

US INTERNATIONAL LAWYERS IN THE INTERWAR YEARS

In the interwar years, a group of reform-minded American scholars of international law, such as Quincy Wright and Manley Hudson, challenged traditional international law and strove to establish a 'new' international law in which outlawry of war was institutionalized. They highly valued the Covenant of the League of Nations and the Kellogg–Briand Pact, and presented legal arguments in support of them. These scholars were activists in their efforts to promote their views to policy makers and the public. In the US international law community, however, a different group of scholars, notably Edwin Borchard, vehemently opposed the progressive scholars. *US International Lawyers in the Interwar Years* chronicles those involved in the debate and provides a detailed account of their scholarly works and activities that hitherto have not had the recognition that they deserve.

HATSUE SHINOHARA is a professor of international relations at the Graduate School of Asia-Pacific Studies, Waseda University. Her work takes a multidisciplinary perspective involving law, history and politics.

US INTERNATIONAL LAWYERS IN THE INTERWAR YEARS

A forgotten crusade

HATSUE SHINOHARA



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-107-01643-9 — US International Lawyers in the Interwar Years: A Forgotten Crusade

Hatsue Shinohara

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107016439

© Hatsue Shinohara 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2012

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Shinohara, Hatsue.

US international lawyers in the interwar years : a forgotten crusade / Hatsue Shinohara.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-01643-9 (hardback)

1. Lawyers – United States – History. 2. Practice of law – United States – History.

3. International law – United States – History. I. Title. II. Title: United States
international lawyers in the interwar years.

KF297.S43 2012

341.023'73–dc23 2012016082

ISBN 978-1-107-01643-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-107-01643-9 — US International Lawyers in the Interwar Years: A Forgotten Crusade

Hatsue Shinohara

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

In Memory:
Robert William Adams
(1960–2000)

“What a fine mind, and truly original good character you have.”

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
Introduction	1
1 The rise of a new international law	12
Root, Scott and the American Society of International Law	12
New and different views: Reinsch, Borchard and Fenwick	17
World War I and division	21
Rising stars from the war era: Garner and Wright	26
Reconstruction or departure: the Committee for the Advancement of International Law	29
2 Toward a more ambitious international law	37
The worldwide configuration	37
The Covenant of the League of Nations and the Washington Conference	43
A distinction between political and legal questions?	50
A happy synthesis: from theory to practice	56
3 Can international law master war?	64
Intellectual discussions on the legal limitations of war	64
The Geneva Protocol	71
Outlawry of war and the Kellogg–Briand Pact	74
Testing the ideals of the Pact: diplomatic repercussions	83

viii	CONTENTS	
4	Half-victory: international law and the Manchurian Incident	92
	Japan's pattern of dissent	93
	A treaty-based approach to China	98
	Theoretical arguments over the Manchurian conflict	103
	The Stimson Doctrine: a great innovation?	112
	A new treaty system: work at the League of Nations	116
5	For better or for worse: the debate over neutrality	123
	Stimson and Wright vs. Moore and Borchard	124
	Views on neutrality from abroad	131
	The American Society of International Law in 1935	137
	Beyond the Neutrality Act of 1935	141
6	International law in a lawless world	149
	The challenge of military hostilities	149
	The legal situation in the Far East	153
	Cordell Hull and the study of international law	159
	International law during the war in Europe	165
	A fresh round of criticism	171
7	Reconstructing the world order once again	177
	Debates over the postwar international organization	177
	War of aggression as crime	188
	Changing orientation in the discipline: from international law to international relations	199
	Conclusion	205
	<i>Appendix: List of International Lawyers in the Interwar Period</i> 217	
	<i>Bibliography</i> 218	
	<i>Index</i> 242	

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work has had a long trajectory. My first encounter with Quincy Wright took place in spring 1983, when I entered the MA program of the School of Law, Waseda University, in Tokyo. The first text for our seminar that year was Wright's *A Study of War*. The interdisciplinary academic milieu of diplomatic history and international law at Waseda helped me to develop the basic academic backbone for this work. My sincere gratitude goes to Tokushiro Ohata, and my fellow students at that time.

However, I had not fully appreciated my background in legal studies – in fact I had felt it rather a burden in an academic atmosphere in which political science oriented IR was dominant – until I rediscovered Wright at the University of Chicago when I was searching for a dissertation topic in the fall of 1990. I was lucky enough to find that his manuscript collection was stored at the university's library. The first couple of days in its reading room were enough for me to decide resolutely to write about Wright and his time. Even to a young historian like me back then, the historical significance lying in his documents was compellingly obvious.

During the first stage of primary source collection, I was highly indebted to the American Society of International Law and in particular to Jill Watson, then Director of Library Services. Without her generous help in finding the Society's documents in the summer of 1991, this work could not have reached its current academic standard. She also kindly introduced me to the late Eleanor Finch, who shared with me her recollections of the period in question.

I wish to express my deepest appreciation to the great teachers I was able to study with at the University of Chicago. The late Barry D. Karl inspired me with his faith in the relevance of theories of social science for public policy, which led me to see the importance of the relationship between international law and foreign policy in the interwar years. Tetsuo Najita introduced me to the magnitude of intellectual history, where ideas have great power. And finally, my greatest intellectual debt goes to Akira Iriye, who, in particular, taught me that an important task for an international

historian is to expand the field. His demand for a high academic standard taught me one should never be content with one's work, but should always strive to improve it.

For their hospitality and friendship during my stay in Chicago, I wish to express my sincere appreciation to Kate and Jim Ficke. They have helped me and supported me since the moment I first arrived at O'Hare Airport in 1984.

I am also deeply grateful to Tadashi Aruga for his valuable assistance in enabling the publication of an earlier Japanese version of this work in 2003. Without his kind help and warm sympathy, this work would have remained unpublished for good, and even worse it would have taken much longer for me to recover from a period of great loss and sorrow in my life. After its publication in Japan, to my happy surprise, it was welcomed by the international law community. I would like to express my gratitude to Shinya Murase and Akira Kotera for giving me the opportunity to expand my research on this topic, and also to Anthony Carty, who read the whole original English thesis version and gave me encouraging comments.

My special thanks go to Yasuaki Onuma. Not only did he support my interest and orientation, but also his commitment to the study of international law led me to the biannual meeting of the Asian Society of International Law held in Tokyo in the summer of 2009. There I had the fortunate opportunity to meet Martti Koskenniemi and Finola O'Sullivan, which incidentally opened the door leading to this publication. I am also indebted to Shiro Amano, who successfully recovered original digital data for me. Sayuri Guthrie-Shimizu, Bennett Richardson and Shuichi Okuda helped me in the preparatory stage of securing a contract with the publisher. I am also grateful to the anonymous reviewers and Shuichi Furuya for their valuable suggestions. Jeffrey Hall proofread, edited and improved the manuscript with his insights and thoroughness.

I have greatly benefitted from colleagues and students at Keisen Jogakuen College, Meijigakuin University and Waseda University, who have been the source of my intellectual inspiration and support as well as the basis for fulfillment in my professional life.

Throughout it all, my family and friends have supported me in numerous ways. Without their support, in particular during a very difficult time of my life, I would have given up my academic career. I am very grateful to my parents Kazutoyo and Yuko Shinohara, my sisters and their family as well as many other friends – friends such as Shoko Aoki and Sheila Hones.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

xi

Last but not least, I would like to thank my American family. My mother-in-law, Marolyn Adams, has always had faith in me. My ultimate debt, however, goes to my late husband, Bob Adams, who was the first reader of and commentator on this work. The original version of this work would never have been finished without his love and encouragement. Despite his passing, I could still sense his invisible guidance leading me to the completion of this work. Perhaps I am in part fulfilling his dream of having his own work published. To his memory I sincerely dedicate this book.

An initial version of Chapter 1 appeared in the *Japanese Journal of American Studies* 5 (1993–4), and that of Chapter 2 in the *Keisen Jogakuen College Bulletin* 6 (1994), while an earlier full version in Japanese, *Senso no Ho kara Heiwa no Ho he* [From the Law for War to the Law for Peace], was published by the University of Tokyo Press (2003).