

## INDEX

- analytic/synthetic distinction, ix, x, xi, xiii, 6, 68–95, *See also* analyticity; collateral information; stimulus analyticity; verification theory of meaning
- analytical hypotheses, 125, 126, 127, 132, 138, 139, 140, 141, 150, 151, 161, 162, 163
- analyticity, xi, 1, 6, 26, 65, 70, 85, 94, 95, 109, 110–14, 117, 119, 120, 280, 300, 303, 304
  - and self-contradictoriness, 69–70
  - and synonymy, 71
  - Carnap's account of, 71–2
  - cognitive synonymy and, 76–7
  - epistemology and, 120
  - Kant's account of, 70
  - logical truth and, 65
  - necessary truth and, 77–80
  - semantical rules and, 81–4, 281, 291
  - synonymy and, 65, 66, 74–5, 81, 119–20, *See also* analytic/synthetic distinction; stimulus analyticity
- attributes, 122
- background language, 171–5, 179–88, 189–92, 196–8, 199, 205, 211, 215, 227, *See also* background theory
- background theory, 180, 181, 182–3, 187, 189, 192–6, 216
- behaviorism, xii, 128–9, 137, 169, 207, 304
  - defended, 232–5
  - indeterminacy of translation and, 129, 134, 233
  - inscrutability of reference and, 157, 158, 233
- Bergström, Lars, 135, 136, 146, 305, 307
- Boghossian, Paul, 86, 283, 305
- Carnap, Rudolph, 67, 73, 82, 87, 289
- Carroll, Lewis, 37
- Chomsky, Noam, 126, 177, 232, 233, 308
- coextensiveness, 27, 71, 164
- cognitive equivalence of sentences, 114–16, 251
  - compared to stimulus synonymy, 116
  - stimulus synonymy and, 118
  - synonymy and, 118–19
- cognitive synonymy of terms, 115–16, 251
- collateral information, 109, 272, 273
  - stimulus meaning and, 100–3, 104–5, *See also* analytic/synthetic distinction; observation sentences
- conventionalism, ix, x, xiii, 1, 9, 10, 29–30, 34, 48, 55, 56–8, 300–3
  - arithmetic and, 7
  - definitional, 9–27
  - infinite regress and, x, 47, 57
  - Lewis's account of, 300–3
  - mathematics and, 34
  - postulational, 9, 27–48, *See also* geometry; logic
- conventions, 36–48
  - explicit, 38
  - implicit, 48, 58
  - in science, 55, 58

- coordinate system, 170–2, 186, 187, 189, 199–204, 210, 211, 212, 214, 215, 216
- Crawford, Dan, 68, 93
- Davidson, Donald, xiii, 104, 234, 241, 243, 284–90, 295, 296
- definition, 10–12, 21, 68
  - as explication, 73–5
  - synonymy and, 72–5
- degrees of observability of sentences, 102–3, 104
- discursive definition, 52, 53, 75
- discursive postulation, 50, 52, 53
- Dreben, Burton, 122
- empirical evidence, 106
  - for the truth of statements, 63
  - for the truth of theories, 63, 91
- empirical meaning, 5, 146
  - of sentences, 120–1
  - of theories, 135, 145, 154, 155, 156
  - stimulus meaning as explication of, 98, 244, *See also* empirical evidence; holism
- explication, 73, 75, 99, 100, 106, 109, 111, 113, 117, 118, 119, 279, 296, 298
- facts, 130
- Field, Hartry, 188, 206, 229, 279
- Føllesdal, Dagfinn, xiv, 128, 154, 305, 307
- frame of reference. *See* coordinate system
- geometry
  - conventionalism and, 9, 53
  - Euclidean, 49, 51
  - Huntington's postulates for, 17–19, 22–4, 25, 33
  - non-Euclidean, 51, 53
- germaneness, 93
- Gibson, Roger, 126
- Goodman, Nelson, 264
- Grice, A. P., 107
- Harman, Gilbert, 125, 126, 232, 308
- Hofstadter, Albert, 91
- holism, xi, 68, 88, 90, 91
  - as premise of argument for indeterminacy of translation, 89, 140, 154
  - implications for analytic/synthetic distinction, 91–3, *See also* empirical evidence; empirical meaning
- Hume, David, 87
- indeterminacy of translation,
  - thesis of, ix, x, xi, xii, 85, 117, 118, 123, 126, 140, 270–80, 303
  - analyticity and, 119
  - implications of, 122
  - interpretations of, 122–37, 149
  - misunderstandings of, 137–9
  - Quine's arguments for, 139, 140
  - strong and weak versions of, 132–5, 153
  - synonymy and, 119, 122
  - under-determination of theories and, 126–8, 131, 230, *See also* behaviorism; holism
- inscrutability of reference, thesis of, ix, x, xii, 123, 138, 140, 157–8, 187, 203, 224, 256, 257, 303
- applicability to ourselves, 168–70, 179, 180, 206–9, 211, 215
- applicability within our own language, 167, 179, 223–6
- as argument for indeterminacy of translation, 140, 141–4
- author's arguments against, 236–44
- equated with ontological relativity, 205–6
- Quine's arguments for, 158–67, 258, *See also* behaviorism; ontological relativity, thesis of; ostension, deferred; proxy functions
- intentional idioms, 122
- Kant, Immanuel, 3, 7, 70, 111
- Katz, Jerrold J., 85, 109–12, 125, 250
- Kirk, Robert, 125, 131, 306

- knowledge
  - a priori, 2, 3, 6, 26, 35, 48, 55, 58, 63, 93, 291
  - empirical, 2, 55, 63
- language
  - artificial, 82–4
  - extensional, 80
  - intensional, 80–1
  - regimented, 67
  - theory and, 176–7, 187, 192, *See also* background language; metalanguage; object language; subject language
- legislative definition, 52, 53, 75, 121
- legislative postulation, 50, 52, 53–5, 58, 121
- Lewis, David, xiii, 48
- linguistic doctrine
  - of logical and mathematical truth, ix, x, 1, 5, 6, 68
  - of logical truth, 58, 280, *See also* conventionalism
- Locke, John, 87
- logic, 1, 2, 10, 27, 29, 36–48
  - conventionalism and, 27–33
  - elementary, 54, 64
  - quantificational, xiii, 293–5
  - set theory and, 1, 25, 27, 56, 65
  - truth functional, xiii, 38, 57, 70, 289–92
- logical truth, 5, 48, 92, 121, 304
- Lukasiewicz, 39
- Lycan, William, 48, 75, 154, 234, 307
- mathematical truth, 5, 121
- mathematics, 2, 10, 29
- meaning, 28, 93, 95, 96, 106, 167
  - of sentences, 154
  - of terms, 253
  - stimulus meaning and, 100, 104, *See also* analyticity; conventionalism; definition; indeterminacy of translation; thesis of; stimulus meaning; synonymy; verification theory of meaning
- metalanguage, 179, 180, 181, 182, 183, 184, 187, 215, 227, 285
- metatheory, 182
- Mill, J. S., 3, 5
- naturalism, 231
- necessary truth, 2
- Nozick, Robert, 130
- object language, 179, 180, 181–3, 187, 285
- object theory, 182
- observation categoricals, 135, 145, 146
- observation sentences, 104, 138, 140, 145, 146, 150–2, 155
  - collateral information and, 244–8, *See also* degrees of observationality of sentences
- occasion sentences, 100, 102, 105, 115, 138, 140, 141, 145
- one-word sentences, xii, 97, 159, 236, 271–4, 275
  - different interpretations of, 235–44, 245–8
- ontological reduction, 178, 218
- ontological relativity, thesis of, xii
  - analogy with spatial relativity, 171, 173–5, 180, 198–204, 205, 212, 216, 217, 229
  - applicability to ourselves, 217–23
  - inscrutability of reference and, 158, 167–72, 180, 204–6, 218
  - interpretation of, 167
- ontology, ix, 176, 182, 188, 196, 204, 216, *See also* ontological reduction
- Orenstein, Alex, 2, 130, 157
- ostension
  - deferred, 164–6, 167, 256, 257, 271, 274
  - direct, 165, 254, 271
- philosophical analysis, 122
- Poincaré, Henri, 53
- Poland, Jeffrey, 234
- proposition, 230
- propositions, 122
- proxy functions, 219, 274

## INDEX

313

- inscrutability of reference and, 166–7, 219, 227, 256–60
  - ontological reduction and, 166–7
- Putnam, Hilary, 111
- radical translation, 96, 102, 157, 248, 270–80, *See also* indeterminacy of translation, thesis of; inscrutability of reference, thesis of
- reductionism
  - radical, 87
  - residual, 87
- reference, 1, 158, 167, 169, 181, 303, 304, *See also* inscrutability of reference, thesis of
- Riemann, George, 50
- Rorty, Richard, 133, 309
- Roth, Paul A., 153
- Russell, Bertrand, 3, 11, 26
- science
  - empirical, 34
- semantical rules. *See* analyticity: semantical rules and
- set theory, 54–5, 58, *See also* logic: set theory and
- standing sentences, 100, 105, 114, 115–16, 279
  - stimulus meaning of, 106–7
- stimulations, 96–100, 104, 115, 124, 159
- stimulus analyticity, 95, 109, 112–13, 140, 150, 226
- stimulus meaning, 95, 98–109, 141, 146, 150, 151, 234, 260, 280, 304
  - collateral information and, 244
  - confirmation and, 99
  - intersubjective, 104
  - meaning and, 100
  - restricted, 247, 248, 253, *See also* collateral information; empirical evidence; empirical meaning; observation sentences; occasion sentences; stimulus analyticity; stimulus synonymy
- stimulus synonymy, xii, 95, 105, 116, 146, 150, 151, 152, 296
  - intersubjective, 104, 105, 141
  - intrasubjective, 104–5, 140, 141, 248–9, 261
  - of sentences, 159, 160, 164
  - of terms, 226
  - restricted, 247
  - synonymy and, 100–1, *See also* cognitive equivalence of sentences; cognitive synonymy of terms; collateral information; stimulus meaning; synonymy
- Strawson, P. F., 107
- Stroud, Barry, 158, 223
- subject language, 179, 180, 181, 183, 184, 187, 215, 227
- subject theory, 182
- synonymy, xi, xii, 27, 69, 95, 105, 109, 117–20, 121, 122, 146, 232, 278–80, 303, 304
  - and analyticity, 71
  - cognitive, 76–7
  - distinguished from coextensiveness, 71
  - interchangeability and, 75–81
  - of sentences, 73–5, 81, 94, 105, 107, 252
  - of terms, 73–5, 81, 110, 115, 160, 252, 253
  - stimulus synonymy and, 106–7, 108–9, 248–54, *See also* cognitive equivalence of sentences; cognitive synonymy of terms
- Tarski, Alfred, xiii, 181, 182, 183, 284, 286, 290, 295, 296, 297, 309
- Tarski's theory of truth, 285–6
  - as a theory of meaning, 286–8
- translation, 1, 58–61, 104, 116, 159–64, 184, 185, 189, 192, 193, 198, 253, 278–80, 304
  - meaning and, 102, 154, *See also* indeterminacy of translation, thesis of; radical translation
- truth, 83, 181
  - logical, 59, 66
  - meaning and, 59, *See also* Tarski's theory of truth; truth by definition

- truth by definition, 51, 52
- truth functional connectives, 28, 140, 276
- under-determination of theories, 92, 135, 146, 154, 219
  - as argument for indeterminacy of translation, 140, 144–54, 155
  - issues in interpretation of, 135–6, 144–9
  - parallels with indeterminacy of translation, 126–8, 135–6,  
*See also* indeterminacy of translation, thesis of
- verification theory of meaning, xi, 106, 254, 267
  - analytic/synthetic distinction and, 86–90
  - holism and, 88–90
  - indeterminacy of translation and, 140, 154
  - Quine's acceptance of, 68, 88–90, 99
  - synonymy and, 86
- White, Morton, 91
- Whitehead, A. N., 26