overlaid with GeoEPR group	
	polygons for Slovenes and Albanians	103
5.2.	Result of spatial wealth estimation for groups in	
	Yugoslavia	104
	Result of spatial wealth estimation for groups in the Sudan	105
	Result of spatial wealth estimation for groups in Myanmar	106
5.5.	Conflict probability for groups less wealthy than the	
	country average	109
5.6.	Conflict probability for groups wealthier than the country	
	average	110
5.7.	Comparing the effect of relative poverty on the conflict	
	probability of included and excluded ethnic groups	III
		ix
		IA



X		Figures
5.8.	First-order difference between excluded and included	
	groups	112
6.1.	The ethnonationalist triad with an excluded TEK group	124
6.2.	The ethnonationalist triad with an included TEK group	124
6.3.	The probability of conflict as a function of relative TEK	
	size	133
6.4.	Conflict probability varying with size of included and	
	excluded TEK groups	134
6.5.	Contour plot showing the effect on conflict probability of	
	relative group and TEK sizes	136
	Vertical versus horizontal political inequality in 2000	152
	Vertical versus horizontal economic inequality in 2000	153
7.3.	Estimated risk of ethnic governmental conflict as a	
	function of extent of political discrimination (black line)	
	with 90% confidence interval (gray area)	159
7.4.	Estimated risk of ethnic territorial conflict as a function of	
	extent of economic inequality (black line) with 90%	
	confidence interval (gray area)	160
	ROC plot of out-of-sample prediction, 2000–9	162
7.6.	Scatter plot of individual out-of-sample predictions,	
	2000–9	163
	Sequential fighting in civil wars	183
8.2.	Outcome probabilities by time, organizations with link to	
	an excluded group	199
8.3.	Outcome probabilities by time, organizations with link to	
	an excluded group and support from a transnational	
	constituency included in another state	200
8.4.	Outcome probabilities by time, organizations with no link	
	to an excluded ethnic group	201
-	Average democracy levels by world region	214
	Ethnically excluded population by world region	216
	Ethnically discriminated population by world region	217
	Share of excluded population by country in 2009	219
9.5.	Share of discriminated population by country in 2009	220



Preface

Apart from acquiring real estate, there are few things that make you more indebted than writing collaborative monographs. Indeed, this book is the product not only of our own efforts, but also those of our colleagues and students who made major contributions in terms of conceptual development, data collection, software development, and analysis. In this very respect, the book falls somewhere between a co-authored book and a co-edited volume.

More than anything else, this book is the fruit of several years of intense research collaboration involving a tight network of conflict researchers in Europe. These activities started as an informal network that we labeled Geographic Research On War Network (GROWnet), which originally included colleagues at the Peace Research Institute Oslo (PRIO) and the Norwegian University of Science and Technology in Norway, ETH Zürich and University of Geneva in Switzerland, and the University of Essex in the United Kingdom, and was subsequently extended to collaborators at Uppsala University in Sweden. Within this context, we have published a large amount of co-authored research, with an author list featuring every possible combination of the three authors of this book and beyond. Some of the research paving the way for the book was funded by an ECRP grant on "Disaggregating Civil War" (o6ECRPFP004) awarded by the European Science Foundation, 2007-10, through individual grants from the national research councils, that is, the Research Council of Norway (182399), Swiss National Science Foundation (105511-116795), and UK Economic and Social Research Council (RES-062-23-0259). Gleditsch also acknowledges support from the Research Council of Norway (180441/V10). As of the summer of 2012, the network received new funding from the European Union as a COST Action (IS 1102), which will allow it to expand its activities to many more partners in Europe under the heading of the European Network of Conflict Research (ENCoRe).

xi



xii Preface

Sidney Tarrow played an instrumental role at a pivotal moment by suggesting that we publish our book project with Cambridge University Press, where Lewis Bateman has supported our work with both patience and professionalism. All in all, we held three book workshops at ETH Zürich on 10 November 2011, at Yale on 24 February 2012, and at PRIO on 10 March 2012. We received excellent feedback from the participants at those workshops, including Keith Darden, Hanne Fjelde, Scott Gates, Jack Goldstone, Håvard Hegre, Helge Holtermann, Simon Hug, Stathis Kalyvas, Janet Lewis, Nicholas Sambanis, Frances Stewart, Andres Vargas, Nils Weidmann, and Tore Wig. We also benefited from comments from participants at seminar presentations at Koç University on 16 April 2012 and the London School of Economics and Political Science on 9 May 2012, including Belgin San Akça, Ali Çarkoğlu, Emre Hatipoğlu, Bill Kissane, Omar McDoom, Michael Mousseau, and Jameson Lee Ungerer. In addition, Carles Boix, Michael Hechter, Erik Melander, and Camber Warren commented on parts of the manuscript.

Current and past PhD students and researchers of the International Conflict Research Groups at ETH Zürich have selflessly sacrificed large chunks of their valuable research time to provide public goods in the shape of data projects and analysis. Nils Weidmann and Christa Deiwiks volunteered their skills in terms of data management and computational and spatial analysis. Julian Wucherpfennig and Philipp Hunziker played an instrumental role in project management and econometric analysis. Luc Girardin, with the help of Sebastian Schutte and Philipp Hunziker, created the computational infrastructure that made the project possible, including the data portal GROW^{up}. Manuel Vogt, Nils-Christian Bormann, and Seraina Rüegger managed the coding and updating of large data structures, all related to the Ethnic Power Relations (EPR) data set. Indeed, this book project revolves around this data resource, which originates from research collaboration involving Andreas Wimmer and Brian Min, both then at UCLA. We are grateful to a long list of experts who offered their advice regarding, the coding of countless country cases; see Chapter 4, footnote 7, and http://www.icr.ethz.ch/data. In particular, we would like to acknowledge the expert input by James Scarritt and Manuel Vogt, who helped us update the coding of Sub-Saharan Africa. Our data collection efforts were generously supported by the National Center of Competence in Research, "Challenges to democracy in the 21st century," and funded by the Swiss National Science Foundation (SNSF) and the Swiss Network for International Studies (SNIS).

At the University of Essex, we have benefited from comments and suggestions from current and former colleagues Tobias Böhmelt, Han Dorussen, Ismene Gizelis, Steve Pickering, and Ulrich Pilster. Nils Metternich and Andrea Ruggeri served as research officers on our ESF project and have become valued collaborators who have influenced the research reported in this book in numerous ways.



Preface xiii

Research underpinning this book has also benefited greatly from brownbag seminars and informal discussions with colleagues at PRIO under the auspices of the Centre for the Study of Civil War (CSCW). Being associated with the GROWnet, Scott Gates, Nils Petter Gleditsch, Johan Dittrich Hallberg, Håvard Hegre, Helge Holtermann, and Gudrun Østby have followed the development of this project and generously offered insightful and constructive comments and suggestions along the way. Likewise, we have benefited tremendously from input on GIS, data, and statistical methods from Jan Ketil Rød, Håvard Strand, and Andreas Forø Tollefsen. External CSCW affiliates such as Sabine Carey, David Cunningham, Kathleen Cunningham, Magnus Öberg, Idean Salehyan, and Gerald Schneider have also provided valuable comments. Finally, we would like to thank Andrew John Feltham for his excellent help managing our activities through CSCW.

It should be stressed that a lot of crucial steps were taken in connection with collaborative publications that preceded this book. Andreas Wimmer and Brian Min co-authored an article that inspired Chapter 4 (see Cederman, Wimmer, and Min 2010). Nils Weidmann co-authored the article that constitutes the initial basis of Chapter 5 (see Cederman, Weidmann, and Gleditsch 2011). Chapter 6 draws heavily on an article co-authored with Idean Salehyan and Julian Wucherpfennig (see Cederman, Gleditsch, Salehyan, and Wucherpfennig 2013), Chapter 7 builds on some of our other joint work (see Buhaug, Cederman, and Gleditsch Forthcoming), and Chapter 8 relies on material from articles that we co-authored with David Cunningham and Idean Salehyan (Cunningham, Gleditsch, and Salehyan 2009) as well as Julian Wucherpfennig and Nils Metternich (Wucherpfennig, Metternich, Cederman, and Gleditsch 2012). We are also grateful for the publishers' permission to use material from these publications.

Last but not least, we would like to acknowledge the continuous support from our partners and families who provided both intellectual inspiration and a healthy counterweight to the "workaholic" tendencies of academic life. Without their boundless patience and generous willingness to bear the burden of often-absent spouses and fathers, this book could not have been written.