

THE JUDICIAL APPLICATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

Since the proclamation of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, over 165 countries have incorporated human rights standards into their legal systems; the resulting jurisprudence from diverse cultural traditions brings new dimensions to concepts first articulated in 1948. In this revised second edition, Nihal Jayawickrama draws on extensive sources to encapsulate the judicial interpretation of human rights law in one comprehensive volume. Jayawickrama covers the case law of the superior courts of 103 countries in America, Europe, Africa, Asia, the Caribbean and the Pacific, as well as jurisprudence of human rights monitoring bodies. He analyses the judicial application of human rights law to demonstrate empirically the universality of contemporary human rights norms. This definitive compendium is essential for legal practitioners and government and non-governmental officials, as well as academics and students of both constitutional law and the international law of human rights.

NIHAL JAYAWICKRAMA was the Ariel F. Sallows Professor of Human Rights at the University of Saskatchewan, and Associate Professor of Law at the University of Hong Kong, where he taught both constitutional law and the international law of human rights. He was Chair of Justice, the Hong Kong Section of the International Commission of Jurists; Chair of the Trustees of the Commonwealth Human Rights Initiative, London; and a member of the Permanent Court of Arbitration at The Hague. Executive Director of Transparency International, Berlin, from 1997 to 2000, he has since 2001 been the Coordinator of the UN-sponsored Judicial Integrity Group, a representative group of Chief Justices, who prepared the Bangalore Principles of Judicial Conduct and related documents. A member of the Sri Lanka Bar, he held the offices of Attorney General and Permanent Secretary to the Ministry of Justice and served as a representative to the United Nations General Assembly.



THE JUDICIAL
APPLICATION OF HUMAN
RIGHTS LAW

National, Regional and International Jurisprudence

Second Edition

NIHAL JAYAWICKRAMA





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107015685
DOI: 10.1017/9781139059121

© Nihal Jayawickrama 2002, 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First Edition 2002 Reprinted 2006 Second Edition 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN-13 9781107015685 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



In memory of
Sarojini
friend, companion and critic



CONTENTS

	Preface to the Second Edition page ix Preface xi Table of Cases xv
PART I	Introduction 1
1	Historical and Juridical Background 3
2	The International Bill of Human Rights 24
3	The Domestic Protection of Human Rights 70
4	The Right to a Remedy 102
PART II	General Principles 113
5	Interpretation 115
6	Non-Discrimination 133
7	Limitations 146
8	Derogation 165
PART III	The Substantive Rights 183
9	The Right of Self-Determination 185
10	The Right to Life 206
11	The Right to Freedom from Torture 281
	vii



viii

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01568-5 — The Judicial Application of Human Rights Law 2nd Edition Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

	CONTENTS
12	The Right to Freedom from Slavery 348
13	The Right to Liberty 364
14	The Rights of Prisoners 432
15	The Right to Freedom of Movement 448
16	The Right to a Fair Trial 490
17	The Rights of Accused Persons 561
18	The Right to Recognition as a Person 642
19	The Right to Privacy 645
20	The Right to Freedom of Thought 704
21	The Right to Freedom of Opinion, Expression and Information 739
22	The Right to Freedom of Assembly 835
23	The Right to Freedom of Association 851
24	The Right to Family Life 881
25	The Rights of the Child 906
26	The Right to Participate in Public Life 920
27	The Right to Equality 950
28	The Rights of Minorities 992
29	The Rights Relating to Work 1003
30	The Rights Relating to Social Security 1016
31	The Right to an Adequate Standard of Living 1025
32	The Right to Health 1041
33	The Right to Education 1051
34	The Right to Cultural Life 1065
35	The Right to Property 1074

Index

1089



PREFACE TO THE SECOND EDITION

It is nearly fifteen years since the first edition of this book was published. Although the language of the principal human rights instruments have remained the same, their judicial interpretation has significantly extended the frontiers of human dignity and freedom. As Justice Sachs observed in the Constitutional Court of South Africa, 'as the conditions of humanity alter and as ideas of justice and equity evolve, so do concepts of rights take on new texture and meaning'. This has been particularly evident in the development of the law in respect of the right to life, freedom from torture, freedom of expression, freedom from discrimination, the right to privacy and the right to family life.

In this edition, the emphasis is on jurisprudence. Accordingly, in the introductory section, the chapter dealing with the international protection of human rights has been replaced with one on the right to a remedy. In the section on substantive rights, many of the chapters have been extensively revised and re-written, drawing not only on the increasing volume of jurisprudence from international and regional human rights tribunals, but also on the judgments of superior courts of over a hundred states, from the Pacific to the Caribbean, through Asia, Africa, Europe and the Americas. In this enormous volume of case law, one striking feature is the recognition of the universality of human rights – the common thread that binds them together.

The re-writing of this book was interrupted, intermittently, during almost two years due to the illness of my wife, Sarojini. She insisted, before she passed away, that I should complete it. I am extremely grateful for the patience and kindness extended to me during that difficult period by Finola O'Sullivan, the Executive Publisher of Law, and the encouragement that I since received from my two daughters, Nishana and Sharanya, which helped me bring my task to an end.



PREFACE

From 1978, I was associated with Professor Paul Sieghart, then chairman of Justice, the United Kingdom section of the International Commission of Jurists, and Professor James Fawcett, then president of the European Commission of Human Rights, in a research project on the international law of human rights. My research on the jurisprudence of the Strasbourg institutions and of national courts was incorporated in Paul Sieghart's pioneering work, *The International Law of Human Rights*, which was published in 1983. The cut-off date for the law examined in that book was 31 December 1981.

In the next two decades, the international human rights regime strengthened considerably. More than 150 countries, spread over every continent, incorporated contemporary human rights standards into their legal systems. More than 100 countries ratified the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, thereby enabling their inhabitants to access the Human Rights Committee. Meanwhile, nearly all the countries of South and Central America, Africa and Europe subscribed to regional human rights instruments with their own monitoring or enforcement mechanisms. The resulting jurisprudence, rich in content and varied in flavour, from diverse cultural traditions, has added a new dimension to the concepts first articulated in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. This book seeks to incorporate that jurisprudence and, in that sense, complement the late Paul Sieghart's invaluable work.

I have not set out to produce a scholarly work on human rights or on international law. There are already several analyses of the theoretical foundations and the politics of human rights, commentaries on the different human rights instruments, academic studies of selected rights, and surveys of selected case law of the Strasbourg institutions and of the Human Rights Committee. What is lacking is a volume that assembles all



XII PREFACE

the available jurisprudence on human rights from international, regional and national sources, a book that presents the content of human rights law as interpreted by the courts. That is the need I have set out to meet.

In identifying the substantive content of the rights recognized in the International Bill of Human Rights, i.e. the Universal Declaration and the two covenants, I have drawn on the following sources:

- 1. *Travaux préparatoires*, particularly in respect of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
- Texts of international instruments dealing with specific rights and other standard setting resolutions of the United Nations General Assembly, specialized agencies and subsidiary institutions
- 3. General comments of the Human Rights Committee and the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, and the conclusions of the Committee of Experts under the European Social Charter
- 4. Judgments and advisory opinions of the International Court of Justice and its predecessor, the Permanent Court of International Justice
- 5. Decisions of the Human Rights Committee on individual communications received under the Optional Protocol, and of the Committee against Torture
- 6. Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights and the reports and decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights
- 7. Decisions and advisory opinions of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights and the reports of the Inter-American Commission of Human Rights
- 8. Judgments of superior courts in national jurisdictions interpreting and applying domestic Bills of Rights, wherever the specific rights and freedoms have been formulated in terms identical or similar to those enunciated in the two international human rights covenants
- 9. Works of jurists

The depth of discussion of a particular right is dependent on the availability of case law. Accordingly, the chapters on economic, social and cultural rights are necessarily brief, while some on civil and political rights may appear inordinately long. Since I have been able to work only in the English language, references to national jurisprudence from the European continent are often based on published summaries. The cut-off date for the law incorporated in this book is, to the extent practicable, 31 December 2001.



PREFACE Xiii

Any work of this kind involves considerable research. Much of the early work was done in the libraries of the United Nations in New York and Geneva, and of the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies in London. I am grateful to the former United Nations Centre for Human Rights in Geneva, the General Secretariat of the Organization of American States in Washington, DC, and the Secretariat of the Council of Europe in Strasbourg for sending me regularly a wealth of information contained in their publications, documents and reports. Many friends, including my former colleagues in Hong Kong, have either sent me, or directed me to, material which I was unaware of or had overlooked, or provided me access to their personal collections.

Writing a book of this nature is difficult to combine with regular teaching at a university, as I soon discovered after I commenced preliminary work on it while teaching constitutional, administrative and human rights law at the University of Hong Kong. I am most grateful, therefore, for the opportunity the University of Saskatchewan afforded me in 1992-3, to spend an academic year in Saskatoon, in the exhilarating climate of the Canadian prairies. It was during that year, when I had the privilege of occupying the Ariel F. Sallows Chair of Human Rights, that I began writing this book. I could not have found a more conducive or stimulating environment, made even more agreeable by the warmth and kindness with which Dean Peter MacKinnon, QC, and his colleagues received my family and me. After leaving both Hong Kong and academia in 1997, progress on this book was interrupted for a while as I commuted between London and Berlin (and a few other places as well), learning and exploring the new, but not entirely unrelated, area of corruption in public life and, more especially, in the judiciary.

This book would not, of course, have assumed the shape and form in which it appears today but for the help and co-operation which was always forthcoming from Professor James Crawford, Whewell Professor of International Law at the University of Cambridge, and Ms Finola O'Sullivan, Executive Publisher of Law, and Dr Jennie Rubio, Law Development Editor, at Cambridge University Press. I am grateful for their recognition of the need for a definitive text on this subject and their belief in my capacity to produce and deliver within the time constraints that regulate most things in life. An effort spread over a decade would not have been possible without the continuing tolerance and understanding of my family. Indeed, it was their profound interest and encouragement that



XİV PREFACE

enabled this work to reach fruition. My deepest debt, therefore, is owed to my wife, Sarojini, and to our two daughters, Nishana and Sharanya, all of whom, I am sure, looked forward on each New Year's Day to life finally returning to normal in our home, wherever it might have been located.

The language of the chapters on the substantive rights that follow is rarely mine. The real authors are the lawyers and judges, the men and women of many cultures who, individually and collectively, enhanced the value of human life and extended the frontiers of human dignity by their courageous, imaginative and innovative approach to the interpretation and application of international and regional human rights instruments and national constitutions. I have attempted to assemble in a single volume as much of the material as I have been able to gather, in the hope that their endeavours will help and inspire others not only to follow but even to improve upon their achievements. Thereby, the evolving body of international human rights law will, in fact, become the universally accepted common standard by which the conduct of governments, public officials, private bodies and individuals is measured. If I have expressed a preference for a particular view, criticized a decision or projected a dissent, I have done so because of my own perception that in the protection of human rights, it is not possible to compromise; there can be no halfway houses, no wayside halting places. Human rights are not only fundamental; they are also inherent and inalienable.



TABLE OF CASES

International

Permanent Court of International Justice

Chorzow Factory Case, PCIJ Reports 1928, Series A, No.17, 29	17
Greco-Bulgarian Communities, PCIJ Reports 1930, Series B.,	
No.17	994
Minority Schools in Albania Case, PCIJ Reports 1935, Series A/B,	
No.64	19
Mosul Boundary Case, PCIJ Reports 1925, Series B, No.12, 32	16
Steiner and Gross v. The Polish State, Upper Silesian Arbitral	
Tribunal, Cases Nos.188 and 287, Annual Digest 1927-8	19
Intermedian 1 Count of Instin	
International Court of Justice	
Aegean Sea Continental Shelf Case, ICJ Reports 1978, 39	15
Applicability of Article VI, Section 22 of the Convention on the	
Privileges and Immunities of the United Nations, Advisory	
Opinion, ICJ Reports 1989 25	, 41, 885
Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment	
of the Crime of Genocide (Bosnia and Herzogovina v.	
Yugoslavia), ICJ Reports 1993	23
Application for Review of Judgment No.333 of the United Nations	
Administrative Tribunal, ICJ Reports 1987	41
Asylum Case (Colombia v. Peru), ICJ Reports 1950, 266	16
Barcelona Traction, Light and Power Company Limited Case	
(Belgium v. Spain), ICJ Reports 1970 16, 17	, 38, 352



> xvi TABLE OF CASES Case Concerning Maritime Delimitation and Territorial Questions between Qatar and Bahrain (Qatar v. Bahrain) (Jurisdiction - First Phase), ICJ Reports 1994 15 Case concerning Maritime Delimitation in the Area between Greenland and Jan Mayen (Denmark v. Norway), ICJ Reports 1993 17 Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Teheran Case (USA v. Iran), ICJ Reports 1980 17, 32, 40 Legal Consequences for States of the Continued Presence of South Africa in Namibia (South West Africa) Notwithstanding Security Council Resolution 276 (1970), ICJ Reports 1971 23, 31, 33, 40, 117, 195, 203 Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons, ICJ Reports 1996 211, 253 Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua Case (Nicaragua v. USA), ICJ Reports 1986 16, 17 North Sea Continental Shelf Case (Federal Republic of Germany v. Denmark and the Netherlands), ICJ Reports 1969 16 Nottebohm Case (second phase), ICJ Reports 1955, 23 23, 40 Reservations to the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide Case, ICJ Reports 1951 43 South West Africa Case (second phase), ICJ Reports 1966 40 Western Sahara Case, ICJ Reports 1975 190, 195 Human Rights Committee A v. Australia, Communication No.560/1993, HRC 1997 Report, Annex VI.L 376, 381, 423, 427 A Group of Associations for the Defence of the Rights of the Disabled and Handicapped Persons in Italy v. Italy, Communication No.163/1984, HRC 1984 Report, Annex XV 48 A v. New Zealand, Communication No.754/1997 429 A v. United Kingdom, 19 February 2009 376

Aarela and Nakkalajarvi v. Finland, Communication No.779/

1997

503, 513



> TABLE OF CASES xvii AB v. Italy, Communication No.413/1990, HRC 1991 Report, Annex XII.O 47, 192 AB Dr v. Italy, Communication No.565/1993, HRC 1994 Report, Annex X.AA Aboufaied v. Libyan Arab Jamahariya, Communication No.1782/ 2008 399 Aboushanif v. Spain, Communication No.1542/2007, 17 July 627 Aboussedra v. Libyan Arab Jamahariya, Communication No.1449/2006 428 Ackla v. Togo, Communication No.505/1992, HRC 1996 Report, Annex VII.I 457 Acosta v. Uruguay, Communication No.110/1981, HRC 1984 Report, Annex XI 306 AD v. Canada, Communication No.78/1980, HRC 1984 Report, Adam v. The Czech Republic, Communication No.586/1994, Selected Decisions, vol.6, p.121 106, 959 Adams v. Jamaica, Communication No.607/1994, HRC 1997 Report, Annex VI.P 315, 440 Adimayo Aduayom v. Togo, Communication Nos.422-4/1990, HRC 1996 Report, Annex VIII.C 948 Aduayom et al v. Togo, Communication Nos.422, 423 and 424/ 1990, 12 July 1996 755, 814 Ahani v. Canada, Communication No.1051/2002 42.2 495, 552 Akwanga v. Cameroon, Communication No.1813/2008 Aliboeva v. Tajikistan, Communication No.985/2001 606, 626 Aliev v. Ukraine, Communication No.798/1997, HRC 2003 Report, vol.II, p.54 272, 606 Altesor v. Uruguay, Communication No.10/1977, HRC 1982 Report, Annex IX 439 Alzery v. Sweden, Communication No.1416/2005, Selected Decisions, vol.9, p.243 106, 326 Amirov v. The Russian Federation, Communication No.1447/ 2006, HRC 2009 Report, vol.II, p.199 255 Amundson v. The Czech Republic, Communication No.1508/

2006, 17 March 2009

959



XVIII TABLE OF CASES

Angela Poma Poma v. Peru, Communication No.1457/2006, 27 March 2009	106
Anni Aarela v. Finland, Communication No.779/1997, Selected Decisions, vol.7, p.90	502
AP v. Italy, Communication No.204/1986, HRC 1988 Report,	29, 630
ARJ v. Australia, Communication No.692/1996, Selected	
Decisions, vol.6, p.177	629
Arredondo v. Peru, Communication No.688/1996, Selected	
Decisions, vol.1, p.36	553
ARS v. Canada, Communication No.91/1981, 28 October 1981	637
Arutyungan v. Uzbekistan, Communication No.917/2000, HRC	
2004 Report, vol.II, p.96 2	72, 607
Asensi v. Spain, Communication No.1413/2005, HRC 2008	
Report, p.146	515
Ashby v. Trinidad and Tobago, Communication No.580/1994,	
HRC 2002 Report, vol.II, p.13	593
Ashurov v. Tajikistan, Communication No.1348/2005, 20 March	
2007	409
Aumeeruddy-Cziffra v. Mauritius, Communication No.35/1978,	
1	80, 889
Avellanal v. Peru, Communication No.202/1986, HRC 1989	
•	06, 975
B ν. Netherlands, Communication No.273/1989, HRC 1989	
Report, Annex XI.F	968
Baboeram-Adhin v. Suriname, Communication No.146/1983,	
HRC 1985 Report, Annex X	251
Bahamonde v. Equatorial Guinea, Communication No.468/1991,	
	95, 544
Bailey v. Jamaica, Communication No.334/1988, 31 March	
	39, 508
Bailey v. Jamaica, Communication No.709/1996, HRC 1999	
Report, Annex XI.W	625
Bakhtiyari v. Australia, Communication No.1069/2002, Selected	
•	85, 914
Bakhytzhan Torego-Zhina v. Kazakhstan, Communication	
No.2137/2012, 21 October 2014	798



TABLE OF CASES XIX

Ballantyne, Davidson and McIntyre v. Canada, Communication	tion
Nos.359/1989 and 385/1989, 31 March 1993	147, 788, 811
Bandajevsky v. Belarus, Communication No.1100/2002,	
Selected Decisions, vol.9, p.84	414, 626, 627
Barbato v. Uruguay, Communication No.84/1981, HRC 198	3
Report, Annex IX	235
Barcaiztegui v. Spain, Communication No.1019/2001, Selector	ed
Decisions, vol.8, p.27	980
Barney v. Colombia, Communication No.1298/2004, Selected	d
Decisions, vol.9, p.188	554
Barrett and Sutcliffe v. Jamaica, Communication Nos.270/19	988
and 271/1988, HRC 1992 Report, Annex IX.F	315
Barroso v. Panama, Communication No.473/1991, HRC 199	95
Report, Annex X.F	593
Barzhig v. France, Communication No.327/1988, HRC 1991	
Report, Annex XI.F	615
Basnet v. Nepal, Communication No.2051/2011, 29 October	
•	409, 439, 644
Bazzano v. Uruguay, Communication No.5/1977, HRC 1979	
Report, Annex VII	305
Belyatsky v. Belarus, Communication No.1296/2004, Selected	d
Decisions, vol.9, p.177	867
Benhadj v. Algeria, Communication No.1173/2003, Selected	
Decision, vol.9, p.143	423, 439, 553
Bennet v. Jamaica, Communication No.590/1994	626
Bequio v. Uruguay, Communication No.88/1981, HRC 1983	3
Report, Annex XXII	306
Berry v. Jamaica, Communication No.330/1988, HRC 1994	
Report, Annex IX.D	273, 616
Bertelli Galvez v. Spain, Communication No.1389/2005	627
Bhandari v. Nepal, Communication No.2031/2011, 29 Octob	oer
2014	105, 409, 644
Bhinder v. Canada, Communication No.208/1986, HRC 199	
Report, Annex IX.E	735, 982
Birindwa and Tshisekedi v. Zaire, Communication Nos.241	and
242/1987, HRC 1990 Report, Annex IX.I	457
Bleier v. Uruguay, Communication No.30/1978, HRC 1982	
Report, Annex X	49



XX

TABLE OF CASES

Blom v. Sweden, Communication No.191/1985, HRC 1988		
Report, Annex VII.E		989
Bodrozic v. Serbia and Montenegro, Communication No.1180/		
2003, 31 October 2005	811,	813
Bolanos v. Ecuador, Communication No.238/1987, HRC 1989		
Report, Annex X.I 416,	428,	527
Bolshakov v. The Russian Federation, Comunication No.1946/		
2010, 15 October 2014		506
Boodoo v. Trinidad and Tobago, Communication		
c c	418,	720
Bousroual v. Algeria, Communication No.992/2001, Selected		
Decisions, vol.9, p.50		258
Bouton v. Uruguay, Communication No.37/1978, HRC 1981		
Report, Annex XIV		292
Brinkhof v. The Netherlands, Communication No.402/1990, 27 July	r	
1993		983
Broeks v. The Netherlands, Communication No.172/1984, HRC		
1987 Report, Annex VIII.B	138,	975
Brough v. Australia, Communication No.1184/2003, Selected		
Decisions, vol.9, p.154		447
Brown v. Jamaica, Communication No.775/1997, HRC 1999		
	607,	608
Brown and Parish v. Jamaica, Communication No.665/1995		626
Burgos v. Uruguay, Communication No.R. 21/52/1979, HRC 1981		
Report, Annex XIX		601
Burrell v. Jamaica, Communication No.546/1993, HRC 1996		
Report, Annex R		272
Butaev v. Tajikistan, Communication No.1264/2004, 20 October		
2008		612
Bwalya v. Zambia, Communication No.314/1988, 14 July 1993		371
Byahuranga v. Denmark, Communication No.1222/2003,		
	323,	684
Cabreira v. Uruguay, Communication No.105/1981, HRC 1983		
Report, Annex XXI		440
Cadeno v. Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela, Communication		
No.1940/2010, 29 October 2012		416
Cadoret v. France, Communication No.221/1987, HRC 1991		
Report, Annex IX.A		526



TABLE OF CASES		xxi
Cagas, Butin and Astillero v. The Philippines, Communication No.788/1997, Selected Decisions, vol.7, p.98	582,	583
Caldas v. Uruguay, Communication No.43/1979, HRC 1983 Report, Annex XVIII	439,	591
Camargo v. Colombia, Communication No.45/1979, HRC 1982 Report, Annex XI		210
Campbell (Glenford) v. Jamaica, Communication No.248/ 1987, HRC 1992 Report, Annex IX.D 272, 400, 422,	603,	616
Campbell (John) v. Jamaica, Communication No.307/1988, 24 March 1993		518
Canepa v. Canada, Communication No.558/1993, HRC 1997 Report, Annex VI.K	483,	652
Carballal v. Uruguay, Communication No.33/1978, HRC 1981 Report, Annex XI		292
Cariboni v. Uruguay, Communication No.159/1983, HRC 1988 Report, Annex VII.A		291
Casanovas v. France, Communication No.441/1990 Casariego v. Uruguay, Communication No.56/1979, HRC 1981	513,	
Report, Annex XX	377,	439
Celepli v. Sweden, Communication No.456/1991, HRC 1994 Report, Annex IX.Z		456
Chan v. Guyana, Communication No.913/2000 Chaplin v. Jamaica, Communication No.596/94, HRC 1995	588,	607
Report, Annex VIII.Y Chongwe v. Zambia, Communication No.821/1998, HRC 2001		315
Report, vol.I, Cifuntes Elgueta v. Chile, Communication No.1536/2006,		371
HRC 2009 Report, vol.II, p.491 109, 110, 256, CLD <i>v.</i> France, Communication No.228/1987, HRC 1988 Report		260
Annex VIII.E Coeriel and Aurik v. The Netherlands, Communication No.453/	1	.002
1991, HRC 1995 Report, Annex X.D Coleman v. Australia, Communication No.1157/2003	653, 811,	
Collins v. Jamaica, Communication No.240/1987, HRC 1992	011,	
Report, Annex IX.C Collins v. Jamaica, Communication No.356/1989, 25 March		515
1993		549



XXII TABLE OF CASES

611
600
688
554
604
985
503
506
628
643
890
914
798
291
590
590
590 935
935
935 440
935



Dissanayake v. Sri Lanka, Comunication No.1373/	2005,		
HRC 2007–2008 Report, p.109	382, 797, 799,	825,	938
Deolall v. Guyana, Communication No.912/200, F.	IRC		
2005 Report, vol.II, p.40		271,	616
Des Fours Walderode v. The Czech Republic, Con	nmunication		
No.747/1197, 30 October 2001			959
Diegaardt v. Namibia, Communication No.760/19	97, Selected		
Decisions, vol.7, p.69		192,	981
Dingiri Banda v. Sri Lanka, Communication No.14	126/2005, 26		
October 2007			106
Domukovsky v. Georgia, Communication Nos.623	6-627, HRC		
1998 Report, Annex XI.M	292,	626,	627
Douglas v. Jamaica, Communication No.352/1989	HRC 1994		
Report, Annex IX.G		587,	624
Drbal ν . Czech Republic, Communication No.498/	1992, 22 July		
1994, HRC 1994 Report, Annex X.N			914
Dudco v. Australia, Communication No.1347/2009	5		507
EB v. Jamaica, Communication No.303/1988, HRC	C 1996 Report,		
Annex VIII.D			607
EHP v. Canada, Communication No.67/1980, Sele	cted Decisions,		
vol.2,p.20			242
Elena Quinteros v. Uruguay, Communication No.	107/1981		109
El Hassy v. Libyan Arab Jamahariya, Communicat	ion no.1422/		
2005, 24 October 2007			106
Engo v. Cameroon, Communication No.1397/2009	5		417
EP ν. Colombia, Communication No.318/1988, HR	C 1990 Report	,	
Annex X.P			192
Espinoza de Polay v. Peru, Communication No.57	7/1994,		

TABLE OF CASES

HRC 1998 Report, Annex XI.F

Everett v. Spain, Communication No.961/2000

Exposito v. Spain, Comunication No.1359/2005

Evrezov v. Belarus, Communication No.1999/2010,

Report, Annex XII

10 October 2014

Decisions, vol.9, p.68

Estrella v. Uruguay, Communication No.74/1980, HRC 1983

Faure v. Australia, Communication No.1036/2000, Selected

439, 440, 441

527, 839, 846

293, 601

506

504

363

xxiii



XXIV TABLE OF CASES

Faurisson v. France, Communication No.550/1993, HRC 1997	
Report, Annex VI.I	751, 812
Fei v. Colombia, Communication No.514/1992, HRC 1995	
Report, Annex X.J 515, 517, 5	527, 904
Fernando v. Sri Lanka, Communication No.1189/2003,	
Selected Decisions, vol.9, p.400	382
Fijalkowska . Poland, Communication No.1062/2001 394, 4	122, 428
Fillastre v. Bolivia, Communication No.336/1988, HRC	
1992 Report, Annex IX.N 412, 415, 4	118, 593
Finn v. Jamaica, Communication No.617/1995, HRC 1998	
Report, Annex XI.K	440
FJAK v. Australia, Communication No.2094/2011	396
Foin v. France, Communication No.666/1995, HRC 2000 Report,	
Annex IX.C	953, 959
Francis (Clement) v. Jamaica, Communication No.606/1994,	
HRC 1995 Report, Annex X.N 315, 4	139, 440
Francis (Victor) v. Jamaica, Communication No.320/1988,	
24 March 1993	272, 626
Francis Hopu and Tepoaitu Bessert v. France, Communication	
No.549/1993, HRC 1997 Report, Annex VI.H	678, 679
Freemantle v. Jamaica, Communication No.625/1995	412
Gallimore v. Jamaica, Communication No.680/1996, HRC 1999	
Report, Annex XI.U	508, 628
Garcia v. Ecuador, Communication No.319/1988, Selected	
Decisions, vol.4, p.90	488
Gauthier v. Canada, Communication No.633/1995,	
Selected Decisions, vol.6, p.135 747, 770, 797, 8	324, 863
Gavrilin v. Belarus, Communication No.1342/2005	422
Gerardus Strik v. The Netherlands, Communication No.1001/	
2001	631
Gilboa v. Uruguay, Communication No.147/1983, HRC 1986	
Report, Annex VIII.B	292
Giry v. Dominican Republic, Communication No.193/1985, HRC	
1990 Report, Annex IX.C	488
Giuterrez Vivanco v. Peru, Communication No.678/1996	554
Gomariz v. Spain, Communication No.1095/2002	625
Gomez Vazquez v. Spain, Communication No.701/1966, HRC	
2000 Report, Annex IX.I	627



TABLE OF CASES		XXV
Gomez Casafranca v. Peru, Communication No.981/2001,		
Selected Decisions, vol.8, p.228 293	3, 410,	636
Gonzalez del Rio v. Peru, Communication No.263/1987		535
Gordon v. Jamaica, Communication No.237/1987, 5 November	•	
1992		612
Gorji-Dinka v. Cameroon, Communication no.1134/2002,		
Selected Decisions, vol.9, p.374 375, 376	6, 444,	457
Goyet v. France, Communication No.1746/2008, 30 October		
2008		105
Graham and Morrison v. Jamaica, Communication No.461/199)1	
HRC 1996 Report, Annex VIII.G	272,	315
Grand Chief Donald Marshall v. Canada, Communication		
No.205/1986, HRC 1991 Report, Annex IX.A	939,	940
Grant v. Jamaica, Communication No.353/1988, HRC 1994		
Report, Annex IX.H	2, 607,	613
Gridin v. The Russian Federation, Communication		
No.770/1997, HRC 2000 Report, Annex IX.O 515, 519	9, 582,	590
Griffin v. Spain, Communication No.493/1992, HRC 1995		
Report, Annex VIII.G 399	9, 440,	444
Grioua v. Algeria, Communication No.1327/2004, Selected		
Decisions, vol.9, p.229	6, 428,	644
Guesdon v. France, Communication No.219/1986, HRC 1990		
Report, Annex IX.G	526,	613
Gueye v. France, Communication No.196/1985, HRC 1989		
Report, Annex X.B	139,	985
Hak-Chul Shin v. Republic of Korea, Comunication No.926/200)0,	
16 March 2004		791
Hammel v. Madagascar, Communication No.155/1983, 3 HRC		
1987 Report, Annex VIII	423,	488
Haraldson v. Iceland, Communication No.1306/2004, 24 Octobe	r	
2007		955
Hartikainen v. Finland, Communication No.40/1978, HRC 198	1	
Report, Annex XV		737
Harward v. Norway, Communication No.451/1991, HRC 1994		
Report, Annex IX.X	587,	588
HC v. Jamaica, Communication No.383/1989		606
Hendricks v. Guyana Communication No 838/1998		607



XXVI TABLE OF CASES

Hendriks v. The Netherlands, Communication No.210/1985, HR	C
1988 Report, Annex VII.H	886, 904
Henry v. Jamaica, Communication No.230/1987, HRC 1992	
Report, Annex IX.B 588	3, 603, 624
Henry ν. Trinidad and Tobago, Communication No.752/1997,	
HRC 1999 Report, Annex IX.DD	503
Henry and Douglas ν. Jamaica, Communication No.571/1994,	
HRC 1996 Report, Annex VIII.U	593
Hermoza v. Peru, Communication No.203/1986, HRC 1989	
Report, Annex X.D	517, 527
Hertzberg v. Finland, Communication No.61/1979, HRC	
1982 Report, Annex XIV 161, 747	7, 792, 793
Hill v. Spain, Communication No.526/1993, HRC 1997	
Report, Annex VI.B 400, 417, 587	', 601, 604
Hinostroza Solis v. Peru, Communication No.1016/2001,	
Selected Decisions, vol.9, p.65	970
Hussain v. Mauritius, Communication No.980/2001	607
Husseini v. Denmark, Communication No.2243/2013,	
24 October 2014	685, 889
Hylton v. Jamaica, Communication No.407/1990, HRC 1994	
Report, Annex IX.M	439
Idiev v. Tajikistan, Communication No.1276/2004, HRC 2009	
Report, vol.II, p.66	270
IP ν. Finland, Communication No.450/1991	496
Irving v. Australia, Communication No.880/1999	640, 641
Ismailov v. Uzbekistan, Communication No.1769/2008,	
25 March 2011	409
Ivan (Victor Kankanamage) v. Sri Lanka, Communication	
No.909/2000, Selected Decisions, vol.8, p.157	799, 817
Izquierdo ν . Uruguay, Communication No.73/1980, HRC 1982	
Report, Annex XVII	292
Jacobs v. Belgium, Communication No.943/2000	514
Janson-Gielen ν . The Netherlands, Comunication No.846/1999	506
Jaona ν . Madagascar, Communication No.132/1982, HRC 1985	
Report, Annex IX	377, 798
Jayawardene v. Sri Lanka, Communication No.916/2000,	
Selected Decisions, vol.8, p.168	371



TABLE OF CASES	xxvii
Jarvinen v. Finland, Communication No.295/1988, HRC 199	
Report, Annex IX.L	362
JB v. Canada, Communication No.118/1982, HRC 1986 Rep	ort,
Annex IX.B	868, 872
Jegatheeswara Sarma v. Sri Lanka, Communication No.950/	
2000, Selected Decisions, vol.8, p.210	258, 297
Jenny v. Austria, Communication No.1437/2005, 9 July 2008	
Jeong-Eun Lee v. Republic of Korea, Communication No.11	19/
2002, Selected Decisions, vol.8, p.363	878
Jijon (Teran) v. Ecuador, Communication No.277/1988,	
•	439, 617, 631
JL v. Australia, Communication No.491/1992, HRC 1992	
Report, Annex X.EE	514
Johnson v. Jamaica, Communication No.588/1994,	
	593, 616, 626
Jong-Kyu Sohn v. Republic of Korea, Communication No.5	18/
1992, 19 July 1995	752
Jose Vicente v. Colombia, Communication No.612/1995,	
Selected Decisions, vol.6, p.135	105
JRT and WG Party v. Canada, Communication No.104/1983	1,
HRC 1983 Report, Annex XXIV	48
Judge v. Canada, Communication No.829/1998, Selected	
Decisions, vol.8, p.85	238
Kalamiotis ν . Greece, Communication No.1486/2006, 24 Jul	у
2008	106
Kalenga v. Zambia, Communication No.326/1988,	
27 July 1993	404, 440
Kall v. Poland, Communication No.552/1993, HRC 1997	
Report, Annex VI.J	947
Kalyakin v. Belarus, Communication No.2153/2012, 10 Octo	ober
2014	875
Kanana v. Zaire, Communication No.366/1989, HRC 1994 Re	eport,
Annex IX.J	377
Kang v. Republic of Korea, Communication No.878/1999, 15	July
2003	751
Karimov and Nursatov v. Tajikistan, Communication Nos.1	108
and 1121/2002, Selected Decisions, vol.9, p.92	271, 286, 602



XXVIII TABLE OF CASES

Karttunen v. Finland, Communication No.387/1989, 23 October	er	
1992		518
Kaur v. Canada, Communication No.1455/2006, 30 October		
2008		514
Kavanagh v. Ireland, Communication No.819/1998, Selected		
Decisions, vol.7, p.117	529,	959
Kazantzis v. Cyprus, Communication No.972/2001		514
Kelly v. Jamaica, Communication No.253/1987, HRC		
1991 Report, Annex XI.D 272, 584, 587, 593, 60	6, 607,	616
Kelly v. Jamaica, Communication No.537/1993, HRC		
1996 Report, Annex VIII.O 272, 273, 59	0, 604,	626
Kennedy v. Trinidad and Tobago, Communication		
No.845/1998, Selected Decisions, vol.7,		
p.127 275, 411, 439, 50	3, 514,	626
Kerouane v. Algeria, Communication No.2132/2012, 30 October	er	
2014		257
Keun-Tae Kim v. Republic of Korea, Communication No.574/		
1994, HRC 1999 Report, Annex XI.A	755,	820
Khalilova v. Tajikistan, Communication No.973/2001		626
Khomidov v. Tajikistan, Communication No.1117/2002,		
HRC 2004 Report, vol.II, p.363 27.	2, 273,	590
Khuseynov v. Tajikistan, Communication No.1263/2004		612
Kibale v. Canada, Communication No.1562/2007, 22 July 2008		105
Kindler v. Canada, Communication No.470/1991, 30 July 1993		315
Kitok v. Sweden, Communication No.197/1985, HRC 1988		
Report, Annex VII.G		999
Kivenmaa ν. Finland, Communication No.412/1990,		
31 March 1994 76	1, 839,	843
KLNH v. Peru, Communication No.1153/2003, Selected		
Decisions, vol.9, p.108	294,	914
Kohoutek ν . The Czech Republic, Communication No.1448/200)6,	
17 July 2008		959
Kolonowski v. Poland, Communication No.837/1998		514
Komarovski v. Turkmenistan, Communication No.1450/2006,		
24 July 2008		703
Kone v. Senegal, Communication No.386/1989, HRC 1995 Repo	rt,	
Annex X.A		415



TABLE OF CASES						xxix
	_	_				

Korneenko v. Belarus, Communication No.1553/2007,	
31 October 2008	787, 798, 867
Kosljak v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, Communication No.19	970/
2010, 28 October 2014	257
Koush v.Belarus, Communication No.1787/2008, 27 March	ı
2013	409, 412
Kovaleva v. Belarus, Communication No.2120/2011,	
29 October 2012	482
Kozulin v. Belarus, Communication No.1773/2008,	
21 October 2014 409, 414	1, 416, 442, 581
Krasnova v. Krygystan, Communication No.1402/2005	400
Kroumi v. Algeria, Communication No.2082/2011,	
30 October 2014	257
Kulomin v. Hungary, Communication No.521/1992,	
HRC 1996 Report, Annex VIII.L	410, 413, 414
Kulov v. Kyrgystan, Communication No.1369/2010, 26 Jul-	у
2010	416
Kurbonov v. Tajikistan, Communication No.1208/2003	616
Kurbanova v. Tajikistan, Communication No.1096/2000,	
Selected Decisions, vol.8, p.355	272, 441
LA v. Uruguay, Communication No.128/1982, HRC 1983 I	Report,
Annex XXVI	48
Lansman v. Finland (No.1), Communication No.511/1992,	
HRC 1995 Report, Annex X.I	998, 1001, 1012
Lansman v. Finland (No.2), Communication No.671/1995,	
HRC 1997 Report, Annex VI.S	998, 1000, 1011
Lansman v. Finland, Communication No.1023/2001, Select	' ed
Decisions, vol.8, p.282	998
Lantsova v. The Russian Federation, Communication No.7	63/
1997, HRC 2002 Report, vol.II, p.96	236
Laptsevich v. Belarus, Communication No.780/1997, HRC	2000
Report, Annex IX.P	779
Larranaga v. The Philippines, Communication No.1421/20	05,
Selected Decisions, vol.9, p.266	550
Laureano v. Peru, Communication No.540/1993, HRC 199	6
Report, Annex VIII.P	296, 914
Laurie Peltonem v. Finland, Communication No.492/1992	•
Selected Decisions, vol.5, p.141	476



XXX TABLE OF CASES

LaVende v. Trinidad and Tobago, Communication	
No.554/1993, HRC 1998 Report, Annex XI.B 315, 605, 606,	, 628
Lecraft v. Spain, Communication No.1493/2006, 27 July 2009	106
Lederbauer v. Austria, Communication No.1454/2006, Selected	
Decisions, vol.9, p.280	514
Leehong v. Belarus, Communication No.613/1995	372
Leirvag v. Norway, Communication No.1155/2003, Selected	
Decisions, vol.8, p.385	737
Leslie v. Jamaica, Communication No.564/1993, HRC 1998	
Report, Annex XI.D	315
Levinov v. Belarus, Communication No.1812/2008	399
Lewis v. Jamaica, Communication No.527/1993, HRC 1996	
Report, Annex VIII.N	440
LG v. Mauritius, Communication No.354/1989, HRC 1991	
Report, Annex XI.K	641
Lichtensztejn v. Uruguay, Communication No.77/1980, HRC	
	471
Lindgren et al. v. Sweden, Communication Nos.298–9/1988,	
HRC 1991 Report, Annex IX.E	989
*	606
Linton v. Jamaica, Communication No.255/1987, 22 October,	
1992	309
Lippmann v. France, Communication No.472/1991, HRC 1996	
Report, Annex IX.A	904
Little v. Jamaica, Communication No.283/1988, HRC 1992	
Report, Annex IX.J 271, 587	626
Lluberas v. Uruguay, Communication No.123/1982, HRC	
1984 Report, Annex XII	440
Lnenicka v.The Czech Republic, Communication No.1484/2006,	
25 March 2008	106
Lopez ν. Uruguay, Communication No.52/1979, HRC 1981	
Report, Annex XIX	76
Loubna El Ghar v. Libyan Arab Jamahariya, Communication	
No.1107/2002, Selected Decisions, vol.8, p.360	467
Louddi v. Algeria, Communication No.2117/2011,	
30 October 2014 257, 409, 437, 439	644
Love v. Australia, Communication No.983/2001, Selected	
Decisions, vol.8, p.232	970



TABLE OF CASES		xxxi
Lovelace v. Canada, Communication No.24/1977, HRC 1981 Report, Annex XVIII		996
LTK v. Finland, Communication No.185/1984, HRC 1985 Report Annex XXI	,	362
Lubuto v. Zambia, Communication No.390/1990, HRC 1996 Report, Annex VIII.B		264
Lumley <i>v.</i> Jamaica, Communication No.662/1995, HRC 1999 Report, Annex XI.Q 607,	625,	627
Machado v. Uruguay, Communication No.83/1981, HRC 1984 Report, Annex VII		439
MacIsaac v. Canada, Communication No.55/1979, HRC 1983 Report, Annex VII		636
Madafferi v. Australia, Communication No.1011/2001, Selected Decisions, vol.8, p.259 380, 483,	684,	685
Madani v. Algeria, Communication No.1172/2003, Selected Decisions, vol.9, p.134	553,	746
Madjhoune v. Algeria, Communication No.1297/2004, Selected Decisions, vol.9, p.182		306
Maille v. France, Communication No.689/1996, HRC 2000 Report, Annex IX.F		959
Maksudov et al v. Kyrgystan, Communication Nos.1461–62, 1476–77/2006, HRC 2008 Report, vol.II, p.226		241
Mansour Ahani v. Canada, Communication No.1052/2002, Selected Decisions, vol.8, p.290		488
Marais v. Madagascar, Communication No.49/1979, HRC 1983 Report, Annex XI		306
Marcellana and Gumanoy <i>v</i> . The Philippines, Communication No.1560/2007, 30 October 2010	106,	372
Maria Sybila Arredondo v. Peru, Communication No.688/1996, Selected Decisions, vol.7, p.36	·	441
Maroufidou v. Sweden, Communication No.58/1979, HRC 1981 Report, Annex XVII	486,	487
Martinez v. Paraguay, Communication No.1407/2005, 27 March 2009	·	889
Martins v. Uruguay, Communication No.57/1979, HRC 1982 Report, Annex XIII		466
Massera v. Uruguay, Communication No.R.1/5, HRC 1979 Report, Annex VII		930



XXXII TABLE OF CASES

Massiotti v. Uruguay, Communication No.R.6/25/1978, HR	kC		
1982 Report, Annex XVIII	305,	381,	440
Matthews v. Trinidad and Tobago, Communication No.569	/1993,	,	
HRC 1998 Report, Annex XI.E			441
Mavlonov and Sa'di v. Uzbekistan, Communication No.133	34/		
2004, 19 March 2009	7	70, 1	060
Mazon Costa v. Spain, Communication No.1745/2007, 1 Ap	ril		
2008			940
Mbenge v. Zaire, Communication No.16/1977, HRC 1983			
Report, Annex X 270	, 584,	585,	601
McCordie Morrison v. Jamaica, Communication No.663/19	95,		
HRC 1999 Report, Annex XI.Q			607
McLawrence v. Jamaica, Communication No.702/1996,			
HRC 1997 Report, Annex VI.V 271	, 399,	413,	584
McLeod v. Jamaica, Communication No.734/1997, HRC			
1998 Report, Annex XI.X			441
McTaggart v. Jamaica, Communication No.749/1997, HRC	1998		
Report, Annex XI.Y		292,	440
MF v. Jamaica, Communication No.233/1987, HRC 1992 R	eport,		
Annex X.A			518
MG v. Germany, Communication No.1482/2006, 23 July 20	008		703
Miango v . Zaire, Communication No.194/1985, HRC 1988			
Report, Annex VII.F			235
Miguel Gonzalez de Rio v. Peru, Communication No.263/1	997,		
Selected Decisions, vol.4, p.68			465
Miha v. Equatorial Guinea, Communication No.414/1990,			
HRC 1994 Report, Annex IX.O	309,	422,	751
Mojica v. Dominican Republic, Communication No.449/19	91,		
HRC 1994 Report, Annex IX.W		258,	371
Montejo (Salgar de) v. Colombia, Communication No.64/19	979,		
HRC 1982 Report, Annex XV		624,	625
Montiro v. Uruguay, Communication No.106/1981, HRC 1	983		
Report, Annex XVII		466,	471
Morael v. France, Communication No.207/1986, HRC 1989)		
Report, Annex X.E		519,	583
Morais (Rafael Marques de) v. Angola, Communication			
No.1128/2002, Selected Decisions, vol.8, p.366 409	, 429,	588,	810



TABLE OF CASES	X	XX111
Morales Tornel v. Spain, Communication No.1473/2006,		
20 March 2009	652,	684
Morrison v. Jamaica, Communication No.635/1998	409,	625
Motta v. Uruguay, Communication No.11/1977, HRC 1980		
Report, Annex X	49,	291
Mpaka-Nsusu v. Zaire, Communication No.157/1983, HRC		
<u>*</u>	, 457,	751
Mpandanjila v. Zaire, Communication No.138/1983, HRC		
1986 Report, Annex VIII.A	440,	457
Muhonen v. Finland, Communication No.89/1981, HRC 1985		
Report, Annex VII		641
Mukong v. Cameroon, Communication No.458/1991,		
HRC 1994 Report, Annex IX.AA 377, 437, 752	, 798,	824
Mulai v. Guyana, Communication No.811/1998,		
Selected Decisions, vol.8, p.72		271
Mulezi v. Democratic Republic of Congo, Communication		
No.962/2001	422,	428
Mumtaz Karakut v. Austria, Communication No.965/2000, 4		
April 2002		971
Mundyo Busyo ν. Democratic Republic of Congo,		
Communication No.933/2000		543
Musaev v. Uzbekistan, Communication No.1914/2009		409
Muteba v. Zaire, Communication No.124/1982, HRC 1984		
Report, Annex XIII		439
Nabil Sayadi and Patricia Vinck v. Belgium, Communication		
No.1472/2006, HRC 2009 Report, vol.II, p.241		476
Ng v. Canada, Communication No.469/1991, HRC 1994 Report		
Annex IX.CC		335
Nieto v. Uruguay, Communication No.92/1981, HRC 1983		
Report, Annex XX		440
Njaru v. Cameroon, Communication No.1353/2005, 19 March		
2007	798,	799
Norma Yurich v. Chile, Communication No.1078/2002, Selected	l	
Decisions, vol.9, p.3		256
Nunez v. Uruguay, Communication No.108/1981, Selected		
Decisions, vol.2, p.143	465,	471