

European Environmental Law

European Environmental Law is a critical, comprehensive and engaging account of the essential and emerging issues in European environmental law and regulation today.

Suitable for advanced undergraduate and postgraduate students, *European Environmental Law* delivers a thematic and contextual treatment of the subject for those taking courses in environmental law, environmental studies, regulation and public policy, and government and international relations.

Placing the key issues in context, *European Environmental Law* takes an interdisciplinary approach to help readers better to understand the implementation and enforcement of environmental law and policy across Europe. It offers an accessible overview and links theory with practical application that will allow students to contextualise the outcomes of legal rules and their impact on public and private behaviours. It provides a definitive account of the subject, examining traditional topics such as nature conservation law, waste law and water law alongside increasingly important fields such as the law of climate change, environmental human rights law and regulation of GMOs and nanotechnology.

Suzanne Kingston is Professor of Law at UCD and Barrister-at-Law practising at the Irish bar, appearing regularly before the Irish and European courts. Suzanne served as a *référéndaire* (legal adviser) in the cabinet of Advocate General Geelhoed at the European Court of Justice, Luxembourg from 2004 to 2006, and has been international visiting professor of law at Columbia Law School, New York.

Veerle Heyvaert is Associate Professor of Law (Reader) at LSE where she teaches and publishes on environmental law. Founding Editor-in-Chief of *Transnational Environmental Law*, she has worked as an attorney in Brussels and was Moragoda Professor of Public International Law (Sri Lanka 2015), Sir Peter North Fellow at the Oxford Centre for Socio-Legal Studies and Keble College, and a UNITAR Special Fellow.

Aleksandra Čavoški is a senior lecturer at the School of Law, University of Birmingham. She has over ten years of academic experience in civil and common law jurisdictions and was a key contributor to the development of EU legal studies in Serbia, in particular EU environmental studies. Her publications include research on environmental law in both English and Serbian. She was a visiting professor at Washington and Lee University School of Law (USA 2011).

European Environmental Law

SUZANNE KINGSTON

University College Dublin

VEERLE HEYVAERT

London School of Economics and Political Science

ALEKSANDRA ČAVOŠKI

University of Birmingham



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01470-1 — European Environmental Law
Suzanne Kingston, Veerle Heyvaert, Aleksandra Čavoški
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107014701

DOI: 10.1017/9781139044202

© Suzanne Kingston, Veerle Heyvaert and Aleksandra Čavoški 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Kingston, Suzanne, 1977– author. | Heyvaert, Veerle, author. | Čavoški, Aleksandra, author.

Title: European environmental law / Suzanne Kingston, Veerle Heyvaert, Aleksandra Čavoški.

Other titles: European Union environmental law

Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017012395 | ISBN 9781107014701 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Environmental law – European Union countries. | BISAC: LAW / Environmental.

Classification: LCC KJE6242 .K56 2017 | DDC 344.2404/6–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017012395>

ISBN 978-1-107-01470-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-64044-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

SK – To Andrew, Saoirse, Róisín, and Cillian
VH – To Jonathan, Jacob, Lia Rose, and the 48%
AC – To my parents, Conor, Niamh and Luka

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	xvii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xviii
<i>List of Cases</i>	xix
<i>Preface and Acknowledgements</i>	xxxiii
1 The Foundations of EU Environmental Law: History, Aims and Context	1
History and Development of the European Union's Environmental Policy	1
Aims of EU Environmental Policy	8
<i>A 'High Level of Environmental Protection Taking into Account the Diversity of Situations in the Various Regions of the Union'</i>	9
<i>Sustainable Development</i>	12
Legal Bases and Environmental Guarantee Provisions	16
<i>General Legal Bases</i>	17
<i>Environmental Guarantee Provisions and Minimum Harmonisation</i>	18
The Nature of the European Union's Environmental Competences	22
Understanding EU Environmental Law and Policy in Context	25
<i>Environment, Risk and Science</i>	26
<i>Risk and Risk Regulation</i>	26
<i>Risk Regulation in the European Union</i>	27
<i>Risk Regulation and Critique</i>	29
<i>Science and Expertise in EU Law and Policy</i>	31
<i>Science, Precaution and Discretion</i>	33
<i>Environment and Governance</i>	36
<i>From Pollution Control to Strategic Environmental Governance</i>	37
<i>Multi-level and Transnational Governance</i>	39
<i>Flexible and Decentralised Governance</i>	40
<i>Good Governance</i>	41
<i>Environment, Philosophy and Ethics</i>	43
<i>Environment and Geography: The Challenges of Enlargement</i>	47
2 Actors and Instruments	54
Actors	54
<i>The European Commission</i>	54
<i>The Council of the EU</i>	60
<i>The European Parliament</i>	62
<i>The European Council</i>	65

<i>The Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU) and the General Court</i>	67
Other Bodies and Actors	68
<i>The Economic and Social Committee</i>	68
<i>The Committee of the Regions (CoR)</i>	69
<i>The European Environment Agency</i>	70
<i>The European Investment Bank (EIB)</i>	72
<i>The European Union Network for the Implementation and Enforcement of Environmental Law (IMPEL)</i>	73
Interest Groups	74
Public Interest Groups	74
Business Interest Groups	76
Instruments	76
Regulations	77
Directives	78
Decisions	80
Environmental Action Programmes	82
Recommendations and other Soft Law Instruments	83
Financial Instruments	84
LIFE (the Financial Instrument for the Environment Regulation)	84
EU Structural and Investment Funds	86
3 Principles in EU Environmental Law	90
Introduction	90
Legal Status and Effect of (Environmental) Principles in EU Law	92
The Precautionary Principle	94
The Preventive Principle	99
The Rectification at Source Principle	100
The Polluter Pays Principle	100
The Environmental Integration Principle	103
Focus on the Integration of EU Economic and Environmental Law and Policy	105
Overview	105
Environmental Considerations and the Treaty Internal Market Provisions	109
Environmental Considerations and Article 110 TFEU	109
Environmental Considerations and Articles 34–36 TFEU	110
Article 34 TFEU and National Measures Promoting Green Energy	112
Green Public Procurement	116
4 Techniques of Regulating the Environment	120
Introduction: The EU's Changing Regulatory Toolbox	120
Understanding Regulatory Choices: Factors and Philosophies	
Underlying EU Decisions as to Environmental Regulatory Technique	123

<i>Environmental Effectiveness</i>	123
<i>Economic Efficiency</i>	124
<i>Political and Administrative Feasibility</i>	125
<i>Flexibility</i>	126
<i>Compatibility with Existing EU and National Institutional Frameworks</i>	126
<i>Compatibility with Beliefs and ‘Ideas’</i>	127
Surveying the EU’s Environmental Regulatory Techniques	129
<i>Hierarchy: Direct or ‘Command and Control’ Techniques</i>	129
<i>Overview</i>	129
<i>Flexible Direct Regulation: Framework Directives</i>	132
<i>Proceduralised Direct Regulation</i>	133
<i>The Pros and Cons of Direct Environmental Regulation in the EU</i>	133
<i>Market-Based Instruments</i>	135
<i>Overview</i>	135
<i>Tradable Permit Schemes</i>	139
<i>Other Examples of the EU’s Embrace of Market-Based Instruments</i>	142
<i>Network-Based Approaches: Voluntary Techniques and Corporate Social Responsibility</i>	143
<i>Overview</i>	143
<i>Enabling Corporations</i>	145
<i>Enabling Consumers and Civil Society</i>	148
5 Environmental Rights in Europe	150
Introduction: Why Environmental (Human) Rights?	150
Rights Originating from the Council of Europe	153
<i>The 1950 European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (the ‘ECHR’)</i>	153
<i>No Right to a Decent Environment</i>	153
<i>Article 8 ECHR: Right to Respect for Private and Family Life</i>	154
<i>Article 6(1) ECHR: Right to a Fair Trial</i>	161
<i>Article 1 of Protocol No. 1: The Right to Property</i>	162
<i>The 1961 European Social Charter (the ‘ESC’)</i>	163
The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU (the ‘Charter’)	165
The Aarhus Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters	168
<i>The Aarhus Convention’s Approach to Environmental Rights</i>	169
<i>Signatories, Ratification and Compliance</i>	170
<i>Aarhus’s Three Substantive Pillars</i>	171
<i>Access to Information</i>	172
<i>Public Participation</i>	173
<i>Access to Justice</i>	176
<i>Implementation of the Aarhus Convention in EU Law</i>	179
Other Relevant Sources of International Human Rights Law	182

x	Contents	
	6 Public Enforcement of EU Environmental Law	184
	Introduction: The Enforcement Deficit in EU Environmental Law	184
	Public Enforcement of EU Environmental Law: Enforcement	
	by the European Commission	186
	<i>Article 258 TFEU</i>	186
	<i>Overview</i>	187
	<i>The Administrative Phase</i>	188
	<i>The Litigation Phase</i>	192
	‘General and Persistent’ Breaches of EU Law	192
	Defences	193
	Interim Measures	194
	<i>Article 260 TFEU</i>	195
	Broader Commission Initiatives to Improve Enforcement of EU	
	Environmental Law	199
	Public Enforcement of EU Environmental Law: Enforcement	
	by National Authorities	200
	Principles	200
	The European Union Network for the Implementation and Enforcement	
	of Environmental Law (IMPEL) Network	203
	The Environmental Liability Directive	204
	Overview	204
	Scope of Application	205
	Causation	207
	Duties Imposed on Operators	209
	Powers and Duties of Competent Authorities	211
	Observations and Requests for Action	212
	Transboundary Damage	212
	Criminal Penalties	213
	7 Private Enforcement of EU Environmental Law	217
	Private Enforcement of EU Environmental Law at National Level	217
	Direct Effect of EU Environmental Law	217
	Overview	217
	Must a Directly Effective Provision Confer a Right on an	
	Individual?	219
	Which Bodies Must Apply Directly Effective Provisions?	222
	Other Means of Relying on EU Law before National Courts	230
	The Duty of Consistent Interpretation (‘Indirect Effect’)	230
	‘Triangular’ Cases	233
	‘Incidental’ Horizontal Direct Effect	234
	Horizontal Direct Effect of a ‘General Principle’ of EU Law	235
	State Liability in Damages for Breach of EU Law	236
	EU Legislation on Access to Justice at National Level and the Role of	
	the Aarhus Convention	237
	The Provisions of the Aarhus Convention on Access to Justice	238

	Contents	xi
<i>Implementation of Article 9 of the Aarhus Convention in EU Law</i>	240	
Private Enforcement of EU Law at EU Level	246	
<i>Access to Justice before the EU Courts</i>	246	
<i>Access to Justice by Means of Internal Review under Regulation 1367/2006</i>	251	
<i>Other Means of Accessing Justice at EU Level</i>	254	
8 Climate Change	257	
Introduction	257	
Mandate of the European Union with Regard to Climate Change	258	
High Stakes: The Challenge of Climate Change Leadership	260	
<i>The External Dimension of Climate Change Leadership</i>	262	
<i>The Internal Dimension of Climate Change Leadership</i>	266	
<i>The Challenge of Leadership Exemplified: The Case of Aviation</i>	269	
The Scope of the Climate Change Challenge	273	
Climate Change as a Multi-Level Governance Challenge: The Example of Renewable Energy	275	
<i>Renewable Energy Policy in the EU: Reconciling European Ambition with National Differentiation through Multi-Level Governance</i>	275	
<i>The 2009 Renewable Energy Directive (RED)</i>	278	
<i>National Action Plans</i>	280	
<i>Cooperation between Member States</i>	281	
<i>Access to the Grid and Guarantees of Origin</i>	282	
<i>The Difficult Question of Biofuels</i>	283	
<i>National Support Schemes</i>	286	
<i>Free Movement of Renewable Energy: Navigating between the Goals of Trade Liberalisation, Environmental Protection and National Control over Energy Policy</i>	287	
The Challenge of a Regulation-Based Market	289	
<i>The ETS as Market-Based Regulation</i>	290	
<i>Gauging the Effectiveness of Market-Based Regulation</i>	292	
<i>Managing a Regulation-Based Market</i>	293	
<i>The Allocation of Allowances</i>	293	
<i>Recession and Transnational Offsetting</i>	294	
<i>Addressing the Burden of the Past: Backloading and the Market Stability Reserve</i>	296	
Concluding Remarks	296	
9 Air Pollution and Industrial Emissions	298	
Introduction: Key Themes of EU Air Pollution and Industrial Emissions Law	299	
Ozone-Depleting Substances	301	

Ambient Air Quality	306
<i>Approaches to Standardisation</i>	309
<i>The EU Legal Framework</i>	312
<i>The 2001 NECD</i>	312
<i>The 2008 AQFD</i>	313
<i>Member State Implementation of EU Ambient Air Legislation</i>	315
Regulating Industrial Emissions	321
<i>Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control within the IED</i>	323
<i>'Best Available Techniques' (BAT)</i>	325
<i>Standardisation in the IPPC Framework: The Anchoring Function of BAT</i>	328
<i>The Evolution of BREFs: A Hardening Attitude towards EU Soft Law</i>	330
<i>Flexibility in the IED: An Assessment</i>	333
Coherence in Air Pollution Law	335
Conclusion	336
10 EU Water Law	338
Introduction	338
<i>Europe's Waters Interconnected</i>	338
<i>The History of EU Water Law</i>	339
<i>The Inter-Related Threads of EU and International Water Law</i>	340
The 2000 Water Framework Directive	341
<i>History of the Water Framework Directive (WFD)</i>	341
<i>Overview</i>	342
<i>River Basin Management and the 'Programme of Measures'</i>	343
<i>The 'Environmental Objectives'</i>	344
<i>Surface Water</i>	345
<i>Groundwater</i>	348
<i>The Water Framework Directive's Derogations from the Environmental Objectives</i>	352
<i>Combined Approach</i>	353
<i>Priority Substances</i>	354
<i>Economic Analysis</i>	355
<i>Public Involvement</i>	357
<i>Governance</i>	357
<i>Assessment</i>	360
Drinking Water	360
<i>History and Overview</i>	360
<i>Ensuring that Drinking Water is 'Wholesome and Clean'</i>	361
<i>Providing for Hard Cases: Lead and Pesticides</i>	362
<i>Monitoring and Compliance</i>	363
<i>Assessment</i>	364
Bathing Water	365
<i>Defining Bathing Waters</i>	365

<i>From Emissions Limit Values to Classification</i>	366
<i>Monitoring and Assessment</i>	367
<i>Public Participation</i>	367
<i>Assessment</i>	368
Regulation of Dangerous Substances	368
<i>Dangerous Substances in Water Directives</i>	368
<i>Priority Substances Directive</i>	369
<i>Directive 2008/105/EC</i>	369
<i>Listing Substances and Review of Adopted List of Priority</i>	
<i>Substances</i>	369
<i>Assessment</i>	370
Nitrates	371
<i>Regulating Non-Point Source Pollution</i>	371
‘Nitrogen Zones’	371
<i>Improving Environmental Quality</i>	372
<i>Additional Measures and Derogations</i>	372
<i>Assessment</i>	373
Urban and Industrial Waste Water	373
<i>Collection, Treatment and Disposal</i>	374
<i>Sensitive Areas</i>	374
<i>Identifying Eutrophication</i>	375
<i>Less-Sensitive Areas</i>	376
<i>Industrial Waste Water</i>	377
<i>Institutional Framework</i>	377
11 Impact Assessment	379
History and International Context	379
The 1991 UNECE Espoo Convention on Transboundary	
Environmental Impact Assessment	382
<i>Overview</i>	382
<i>Obligations</i>	383
The EIA Directive	385
<i>Scope and Purpose</i>	386
<i>What is an EIA?</i>	387
<i>The ‘Competent Authority’</i>	389
<i>Projects Subject to EIA</i>	390
<i>Annex I Projects: Mandatory EIA</i>	390
<i>Annex II Projects: The Screening Process</i>	391
<i>Exemptions from the EIA Requirement</i>	393
<i>The EIA Procedure</i>	394
<i>The Developer’s EIA Report</i>	394
<i>Consultation and Public Participation</i>	395
<i>Transboundary Projects</i>	396
<i>The Decision to Grant or Refuse Development Consent</i>	396

<i>Relationship with other Assessment Procedures</i>	397
<i>Communication of the Competent Authority's Decision</i>	398
<i>Remedies and Access to Justice</i>	398
The Strategic Environmental Assessment Directive	402
<i>Scope and Purpose of the SEA Directive</i>	403
<i>The Obligation to Carry Out an SEA</i>	403
<i>Plans and Programmes Subject to Mandatory SEA</i>	403
<i>Screening of other Projects</i>	404
<i>Exemptions</i>	404
<i>The SEA Procedure</i>	405
<i>Environmental Report</i>	405
<i>Consultation of Designated Authorities and of the Public Likely to be Affected</i>	405
<i>Transboundary Consultation</i>	406
<i>Relationship with other Assessment Procedures</i>	407
<i>The Decision</i>	407
<i>Remedies</i>	407
12 Nature and Biodiversity Protection	410
Introduction	410
Changing Narratives: Nature Conservation, Biodiversity Protection and the Safeguarding of Natural Capital	412
The Birds Directive and Habitats Directive: The Twin Pillars of Natura 2000	416
<i>The Birds Directive</i>	416
<i>The Habitats Directive</i>	417
Designation and its Consequences: The Legal Status of SPAS and SACS	419
<i>The Designation Process</i>	420
<i>The Consequences of Designation</i>	421
<i>Designation and its Discontents</i>	422
Biodiversity and Sustainability: The Role of Economic Considerations in Natura 2000	423
Protecting SCIs and the Role of the Precautionary Principle	428
<i>Protective Regimes: The Relation between the Birds and Habitats Directives</i>	429
<i>Timing of Member State Obligations</i>	431
<i>The Management of Protected Sites: Article 6(1) Habitats Directive</i>	432
<i>Avoiding Deterioration and Disturbance: Article 6(2) Habitats Directive</i>	434
<i>Assessing Development: Article 6(3) Habitats Directive</i>	434
<i>Declassification</i>	440
Compensating Biodiversity Losses	441
The Effectiveness of the Birds and Habitats Directives	443
Other Measures	444

Conclusion: Overcoming Institutional and Systemic Dichotomy	445
13 Technological Risk Regulation: Chemicals, Genetically Modified Organisms and Nanotechnology	447
Introduction	447
Dual-Purpose Regulation: Reconciling Market Harmonisation with Health and Environmental Protection	450
EU Chemicals Regulation as a Network	453
<i>The REACH Regulation</i>	454
<i>The CLP Regulation</i>	457
<i>Further Measures</i>	459
Chemicals, GMO and Nano Regulation as Technological Risk Regulation	460
<i>Information Production</i>	460
<i>Risk Management</i>	461
<i>Legitimacy and Effectiveness Challenges of Data-Driven Regimes</i>	463
Regulating Uncertainty	465
<i>Legal Principles: The Requirement to Pursue a High Level of Environmental Protection (HLP) and the Precautionary Principle</i>	466
<i>Claims to Legitimacy: Expertise, Transparency and Participation</i>	468
<i>Claims to Legitimacy: Updating, Review and Monitoring</i>	470
GMO Regulation: A Fraught State of Coexistence	471
<i>The Regulatory Framework</i>	474
<i>Scope for Post-Authorisation Differentiation</i>	475
<i>Coexistence Measures</i>	476
<i>Safeguard Clauses</i>	477
<i>Derogation or 'Opt-Ups' under Article 114(4)–(6) TFEU</i>	480
<i>Article 26(b) DRD: Farewell Internal Market?</i>	480
Nanotechnology: New Rules for New Tools?	483
Conclusion	487
14 Waste	489
EU Waste Policy	489
Waste Framework Directive (WFD)	494
<i>Overview of the WFD</i>	494
<i>What is Waste?</i>	498
<i>By-Product</i>	502
<i>End-of-Waste</i>	504
<i>Hazardous Waste</i>	505
<i>Shipment of Waste</i>	506
<i>Waste Operations</i>	508
<i>Landfills</i>	508

<i>Incineration of Waste</i>	510
<i>Waste Streams</i>	512
<i>Packaging</i>	513
<i>Batteries and Accumulators</i>	514
<i>End-of-Life Vehicles</i>	515
<i>Waste Electrical and Electronic Equipment (WEEE)</i>	516
Future Challenges	517
<i>Index</i>	518

Figures

2.1	Percentage of ENVI Co-Decision Files Agreed per Reading in the Last Parliamentary Mandate	65
4.1	Actors in EU Environmental Governance, and Examples of the Associated Regulatory Techniques	122
6.1	Open DG Environment Infringements	187
6.2	Infringements by Environmental Sector (2015)	188
6.3	Article 260(2) TFEU Actions per Member State as at End 2015	198
8.1	Renewable Energy Production 2005 and 2020 Targets	279
14.1	Infringements by Environmental Sector, 2007–2015	493
14.2	EU Waste Hierarchy	495

Tables

2.1	Allocation of Portfolios and Supporting Services in the Environmental Policy Area	56
2.2	Breakdown of the Available Structural Funds by Theme for the EU as a Whole	87
12.1	Habitats Non-Deterioration and Non-Disturbance Strategies	435