European Environmental Law

*European Environmental Law* is a critical, comprehensive and engaging account of the essential and emerging issues in European environmental law and regulation today.

Suitable for advanced undergraduate and postgraduate students, *European Environmental Law* delivers a thematic and contextual treatment of the subject for those taking courses in environmental law, environmental studies, regulation and public policy, and government and international relations.

Placing the key issues in context, *European Environmental Law* takes an interdisciplinary approach to help readers better to understand the implementation and enforcement of environmental law and policy across Europe. It offers an accessible overview and links theory with practical application that will allow students to contextualise the outcomes of legal rules and their impact on public and private behaviours. It provides a definitive account of the subject, examining traditional topics such as nature conservation law, waste law and water law alongside increasingly important fields such as the law of climate change, environmental human rights law and regulation of GMOs and nanotechnology.

**Suzanne Kingston** is Professor of Law at UCD and Barrister-at-Law practising at the Irish bar, appearing regularly before the Irish and European courts. Suzanne served as a référendaire (legal adviser) in the cabinet of Advocate General Geelhoed at the European Court of Justice, Luxembourg from 2004 to 2006, and has been international visiting professor of law at Columbia Law School, New York.

**Veerle Heyvaert** is Associate Professor of Law (Reader) at LSE where she teaches and publishes on environmental law. Founding Editor-in-Chief of *Transnational Environmental Law*, she has worked as an attorney in Brussels and was Moragoda Professor of Public International Law (Sri Lanka 2015), Sir Peter North Fellow at the Oxford Centre for Socio-Legal Studies and Keble College, and a UNITAR Special Fellow.

**Aleksandra Čavoški** is a senior lecturer at the School of Law, University of Birmingham. She has over ten years of academic experience in civil and common law jurisdictions and was a key contributor to the development of EU legal studies in Serbia, in particular EU environmental studies. Her publications include research on environmental law in both English and Serbian. She was a visiting professor at Washington and Lee University School of Law (USA 2011).
European Environmental Law

SUZANNE KINGSTON
University College Dublin

VEERLE HEYVAERT
London School of Economics and Political Science

ALEKSANDRA ČAVOŠKI
University of Birmingham
SK – To Andrew, Saoirse, Róisín, and Cillian
VH – To Jonathan, Jacob, Lia Rose, and the 48%
AC – To my parents, Conor, Niamh and Luka
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>xviii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Cases</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface and Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xxxiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 The Foundations of EU Environmental Law: History, Aims and Context</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History and Development of the European Union’s Environmental Policy</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aims of EU Environmental Policy</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A ‘High Level of Environmental Protection Taking into Account the</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversity of Situations in the Various Regions of the Union’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable Development</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Bases and Environmental Guarantee Provisions</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Legal Bases</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Guarantee Provisions and Minimum Harmonisation</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Nature of the European Union’s Environmental Competences</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding EU Environmental Law and Policy in Context</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment, Risk and Science</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk and Risk Regulation</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk Regulation in the European Union</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk Regulation and Critique</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science and Expertise in EU Law and Policy</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science, Precaution and Discretion</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and Governance</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Pollution Control to Strategic Environmental Governance</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multi-level and Transnational Governance</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flexible and Decentred Governance</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good Governance</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment, Philosophy and Ethics</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and Geography: The Challenges of Enlargement</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Actors and Instruments</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actors</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The European Commission</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Council of the EU</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The European Parliament</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The European Council</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

The Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU) and the General Court 67
Other Bodies and Actors 68
The Economic and Social Committee 68
The Committee of the Regions (CoR) 69
The European Environment Agency 70
The European Investment Bank (EIB) 72
The European Union Network for the Implementation and Enforcement of Environmental Law (IMPEL) 73
Interest Groups 74
Public Interest Groups 74
Business Interest Groups 76
Instruments 76
Regulations 77
Directives 78
Decisions 80
Environmental Action Programmes 82
Recommendations and other Soft Law Instruments 83
Financial Instruments 84
LIFE (the Financial Instrument for the Environment Regulation) 84
EU Structural and Investment Funds 86

3 Principles in EU Environmental Law 90
Introduction 90
Legal Status and Effect of (Environmental) Principles in EU Law 92
The Precautionary Principle 94
The Preventive Principle 99
The Rectification at Source Principle 100
The Polluter Pays Principle 100
The Environmental Integration Principle 103
Focus on the Integration of EU Economic and Environmental Law and Policy 105
Overview 105
Environmental Considerations and the Treaty Internal Market Provisions 109
Environmental Considerations and Article 110 TFEU 109
Environmental Considerations and Articles 34–36 TFEU 110
Article 34 TFEU and National Measures Promoting Green Energy 112
Green Public Procurement 116

4 Techniques of Regulating the Environment 120
Introduction: The EU’s Changing Regulatory Toolbox 120
Understanding Regulatory Choices: Factors and Philosophies Underlying EU Decisions as to Environmental Regulatory Technique 123
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Effectiveness</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Efficiency</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political and Administrative Feasibility</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flexibility</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compatibility with Existing EU and National Institutional Frameworks</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compatibility with Beliefs and ‘Ideas’</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surveying the EU’s Environmental Regulatory Techniques</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hierarchy: Direct or ‘Command and Control’ Techniques</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flexible Direct Regulation: Framework Directives</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proceduralised Direct Regulation</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Pros and Cons of Direct Environmental Regulation in the EU</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market-Based Instruments</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tradable Permit Schemes</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Examples of the EU’s Embrace of Market-Based Instruments</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Network-Based Approaches: Voluntary Techniques and Corporate Social Responsibility</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enabling Corporations</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enabling Consumers and Civil Society</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Environmental Rights in Europe</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction: Why Environmental (Human) Rights?</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rights Originating from the Council of Europe</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The 1950 European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (the ‘ECHR’)</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Right to a Decent Environment</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 8 ECHR: Right to Respect for Private and Family Life</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 6(1) ECHR: Right to a Fair Trial</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 1 of Protocol No. 1: The Right to Property</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The 1961 European Social Charter (the ‘ESC’)</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU (the ‘Charter’)</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Aarhus Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Aarhus Convention’s Approach to Environmental Rights</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signatories, Ratification and Compliance</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aarhus’s Three Substantive Pillars</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to Information</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Participation</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to Justice</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of the Aarhus Convention in EU Law</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Relevant Sources of International Human Rights Law</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 6 Public Enforcement of EU Environmental Law

**Introduction: The Enforcement Deficit in EU Environmental Law**

Public Enforcement of EU Environmental Law: Enforcement by the European Commission
- Article 258 TFEU
  - Overview
  - The Administrative Phase
  - The Litigation Phase
- ‘General and Persistent’ Breaches of EU Law
  - Defences
  - Interim Measures
- Article 260 TFEU
  - Broader Commission Initiatives to Improve Enforcement of EU Environmental Law

Public Enforcement of EU Environmental Law: Enforcement by National Authorities
- Principles
  - The European Union Network for the Implementation and Enforcement of Environmental Law (IMPEL) Network
  - The Environmental Liability Directive
    - Overview
    - Scope of Application
    - Causation
    - Duties Imposed on Operators
    - Powers and Duties of Competent Authorities
    - Observations and Requests for Action
    - Transboundary Damage
    - Criminal Penalties

### 7 Private Enforcement of EU Environmental Law

Private Enforcement of EU Environmental Law at National Level
- Direct Effect of EU Environmental Law
  - Overview
  - Must a Directly Effective Provision Confer a Right on an Individual?
  - Which Bodies Must Apply Directly Effective Provisions?
- Other Means of Relying on EU Law before National Courts
  - The Duty of Consistent Interpretation (‘Indirect Effect’)
  - ‘Triangular’ Cases
  - ‘Incidental’ Horizontal Direct Effect
  - Horizontal Direct Effect of a ‘General Principle’ of EU Law
  - State Liability in Damages for Breach of EU Law
- EU Legislation on Access to Justice at National Level and the Role of the Aarhus Convention
  - The Provisions of the Aarhus Convention on Access to Justice
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of Article 9 of the Aarhus Convention in EU Law</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Enforcement of EU Law at EU Level</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to Justice before the EU Courts</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to Justice by Means of Internal Review under Regulation 1367/2006</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Means of Accessing Justice at EU Level</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 8 Climate Change

- Introduction: 257
- Mandate of the European Union with Regard to Climate Change: 258
- High Stakes: The Challenge of Climate Change Leadership: 260
  - The External Dimension of Climate Change Leadership: 262
  - The Internal Dimension of Climate Change Leadership: 266
  - The Challenge of Leadership Exemplified: The Case of Aviation: 269
- The Scope of the Climate Change Challenge: 273

#### Climate Change as a Multi-Level Governance Challenge: The Example of Renewable Energy: 275

- Renewable Energy Policy in the EU: Reconciling European Ambition with National Differentiation through Multi-Level Governance: 275
- The 2009 Renewable Energy Directive (RED): 278
  - National Action Plans: 280
  - Cooperation between Member States: 281
  - Access to the Grid and Guarantees of Origin: 282
  - The Difficult Question of Biofuels: 283
  - National Support Schemes: 286
  - Free Movement of Renewable Energy: Navigating between the Goals of Trade Liberalisation, Environmental Protection and National Control over Energy Policy: 287
- The Challenge of a Regulation-Based Market: 289
  - The ETS as Market-Based Regulation: 290
  - Gauging the Effectiveness of Market-Based Regulation: 292
  - Managing a Regulation-Based Market: 293
    - The Allocation of Allowances: 293
    - Recession and Transnational Offsetting: 294
    - Addressing the Burden of the Past: Backloading and the Market Stability Reserve: 296
- Concluding Remarks: 296

### 9 Air Pollution and Industrial Emissions

- Introduction: Key Themes of EU Air Pollution and Industrial Emissions Law: 298
- Ozone-Depleting Substances: 301
Ambient Air Quality 306
Approaches to Standardisation 309
The EU Legal Framework 312
The 2001 NECD 312
The 2008 AQFD 313
Member State Implementation of EU Ambient Air Legislation 315
Regulating Industrial Emissions 321
Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control within the IED 323
‘Best Available Techniques’ (BAT) 325
Standardisation in the IPPC Framework: The Anchoring Function of BAT 328
The Evolution of BREFs: A Hardening Attitude towards EU Soft Law Flexibility in the IED: An Assessment 330
Coherence in Air Pollution Law 335
Conclusion 336

10 EU Water Law 338
Introduction 338
Europe’s Waters Interconnected 338
The History of EU Water Law 339
The Inter-Related Threads of EU and International Water Law 340
The 2000 Water Framework Directive 341
History of the Water Framework Directive (WFD) 341
Overview 342
River Basin Management and the ‘Programme of Measures’ 343
The ‘Environmental Objectives’ 344
Surface Water 345
Groundwater 348
The Water Framework Directive’s Derogations from the Environmental Objectives 352
Combined Approach 353
Priority Substances 354
Economic Analysis 355
Public Involvement 357
Governance 357
Assessment 360
Drinking Water 360
History and Overview 360
Ensuring that Drinking Water is ‘Wholesome and Clean’ 361
Providing for Hard Cases: Lead and Pesticides 362
Monitoring and Compliance 363
Assessment 364
Bathing Water 365
Defining Bathing Waters 365
From Emissions Limit Values to Classification 366
Monitoring and Assessment 367
Public Participation 367
Assessment 368
Regulation of Dangerous Substances 368
Dangerous Substances in Water Directives 368
Priority Substances Directive 369
Directive 2008/105/EC 369
Listing Substances and Review of Adopted List of Priority Substances 369
Assessment 370
Nitrates 371
Regulating Non-Point Source Pollution 371
‘Nitrogen Zones’ 371
Improving Environmental Quality 372
Additional Measures and Derogations 372
Assessment 373
Urban and Industrial Waste Water 373
Collection, Treatment and Disposal 374
Sensitive Areas 374
Identifying Eutrophication 375
Less-Sensitive Areas 376
Industrial Waste Water 377
Institutional Framework 377

11 Impact Assessment 379
History and International Context 379
The 1991 UNECE Espoo Convention on Transboundary Environmental Impact Assessment 382
Overview 382
Obligations 383
The EIA Directive 385
Scope and Purpose 386
What is an EIA? 387
The ‘Competent Authority’ 389
Projects Subject to EIA 390
Annex I Projects: Mandatory EIA 390
Annex II Projects: The Screening Process 391
Exemptions from the EIA Requirement 393
The EIA Procedure 394
The Developer’s EIA Report 394
Consultation and Public Participation 395
Transboundary Projects 396
The Decision to Grant or Refuse Development Consent 396
12 Nature and Biodiversity Protection

Introduction
Changing Narratives: Nature Conservation, Biodiversity Protection and the Safeguarding of Natural Capital
The Birds Directive
The Habitats Directive
Designation and its Consequences: The Legal Status of SPAS and SACS
The Designation Process
The Consequences of Designation
Designation and its Discontents
Biodiversity and Sustainability: The Role of Economic Considerations in Natura 2000
Protecting SCIs and the Role of the Precautionary Principle
Protective Regimes: The Relation between the Birds and Habitats Directives
Timing of Member State Obligations
The Management of Protected Sites: Article 6(1) Habitats Directive
Avoiding Deterioration and Disturbance: Article 6(2) Habitats Directive
Assessing Development: Article 6(3) Habitats Directive
Declassification
Compensating Biodiversity Losses
The Effectiveness of the Birds and Habitats Directives
Other Measures
13 Technological Risk Regulation: Chemicals, Genetically Modified Organisms and Nanotechnology

Technological Risk Regulation: Chemicals, GMO and Nano Regulation as Technological Risk Regulation

Introduction
Dual-Purpose Regulation: Reconciling Market Harmonisation with Health and Environmental Protection
EU Chemicals Regulation as a Network
The REACH Regulation
The CLP Regulation
Further Measures
Chemicals, GMO and Nano Regulation as Technological Risk Regulation
Information Production
Risk Management
Legitimacy and Effectiveness Challenges of Data-Driven Regimes
Regulating Uncertainty
Legal Principles: The Requirement to Pursue a High Level of Environmental Protection (HLP) and the Precautionary Principle
Claims to Legitimacy: Expertise, Transparency and Participation
Claims to Legitimacy: Updating, Review and Monitoring
GMO Regulation: A Fraught State of Coexistence
Scope for Post-Authorisation Differentiation
Coexistence Measures
Safeguard Clauses
Derogation or ‘Opt-Ups’ under Article 114(4)–(6) TFEU
Article 26(b) DRD: Farewell Internal Market?
Nanotechnology: New Rules for New Tools?
Conclusion

14 Waste
EU Waste Policy
Waste Framework Directive (WFD)
Overview of the WFD
What is Waste?
By-Product
End-of-Waste
Hazardous Waste
Shipment of Waste
Waste Operations
Landfills
## Contents

- Incineration of Waste ........................................ 510
- Waste Streams .............................................. 512
- Packaging .................................................. 513
- Batteries and Accumulators .............................. 514
- End-of-Life Vehicles ...................................... 515
- Waste Electrical and Electronic Equipment (WEEE) 516
- Future Challenges ......................................... 517
- Index ......................................................... 518
Figures

2.1 Percentage of ENVI Co-Decision Files Agreed per Reading in the Last Parliamentary Mandate 65
4.1 Actors in EU Environmental Governance, and Examples of the Associated Regulatory Techniques 122
6.1 Open DG Environment Infringements 187
6.2 Infringements by Environmental Sector (2015) 188
6.3 Article 260(2) TFEU Actions per Member State as at End 2015 198
8.1 Renewable Energy Production 2005 and 2020 Targets 279
14.1 Infringements by Environmental Sector, 2007–2015 493
14.2 EU Waste Hierarchy 495
Tables

2.1 Allocation of Portfolios and Supporting Services in the Environmental Policy Area  56
2.2 Breakdown of the Available Structural Funds by Theme for the EU as a Whole  87
12.1 Habitats Non-Deterioration and Non-Disturbance Strategies  435