

# The Cambridge Companion to Human Rights Law

Human rights are considered one of the big thoughts of the early twenty-first century. This book presents in an authoritative and readable form the variety of platforms on which human rights law is practised today, reflecting also on the dynamic inter-relationships that exist between these various levels. The collection has a critical edge. The chapters engage with how human rights law has developed in its various subfields, what (if anything) has been achieved and at what cost, in terms of expected or unexpected side-effects. The authors pass judgment about the consistency, efficacy and success of human rights law (set against the standards of the field itself or other external goals). Written by world-class academics, this *Companion* will be essential reading for students and scholars of human rights law.

Conor Gearty is Professor of Human Rights Law at the London School of Economics and Political Science. He is a specialist in European and UK human rights law, as well as in terrorism law and civil liberties, on each of which subjects he has written extensively. He is also a barrister and a founding member of Matrix Chambers from where he continues to practise.

Costas Douzinas is Professor of Law and Director of the Birkbeck Institute for the Humanities. In his many books, and the talks he has given around the world, he has developed a position on human rights that seeks to retain the radical and emancipatory power of the term and practice without however accepting the arid and self-interested arguments of the powerful (of both the scholarly and political variety).





# The Cambridge Companion to

# **Human Rights Law**

Edited by

**Conor Gearty** 

London School of Economics and Political Science

and

**Costas Douzinas** 

Birkbeck College, University of London





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107016248

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed and bound in the United Kingdom by the MPG Books Group

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The Cambridge companion to human rights law / edited by Conor Gearty and Costas Douzinas.

p. cm.

Papers presented at a conference at Birbeck College in London in November 2011 – Preface. Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-1-107-01624-8

 Human rights - Congresses. I. Gearty, C. A. II. Douzinas, Costas, 1951– K3239.8.C36 2012
 341.4'8-dc23

2012023178

ISBN 978-1-107-01624-8 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-60235-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### Contents

	Preface	page vii
	Notes on contributors	ix
	List of acronyms and abbreviations	xiii
	Introduction	
	Costas Douzinas and Conor Gearty	1
	Part I All kinds of everyone	15
1	'Framing the project' of international human rights law: reflections on the dysfunctional 'family' of the Universal Declaration	
	Anna Grear	17
2	Restoring the 'human' in 'human rights': personhood and	
	doctrinal innovation in the UN disability convention Gerard Quinn with Anna Arstein-Kerslake	36
3	The poverty of (rights) jurisprudence Costas Douzinas	56
	Part II Interconnections	79
4	Foundations beyond law Florian Hoffmann	81
5	The interdisciplinarity of human rights Abdullahi A. An-Na'im	97
6	Atrocity, law, humanity: punishing human rights violators Gerry Simpson	114
7	Violence in the name of human rights Simon Chesterman	134



#### vi Contents

8	Reinventing human rights in an era of hyper-globalisation: a few wayside remarks	
	Upendra Baxi	150
	Part III Platforms	171
9	Reconstituting the universal: human rights as a regional idea Chaloka Beyani	173
10	The embryonic sovereign and the biological citizen: the biopolitics of reproductive rights Patrick Hanafin	191
11	Spoils for which victor? Human rights within the democratic state Conor Gearty	214
12	Devoluted human rights Chris Himsworth	231
13	Does enforcement matter? Gerd Oberleitner	249
	Part IV Pressures	269
14	Winners and others: accounting for international law's favourites  Margot E. Salomon	271
15	Resisting panic: lessons about the role of human rights during the long decade after 9/11 Martin Scheinin	293
16	What's in a name? The prohibitions on torture and ill treatment today  Manfred Nowak	307
17	Do human rights treaties make enough of a difference? Samuel Moyn	329
	Index	348



## **Preface**

This study was planned and brought to fruition over the past couple of years. It has been the source of many thoroughly enjoyable excuses for conversation between the two of us, and also provided the platform for a quite extraordinarily energetic and creative conference at Birkbeck College in London in November 2011. Our idea for the conference was to bring together not only the contributors to this volume but also to a sister volume that we are editing. The result was a four-day event marked by papers that combined strong interdisciplinary engagements with fascinating multidisciplinary styles. Like blindfolded wine tasters we played the game of telling discipline from style without checking first who the speaker was and we were not often wrong – our lawyers, a good proportion of this volume's contributors, did not let us down, demonstrating that good lawyers can always engage with the world outside without sacrificing the analytical strengths that have made them excellent in their own field in the first place.

Human rights law has migrated from a little-known corner of international law to the whole of law and to the entirety of social relations. To collate a compendium on human rights law is an impossible task. A compendium is a 'shortcut across a mountain' and by extension a shortening, an abridgment, an abbreviation. Can such heavy concepts as those entailed in human rights law be shortened or abridged? A compendium must be a shortcut to the most weighty matter, to gains saved over centuries. Can there be a shortcut for human rights law? In this sense, we freely acknowledge that the present collection is caught in a paradox that can be resolved only partially. We have done our best in the selection of contributors to capture the international nature of our subject and the vibrancy of current debates within it. Of course we would have liked an even wider range of writers, from more places and different backgrounds, but the demands of space precluded this.

We are grateful to the Leverhulme Trust for funding the conference, the Birkbeck Law School, the LSE Department of Law and the Birkbeck Institute for the Humanities for their support in hosting the conference and to



viii Preface

Cambridge University Press for generously sponsoring the conference reception. We are also particularly grateful to Valerie Kelley for her efficient and elegant organisation of the event and to Julia Eisner for her support. And finally we are immensely grateful to our editor at the Press Sinéad Moloney for having conceived the idea of this book and, having approached us to write it, given us her full support throughout the editing process.

**Costas Douzinas and Conor Gearty** 



### Notes on contributors

Abdullahi A. An-Na'im is Charles Howard Candler Professor of Law, Emory University, Atlanta, USA. His most recent publications include *Muslims and Global Justice* (2011) and *Islam and the Secular State* (2008).

Anna Arstein-Kerslake is a Marie Curie Research Fellow in the Disability Rights Expanding Accessible Markets (DREAM) Training Network. Before becoming a DREAM Researcher, she worked on disability rights issues in the Brussels office of Human Rights Watch and spent a year as a student attorney in Rhonda Copelon's International Women's Human Rights (IWHR) Clinic at CUNY School of Law. From 2008 to 2010 she sat on the Association of the Bar of the City of New York (ABCNY) Committee on Legal Issues Affecting People with Disabilities.

Upendra Baxi is Emeritus Professor of Law, University of Warwick and University of Delhi. He has served as a Vice Chancellor, University of Delhi and University of South Gujarat and as Director (Research) at the Indian Law Institute. His most recent works include *The Future of Human Rights* (3rd edn, 2008) and *A Tale of Three Cities: Aspects of Justice* (forthcoming 2013).

Chaloka Beyani is Senior Lecturer in International Law, Law Department, London School of Economics and Political Science. He is also UN Special Rapporteur on the Human Rights of Internally Displaced Persons.

Simon Chesterman is Dean of the National University of Singapore Faculty of Law. He is the author or editor of twelve books, including *One Nation Under Surveillance* (2011); *Law and Practice of the United Nations* (with Thomas M. Franck and David M. Malone, 2008); *You, The People* (2004); and *Just War or Just Peace*? (2001).

Costas Douzinas is Professor of Law and Director of the Birkbeck Institute for the Humanities, Birkbeck College, University of London. Educated in Athens, London and Strasbourg, Costas has taught at the Universities of Middlesex, Lancaster, Prague, Athens, Griffith and Nanjing. Costas is a founding member of the Critical Legal Conference; founding member of the Birkbeck Law School and the Birkbeck Institute for the Humanities; managing editor of *Law and* 



#### x Notes on contributors

Critique: The International Journal of Critical Legal Thought and managing director of the publishing house Birkbeck Law Press. Costas has written extensively on legal and political philosophy, human rights, aesthetics, literature, art and critical theory. His books include Postmodern Jurisprudence (1991); The End of Human Rights (2000); Critical Jurisprudence (2005); Nomos and Aesthetics (1996); Human Rights and Empire (2007); Philosophy and Resistance in the Crisis (forthcoming 2013). He has edited the collection Law and the Image; Adieu Derrida; The Idea of Communism; New Critical Legal Studies. His books have been translated into twelve languages.

Conor Gearty is Professor of Human Rights Law at the London School of Economics and Political Science, a founding member of Matrix Chambers and a fellow of the British Academy. He has published many books on human rights, civil liberties and terrorism, most recently *Debating Social Rights* (2011, with Virginia Mantouvalou) and *Essays on Human Rights and Terrorism* (2008). His publication on the internet *the rights future* (see www.therightsfuture.com) appeared in 2011 and his *Liberty and Security* will be published by Polity Press at the start of 2013. As a practising barrister he has appeared in cases in the Administrative Court, the Court of Appeal and the House of Lords.

Anna Grear is Associate Professor of Law at the University of Waikato, New Zealand. She is a legal theorist whose work focuses largely upon questions related to law's construction of the human being and of the human relationship with the world, broadly conceived. In human rights theory, her work has primarily focused upon questions concerning international human rights subjectivity and the politics of dis/embodiment. Her book *Redirecting Human Rights: Facing the Challenge of Corporate Legal Humanity* was published in 2010.

Patrick Hanafin is Professor of Law at Birkbeck Law School, Birkbeck College, University of London, where he also directs the Law School's Centre for Law and the Humanities. His research engages with questions of law and biopolitics, law and literature, human rights and citizenship, and the construction of community and identity in constitutional discourse. He has been a Visiting Professor at the School of Law at the University of Porto, Portugal and at the Law Faculty at the University of Pretoria, South Africa.

Chris Himsworth has been teaching and researching in public law at the University of Edinburgh since the mid 1970s. Latterly he has been Professor of Administrative Law and is now Emeritus Professor at the University. He has written widely in the fields of administrative law, local government, devolution



Notes on contributors

хi

and human rights and has had a particular interest in Scottish devolved government and inter-governmental relationships within the UK.

Florian Hoffmann is currently the Franz Haniel Chair of Public Policy and a Deputy Director of the Willy Brandt School of Public Policy at the University of Erfurt, Germany. Prior to joining the School in 2010 he taught at the London School of Economics and Political Science and the Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro (PUC-Rio). He works at the interface between law and politics, with a special interest in international law and human rights.

Samuel Moyn is Professor of History at Columbia University, where he has taught since 2001. Most recently, he is the author of *The Last Utopia: Human Rights in History* (2010); he is also editor of *Humanity*, a new interdisciplinary journal. He has served as Visiting Professor of Law at Harvard and Yale University, and is now at work on the trajectory of human rights in the last several decades.

Manfred Nowak is Professor of International Law and Human Rights and Scientific Director of the Vienna Master of Arts in Human Rights at the University of Vienna. He is also Director of the Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights, and served for many years as UN Expert on Enforced Disappearance, as Judge at the Human Rights Chamber for Bosnia and Herzegovina, and as UN Special Rapporteur on Torture 2004–10. He has authored more than 500 publications in the fields of constitutional, administrative and international law with a focus on fundamental and human rights.

Gerd Oberleitner is Senior Lecturer at the Institute of International Law and International Relations at the University of Graz, Austria. He was Lecturer in Human Rights at the London School of Economics and Political Science and Visiting Scholar at the School's Centre for the Study of Human Rights, the European Inter-University Centre in Venice and the Université du Québec à Montréal. His publications include *Global Human Rights Institutions: Between Remedy and Ritual* (2007).

Gerard Quinn is Professor of Law at the National University of Ireland, Galway and director of its Centre for Disability Law and Policy. He led the delegation of Rehabilitation International at the negotiations during the Working Group session of the UN Ad Hoc Committee that negotiated the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. He is a former member of the Irish Human Rights Commission and a former Vice President of the European Committee on Social Rights (Council of Europe).

Margot E. Salomon is Senior Lecturer at the Centre for the Study of Human Rights and Law Department, London School of Economics and Political Science.



#### xii Notes on contributors

She specialises in international human rights law and global economic justice and has consulted and published widely on the topic. Recent publications include *Global Responsibility for Human Rights: World Poverty and the Development of International Law* (2007) and 'Deprivation, Causation, and the Law of International Cooperation', in M. Langford *et al.* (eds.), *Global Justice, State Duties* (2012).

Martin Scheinin is Professor of Public International Law at the European University Institute in Florence, Italy. In 2005–11 he served as the first UN Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism.

Gerry Simpson holds the Sir Kenneth Bailey Chair of Law at Melbourne Law School. He is a Visiting Professor of Public International Law at the London School of Economics and Political Science and Open Society Fellow at the State University of Tbilisi in Georgia. His latest book, The *Margins of International Law*, will be published in 2012.



# Acronyms and abbreviations

ACESCR American Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

ACHR American Convention on Human Rights

APC African, Pacific and Caribbean
ART assisted reproductive technology

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations

ASP Acts of the Scottish Parliament
BIT Bilateral Investment Treaty

CAT Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or

Degrading Treatment or Punishment

CCPR Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination

against Women

CERD International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of

Racial Discrimination

CHM common heritage of mankind

CIDT cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment CPT European Committee for the Prevention of Torture

CRC Convention on the Rights of the Child

CRPD Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

CRT Convention on the Rights of the Child CSW Commission on the Status of Women

CTITF Counter-Terrorism Implementation Task Force

DRC Democratic Republic of the Congo

DRD Declaration on the Right to Development

ECHR European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental

Freedoms

ECJ European Court of Justice
ECOSOC Economic and Social Council
ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

HRA Human Rights Act (UK)



#### xiv Acronyms and abbreviations

IACHR Inter-American Court on Human Rights

ICC International Criminal Court

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural

Rights

ICISS International Commission on Intervention and State

Sovereignty

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia

IIA International Investment Agreement O.II International Labor Organization INTERFET International Force for East Timor Judicial Committee of the Privy Council JCPC Member of Parliament (Westminster) MP **MSP** Member of the Scottish Parliament NATO North American Treaty Organisation NGO non-governmental organisation NIEO New International Economic Order

NIO New Informational Order

NPM national preventive mechanism
 OAS Organisation of African States
 OAS Organization of American States
 OAU Organisation of African Unity

OECD Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development

OHCHR Office of the High Commissioner of Human Rights
OPCAT Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture

PPP purchasing power parity

PSNR principle of permanent sovereignty over natural resources

PTSD post-traumatic stress disorder R2P responsibility to protect

SHRC Scottish Human Rights Commission

SNP Scottish National Party
TNC transnational corporation

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UN United Nations



Acronyms and abbreviations

χV

UNCAT UN Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or

Degrading Treatment or Punishment

UNCLOS UN Convention on the Law of the Sea

UNDP UN Development Programme

UNHCR UN High Commissioner for Refugees

UPR Universal Periodic Review

WARM World Association for Reproductive Medicine

WTO World Trade Organization