

The Science of Language

Noam Chomsky is one of the most influential thinkers of our time, yet his views are often misunderstood. In this previously unpublished series of interviews, Chomsky discusses his iconoclastic and important ideas concerning language, human nature, and politics. In dialogue with James McGilvray, Professor of Philosophy at McGill University, Chomsky takes up a wide variety of topics – the nature of language, the philosophies of language and mind, morality and universality, science and common sense, and the evolution of language. McGilvray's extensive commentary helps make this incisive set of interviews accessible to a variety of readers. The volume is essential reading for those involved in the study of language and mind, as well as anyone with an interest in Chomsky's ideas.

NOAM CHOMSKY is Institute Professor (retired) in the Department of Linguistics and Philosophy at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

JAMES MCGILVRAY is Professor of Philosophy at McGill University, Montréal.





The Science of Language

Interviews with James McGilvray

Noam Chomsky





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107602403

© Noam Chomsky and James McGilvray 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Chomsky, Noam.

The science of language: interviews with James McGilvray / Noam Chomsky.
p. cm.
ISBN 978-1-107-01637-8 (Hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-60240-3 (Paperback)
1. Chomsky, Noam–Interviews. 2. Chomsky, Noam–Philosophy. 3. Cognition and language. 4. Psycholinguistics. I. McGilvray, James. II. Title.
P85.C47A3 2011
401–dc23

2011030292

ISBN 978-1-107-01637-8 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-60240-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Introduction		page 1	
Part I The science of language and mind			
1	Language, function, communication: language and the use of language	11	
2	On a formal theory of language and its accommodation to biology; the distinctive nature of human concepts	21	
3	Representation and computation	31	
4	More on human concepts	33	
5	Reflections on the study of language	36	
6	Parameters, canalization, innateness, Universal Grammar	39	
7	Development, master/control genes, etc.	46	
8	Perfection and design (interview 20 January 2009)	50	
9	Universal Grammar and simplicity	59	
10	On the intellectual ailments of some scientists	65	
11	The place of language in the mind	69	
12	Chomsky's intellectual contributions	76	
13	Simplicity and its role in Chomsky's work	80	
14	Chomsky and Nelson Goodman	86	
Part II Human nature and its study			
15	Chomsky on human nature and human understanding	95	
16	Human nature and evolution: thoughts on sociobiology and evolutionary psychology	103	

© in this web service Cambridge University Press



vi	Contents		
17	Human nature again	108	
18	Morality and universalization	113	
19	Optimism and grounds for it	118	
20	Language, agency, common sense, and science	124	
21	Philosophers and their roles	129	
22	Biophysical limitations on understanding	132	
23	Epistemology and biological limits	133	
24	Studies of mind and behavior and their limitations	138	
25	Linguistics and politics	152	
Appendices			
I	I-concepts, I-beliefs, and I-language	153	
II	The several uses of "function"	157	
III	On what is distinctive about human nature (and how to deal with the distinction)	176	
IV	Chomsky on natural science	183	
V	Of concepts and misguided theories of them, and why human concepts are unique	186	
VI	Semantics and how to do it	206	
VII	Hierarchy, structure, domination, c-command, etc.	232	
VIII	Variation, parameters, and canalization	239	
IX	Simplicity	243	
X	Hume on the missing shade of blue and related matters	247	
XI	Syntax, semantics, pragmatics, non-Chomskyan and Chomskyan	250	
XII	An internalist picture of how concepts 'work'	255	
Commentaries		262	
Glo	Glossary		
Bibl	Bibliography		
Inde	Index		