abolitionism, 109
abolitionism and religion, 65–66
absolutism and religion, 65–66
abuse of state power and government links to religion, 62–64
ACA (Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act), 156, 157, 175, 181, 233
accommodation, legislative and administrative, 8, 258–261
complementary relationship with right of exemption, 258–259
entanglement of courts or government in religious matters, avoiding, 276
equal treatment of religious sects and, 273–276
impermissibly advancing religion, 262–264
importance of, 229
limits on, 8, 259–260, 261–276
in public versus private settings, 273
regulating relations between private parties, 272–273
of religious instruction, 31
supplemental, minimally protective right of exemption and, 260–261, 276–278
third parties burdened by, 264–272
accommodationism, 8, 12, 53, 54, 38, 42, 43, 49
Adamczyk, Amy, 189, 197
Adams, Jasper, 216, 242
Adams, John, 84, 107, 111
Adams, Third Circuit Court of Appeals Judge, 205–207
administrative and legislative accommodation.
See accommodation, legislative and administrative
adoption agencies, religiously affiliated, 157, 175
African traditional faiths, 86, 92
agonism
in modern America, 210
state not allowed to suppress or discriminate against, 322
Agostini v. Felton, 51
Alexander, Larry, 118
Alito, Justice Samuel, 7, 154, 156
American Indians. See entries at Native American American Religious Identification Survey (ARIS), 210
American Revolution, 109, 216, 224
Amish, 18, 191, 239, 267
analogical approach to defining religion, 285–287
ARIS (American Religious Identification Survey), 210
Arizona, state RFRA statute, 181
association, right of, 53
atheists
in early America, 141
in modern America, 210
state not allowed to suppress or discriminate against, 322
Backus, Isaac
distinctiveness of religion and, 65, 84, 85, 87
on equal treatment of religious sects, 139
on ethics and morality, 107
on freedom of religion, 104, 112, 119
on limits of free exercise, 241
on separation of church and state, 126
balancing problem and right of exemption, 23, 195–200, 235–236
Baptists
distinctiveness of religion and, 86, 87, 88, 89–90
on exemptions from neutral laws of general applicability, 163
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Index</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
distinctiveness of religion, demonstrating (cont.) openness to the divine as ultimate reality, 
grounding all that is, 91, 92, 97, 98–99 relationship to common human experience of 
importance to believers and nonbelievers, 93–99 religious traditions, commonalities and 
variations in views among, 85–94 salvation, liberation, or fulfillment inhering in 
connection with the divine, 72, 73–74, 83–84, 89, 90, 97, 102, 105, 126, 146, 219, 230, 287, 288, 300, 314, 317, 322 
distinctiveness of religion, difficulties articulating, 4–5 distinguishing religion and nonreligion, 57–69 equality paradigm and, 56–57 
higher authority, religious claims involving, 
argument for, 5, 63, 69–71 in pluralistic world, 69–75 text and history, arguments based on, 75–78 
types of arguments, 57–58, 69, 75–76, 78 diversity, religious. See pluralism 
the divine 
described as the Ultimate, Ultimate Reality, 
Power, the Absolute, Being itself, the infinite, 
the Holy, Mystery, 59, 72–73, 82–83, 91, 92 
despair, response of, 94, 96–97 
different understandings of, 83–86 
goodness of, religious belief embracing, 83 
implicit in secular moral reasoning, 311–314 
knowability of, 88 
knowledge about, means of acquiring, 87–88 
nontheistic faiths, 70, 86, 93, 108, 220, 230 
openness to, as ultimate reality grounding all 
that is, 91, 92, 97, 98–99 
orientation to, as part of human experience, 82–83 
religious response, 83 
theism, in Western faith traditions, 85–86, 93 
Douglas, Justice William O., 20 
Due Process Clause, 317–318, 321 
duty to the Creator. See higher authority, religious 
claims based on 
Dworkin, Ronald, 4, 193, 310, 311 
Eastern religious traditions, 70, 86, 220 
education. See schools 
 Edwards v. Aguillard, 46 
Eisgruber, Christopher, and Lawrence Sager 
distinctiveness of religious belief and, 58, 62 
on equality paradigm, 24, 28, 45, 52, 53 
on right of exemption, 153, 186, 193 
on secular moral commitments, 303, 315 
Elane Photography v. Willock, 247, 248 
employment and employment laws 
collective bargaining principles and Catholic 
Church, 199–200 
Fair Labor Standards Act, 244, 245 
health care coverage for same-sex spouses, 175 
limitations on free exercise and, 243 
religious conformity, employment conditioned 
on, 266 religious exemptions, 25, 53, 266 
Sabbath work, 231, 260, 266, 267, 282 
Employment Division v. Smith 
accommodation and, 261, 275 
Boerne and, 158 
equality paradigm and, 17–18, 19, 20, 21, 22–29, 38, 43, 46, 47, 48, 50, 55, 67, 76 
new framework for religion clause 
jurisprudence and, 118, 147 
right of exemption and, 151–154, 155–158, 159, 161, 179, 181, 185–186, 187, 188, 189, 192, 194, 196, 198, 201, 205, 215, 228, 241 
sincerity inquiries and, 284 
success rates for free exercise plaintiffs before 
and after, 189 
Supreme Court investment in, 152 
discrimination test, 8, 12, 33–34, 38–39, 48 
etanglement of courts or government in religious 
Equal Access Act, 39 
Equal Protection Clause, 23, 47, 194, 318 
equal treatment between religion and nonreligion 
separation of church and state complemented 
by, 129 
in Supreme Court decisions, 2 
as value in religion clause jurisprudence, 30, 32, 36–42, 46–51, 55, 121–122, 129, 145–146 
equal treatment of religious sects, 136–144, 212–213, 273–276 
equality paradigm, 2 
academic limits on, 3 
continuing power of, 56–57 
Establishment Clause context, development in, 
70–75 
Free Exercise Clause context, development in, 
18–20 
limits of, 2–3, 46–55 
secular moral commitments, protections for, 
301–302, 303–306, 322 
Smith decision as catalyst for, 17–18 
Esbeck, Carl, 44 
Establishment Clause, 1
access of religious speakers to
government-operated speech fora and,
39–40, 49
accommodation, limits on, 8
equal treatment of religious sects and, 136–144,
212–213, 273–276
equality paradigm and understanding of, 2
equality paradigm, development of, 30–46
founding era disagreement on
destablishment, 10–11, 129–131
government funding for religious organizations
and, 44
neutrality between religion and nonreligion
and, 30, 31, 36–42, 46–51
permissibility of religious speech and
symbolism by government and, 46, 48
separation of church and state and, 1, 129
substantively read by Supreme Court, 31, 131

Estate of Thornton v. Caldor, Inc., 260, 265, 266,
267, 273
ethics and morality. See also Backus, Isaac;
Jefferson, Thomas; Madison, James; public
values; secular moral conscience, protections for
common morality shared by founding era
Americans, 164
different religious approaches to, 90
founding era views on importance of
promoting, 163–170
importance of religion for, 106–111
moral perfectionism, founding era
conscientious objection based on, 117, 164,
165, 170, 349
nonreligious support for, 108, 170
religious diversity, inevitability and desirability of,
144–146

evangelical Christianity, 61, 86, 87, 88–90, 109,
119, 176, 177
Everson v. Board of Education, 30, 31, 32, 129
exemption, challenges to articulating right of,
165–166, 215
chaos concerns and, 186–195
defining religion and, 204–211
Employment Division v. Smith, effect of, 147,
151–155
tenet of courts or government in
religious matters and, 200–201, 234–235, 276
equal treatment of religious sects and, 212–213
minority religious beliefs versus larger religious
groups, 179, 197–198, 275
moral diversity replacing former common
morality, 172–182
nineteenth century concerns with, 183–186
problems with balancing and, 195–200, 235–236
public values, exemptions viewed as
undermining, 187, 195
sincerity of claimant, judicial evaluation of,
202–204
exemption, new proposals for right of, 228–229.
See also sincerity inquiries
defining religion, 204–211
divine-human connection, robust protection
for practices essential to, 218–223, 230
entanglement of courts or government in
religious matters, avoiding, 234–235, 276
extrajudicial solutions, encouraging, 251–257
identification of specific situations as covered or
not covered, 232–235
indirect and direct burdens, 231–232
limits on free exercise protection, 235–237
substantially nature of burden, showing, 239
supplemental, minimally protective right of
exemption, 260–261, 276–278
threshold burden on religious exercise, establishing, 229–235
exemption, right of, 8
accommodation, legislative and administrative,
complementary relationship of, 255–259
alternative burdens, imposing, 227
alternatives to traditional compelling state
interest test, 217–218
compelling state interest test and, 154
conscientious objection provisions considered by
first Congress and, 159–161, 164–165,
216–227
disgorgement of surplus secular benefits as
required for, 225–227, 291
extrajudicial compromises for conscientious
objectors, 231–237
founding era views on, 116–118, 159–165,
166–167, 169–171
general applicability, interpretation of, 154–155
Hobby Lobby decision, public backlash against,
157, 181–182
limitations, founding era views on, 167–169
narrow constructions of Smith, room for,
155–158
narrow judicial interpretations of, 154–158
from neutral laws of general applicability, 147
piecemeal approach to, 171–172, 214–215
secular moral conscience, extension to,
302–306
Sherbert v. Verner recognizing, 18
strict scrutiny, 154, 156, 193–194
strong protection of conscience, need for, 216
tax exemptions for religious groups, 322
existent problems and relationship to religious
belief, 83–84, 89–90
expressive function of law, exemptions and accommodations undermining, 271
extrajudicial solutions and compromises, 223–225, 253–257
Fair Labor Standards Act, 244, 245
faith and reason, 64–65, 88, 187, 195
fanaticism and religion, 65–66
federal government. See also government continued application of RFRA to, 188
lack of authority in religious matters and original understanding of religion clauses, 10, 11, 120, 129, 132, 133, 144, 161
Fellowship of Humanity v. County of Alameda, 208, 299, 320
Finnis, John, 94
First Amendment. See also Establishment Clause; Free Exercise Clause
Christian origins, not restricted by, 94
religious groups, protections for, 228
first Congress
Congressional chaplains appointed by, 132
conscientious objector provisions considered by, 118, 159–161, 164–165, 216–227
day of thanksgiving and prayer, resolution respecting, 132
Free Exercise Clause drafted by, 119
lessons for identifying situations requiring strong right of exemption, 218–223
lessons regarding extrajudicial solutions to conflicts between believers and state, 223–225
strong protection of conscience, recognition of need for, 216
for-profit corporations. See corporations founding era views, 5–6, 7. See also first Congress; specific founding era figures, e.g. Madison, James
American Revolution and, 109, 216, 224
on civil disabilities on religious minorities, 114, 162–163, 232
common morality of, 164
on conscientious objection, 117–118, 164
on defining religion, 287
disestablishment, disagreement on, 10–11, 129–131
on distinctiveness of religion, 81, 82–85
ethics and morality, importance of promoting, 169–170, 242
on Free Exercise Clause, 6, 171
on limitations of free exercise, 167–169, 236–238
principles and insights, modern use of, 101

Index

Fourteenth Amendment
Bill of Rights, incorporation of, 11
Due Process Clause, 237–239, 321
Equal Protection Clause, 23, 47, 194, 318
RFRA and, 180
states, religion clauses extended to, 18
fragmentation and personalization of religious belief in America, 208–211, 285, 295–296
fraudulent claims. See also sincerity inquiries
alternative burdens to discourage, 227
defining religion and, 297
disgorgement of surplus benefits to offset, 225–227, 291
secular moral conscience, protections for, 307–318

Frazee v. Illinois Department of Employment Security, 19, 190
Free Exercise Clause, 1. See also limitations on free exercise
civil liberties on religious minorities and, 114, 162–163, 232
compulsory tax support for religion and, 114
civil disabilities on religious minorities, 114, 162–163, 232
conflicts between state practice and, 116–118
conscience, founding era views on freedom of, 166–167
difficulties distinguishing religious and nonreligious beliefs, 60
distinctiveness of religion, implications of, 103–106
of for-profit corporations, 234
as guiding principle of new framework for religion clause jurisprudence, 113–117

Frothingham, Ebenezer, 165
fulfillment, in religious belief systems, 72, 83–84, 90, 102, 210, 230, 287, 300
Fuller, Robert, Spiritual But Not Religious, 209

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org
Index

fundamentalism
Christian, 197
Islam, 104

Garrett, Richard W., 159
Garvey, John, 60, 71
gay rights. See same-sex marriage; sexual orientation discrimination and religious exemptions
Gedicks, Frederick Mark
on accommodation, 264, 269
on distinctiveness of religious belief, 76
on equality paradigm, 43
on right of exemption, 152, 187, 205, 207
on secular moral commitments, 307
gender discrimination and limits on free exercise, 243

Georgia
freedom of religion in, 116
limitations on free exercise in, 168
Gibson, John Bannister, 185
Ginsburg, Justice Ruth Bader, 50, 64, 157, 205, 233–234, 253, 265, 268
God. See the divine, under D
Goldman v. Weinberger, 60, 191, 221, 232, 282, 283
Gonzales v. O Centro Espirita Beneficente Uniao Do Vegetal, 156, 179

Good News Club v. Milford Central School, 46
goodness of the divine
despair, response of, 94, 96–97
religious belief embracing, 83
government. See also federal government;
separation of church and state; states existence, peace, and safety of state, free exercise limits on threats to, 200, 201, 203, 168, 237, 238, 240, 249, 252, 259, 304
funding for religious schools and other religious organizations, 32, 37–38, 39, 40–42, 44
[in]competence in religious matters, 64, 68–69, 124
[re]cognition and benefits, religions competing for, 61–62, 125, 126
religious speakers using government-operated speech fora, 39–40, 49
religious speech and symbolism, restrictions on, 46, 48
Greenawalt, Kent, 4, 74, 202, 218, 265, 286
groups, religious. See religious groups

Hand, Learned, 267
Harlan, Justice John Marshall, 19, 20, 21
health care coverage for same-sex spouses, 175
higher authority, religious claims based on argument for religion’s distinctiveness, difficulties with, 5, 72
charge of sectarianism with respect to, 81
Madison’s use of, 5, 63, 69, 70, 80, 81, 82–84, 167, 302
Hinduism, 70, 86, 88, 89, 96, 210
holiday displays, 32, 34, 38, 40
Holt v. Hobbs, 190, 250, 253
homosexuality. See same-sex marriage; sexual orientation discrimination and religious exemptions
Hosanna-Tabor Evangelical Lutheran Church and School v. EEOC, 50, 52, 53, 56, 155
housing, prohibitions on discrimination in, and limitations on free exercise, 243
humanist organizations, 298, 322
Hume, David, 95

ICCPPR (International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights), 299–300, 318
incompetence of government in religious matters, 64, 68–69, 124
Indians. See entries at Native American indirect and direct burdens on religious exercise, 232–233
individual and group religious rights, relationship between, 158–159, 228
individual liberty and public interests, links between, 315–336
internal affairs of religious organizations, government interference or involvement with, 49–50, 53
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPPR), 299–310, 318
intolerance in religion, 65–66
intrinsic value of religion, as argument in favor of religious protections, 71–72
Islam
ethics in, 90
fundamentalist, 104
mysticism in, 88
Jackson, Justice Robert H., 250
Jainism, 92
Jefferson, Thomas
on acquisition of knowledge about God, 87
on civil disabilities on religious minorities, 114
communal dimensions of belief system of, 292
on contacts compatible and incompatible with principle of separation, 133–135
distinctiveness of religion, implications of, 101
on endowment of rights by Creator, 63
Jefferson, Thomas (cont.)
on equal treatment of religious sects, 158, 141, 143
on Establishment Clause, 150
on ethics and morality, 107, 110
on exemptions from neutral laws of general applicability, 163
on freedom of religion, 104, 105, 110, 119, 122, 300
on identity of moral branch of religion between sects, 164, 169
on individual nature of religion, 87
letter to Danbury Baptist Association, 116, 122, 126, 130, 168
on limits of free exercise, 168, 241
on moral order and religious belief, 106, 109, 110, 169
personalization of Bible by, 208
on religious belief, 84, 302, 315
on religious diversity, 144, 170
on separation of church and state, 10, 30, 122, 124, 155, 126
thanksgiving and prayer, on days of, 133
University of Virginia and, 40, 101, 134, 139
Virginia Bill for Establishing Religious Freedom, 116, 138
Jehovah’s witnesses, proselytizing of, 173
Judiasm
ethics in, 90
Kosher diets for Jewish prisoners, 274
military officer seeking to wear yarmulke on duty, 221, 232
mysticism in, 88
percentage of Americans identifying as Jewish, 210
Satmar Hasidic sect, constitutionality of separate school district for disabled children from, 42, 263
jurisdictions or spheres, different, religion and government regarded as belonging to, 66–68, 122, 128
Kagan, Justice Elena, 7
Kennedy, Justice Anthony, 34, 49, 135, 157, 158, 265
knowability of the divine, 88
knowledge about the divine, means of acquiring, 87–88
Kolber, Adam, 227
Koppelman, Andrew, 72–74, 309, 319
Kurland, Philip, 21, 22
language, Wittgenstein’s philosophy of, 91, 204, 286

Late Corp. of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints v. United States, 173
laws, citizen’s duty of obedience to, 185, 192–193
Laycock, Douglas
on accommodations, 274
on distinctiveness of religious belief, 58, 70
on equality paradigm, 27, 38, 55
on right of exemption, 154, 155, 177, 179, 193, 198, 217
secular moral commitments and, 301, 304, 305, 309, 310, 311
least restrictive means test, 253–254
Lee, Richard Henry, 85, 106, 127
Lee v. Weisman, 46, 64
legal and civil rights of others impacted by religious practice, 241–245
legislative and administrative accommodation. See accommodation, legislative and administrative
Leiter, Brian, 4, 98, 193, 302, 311
Leland, John
on civil disabilities on religious minorities, 114
on contacts compatible and incompatible with principle of separation, 135
distinctiveness of religion and, 84, 87
on equal treatment of religious sects, 140
on Establishment Clause, 150
on exemptions for neutral laws of general applicability, 163
on freedom of religion, 104, 109, 116
on limits of free exercise, 168, 241
on religious diversity, 144
on separation of church and state, 124, 125
Lemon test, 12, 31, 36
Lemon v. Kurtzman, 31
liberal Christianity, 86, 88, 90, 210, 281, 290
liberation, in religious belief systems, 83–84, 90, 97, 102, 105, 146, 219, 230, 287, 288, 300, 314, 317, 323
liberty, individual, and public interests, links between, 315–316
liberty, religious. See freedom of religion
limitations on accommodation, 8, 259–260, 261–276
limitations on free exercise, 114
accommodation, in context of, 8
basic conditions of public order, threats to, 238, 240, 249, 252, 304
exemption, in context of right of, 235–231
existence, peace, and safety of state, threats to, 200, 114, 163, 168, 237, 238, 240, 249, 252, 269, 304
founding era views on, 167–169, 236–238
military, limits relating to, 240
Index

necessary to protect religious liberty, 237
rights of others impacted by free exercise, 241–245
by states, 168, 237
Livingston, Edward, 236
Locke, John, 66, 101, 104, 127, 312
Locke v. Davey, 47, 50, 56
Lupu, Ira C.
on distinctiveness of religious belief, 59, 62
on equality paradigm, 4, 20, 24, 34, 42
on right of exemption, 187, 204, 208
on secular moral commitments, 324
Luther, Martin, 220
Lynch v. Donnelly, 33, 75
Lynn v. Northwest Indian Cemetery Protective Association, 232, 233
Maclure, Jocelyn, 4, 304
Madison, James
balancing approach and, 236
on Bill of Rights, 120, 140
on civil disabilities on religious minorities, 114
on civil strife and religion, 112
on Congressional chaplains, 133, 136, 139
on contacts compatible and incompatible with principle of separation, 133–135, 136
Detached Memoranda, 63
different spheres or jurisdictions, on religion and government belonging to, 66, 122, 128
distinctiveness of religion, implications of, 101
on divine-human connection at heart of religious faith, 219
on equal treatment of religious sects, 138, 140, 141
on Establishment Clause, 150
on freedom of conscience and free exercise of religion, 103, 104, 105, 113, 114, 116, 119, 139, 167, 228, 316
higher authority, religious claims based on, arguments related to, 5, 63, 69, 70, 50, 51, 82–84, 167, 302
on importance of ethics and morality, 106
on legal rights, 242
on limits of free exercise, 236, 237
materialists, response to, 95, 97
Memorial and Remonstrance Against Religious Assessments, 82–84, 85, 100, 103, 112, 113, 115, 122, 123, 167, 210
on moral order and religious belief, 106, 170
opposition to state support for religion, 85, 122
on purpose of Establishment Clause, 10
as rationalist Christian, 85, 87
on religious diversity, 144, 145
on religious exemptions, 117
on separation of church and state, 10, 122, 124, 125, 126, 127, 128, 130
thanksgiving and prayer, on days of, 133, 134
understanding of religion for, 82–84, 287
magic, distinguished from religion, 83, 91, 92, 287–289
Mahayana Buddhism, 86, 88, 89, 90, 92, 96, 105, 260
Malicki v. Doe, 26
Malnak v. Yogi, 205
Marsh v. Chambers, 33
Marshall, William, 22, 26, 58, 205
Maryland
compulsory tax support for religion in, 115, 121, 123, 137, 138, 141, 142
freedom of religion in, 114, 166
limitations on free exercise in, 168, 242
officeworking, declaration of belief in God required for, 162
Massachusetts
compulsory tax support for religion in, 115, 121, 123, 126, 127, 137, 138, 141, 142
equal treatment of religious sects in, 137, 139
freedom of religion in, 113
limitations on free exercise in, 168, 237, 242
religious tests for officeworking in, 138
materialism, in Enlightenment Europe, as argument against religion, 95
McConnell, Michael, 34, 35, 70, 78, 167, 198, 274
McCready County v. ACLU, 46
meaning, religion viewed as source of, 72
Mennonites, 126, 139
military
air force officer seeking to wear yarmulke on duty, 221, 232
conscientious objection to serving in (See conscientious objection)
limits on free exercise relating to, 240
need for uniformity and right of exemption in, 191
Universal Military Training and Service Act, 19, 59
minority religions
civil disabilities on, 144, 162–163, 232
equal treatment of religious sects and, 136–144, 218–213
larger religious groups, success in securing exemptions versus, 179, 197–198, 275
Mississippi, state RFRA statute, 181
Mitchell v. Helms, 40–42, 48, 50
monotheism, 86
Monsma, Stephen, 25, 44, 46, 51, 306
morality. See ethics and morality
Native American Church
percentage of Americans identifying with, 210
peyote use in, 67, 274
Native Americans
government land originally used for religious purposes of, 232
objections to use of social security numbers, 221
natural rights and civil or legal rights, 242
neutral laws of general applicability, religious exemptions from. See exemption, right of neutrality between religion and nonreligion. See equal treatment between religion and nonreligion; equality paradigm; Establishment Clause
new framework for religion clause jurisprudence, 7–8, 100–101, 146–148. See also accommodation, legislative and administrative; exemption, new proposals, for right of
civil strife, prevention of, 111–112
contacts compatible with principle of separation, 122–126
distinctiveness of religion, implications of, 101–113
diversity, religious, inevitability and desirability of, 144–146
equal treatment of sects, 136–144
ethics and morality, importance of religion for, 106–111
founding era principles and insights informing, 101
freedom of religion, importance of, 103–106, 113–122
guiding principles for, 113–146
separation of church and state, 122–132
New Hampshire
equal treatment of religious sects in, 137
limitations on free exercise in, 168, 237, 242
religious tests for officeholding in, 138
New Jersey
equal treatment of religious sects in, 137
religious tests for officeholding in, 138
New Light Congregationalists, 88, 89–90
New Mexico Human Rights Act (NMHRA), 247
Mormon polygamy and religious accommodation, 173
MOVE, 205–207, 222, 274, 293–294
Mueller v. Allen, 37, 38, 42
multiple goods, religion associated with, 73–74
Murdock v. Pennsylvania, 18
mysticism, 88
New York State
creation of separate school district for disabled children from Satmar Hasidic sect, 42, 265
equal treatment of religious sects in, 138
freedom of religion in, 114
limits on free exercise by, 237
right of exemption under state constitution, 183–184, 215
Newman, John Henry, Cardinal, 312
NMHRA (New Mexico Human Rights Act), 247
non-Christians in early America, 141
nonreligious belief. See entries at secular nontheistic faiths, 70, 86, 93, 108, 220, 230
Noonan, John T., Jr., 109, 173, 280
North Carolina, equal treatment of religious sects in, 137–138
North Dakota, proposed state constitutional amendment paralleling RFRA statute in, 181
Northwest Ordinance, 132
Nussbaum, Martha, 28
oath-taking, religious objections to, 164, 167
Obama, Barack, 176
obedience to the state, 185, 192–193
Obergefell v. Hodges, 174, 181, 247
O’Connor, Justice Sandra Day, 7, 33, 38, 41, 48, 50, 241
officeholding, religious tests for, 114, 158, 162–163, 232
Old Light Congregationalists, 88
organizations, religious. See religious groups originalism, 9, 12, 77
pacifism. See conscientious objection
parents and children. See also schools
faith healing, parental reliance on, 274
free exercise of parents affecting liberties of children, 246
Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act (ACA), 156, 157, 175, 181, 233
Paulsen, Michael, 72
Payson, Phillips, 107
Peralver, Eduardo, 286
Pennsylvania, conscientious objection provisions in, 160, 216
Perpetocostals, 107
People v. Philips, 183–184, 185, 215, 237, 238
Pepper, Stephen, 72
Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act, 44
personalization and fragmentation of religious belief in America, 208–211, 285, 295–296
peyote use in Native American Church, 67, 274
Philips v. Gratz, 185
Pe˜ nalver, Eduardo, 173
Payson, Phillips, 107
Paulsen, Michael, 72
Peralver, Eduardo, 286
Pennsylvania, conscientious objection provisions in, 160, 216
Perpetocostals, 107
People v. Philips, 183–184, 185, 215, 237, 238
Pepper, Stephen, 72
Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act, 44
personalization and fragmentation of religious belief in America, 208–211, 285, 295–296
peyote use in Native American Church, 67, 274
Philips v. Gratz, 185
Pe˜ nalver, Eduardo, 173
Payson, Phillips, 107
Paulsen, Michael, 72
Peralver, Eduardo, 286
Pennsylvania, conscientious objection provisions in, 160, 216
Perpetocostals, 107
People v. Philips, 183–184, 185, 215, 237, 238
Pepper, Stephen, 72
Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act, 44
personalization and fragmentation of religious belief in America, 208–211, 285, 295–296
peyote use in Native American Church, 67, 274
Philips v. Gratz, 185
Pe˜ nalver, Eduardo, 173
Payson, Phillips, 107
Paulsen, Michael, 72
Peralver, Eduardo, 286
Pennsylvania, conscientious objection provisions in, 160, 216
Perpetocostals, 107
People v. Philips, 183–184, 185, 215, 237, 238
Pepper, Stephen, 72
Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act, 44
personalization and fragmentation of religious belief in America, 208–211, 285, 295–296
peyote use in Native American Church, 67, 274
Philips v. Gratz, 185
Index

philosophy, distinguished from religion, 83
pietist Christianity, 65
pluralism
  defining religion and, 285
  difficulties articulating distinctiveness of religion and, 60–75
  equal treatment of religious sects, 136–144
  inevitability and desirability of religious diversity, 144–146
  moral diversity replacing former common morality, 172–182
  practical problems for exemption rights raised by increase in, 185
public values, disagreements about, 110–111
polygamy, 173, 238
polytheism, 86
post-modern position on reality beyond human experience, 95–96
prayer
  Congressional chaplains, 33, 130, 133, 136, 139
  at government sessions, 33
  presidential proclamations of days of thanksgiving and, 132, 133, 134
  in schools, 127
Priestley, Joseph, 293
prisons
  exemption claims by prisoners, 188, 205–207, 222, 240, 249, 274, 296–297
  limits on free exercise, 240
  religious requests for special diets in, 205–207, 222, 274
  private versus public settings, accommodations in, 273
public accommodations and limitations on free exercise, 243
public good, contributions of religion to, 60
public interests and individual liberty, links between, 315–316
public order, basic conditions for, and limits on free exercise, 238, 240, 249, 252, 304
public values
  disputes over, 110–111
  religion in America as informing, 74, 75, 98–99
  religious diversity, inevitability and desirability of, 144–146
  right of exemption viewed as potentially undermining, 187, 195
  public versus private settings, accommodations in, 273
Puritans, 88, 89–90, 112, 293
Quakers, 117, 126, 139, 160, 164, 166, 167, 172, 216, 219–221. See also conscientious objection
racial discrimination
  interracial dating and marriage, revocation of tax exempt status for Christian university prohibiting, 191
  limits on free exercise and, 243
rationalist Christians, 65, 85, 87, 88–89, 109
Rawls, John, 28
reason and faith, 64–65, 88, 187, 195
Rehnquist, Justice William H., 7, 50
religion in American law, 1–13
  accommodation, 8, 258–261. See also accommodation, legislative and administrative
  common human experience, relationship of religion to, 6–7
  current issues, examination of, 8–9
defining, 285–290. See also defining religion
demonstrating religion’s distinctiveness, 80–82. See also distinctiveness of religion, demonstrating
difficulty articulating why religion should be treated differently, 4–5. See also distinctiveness of religion, difficulties articulating
equality paradigm, shift to, 2. See also equality paradigm
founding era views on, 5–6, 7. See also founding era views
implications flowing from uniqueness of, 7
individual and group rights, relationship between, 158–159, 228
individual religious believer and state, focus on relationship between, 9
new framework for decisionmaking, development of, 7–8, 100–101, 146–148. See also new framework for religion clause jurisprudence
originalism, role of, 9, 12, 77
protection, religion clauses originally viewed as, 1–2
right of exemption, 8. See entries at exemption
secular moral conscience and, 9, 300–324. See also secular moral conscience, protections for
sincerity inquiries and, 279–285. See also sincerity inquiries
states, incorporation of religion clauses against, 12
religious diversity. See pluralism
religious equality amendment, Congressional consideration of, 45
Religious Freedom Restoration Act (RFRA) balancing under, 193
challenges of right of exemption and, 188, 189, 190, 192–194, 199
changing views on right of exemption and, 156, 157, 173, 180, 181, 182
commercial activity under, 267
compelling state interest test under, 29, 193–194
equality paradigm and, 29
federal government, continued application to, 188
for-profit corporations under, 234
least restrictive means test, 233–254
religious exercise under, defined by RLUIPA, 249, 250
religious groups
access to government funding for social welfare, 44
individual and group rights, relationship between, 158–159, 228
internal affairs of, government interference or involvement with, 49–50, 53
limits on free exercise of, 245
property tax exemptions for, 262–263, 298
protection of, 159–159, 228
tax exemptions for, 322
Religious Land Use and Institutionalized Persons Act (RLUIPA)
compelling state interest test under, 188, 193–194
equality paradigm and, 26, 29, 47
judicial construction of, 190, 250, 253–254
least restrictive means test, 233–254
religious exercise under, 249, 250
right of exemption and, 174, 180, 188, 194
sincerity inquiries and, 265
religious liberty. See freedom of religion
Religious Liberty Protection Act (RLPA), 29, 173, 180
religious minorities. See minority religions
religious speakers using government-operated speech fora, 39–40, 49
religious traditions, commonalities and variations in views among, 85–94
reproductive choice, 157, 175–176, 181–182
Revolutionary War, 190, 216, 224
Reynolds v. United States, 173, 183, 184, 185, 186
RFRA. See Religious Freedom Restoration Act
Rhode Island conscientious objection in, 225
equal treatment of religious sects in, 138
right of exemption. See entries at exemption
rights of others impacted by religious practice, 241–245
RLPA. See Religious Liberty Protection Act
RLUIPA. See Religious Land Use and Institutionalized Persons Act
Roberts, Justice John, 7, 155, 156
Roman Catholic Church. See Catholic Church
Roman Catholic Supreme Court justices, 157
Rosenberger v. Rector and Visitors of the University of Virginia, 40
Rush, Benjamin, 106, 145
Ryan, James, 172
Sabbath, accommodations related to observance of, 231, 260, 266, 267, 282
Sager, Lawrence. See Eisgruber, Christopher, and Lawrence Sager
salvation, in religious belief systems, 73–74
same-sex marriage
dignitary harms related to religious refusal to serve same-sex couples, 247, 248–249, 271
exemption claims related to, 173–175, 181, 247–248, 271
health care coverage and, 175
prohibitions against discrimination based on sexual orientation and exemption claims, 173
rights of same-sex couples and limits on free exercise, 247–249
state legislation recognizing, 174
Santa Fe Independent School District v. Doe, 49
Satmar Hasidic sect, constitutionality of separate school district for disabled children from, 42, 263
Saybrook Platform, 123
Scalia, Justice Antonin, 50, 157, 196, 201, 205, 241
School District of Abington Township v. Schempp, 32
schools
attendance exemptions, 38
eyear American proposals for publicly-funded education, 139–140
facilities, access to, 36, 39
limits on exemptions in context of education, 240
prayer, Bible readings, and religious invocations in, 32, 46, 127
religious schools, direct state aid to, 32, 41
religious schools, indirect state aid to, 32, 37–38, 39, 40–42
Index

Satmar Hasidic sect, constitutionality of separate school district for disabled children, 42, 263
Schwartzman, Micah, 4, 54–55, 310
Scottish Common Sense Realism, 87
Second Vatican Council, 105, 332
secular beliefs
difficulties distinguishing from religious belief, 57–69
distinguished from religious belief, 102, 302, 306, 314–315
equality protection for (See equality paradigm)
equal treatment for religious sects and, 142–144
ethics and morality supported by, 193, 170
growing similarity of religious belief and, 207–208
Supreme Court on equality between religion and, 2
secular benefits associated with exemptions
disgorgement of, in context of religious exemptions, 225–227
managing, in context of protections for secular moral commitments, 308
minimization of incentives associated with, in context of religious exemptions, 291
secular hostility to religion and religious liberty, 177, 179
secular moral conscience, protections for, 9, 300–324
collapsing distinction between religious and nonreligious belief, dangers of, 310–311, 315
comprehensive moral or philosophical doctrines, 54–55
conscientious objection, 303, 310–322
distinguished from religious belief, 302, 306, 314–315
divine implicit in secular moral reasoning, 311–314
Due Process Clause and, 317–318, 321
Equal Protection Clause and, 23, 47, 194, 316
equality paradigm and, 301–302, 303–306, 322
extending right of exemption to, 303–306
forms of, 317–321
fraudulent claims, detecting, 307–308
in ICCPR, 309–310, 318
public interests and individual liberty, links between, 315–316
secular benefits of exemptions and, 308
sincerity inquiries and, 307–309
weaker right of exemption when coverage extended to, 309–310
self-identity, self-definition, and religious belief, 59, 103
separation of church and state
contacts compatible with principle of, 132–136
equal treatment between religion and nonreligion complementing, 129
as guiding principle in new framework for religion clause jurisprudence, 122–132
implications for equal treatment of religious sects, 141
separationism, as Supreme Court doctrine, 8, 12, 30–33, 34–35, 41, 49, 61, 129
Serbian Eastern Orthodox Diocese for the U.S. & Can. v. Milivojevich, 64
Seventh-day Adventism, 4
sex discrimination and limits on free exercise, 243
sexual orientation discrimination and religious exemptions, 171–172, 173–175, 247. See also same-sex marriage
Sherbert v. Verner
equality paradigm and, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 26, 29, 47
right of exemption and, 151, 153, 156, 172, 173, 186, 188, 189, 190, 196, 231, 232
sincerity inquiries and, 282, 283
Shinto, 92
sincerity inquiries, 279–285
challenges related to right of exemption and, 202–204
defining religion and, 296–297
guidelines for courts regarding, 222
inconsistencies between free exercise claims and belief systems, 280
overall conduct and claimant assertions, examining fit between, 282–284
plausibility or rationality of belief, 281
pluralism, fragmentation, and personalization of religion affecting, 285
relationship of religious persons with the divine and, 281–282
secular moral conscience, protections for, 307–309
spoofs and parodies, 283
Supreme Court on, 202–203
truth of belief, 280
Siracusa Principles, 310
Siik, Gregory, 197
Smith, Steven, 220
Smith v. O’Connell, 25
Smith v. Raleigh Dist. of the N.C Conference of the United Methodist Church, 26
Social Gospel movement, 109
social welfare
health care coverage for same-sex spouses, 175
religious groups’ access to government funding for, 44
| social welfare (cont.) uniform eligibility criteria and right of exemption, 191, 222  |
| Sotomayor, Justice Sonia, 7  |
| Souter, Justice David, 50, 51  |
| special status of religion. See entries at distinctiveness of religion  |
| speech and symbolism, religious, by government, 33–35, 48  |
| spheres or jurisdictions, different, religion and government regarded as belonging to, 66–68, 122, 128  |
| State. See government state constitutions  |
| disestablishment and, 115, 121, 126, 127, 145  |
| equal treatment of religious sects in, 157–159, 179  |
| freedom of religion in, 113–114  |
| protections against denial of civil rights based on religion, 115  |
| religious tests for officeholding in, 114, 138, 162–163, 232  |
| tax supports for religion in, 114, 121, 126, 127, 137, 141, 142  |
| states. See also specific states  |
| Bill of Rights incorporated against, 11  |
| compulsory state tax supports for religion, 114, 121, 126, 127, 137, 141, 142  |
| on conscientious objection, 160, 166  |
| early expansion of conscience protections by, 121  |
| equal treatment of religious sects in, 157–158  |
| Free Exercise Clause and early constitutions of, 10  |
| limits on free exercise, 168, 237  |
| property tax exemptions for religious groups, 262–263, 298  |
| religion clauses incorporated against, 12, 18  |
| RFRA, state statutes tracking, 180, 190  |
| same-sex marriage legislation, 174  |
| statism, increase in, 185, 192–193  |
| Stevens, Justice John Paul, 7, 20, 34, 50  |
| strict scrutiny, 154, 155, 193–194  |
| See also compelling state interest test  |
| subjectivity of religious belief in America, 207–210, 290–291  |
| substantial nature of burden on religious exercise, 231  |
| supplemental, minimally protective right of exemption, 260–261, 276–278  |
| Supreme Court, U.S. See also specific justices and cases  |

analogue approach to defining religion used by, 285  |
| Catholic justices, 157  |
| compelling state interest test, watering down of, 189–192  |
| development of equality paradigm in Establishment Clause context, 30–46, 129  |
| development of equality paradigm in Free Exercise Clause context, 18–29  |
| on distinctiveness of religion, 60, 71, 100  |
| on equality between religion and nonreligion, 2  |
| Establishment Clause substantively read by, 11, 131  |
| interpretation of RFRA and RLUIPA, 156, 181–182, 192, 233–234, 250, 253–254, 267  |
| on limits on accommodations burdening third parties, 265–268  |
| limits placed on equality paradigm by, 2–3, 46–51  |
| on protective function of religious clauses, 1  |
| RFRA struck down by, 29  |
| on sincerity inquiries, 202–203  |
| surplus secular benefits associated with religious exemptions, disgorgement of, 225–227, 291  |
| Taoism, 86, 89  |
| taxation. See also specific states  |
| compulsory state tax supports for religion, 114, 121, 126, 127, 137, 141, 142  |
| door-to-door distribution of religious literature and license tax, 18, 173  |
| exemptions for religious groups, 322  |
| general taxes, no right to designate use of, 239  |
| payroll taxes, right of exemption from, 191, 239, 267  |
| property tax exemptions for religious groups, 262–263, 298  |
| sales tax exemptions for religious publications, 262  |
| specialized taxes, exemptions from, 239  |
| Taylor, Charles, 4, 301  |
| Ten Commandments, government displays of, 30  |
| Texas Monthly, Inc. v. Bullock, 260, 262, 263  |
| thanksgiving and prayer, presidential proclamations of days of, 132, 133, 134  |
| theism, in Western and other faith traditions, 85–86, 93  |
| therapy, distinguished from religion, 83  |
| third parties burdened by religious accommodations, 264–272  |
| Thomas, Justice Clarence, 12, 41, 50  |
| Thomas v. Review Board, 190, 232  |
| threshold burden on religious exercise, establishing, 229–235  |
Index

Tillich, Paul, 96, 103
Toqueville, Alexis de, 63
Tony and Susan Alamo Foundation v. Secretary of Labor, 244, 245
Torcaso v. Watkins, 163, 298
Town of Greece v. Galloway, 12, 49
Tucker, Thomas, 133
Tushnet, Mark, 21
Tuttle, Robert W., 4, 59, 62, 187, 208, 324
ultimate meaning, association of religious belief with, 59, 72–73, 82–83, 91, 92
unaffiliated believers in America, percentage of, 207, 209, 211, 279
uniqueness of religion. See entries at distinctiveness of religion
Unitarians, 126, 210, 293
United States v. Ballard, 202, 280
United States v. Lee, 191, 239, 267, 268
United States v. Seeger, 19, 20, 285, 319
United States v. Windsor
Universal Military Training and Service Act, 19, 59
University of Virginia, 40, 101, 134, 139
U.S. Religious Landscape Survey, 210–211
Van Orden v. Perry, 12, 46, 50, 51, 75
Van Tassell, Rebecca, 264, 269
Vatican Council II, 105, 312
Vietnam War, 319
Virginia assessment bill for teachers of Christian religion, 85, 88, 115, 123, 137, 138, 139, 141, 142
Bill for Establishing Religious Freedom, 116, 126
equal treatment of religious sects in, 138
Establishment Clause and, 131
freedom of religion in, 116
University of Virginia, 40, 101, 134, 139
Virginia Declaration of Rights, 82, 114, 236
virtue. See ethics and morality
voluntariness in religious matters. See freedom of religion
Walz v. Tax Commission, 262, 263
Washington Ethical Society v. District of Columbia, 298, 299
Washington, George, 67, 106, 132, 133, 131, 172, 185, 225
Welsh v. United States, 19, 20, 21, 24, 59, 285, 304, 305, 308, 319, 320
West, Ellis, 22
West, Samuel, 127
Widmar v. Vincent, 36, 37, 39, 42, 43
Williams, Roger, 208, 293
wine, sacramental use of, 274
Wisconsin v. Yoder, 18, 20, 25, 60, 151, 190, 303, 323
Witherspoon, John, 87
Witters v. Washington Department of Services for the Blind, 37, 47
Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 91, 204, 286
Withrow, Robert, 209
Zelman v. Simmons-Harris, 42, 46, 47, 50
Zorach v. Clauson, 31, 74, 75, 263