

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

GREEK AND ROMAN ANIMAL SACRIFICE

The interpretation of animal sacrifice, now considered the most important ancient Greek and Roman religious ritual, has long been dominated by the views of Walter Burkert, the late J.-P. Vernant, and Marcel Detienne. No penetrating and general critique of their views has appeared and, in particular, no critique of the application of these views to Roman religion. Nor has any critique dealt with the use of literary and visual sources by these writers. This book, a collection of essays by leading scholars, incorporates all these subjects and provides a theoretical background for the study of animal sacrifice in an ancient context.

CHRISTOPHER A. FARAONE is the Frank Curtis Springer and Gertrude Melcher Springer Professor in the Humanities at the University of Chicago.

F. S. NAIDEN is Associate Professor of History at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

GREEK AND ROMAN ANIMAL SACRIFICE

Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

EDITED BY

CHRISTOPHER A. FARAONE AND F. S. NAIDEN



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107011120

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-01112-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Note on the contributors</i>	x
<i>Preface</i>	xi
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xiii
 Introduction	 I
<i>Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden</i>	
 PART I MODERN HISTORIOGRAPHY	
1 From Bergaigne to Meuli: how animal sacrifice became a hot topic	13
<i>Bruce Lincoln</i>	
2 One generation after Burkert and Girard: where are the great theories?	32
<i>Fritz Graf</i>	
 PART II GREEK AND ROMAN PRACTICE	
3 Blessèd are the parasites	55
<i>F. S. Naiden</i>	
4 Roman animal sacrifice and the system of being	84
<i>John Scheid</i>	
 PART III VISUAL REPRESENTATION	
5 Sacrificing stones: on some sculpture, mostly Athenian	99
<i>Richard Neer</i>	

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
6	Sacrifice in late Roman art <i>Jaś Elsner</i>	120
PART IV LITERARY REPRESENTATION		
7	Animal sacrifice in comedy: an alternative point of view <i>James Redfield</i>	167
8	Animal sacrifice in Greek tragedy: ritual, metaphor, problematizations <i>Albert Henrichs</i>	180
	Afterword <i>Clifford Ando</i>	195
	<i>Index</i>	201

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Figures*

5.1	Athens, Temple of Hephaestus. Mid-fifth century BCE. Photo: Richard Neer.	<i>page</i> 100
5.2	Athens, Parthenon: East frieze. Man and child with peplos. <i>c.</i> 447–32 BCE. Photo: © Marie-Lan Nguyen / Wikimedia Commons.	102
5.3	Bronze bull figurine from Olympia. Eighth century BCE. After <i>Olympia</i> IV pl. XI no. 159.	104
5.4	Calf-Bearer from the Acropolis of Athens. Marble. <i>c.</i> 560 BCE. Athens, Acropolis Museum. Photo: Richard Neer.	105
5.5	Procne and Itys by Alcamenes. Marble. Late fifth century BCE. Athens, Acropolis Museum. Photo: Richard Neer.	108
5.6	Procne and Itys: detail of Itys. Photo: Richard Neer.	111
5.7	Figures L and M from the east pediment of the Parthenon, Athens. Marble. <i>c.</i> 447–32 BCE. London, British Museum. Photo: Richard Neer.	112
5.8	Drawing by Jacques Carrey of a woman spinning wool, Metope South 19 of the Parthenon. Original <i>c.</i> 447–32 BCE. Photo: University of Chicago Epstein Archive.	115
6.1	Sacrificial relief from the attic storey at the northeast side of the quadrifonal Arch of Septimius Severus at Lepcis Magna. Photograph: DAI Rome Inst. Neg. 1961.1699 (Koppermann).	127
6.2	Sacrificial relief on the central exedra from the Theatre at Sabratha. Photograph: DAI Rome Inst. Neg. 1958.0459 (Sichtermann).	128
6.3	Inner face of the east pier of the gate of the Argentarii, Forum Boarium, Rome. Photograph: Alinari/Art Resource, NY.	129

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii	<i>List of figures</i>	
6.4	Sacrificial procession from the right face of the surviving base of Diocletian's Five-Column Monument. Photograph: DAI Rome Inst. Neg. 1935.0358 (Faraglia).	130
6.5	Back face of the surviving base of Diocletian's Five-Column Monument. Photograph: DAI Rome Inst. Neg. 1935.0357 (Faraglia).	130
6.6	Southeastern face of the southwest pier of the quadrifonal Arch of Galerius at Thessalonica. Photograph: courtesy of Jorge-11 from Flickr.com under a creative commons license for free distribution.	131
6.7	Sacrificial panel relief, originally from the Arch of Marcus Aurelius inserted into the attic storey of the Arch of Constantine in Rome. Photograph: Alinari/Art Resource, NY.	132
6.8	Fol. 33v from the Vatican Vergil. Photograph: Vat. Lat. 3225, by permission of the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, with all rights reserved.	134
6.9	Fol. 76v from the Roman Vergil. Photograph: Vat. Lat. 3867, by permission of the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, with all rights reserved.	135
6.10	Image of a female figure from the right hand leaf of an ivory diptych. Photograph: By permission of the Victoria and Albert Museum, London.	136
6.11	Left end of a sarcophagus from Rome now in the Campo Santo, Pisa. Photograph: J. Elsner.	137
6.12	Detail of the central panel of a strigillated sarcophagus from the Pamphilus Catacomb in Rome. Photograph: DAI Rome, Inst. Neg. 1948.0021.	138
6.13	Altar of unknown provenance but likely from Rome. Photograph: DAI Rome, Inst. Neg. 01073.	140
6.14	Stele with a reclining bearded deity, probably from central Tunisia, now in the British Museum. Photograph: Courtesy of Matthew McCarty.	142
6.15	Stele with Saturn seated between the Dioscuri at the top, probably from central Tunisia, now in the British Museum. Photograph: Courtesy of Matthew McCarty.	143
6.16	Votive monument dedicated by C. Candidinius Verus to the Aufaniae. From Bonn. Photograph: After Lehner, 1930.	145

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*List of figures*

ix

- | | | |
|------|---|-----|
| 6.17 | Front face of an altar dedicated to the <i>Matronae Aufaniae</i> by Q. Caldinius Celsus. Photograph: After Lehner, 1930. | 146 |
| 6.18 | Front face of a sarcophagus from Palmyra. Photograph: Courtesy of Ted Kaizer. | 148 |
| 6.19 | Fresco of the Tribune Julius Terentius in the centre, with other members of his cohort behind him to the right and his standard bearer at center right. From a room in the temple of the Palmyrene Gods (or the “Temple of Bel”), Dura-Europos, now in the Yale University Art Gallery. Photograph: Yale University Art Gallery, Dura-Europos Collection. | 149 |
| 6.20 | Drawing (c. 0.6 × 0.32 m) of the deity Iarhibol with a flying Victory. From a room in the Temple of Azzanathkona, Dura-Europos, now in Yale University Art Gallery. Photograph: Yale University Art Gallery, Dura-Europos Collection. | 150 |
| 6.21 | Relief of the priest Hairan from the “Temple of the Gaddé”, Dura-Europos, now in the Yale University Art Gallery. Photograph: Yale University Art Gallery, Dura-Europos Collection. | 151 |
| 6.22 | Relief depicting a man to the left sprinkling incense over a flaming altar in the presence of the goddess Nemesis. From the vicinity of the Palmyrene gate, Dura-Europos, now in the Yale University Art Gallery. Photograph: Yale University Art Gallery, Dura-Europos Collection. | 152 |
| 6.23 | Painted imagery of the upper part of the Torah shrine in the synagogue at Dura-Europos. Now in the Damascus Museum. Photograph: Yale University Art Gallery, Dura-Europos Collection. | 154 |
| 6.24 | Cult relief of the “tauroctony”, showing Mithras in Persian dress killing the bull with a stab-wound to the neck. Found in Rome. Photograph: DAI Rome, Inst. Neg. 34.227 (Faraglia). | 156 |

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Note on the contributors

CLIFFORD ANDO is Professor of Classics at the University of Chicago.

JAŚ ELSNER is Humfry Payne Senior Research Fellow in Classical Art at Corpus Christi College, Oxford, and Visiting Professor of Art History at the University of Chicago.

CHRISTOPHER A. FARAONE is the Frank Curtis Springer and Gertrude Melcher Springer Professor in the Humanities at the University of Chicago.

FRITZ GRAF is Professor of Greek and Latin at Ohio State University.

ALBERT HENRICHS is the Eliot Professor of Greek at Harvard University.

BRUCE LINCOLN is the Caroline E. Haskell Professor of the History of Religions at the University of Chicago.

F. S. NAIDEN is Associate Professor of History at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill.

RICHARD NEER is Associate Professor of Art History at the University of Chicago.

JAMES REDFIELD is the Edward Olson Distinguished Service Professor of Classics and Professor on the Committee for Social Thought at the University of Chicago.

JOHN SCHEID is Professor at the Collège de France.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Preface

This book began its life as a conversation between the editors in a café in New Orleans, not long after Hurricane Katrina. It grew and eventually took shape as a conference, “The Centrality of Animal Sacrifice in Ancient Religion: Ancient Reality or Modern Construct?”, at the Franke Institute for the Humanities at the University of Chicago in April 2008. The discussions during the conference were exceptionally lively and cannot be captured here on the page, but suffice it to say that this collection of essays has benefited greatly from the participation of B. Arnold, J. Bremmer, A. Bresson, D. Collins, M. Gaifman, E. Gebhard, S. I. Johnston, C. Lopez Ruiz, B. Kowalzig, N. Marinatos, E. Mayer, I. Moyer, R. Palmer, S. Palmie, V. Platt, K. Rigsby, D. Schloen, L. Slatkin, T. Van Den Hout and Roger Woodard.

We are grateful to the Franke Institute and its director Jim Chandler for financial and logistical support for the conference and to the University of Chicago’s Center for the Study of Ancient Religions for underwriting part of the conference as well as the editing and indexing of this volume. Special thanks to Martha Roth, Dean of Humanities at the University of Chicago, for her generous support in setting up the Center for the Study of Ancient Religions as a way of recognizing and nourishing the University’s considerable resources and dynamism in the study of ancient religions. The University’s Divinity School, as well as the departments of Anthropology, Art, Classics, Near Eastern Languages, the Committee on Social Thought, and the Workshop on Ancient Societies, also supported the conference, which was the eighth in a series of annual meetings sponsored by the Midwestern Consortium on Ancient Religions, a group of faculty from Ohio State University, the University of Chicago, and the University of Michigan, under the leadership of Christopher A. Faraone, Fritz Graf, Richard Janko, Sarah I. Johnston, Bruce Lincoln, and Ruth Scodel.

We would also like to thank Rachel Kamins for her editorial and indexical help on the manuscript, two anonymous readers, as well as Michael Sharp and Josephine Lane of Cambridge University Press.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Abbreviations*

Except for Demosthenes, rendered as “Dem.,” and Plutarch, rendered as “Plut.,” the names of Greek and Roman authors and titles of works and collections are abbreviated as in *A Greek–English Lexicon*, ed. H. Liddell & R. Scott, rev. H. Stuart Jones (Oxford 1968) = *LSJ*, and as in the *Oxford Latin Dictionary*, ed. P. G. W. Glare (Oxford 1982). Other editions of these works are identified by the name of the editor. Epigraphical works and collections are mostly abbreviated as at *Searchable Greek Inscriptions: A Scholarly Tool in Progress*, by the Packard Humanities Institute (Los Altos, Calif. 2006–), but occasionally as in *LSJ*. Names of journals are abbreviated as in *L’Année Philologique*, and reference works dealing with visual art are abbreviated as in the *Lexicon Iconographicum Mythologiae Classicae*, ed. H. Ackermann & J.-R. Gisler (Zurich, 1981–97). Commentaries are identified by commentator.

Each essay contains its own bibliography, as in the system used in *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology*. Other abbreviations:

Ambrose, <i>Epistulae</i>	<i>Epistulae et acta</i> , ed. O. Faller (Vienna, 1968–96).
Arn. <i>Adv. nat.</i>	<i>Arnobii Adversus nationes libri VII</i> , ed. C. Marchesi (Turin, 1953 ²).
<i>Cod. Theod.</i>	<i>Theodosiani libri XVI cum Constitutionibus Sirmondianis et Leges novellae ad Theodosianum pertinentes</i> , ed. T. Mommsen et P. Meyer (Berlin, 1954 ²).
Dar.–Sag.	<i>Dictionnaire des antiquités Grecques et Romaines</i> , ed. C. Daremberg and E. Saglio (Paris, 1877–1919).
FGrH	<i>Fragmente der griechischen Historiker</i> , ed. F. Jacoby (Berlin, 1923–58).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01112-0 - Greek and Roman Animal Sacrifice: Ancient Victims, Modern Observers

Edited by Christopher A. Faraone and F. S. Naiden

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv

List of abbreviations

- Firm. Mat. *Err. prof. rel.* Firmicus Maternus. *De errore profanarum religionum*, ed. R. Turcan (Paris, 1982).
- LSAM *Lois sacrées de l'Asie Mineure*, ed. F. Sokolowski (Paris, 1955).
- LSCG *Lois sacrées des cités grecques*, ed. F. Sokolowski (Paris, 1969).
- LSS *Lois sacrées des cités grecques. Supplément*, ed. F. Sokolowski. (Paris, 1962).
- OCD *Oxford Classical Dictionary*, ed. S. Hornblower and A. Spawforth (Oxford, 1996³).
- PG *Patrologiae cursus completus, series Graeca*, ed. J. Migne (Paris, 1857–66).
- Prudent. *C. Symm.* Prudentius. *Contra Symmachum*, ed. H. Tränkle (Turnhout, 2008).
- Peristephanon* *Le Corone. Aurelio Prudenzio Clemente*, ed. L. Canali (Florence, 2005).
- RE *Real-Encyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft*, ed. A. Pauly and G. Wissowa (Stuttgart, 1894–1963), 2nd ser. (1914–72).
- SB *The Standard Babylonian Epic of Gilgamesh*, ed. S. Parpola. *State Archives of Assyria Cuneiform Texts I* (Helsinki, 1997).
- ThesCRA* *Thesaurus Cultus et Rituum Antiquorum*, ed. J. Balty, J. Boardman, et al. (Los Angeles 2004–6).
- TrGF *Tragicorum Graecorum fragmenta*, ed. A. Nauck. 2nd ed. rev. B. Snell et al. (Göttingen, 1971).