CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01227-1 — The Derivative Action in Asia
Dan W. Puchniak , Harald Baum , Michael Ewing-Chow
Table of Contents
More Information

CONTENTS

List of tables *page* xiv
List of contributors xv
Foreword xvii
Preface xix
List of abbreviations xxi

1 The derivative action: an economic, historical and practice-oriented approach 1
HARALD BAUM AND DAN W. PUCHNIAK

I Introduction 1

II The derivative action from an economic and functional perspective 7
1 Definition, characteristics and delimitation 7
a Definition 7
b Characteristics 8
c Delimitation 10
2 Economic efficiencies and inefficiencies 12
a Function 12
b Empirical studies on the derivative action's compensatory value 15
c The comparative value of the empirical research 19
d The ambiguous empirical picture is compounded by the deterrence effect 23
e Illuminating the potential negative effects of derivative actions 26
3 Key elements of regulatory design 31
a The need for economic incentives and disincentives 31
b Designing appropriate economic incentives 35
c Sufficient access to corporate information 43

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01227-1 — The Derivative Action in Asia
Dan W. Puchniak , Harald Baum , Michael Ewing-Chow
Table of Contents
More Information

d Making the company the first option 46
e Filtering out unmeritorious actions 47
f Settlement and abandonment 58
4 The derivative action in context: functional alternatives 60

III The derivative action from a historical perspective 64
1 Historical development in the United States 64
2 Historical development in the United Kingdom 66
3 Germany's historical rejection of the derivative action 72

IV The derivative action from a practical perspective 74
1 Procedure and practice in the United States 74
2 Procedure and practice in the United Kingdom 77
3 Procedure and practice in France 82
4 Procedure and practice in Germany 84

2 The complexity of derivative actions in Asia: an inconvenient truth 90

DAN W. PUCHNIAK

I Introduction 90

II The seven leading Asian jurisdictions 98

III An overview of the derivative action in Asia 100
1 Japanese derivative actions: the rise of non-economic litigiousness 100
2 South Korean derivative actions: moderately litigious and intriguingly unpredictable 104
3 Taiwanese derivative actions: the chill of financial disincentives and domestic cultural norms 108
4 Chinese derivative actions: a complex pathway to minority shareholder protection 111
5 Hong Kong derivative actions: a late and partial break with common law tradition lays a path for reform 114
6 Singapore's derivative actions: mundanely non-Asian, intriguingly non-American and at the forefront of the Commonwealth 117
7 Derivative actions in India: explaining the rarity of derivative actions in a sea of litigation 120

IV The complexity of derivative actions in Asia: a less convenient, but more realistic, truth 124

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01227-1 — The Derivative Action in Asia
Dan W. Puchniak , Harald Baum , Michael Ewing-Chow
Table of Contents
More Information

3 Land of the rising derivative action: revisiting irrationality to understand Japan's unreluctant shareholder litigant 128

MASAFUMI NAKAHIGASHI AND DAN W. PUCHNIAK

I Introduction 128

II Applying the assumption of the economically motivated and rational shareholder litigant to Japan 132

1 The economically motivated and rational explanation for the absence of shareholder litigation in postwar Japan 132

2 Japan's explosion of derivative actions (mis)understood through the lens of the economically motivated and rational shareholder litigant and its testable hypotheses 139

III Putting the hypotheses of the economically motivated and rational Japanese derivative litigant to the test 144

1 Testing the economically motivated and rational shareholder hypothesis: do shareholders benefit financially from derivative actions in Japan? 144

2 Testing the economically motivated and rational attorney hypothesis: do economically motivated and rational attorneys drive derivative litigation in Japan? 150

3 Testing the financial tracking hypothesis: does the rate of derivative actions track changes in their financial costs/benefits? 155

IV Providing a rational explanation for 'economically irrational' derivative litigation in Japan 158

1 Demarcating the boundaries between rational and irrational behaviour 158

2 Quasi-rational (non-economically motivated) behaviour drives derivative litigation in Japan 160

3 Purely irrational behaviour as a potential driver of derivative litigation in Japan 163

V Conclusion 168

Appendices 170

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01227-1 — The Derivative Action in Asia
Dan W. Puchniak , Harald Baum , Michael Ewing-Chow
Table of Contents
More Information

4 Invigorating shareholder derivative actions in South Korea 186

HYEOK-JOON RHO AND KON-SIK KIM

I Introduction 186

II Basics of derivative actions: law and reality in South Korea 187
1 Background: the shareholding structure and the legal institutions for shareholder protection 187
a The shareholding structure 187
b Legal institutions for shareholder protection: shareholder direct suits and class actions 189
2 Overview of the structure of a derivative action 192
3 Some statistics and features 193

III Standing for plaintiffs 196
1 General shareholding requirement under the KCC 196
2 Double derivative actions 198
a Concept of a double derivative action and a recent Supreme Court case 198
b Analysis: why are double derivative actions necessary in South Korea? 199

IV Entrepreneurial lawyers: fees and incentives 200
1 Lack of shareholders' incentives and the role of entrepreneurial lawyers in derivative actions 200
2 Who will pay the plaintiff's lawyer? 201
3 How much will the plaintiff's lawyer be paid? 203
a Limitation on contingency fees 203
b Limitation of directors' liability 205

V Regulation of frivolous actions 206
1 Demand requirement 206
a Introduction 206
b A corporation's decision not to sue 207
c A derivative action filed without going through the demand process 207
d Analysis 209
2 Limiting collusive settlements 210

VI A new trend in case law: digression from the passive role model? 211

VII Concluding remarks 213

Appendix 214

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01227-1 — The Derivative Action in Asia
Dan W. Puchniak , Harald Baum , Michael Ewing-Chow
Table of Contents
More Information

5 Derivative actions in Taiwan: legal and cultural hurdles with a glimmer of hope for the future 215

WANG RUU TSENG AND WALLACE WEN YEU WANG

I Introduction 215

II The legal mechanism for conducting a derivative action: requirements for maintaining a derivative action 216
- 1 The shareholder rules 219
- 2 The 'continuing ownership' rule 220
- 3 The 'security for damages or costs' rule 220

III The ambiguity of civil procedure in Taiwanese derivative actions 223
- 1 Notification of and intervening in a derivative action 224
- 2 Ambiguity in an involuntary decrease in a plaintiff's shareholdings 225
- 3 The binding effect of settlements in derivative actions 227
- 4 Court fees in derivative actions: a flat rate or a percentage? 227

IV Derivative actions versus direct suits 228

V The relationship between culture, institutional background and the derivative action 230
- 1 The controlling shareholder system 230
- 2 Weak company code 231
- 3 Emphasis on criminal/administrative sanctions 233
- 4 Taiwan's legal culture 233
- 5 Paternalism and mass dispute resolution: 'Asian values' after all? 234

VI The impact of the derivative action on corporate governance 235

VII The perception of the derivative action and professional services in the marketplace 237

VIII Idiosyncrasies in derivative actions: the role of the government-sanctioned non-profit organization 240

IX Concluding remarks 241

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01227-1 — The Derivative Action in Asia
Dan W. Puchniak , Harald Baum , Michael Ewing-Chow
Table of Contents
More Information

6 Pathway to minority shareholder protection: derivative actions in the People's Republic of China 243

DONALD C. CLARKE AND NICHOLAS C. HOWSON

I Introduction 243

II Economic and legal reform in the PRC and the derivative action 244

1 Introduction: the derivative lawsuit and corporate governance in the Chinese context 244
2 Corporatization and its effects 245
3 The LLC form and other non-Company-Law forms 249
4 The legal representative 253
5 The Chinese judiciary: local protectionism, Party control and the avoidance of 'mass' litigant cases 254
6 Derivative versus representative 257
7 Costs, cost allocation and cost–benefit analysis for shareholder plaintiffs 258

III Derivative actions before 2006 260

1 Non-statutory rule making: CSRC principles, SPC utterances, local 'opinions', and the (draft) 'Omnibus' regulation on the 1994 Company Law 260
2 Pre-2006 cases 263
a Genesis of the 1994 SPC Approving Response and other LLC cases 263
b Widely held companies 267

IV The 2006 Company Law and statutory authorization for derivative actions 269

1 Standing 270
2 Demand 272
3 Defendants and associated causes of action 273

V The reality of derivative actions in the PRC from 1 January 2006 to date 275

1 Absence of CLS or publicly listed CLS-related cases 275
2 'Straddling' actions: 2006 Company Law application to pre-2006 transactions 278
3 Avoidance of derivative pleadings 279
4 Autonomy and acceptance 280
5 Technical competence 282
6 Difficulties regarding underlying substantive claims 284

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01227-1 — The Derivative Action in Asia
Dan W. Puchniak , Harald Baum , Michael Ewing-Chow
Table of Contents
More Information

7 Confusion between derivative and representative lawsuits 286
8 Judge-made direct litigation right for supervisors 286
9 Allocation of court fees and 'loser pays all' 287

VI Critique of article 152 and reform suggestions 288

VII Conclusion 293

7 A parallel path to shareholder remedies: Hong Kong's derivative actions 296

PAUL VON NESSEN, S. H. GOO AND CHEE KEONG LOW

I Introduction 296

II The common law derivative action: *Foss* v. *Harbottle* and its exceptions 297

III The reform process in Hong Kong 304
1 The consultancy report 304
2 The report of the Standing Committee on Company Law Reform 305
3 The SCCLR corporate governance consultation paper (July 2001) 307
4 Companies (Amendments) Bill 2003 308

IV How successful is Hong Kong's statutory derivative action? 310
1 The judicial pronouncements 311
2 Coexistence with the common law 315
3 Should Hong Kong adopt the British reforms? 319
4 Conclusions and observations on future success 321

8 Derivative actions in Singapore: mundanely non-Asian, intriguingly non-American and at the forefront of the Commonwealth 323

MENG SENG WEE AND DAN W. PUCHNIAK

I Introduction 323

II Law of minority protection 326
1 History and development 326
a English tradition and seeds of change 326
b Development of company law 328
c Evolution of minority protection law 330

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01227-1 — The Derivative Action in Asia
Dan W. Puchniak , Harald Baum , Michael Ewing-Chow
Table of Contents
More Information

2 Common law derivative action 331
a Introduction 331
b Critique 332
c Conclusion 336
3 Statutory derivative action 336
a Impetus for reform 336
b Scope 338
c The law 341
4 Personal right, corporate right and section 216 348
a Introduction 348
b Giving corporate relief under section 216 349
5 Conclusion 351

III Debunking Western stereotypes 351
1 Western stereotypes of Singapore 351
2 Realities 354
a The evolution of Singapore society and the concurrent rise in shareholder litigation 354
b Singapore's shareholder litigation defies the 'nanny state' and 'Asian values' stereotypes 359

IV Intriguingly non-American in its success 365

9 The rarity of derivative actions in India: reasons and consequences 369

VIKRAMADITYA KHANNA AND UMAKANTH VAROTTIL

I Introduction 369

II Why have derivative actions? 371
1 The desirability of derivative suits to enforce corporate laws 371
2 Application to the Indian context 378

III The derivative action in India 380
1 *Foss* v. *Harbottle* and its exceptions 381
a Ultra vires transactions or illegality 382
b Matters requiring special resolution 382
c Fraud on the minority 382
2 Procedural constraints 383
a The 'clean hands' doctrine 384
b Order I, rule 8, Civil Procedure Code 1908 384

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01227-1 — The Derivative Action in Asia
Dan W. Puchniak , Harald Baum , Michael Ewing-Chow
Table of Contents
More Information

3 Availability of other remedies 386
a Oppression and mismanagement 386
b Securities laws and SEBI 388
4 Other constraints 390
a Directors' duties 390
b Controlling shareholders' duties 391
c Cultural concerns 392
d Costs 393

IV Recent developments and reform efforts 394

V Conclusions and recommendations for the future 396

10 The derivative action in Asia: some concluding observations 398
DAN W. PUCHNIAK AND HARALD BAUM

Legislative appendix 404
Bibliography 422
Index 443

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org