

## CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page</i> xvii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xlvii
<b>1 Expropriation</b>	1
I Introduction	5
A General	5
B Historic Background of Property Protection	5
1 The International Minimum Standard: The Treatment of Foreigners	5
2 The Contribution of Human Rights Law	11
3 The Contribution of the Iran–US Claims Tribunal: The Lex Specialis Problem of the Algiers Accord	13
C The Continued Relevance of the Customary International Law on Expropriation	14
D Historic Origin of Expropriation Clauses	16
E The Relevance of Textual Variations of Expropriation Clauses	18
II The Object of Protection: ‘Investments’	19
A The Broadening of the Object of Property Protection	20
B ‘Possessions’ as Objects of Expropriation in Human Rights Law	24
C Intangible Rights	26
D Contractual Rights	28
E Market Access	33
F Judicial and Arbitral Decisions	34
III The Notion of Expropriation	36
A General	36
B Direct Expropriation	39
C Confiscation	45
D Nationalization	45
E Indirect Expropriation	46
1 Scholarly Attempts to Define Indirect Expropriation	46
2 Recent Attempts to Define Indirect Expropriation in IIAs	48
IV General Considerations on Indirect Expropriation	51
A Fact-Based Case-by-Case Analysis	51
B Interchangeable Use of Indirect Expropriation Terms	52
C Measures Tantamount to Expropriation and Indirect Expropriation	54
	v

D Measures Tantamount to Expropriation and Dispossession	57
E Creeping Expropriation	57
F Acts and Omissions	69
G Property Deprivation: An Expropriation Need Not Benefit the State	71
H Judicial Expropriation	76
I The Problem of Partial Expropriation	81
J Regulatory Expropriation	85
1 The Difficulty of Distinguishing between Legitimate Regulation and Regulatory Expropriation	86
2 Legitimate Regulatory Purposes	88
(a) Taxation	91
(b) Monetary Regulation	99
(c) Environmental Regulation	100
(d) Health Regulation	102
3 The Methanex/Saluka Doctrine: Legitimate Regulatory Measures	103
4 Beyond Methanex and Saluka	104
V The Main Criteria Used to Identify Indirect Expropriation in Arbitral Practice	112
A Severity of Interference: Substantial Deprivation	112
1 The Severity of Interference in NAFTA Cases	115
2 The Intensity/Severity of Interference in Other Investment Cases	119
B Durational Aspects of Expropriation	135
C Loss of Control	140
1 De Facto Deprivation of Facilities	142
2 Loss of Control Indirectly Acknowledged	146
3 The Compulsory Nature of the Transfer of Property/Loss of Control	149
4 The Role of Governmental Intent: 'Sole Effects' Doctrine	149
D Protection of Legitimate Investor Expectations	156
1 Specific Assurances	157
2 General Assurances	159
3 High-Risk Investments	162
E Predictability and Stability	164
F Discrimination	166
G Proportionality	168
H Transparency	170
I Due Process	171
J Governmental Interference in Case of Takings of Contractual Rights	172
1 Breach of Contract or Expropriation of Contractual Rights	172
2 Expropriation of Contractual Rights: the Exercise of Governmental Authority	175
3 The Rare Cases of Expropriation of Contractual Rights vis-à-vis Private Parties	187
VI Lawfulness of Expropriation	188
A Public Interest	190
1 Textual Variations	190
2 Relationship to Customary International Law	191

<i>Contents</i>	vii
3 The Review of Public Interest on the Basis of IIA Provisions	194
4 Main Issues and Purpose	195
5 Scope of Review	195
(a) Wide Discretion of Host States to Determine Public Interest	196
(b) Limited Review of Host State Determinations of Public Interest	199
6 Summary	204
<b>B Non-discrimination</b>	<b>204</b>
1 Textual Variations	204
2 Relationship to Customary International Law	204
3 Main Issues and Purpose	206
(a) Discrimination of Foreigners	206
(b) Racial Discrimination	210
(c) ‘Justified’ Discrimination	211
4 Summary	213
<b>C Due Process</b>	<b>213</b>
1 Textual Variations	214
2 Relationship to Customary International Law	215
3 Main Issues and Purpose	216
(a) Meaning of Due Process	216
(b) Due Process As a Right to Have an Expropriation Reviewed	217
(c) Due Process As an Obligation to Expropriate According to Host State Law	222
4 Summary	223
<b>D Compensation for Expropriation</b>	<b>223</b>
1 Textual Variations	223
2 Compensation under Customary International Law	225
3 The Compensation Requirement under IIAs	228
4 The Adequacy of Compensation: ‘Full’, ‘Adequate’, or ‘Appropriate’	229
5 Prompt Compensation	233
(a) Offers of Compensation	236
(b) Compensation in Cases of Indirect Expropriation	238
6 Effective Compensation	241
7 Summary	242
<b>E Damages for Unlawful Expropriation</b>	<b>242</b>
1 The Differentiation between Compensation and Damages in Theory	243
2 The Differentiation in Practice under Customary International Law	244
3 The Differentiation in Practice under Treaty Law	246
<b>VII Conclusions</b>	<b>250</b>
<b>2 Fair and Equitable Treatment</b>	<b>251</b>
I Introduction	254
A General	254
B Historic Origin	255
C Scholarly Debates	257

II FET Clauses in International Investment Agreements	259
A Textual Variations of FET Clauses	261
1 Stand-alone FET Clauses	263
2 Combined FET Clauses	263
3 FET Clauses Referring to International Law	264
(a) References to International Law in General	264
(b) References to Customary International Law	265
(c) References to the International Minimum Standard	266
4 FET Clauses Stressing Individual Elements	266
5 FET Clauses Containing More Detailed Explanations	267
6 FET Clauses Referring to Domestic Law	269
B The Importation of FET Obligations via MFN Clauses	270
III Interpretative Approaches to FET Clauses	272
A Ordinary Meaning	274
1 The ‘Dictionary Approach’	274
2 Criticism of the ‘Dictionary Approach’	277
B Contextual Interpretation	279
1 Other Treaty Provisions as ‘Context’	279
2 Treaty Preambles as ‘Context’	281
3 Broader ‘Context’	282
4 Human Rights and Trade Treaty Provisions as ‘Context’	285
5 International Law and Jurisprudence as ‘Context’	287
C Object and Purpose	287
D Resulting Expansive or Restrictive Interpretations of FET	290
1 High Level of Protection	291
2 Low Level of Protection	294
IV Conceptual Aspects of FET	295
A The Legal Basis of Fair and Equitable Treatment: Good Faith	296
1 Bad Faith Is Not Required for a Breach of FET	297
2 Bad Faith Is a Strong Indication for a Breach of FET	300
B Fair and Equitable Treatment Distinguished from <i>Ex Aequo et Bono</i>	302
C Fair and Equitable Treatment as Customary International Law Minimum Standard or as Autonomous (Higher) Standard	303
1 The Content of the International Minimum Standard	305
(a) The Jurisprudence of Mixed Claims Commissions	305
(b) The Neer Standard	306
(c) Further Development of the Neer Standard	307
(d) The Evolutive Character of the International Minimum Standard	310
2 FET As Equivalent to the International Minimum Standard	314
3 An Autonomous Higher Standard	324
(a) An Autonomous Standard Where IIAs Do Not Refer to International Law	325
(b) An Autonomous Standard Where IIAs Refer to International Law	328
4 The Approximation of the Autonomous and the Customary Standard	333
D Fair and Equitable Treatment as Treatment under Customary International Law Does Not Incorporate Other International Law Guarantees	338

*Contents*

ix

E Fair and Equitable Treatment as an Expression of General Principles of Law	339
F Fair and Equitable Treatment as an Expression of the Rule of Law	342
G Fair and Equitable Treatment and Proportionality	344
H Fair and Equitable Treatment as a Non-Contingent Standard	346
I Cumulative Effect of Several Acts as Violations	347
J The Delimitation between Fair and Equitable Treatment and Other Protection Standards as Well as Their Interrelationship	349
1 Expropriation	351
(a) Breach of Contract under Expropriation and FET	354
(b) Due Process	357
2 Full Protection and Security	358
3 Non-Discrimination Standards	363
(a) The Prohibition of Arbitrary and Discriminatory Treatment	363
(b) National Treatment and MFN	365
4 Transfer Clauses	365
V The Elements of FET Identified in the Jurisprudence of Investment Tribunals	367
A Fact-Specific Assessment of FET Claims	368
B The Relevance of Jurisprudence and Scholarship	369
C Jurisprudential Summaries of the Elements of FET	371
D Procedural Fairness and Due Process	376
1 Due Process and Denial of Justice	379
2 Due Process Scrutiny Distinguished from Appellate Review	382
3 Due Process Scrutiny and Exhaustion of Local Remedies ('Finality Rule')	386
(a) The Exhaustion of Local Remedies and Access to ISDS	388
(b) The 'Exhaustion of Local Remedies' and the Requirement of Final Judicial Acts to Ascertain a Denial of Justice	390
4 Due Process Requirements Apply to Civil, Criminal and Administrative Proceedings	396
(a) Due Process in Civil Proceedings	396
(b) Due Process in Criminal Proceedings	396
(c) Due Process in Administrative Proceedings	398
5 The Content of the Due Process Obligation of Host States	402
(a) Access to Court	408
(b) Undue Delay	410
(c) Fair Procedure	416
(d) Equality of Treatment	418
(e) Right to be Heard	419
(f) Independence and Impartiality	422
(g) Manifestly Unjust Outcome	423
E Good Faith-Inspired FET Requirements: No Harassment and Abuse of Power	427
F A Possible Duty to Negotiate in Good Faith	432

x	<i>Contents</i>	
	G Absence of Discrimination and Arbitrariness	434
	1 Discriminatory Measures	436
	2 Arbitrary Measures	439
	H Reasonableness	441
	I Proportionality	446
	J Transparency	453
	1 High Level of Transparency	455
	2 Low Level of Transparency	459
	3 Challenges to Transparency As an Element of FET	460
	K Stability and Predictability	461
	1 Policy Reasons for Stability and Predictability	462
	2 Stability and Predictability As Part of FET	462
	3 Consistency	468
	4 How Much Stability?	471
	5 The Right to Regulate	478
	L Legitimate Expectations	480
	1 Legitimate Expectations As an Expression of Good Faith	482
	2 Ascertaining Legitimate Expectations by a Comparative Law Method	483
	3 Legitimate Expectations As a Controversial Aspect of FET	484
	4 The Objective Nature of Legitimate Expectations	486
	5 The Role of Investor Due Diligence for ‘Legitimate Expectations’	492
	6 The Timing of Legitimate Expectations	496
	7 The Host State’s Role in Creating Legitimate Expectations	500
	(a) Types of Host State Acts Creating Legitimate Expectations	503
	(i) Contracts	503
	(ii) Unilateral Promises	507
	(iii) Unilateral Statements	508
	(iv) Regulatory Framework and Legislation	510
	(b) Specificity of Host State Acts	517
	8 Legitimate Expectations and the Host State’s Right to Regulate	524
	M Legality	530
	1 Not Every Breach of Domestic Law by Host States Violates FET	530
	2 Legal or Illegal Host State Behaviour As an Indication of FET Violations	532
	VI Conclusions	535
	<b>3 Full Protection and Security</b>	<b>536</b>
	I Introduction	540
	A General	540
	B Historic Origin	540
	II Functioning and Basic Concepts	542
	A Textual Variations of FPS Provisions	542
	B FPS and Customary International Law	545
	1 International Law As a Floor	546
	2 International Law As a Ceiling	548

<i>Contents</i>	xi
C FPS and Fair and Equitable Treatment	550
1 FPS and FET As a Unitary Concept	550
2 FPS and FET As Separate Standards	554
III The Application of FPS in Arbitral Practice	558
A Physical Protection	558
1 Protection against Private Violence	561
2 Protection against Violence by State Organs	565
B Legal Protection	568
1 Inclusion of Legal Security	568
2 Exclusion of Legal Security	576
C The Standard of Liability for FPS	580
1 Due Diligence	580
2 The Relevance of Economic and Social Conditions	584
IV Conclusions	586
<b>4 National Treatment</b>	<b>587</b>
I Introduction	591
A General	591
B Historic Origin	592
II National Treatment Clauses in International Investment Agreements	594
A Textual Variations of National Treatment Provisions	595
B Exceptions from National Treatment Obligations	595
C National Treatment and Entry or Establishment	597
D Overlap with Other Standards: The Prohibition of Arbitrary and Discriminatory Measures	599
III The Functioning and Basic Concepts of National Treatment Clauses	603
A National Treatment as an Expression of Non-Discrimination	603
B Non-Discrimination as a Normative Concept	604
C National Treatment and Customary International Law	605
D National Treatment and the International Minimum Standard	606
E The Function of National Treatment	607
F Inherent Limitation of the Availability of the National Treatment Claim	608
IV Interpretation of National Treatment Clauses	609
A The Relevance of GATT/WTO Jurisprudence	609
1 Tribunals Accepting the Interpretative Value of Trade Law Concepts	610
2 Tribunals Reluctant to Accept the Interpretative Value of Trade Law Concepts	611
B The Relevance of MFN Jurisprudence	615
C Discriminatory Intent as a Requirement for a Breach of National Treatment?	616
1 No Intent Requirement	616
2 A Possible Intent Requirement	619
3 Proven Intent As an Indication of Discrimination	621

V Application in Practice: The Three-Step Test and Its Variations	623
A The Identification of a Domestic Comparator: ‘Like Circumstances’ or ‘Like Situations’	626
1 Textual Variations	627
2 A Flexible, Fact-Specific Approach to ‘Likeness’	630
3 The Relevance of ‘Economic’ or ‘Business’ Sectors	632
4 Number of Competitors	638
5 The Existence of a Competitive Relationship	639
6 The Need for ‘Substantially’ or ‘Materially’ Similar Circumstances	643
7 Examples of ‘Circumstances’ Which Are Not ‘Like’	644
B Less Favourable Treatment: Discrimination	653
1 What Constitutes ‘Treatment’?	654
2 ‘No Less Favourable’ Treatment or ‘Most Favourable’ Treatment?	656
3 De Jure and De Facto Discrimination	658
4 Factually Discriminatory Treatment	661
5 Any Discrimination or Only Sufficiently Serious Discrimination?	663
6 Examples of Discrimination and Lack of Discrimination	664
C Lack of Justification	667
1 The Possibility of Justification As an Implicit Element of Discrimination Claims	668
2 Legitimate Reasons to Differentiate As ‘Justification’ or As an Element to Assess ‘Like Circumstances’?	669
3 Few Genuine Examples of Investment Awards Justifying Different Treatment	672
D Burden of Proof	672
1 Claimants Have to Prove Discrimination in ‘Like Circumstances’	673
2 Respondents Have to Prove Affirmative Defences	674
VI Conclusions	679
<b>5 Most-Favoured-Nation Treatment</b>	<b>680</b>
I Introduction	686
A General	686
B Historic Origin	687
C Scholarly Debates	689
D The Use of MFN Clauses in Different Contexts	691
II MFN in Trade Matters	691
III MFN in International Investment Agreements	693
A Textual Variations of MFN Provisions	694
1 MFN in the Pre-establishment Phase	695
2 MFN Linked to Fair and Equitable Treatment	696
3 MFN Linked to Full Protection and Security	698
4 MFN and National Treatment Combined	698
5 MFN Clauses and Dispute Settlement	698
6 Exceptions from MFN Obligations	702
IV The Functioning and Basic Concepts of MFN Clauses	704
A The Multilateralizing Effect of MFN Treatment	705



<i>Contents</i>	xiii
B MFN Treatment as Treatment of Foreign Investments and Investors	705
C MFN as a Treaty, Not a Custom-based Obligation	709
D The ‘Basic Treaty’ as the Legal Basis of MFN Treatment	710
E MFN Clauses as Treaty Provisions Are Subject to Treaty Interpretation Rules	711
F Temporal Issues concerning MFN Treatment	712
1 The Prospective and/or Retrospective Effect of MFN Clauses	713
2 The Effect of MFN Clauses on the Temporal Scope of Application of a BIT	716
G The Scope of MFN Clauses: The <i>Ejusdem Generis</i> Principle	719
H The Scope of MFN Treatment: Treaty Stipulations and De Facto Treatment	725
I The Relevance of National Treatment Jurisprudence for MFN Cases	726
J Application of the Three-Step Test in Factual Discrimination Cases	727
1 ‘In Similar/Like Situations/Circumstances’	728
2 Treatment ‘No Less Favourable’: Not ‘Equal’ Treatment	732
3 What Constitutes More/Less Favourable Treatment?	732
K The Scope of MFN Treatment: Third Party Treatment in Its Entirety or Selectively – The ‘Cherry Picking’ Issue	735
V The Rationale/Purpose of MFN Clauses in International Investment Agreements	738
A Creating Equal Competitive Conditions for Investors	738
B Expansion of Investor Rights	740
VI The Application of MFN Clauses in Investment Practice	740
A MFN and the Scope of Protected Investments and Investors	740
B MFN As a Tool to Import Substantive Treatment Standards	743
1 Fair and Equitable Treatment in NAFTA	744
2 Fair and Equitable Treatment in Other Cases	746
3 Other Treatment Standards	749
4 MFN and Expropriation	754
5 MFN and De Facto Discrimination	756
C Treatment in Regard to Dispute Settlement	759
1 The Maffezini Case	764
2 Post-Maffezini Cases	766
3 Cases Following and Widening the Maffezini Approach	767
D Cases Rejecting the <i>Maffezini</i> Approach	779
VII The Main Aspects of the Post- <i>Maffezini</i> Debate	799
A The Use of Presumptions	800
B The Relevance of the Specific Wording of an MFN Clause	801
1 ‘Treatment’	802
2 ‘Treatment with Respect to the Management, Maintenance, Use, Enjoyment or Disposal of Investments’	804
3 ‘In the Territory’	805
4 ‘All Matters Subject to this Agreement’	807
5 ‘In Like Situations/Circumstances’	808
6 Exceptions	808

xiv	<i>Contents</i>	
	C Harmonization or More Inconsistency on the Interpretation of MFN Clauses in Procedural Matters?	810
	VIII Conclusions	812
<b>6</b>	<b>Protection against Arbitrary or Discriminatory Measures</b>	<b>813</b>
	I Introduction	816
	A General	816
	B Historic Origin	817
	II Functioning and Basic Concepts	819
	A Textual Variations	819
	B The Meaning of Unreasonable/Arbitrary Measures	820
	1 Ordinary Meaning	821
	2 Rule of Law	821
	3 Due Process	824
	4 Shock, Outrage and Surprise	825
	5 Expectations	826
	6 Bad Faith/Adverse Intention	827
	7 Rational Decision-Making	828
	8 Synopsis of Practice	834
	C The Meaning of Discriminatory Measures	835
	1 The Basis of Comparison for Discrimination	836
	2 Discriminatory Intent or de Facto Discrimination	839
	D Relationship to Customary International Law	843
	E Relationship to Fair and Equitable Treatment	845
	1 Unitary Concept with FET	846
	2 Separate Standards	851
	III Conclusions	854
<b>7</b>	<b>Umbrella Clause</b>	<b>855</b>
	I Introduction	857
	A General	857
	B Origin of the Term ‘Umbrella Clause’ and Other Designations	858
	C Historic Origin of Umbrella Protection	859
	D Scholarly Debates	860
	II Umbrella Clauses in International Investment Agreements	865
	A Textual Variations of Umbrella Clauses	867
	1 Umbrella Clauses Referring to Obligations ‘Entered Into’	868
	2 Umbrella Clauses Referring to Obligations ‘With Regard to Investments’ or ‘With Regard to Specific Investments’	869
	3 Umbrella Clauses Referring to ‘Any Obligations Whether General or Specific’	869
	4 Umbrella Clauses Referring to ‘Any Obligations Assumed’	870
	5 Umbrella Clauses Referring to Obligations ‘Entered Into’ by Third Parties	870

<i>Contents</i>	xv
6 Umbrella Clauses Constantly Guaranteeing the Observance of Commitments	871
7 Umbrella Clauses Making Observance of Obligations ‘Subject to Host State Law’	871
8 Umbrella Clauses Specifying the Applicable Law	872
9 Umbrella Clauses Clarifying Their Legal Effect	872
10 Opting Out from Umbrella Clauses	873
B Treaty Provisions Similar, but Distinct from, Umbrella Clauses	874
1 Clauses Generally Requiring Respect for Contractual Obligations	874
2 Preservation of Rights Clauses	876
3 ‘Floor’ Provisions	877
III The Interpretation of Umbrella Clauses	878
A Ordinary Meaning	879
B Object and Purpose	880
C Contextual Interpretation	881
D Expansive or Restrictive Interpretation	883
IV Conceptual Aspects of the Use of Umbrella Clauses	884
A The Purpose of Umbrella Clauses	885
1 Pacta Sunt Servanda	885
2 Access to Treaty Arbitration	886
B Scope of Umbrella Clauses	889
1 Unilateral Obligations – Host State Legislation and Regulation	890
2 Obligations Relating to Investments	901
(a) All Contractual Obligations or only Investment-Related Agreements?	901
(b) Specific Agreements and Other Treaty Provisions	903
3 Personal Scope of Obligations – Privity between Investors and Host States?	904
(a) Sub-state Entities	905
(b) Subsidiaries	915
(c) Conclusion on Privity	924
C The Possible Exclusion of Purely Commercial Commitments	924
D The Potential Need for a Governmental Act to Violate an Umbrella Clause	926
E The Power of Investors to Waive Rights under an Umbrella Clause	927
V Overview of the Jurisprudence on Umbrella Clauses	928
A Decisions de Facto Depriving Umbrella Clauses of any Practical Effect	930
B Decisions Requiring an Element of Sovereign Authority	933
1 Sovereign or Governmental versus Purely Commercial Obligations	934
2 Sovereign or Governmental versus Commercial Breaches of Obligations	937
C Decisions Giving Effect to Umbrella Clauses and the Issue of Applicable Law	944
D Decisions Giving Effect to Umbrella Clauses but Giving Precedence to Contractually Agreed upon Dispute Settlement Mechanisms	951

xvi	<i>Contents</i>	
	E Decisions Fully Internationalizing Contract Breaches through Umbrella Clauses	956
	F Passing References to Umbrella Clauses	962
	VI Conclusions	968
<b>8</b>	<b>Transfer Clauses</b>	<b>970</b>
	I Introduction	976
	II The Liberalization of Payments and Capital Transfers	976
	III Purpose of Transfer of Funds Provisions and Monetary Sovereignty	978
	IV The Texts of Transfer of Funds Provisions	980
	A Historic Origin	980
	B Textual Variations of Transfer Clauses	981
	1 In- and Outbound Transfers or Only Outbound Transfers	981
	2 Types of Transfers Covered	982
	3 Transfers Subject to Host State Law	983
	4 Time Element	984
	5 Types of Currencies Available for Transfers	984
	6 Applicable Exchange Rates	985
	C Exceptions from Transfer Obligations	986
	1 Exceptions relating to Judicial Proceedings	986
	2 Balance of Payments Exceptions	986
	V The Compatibility of Transfer Provisions with EU Law	987
	VI Application of Transfer Provisions in Practice	989
	A The Argentinian Financial Crisis	990
	B Violations of Transfer Obligations	992
	C No State Interference with Transfers	994
	D No Violations of Transfer Obligations	994
	VII Transfer Obligations Distinguished from other Treatment Standards	996
	VIII Conclusions	998
	<i>Bibliography</i>	999
	<i>Index</i>	1040