

THE ISRAELI SUPREME COURT AND THE HUMAN
RIGHTS REVOLUTION: COURTS AS AGENDA SETTERS

This book explains the reciprocal relations between the Supreme Court and the Israeli political system. It is based on a unique approach that contends that the non-governability of the political system and an alternative political culture are two key formal and informal variables affecting the behavior of several political players within the Israeli arena. The analysis illustrates the usefulness of such a model for analyzing long-term socio-political processes and explaining the actions of the players. Until this model changes significantly, the decisions of the High Court of Justice express the values of the state and enable Israel to remain a nation that upholds human rights. The court's decisions determine the normative educational direction and reflect Israel's democratic character with regard to the values of human rights.

Dr. Assaf Meydani is a Senior Lecturer in the School of Government and Society at the Academic College of Tel-Aviv–Yaffo. His research interests include public policy, politics and law, and political economy. Dr. Meydani has been a Visiting Scholar at the Center for New Institutional Science at Washington University in St. Louis, Missouri, and the Institute of Management, Innovation, and Organization at the University of California at Berkeley. He is the author of *Political Transformations and Political Entrepreneurs: Israel in Comparative Perspective* (2009). His articles have appeared in journals such as *Israel Studies*, *Israel Law Review*, *Policy and Society*, *Constitutional Political Economy*, *Rationality and Society*, and *Land Use Policy*.

The Israeli Supreme Court and the Human Rights Revolution

COURTS AS AGENDA SETTERS

Assaf Meydani

School of Government and Society, The Academic College of
Tel-Aviv–Yaffo



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-107-01262-2 — The Israeli Supreme Court and the Human Rights Revolution

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107012622

© Assaf Meydani 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2011

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Meydani, Assaf.

The Israeli Supreme Court and the human rights revolution : courts as agenda setters / Assaf Meydani.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-01262-2 (hardback)

1. Courts of last resort – Israel. 2. Political questions and judicial power – Israel.

3. Constitutional law – Israel. 4. Human rights – Israel. I. Title.

KMK3466.M49 2011

347.5694'035 – dc22 2011009809

ISBN 978-1-107-01262-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To Marit, Romy, and Alma with love and appreciation.

*To Lea and Ben-Zion Meydani – thank you for always
being there.*

Contents

| | |
|---|----------------|
| <i>Figures and Tables</i> | <i>page</i> xi |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | xiii |
| 1 Introduction | 1 |
| 2 The Intervention of the Israeli High Court of Justice in Government Decisions: An Empirical, Quantitative Study with Paradoxical Results | 6 |
| 2.1 On the Method of the Quantitative Study | 8 |
| 2.2 Research Findings | 11 |
| 2.3 From a Descriptive Analysis to a Path-Dependent Analysis: From Intervention to Involvement | 16 |
| 3 Law and Politics: Theoretical Aspects | 19 |
| 3.1 Political Thought and Legal Thought | 20 |
| 3.2 Major Approaches for Analyzing the Relationship Between Law and Politics | 25 |
| 3.3 The Supreme Court and the Political System in Israel | 33 |
| 3.4 Summary and Contribution | 39 |
| 4 The Supreme Court as a Political Entrepreneur in the Process of Institutional Change – an Analysis Based on Shared Mental Models and Political Entrepreneurship | 43 |
| 4.1 Institutional Theory | 43 |
| 4.2 The Sociological Perspective of Institutional Theory | 44 |
| 4.3 Institutional Theory as Perceived through Social Choice Studies | 45 |
| 4.4 Political Entrepreneurship | 51 |
| 4.5 The Policy-Making Process and Supreme Courts | 53 |

| | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| 4.6 | The Involvement of the Supreme Court in Policy-Making Processes | 58 |
| 5 | Israeli Public Law | 63 |
| 5.1 | Public Law and Human Rights | 63 |
| 5.2 | The Constitutional Mechanism in Law and Practice | 63 |
| 5.3 | Israeli Constitutional History and the Human Rights Statement | 65 |
| 5.4 | The Separation of Powers: The Role of the Israeli Supreme Court in Defending Human Rights in Israel | 67 |
| 5.5 | A Jewish and Democratic State: An Undefined Human Rights Attitude | 68 |
| 6 | Israel in Light of Structural and Cultural Variables | 69 |
| 6.1 | The Political Culture: Israel and Its Non-Liberal Culture of Alternative Politics | 69 |
| 6.2 | The Transformation of Israeli Political Culture: From a Top-Down to a Bottom-Up Orientation in Decision-Making Processes | 70 |
| 6.3 | Non-Governability in Israel | 73 |
| 6.4 | The Alternative Politics of the State Economy Arrangement Law | 79 |
| 7 | The Supreme Court and the Political System in Light of Social and Political Processes in Israel during 1948–1999 | 83 |
| 7.1 | Initial Structural and Cultural Conditions | 84 |
| 7.2 | The 1950s and 1960s: From the Establishment of the State to the Six Day War (1948–1967) | 86 |
| 7.3 | The 1970s: From the Bergman Petition to the Rubinstein Petition (1967–1982) | 90 |
| 7.4 | The 1980s: From the Rubinstein Petition to the Passage of Basic Laws: Human Dignity and Freedom of Occupation | 94 |
| 7.5 | The 1990s: From the Passage of Basic Laws: Human Dignity and Freedom of Occupation to the Zemach Petition (1992–1999) | 100 |
| 8 | The Struggle for a New Conservative Constitutional Court (2000): Redefining the Guarantor of Human Rights in Israel – the Role of the Israeli Supreme Court | 106 |
| 8.1 | A Constitution for Israel and a Constitutional Court: An Ongoing Debate | 107 |

| <i>Contents</i> | <i>ix</i> |
|---|-----------|
| 8.2 The High Court and the Process of Public Policy Making: The Proposal to Create a Constitutional Court of Law (2000) | 108 |
| 8.3 The Legal System Supported by the Minister of Justice | 109 |
| 8.4 Politicians – The Goal of Being Re-Elected | 109 |
| 8.5 The Activities of Interest Groups | 111 |
| 8.6 In the Political Arena: The Role of the Chair of the Constitutional Committee | 112 |
| 8.7 The Politicians – the Prime Minister’s Stand | 114 |
| 9 The Rule of “Who Governs?” as Electoral Capital (1999–2007): The Supreme Court as an Agenda Setter in Israel | 116 |
| 9.1 The Supreme Court Versus the Political System: A Balance of Power (1999–2007) | 116 |
| 9.2 The Israeli Supreme Court as a Political Entrepreneur, Providing an Alternative Form of Governability in Controversial Issues | 117 |
| 9.3 The Rule of “Who Governs?” as Electoral Capital | 119 |
| 10 The Supreme Court of Israel as an Agenda Setter: Three Cases | 121 |
| 10.1 Judicial Activism in Military Courts: Toward a Human Rights Approach | 121 |
| 10.2 The Interrogation Case (1999) | 134 |
| 10.3 The Land Decision Case (2002) | 136 |
| 10.4 Analyzing Public Policy in the Interrogation Case and the Land Decision Case | 137 |
| 10.5 Summary | 145 |
| 11 On Law, Society, and Policy Design – toward a Reform in the Relationship between the High Court of Justice and the Knesset | 147 |
| 11.1 Introduction | 147 |
| 11.2 The Shetreet Report | 148 |
| 11.3 Discussion of the Legal Literature | 149 |
| 11.4 Policy Science | 152 |
| 11.5 The Centrality of the High Court of Justice: Non-Governance and the Culture of Alternative Politics | 152 |

| | | |
|------|---|-----|
| 11.6 | An Arrangement That Promotes Governance Is Needed | 154 |
| 11.7 | A Summary – a Proposed Institutional Arrangement | 156 |
| 12 | Conclusion and Normative Implications | 162 |
| | <i>Bibliography</i> | 169 |
| | <i>Index</i> | 189 |

Figures and Tables

FIGURES

| | | |
|-----|--|----------------|
| 2.1 | The extent of the caseload in the Supreme Court | <i>page</i> 10 |
| 2.2 | The number of petitions against the government in the HCJ between 2000 and 2006 | 10 |
| 2.3 | The relative percentage of petitions against the government in the HCJ between 2000 and 2006, of the total number of cases discussed in the Supreme Court. | 11 |
| 2.4 | The distribution of petitions filed with the HCJ against the government (by ministers) | 13 |
| 2.5 | The distribution of petitions filed with the HCJ against the government (by judicial results) | 15 |
| 4.1 | The policy-making process and supreme courts | 54 |

TABLES

| | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| 6.1 | Rae’s Split Measure, 1949–1999 | 76 |
| 6.2 | The effective number of parties and the measures of centralization, 1949–1999 | 77 |
| 8.1 | The level of public trust in governmental institutions, 1995–2000 | 113 |

Acknowledgments

This book reflects the efforts of a decade of research and study about law and politics in Israel. Parts of its rationales and ideas have appeared in journals such as *Israel Studies*, *Israel Law Review*, *Policy and Society*, *Constitutional Political Economy*, *Rationality and Society*, *Land Use Policy*, *Democracy and Security*, and *Contemporary Security Policy*. Portions of the book have also been presented at conferences held by the Law and Society Association (LSA), the American Political Science Association (APSA), the Association for Israel Studies (AIS), and the International Political Science Association (IPSA). I would like to thank Gideon Doron, Shlomo Mizrahi, David A. Frenkel, Gad Barzilai, Arye Naor, David Nachmias, Shimon Shetreet, Daphne Barak-Erez, Pablo T. Spiller, Barak Medina, Ronen Shamir, Raanan Sulitzeanu-Kenan, Yoav Dotan, Menachem Hofnung, Itzhak Galnoor, Yoram Rabin, Suzie Navot, Ilan Saban, Udi Sommer, and Guy Seidman for their advice and collaboration. I would also like to thank Naomi Chazan for her time and support. Thanks, too, to the Academic College of Tel-Aviv–Yaffo for generous support, especially Israel Zang, Nehemia Friedland, and Dror Amir. I would also like to thank The Citizens’ Empowerment Center in Israel for their support.

The manuscript would never have achieved its final form but for the editorial skill and dedication of Diane Romm. In addition, I would like to thank John Berger, my editor at Cambridge University Press, for his useful advice and support. Finally, my thanks to the anonymous readers for their useful remarks.