

Cyber Warfare and the Laws of War

The information revolution has transformed both modern societies and the way in which they conduct warfare. *Cyber Warfare and the Laws of War* analyses the status of computer network attacks in international law and examines their treatment under the laws of armed conflict. The first part of the book deals with the resort to force by states and discusses the threshold issues of force and armed attack by examining the permitted responses against such attacks. The second part offers a comprehensive analysis of the applicability of international humanitarian law to computer network attacks. By examining the legal framework regulating these attacks, Heather Harrison Dinniss addresses the issues associated with this method of attack in terms of the current law and explores the underlying debates which are shaping the modern laws applicable in armed conflict.

at the International Law Centre of the Swedish National Defence College. She has previously taught at the London School of Economics and Political Science and at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London. Her research focuses on the impact of modern warfare on international humanitarian law, in particular, on advanced and autonomous weapons systems and the status and use of computer network attacks in the law of armed conflict.



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL AND COMPARATIVE LAW

Established in 1946, this series produces high quality scholarship in the fields of public and private international law and comparative law. Although these are distinct legal sub-disciplines, developments since 1946 confirm their interrelations.

Comparative law is increasingly used as a tool in the making of law at national, regional and international levels. Private international law is now often affected by international conventions, and the issues faced by classical conflicts rules are frequently dealt with by substantive harmonisation of law under international auspices. Mixed international arbitrations, especially those involving state economic activity, raise mixed questions of public and private international law, while in many fields (such as the protection of human rights and democratic standards, investment guarantees and international criminal law) international and national systems interact. National constitutional arrangements relating to 'foreign affairs', and to the implementation of international norms, are a focus of attention.

The Series welcomes works of a theoretical or interdisciplinary character, and those focusing on the new approaches to international or comparative law or conflicts of law. Studies of particular institutions or problems are equally welcome, as are translations of the best work published in other languages.

General Editors

James Crawford SC FBA Whewell Professor of International Law, Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge John S. Bell FBA Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.



Cyber Warfare and the Laws of War

Heather Harrison Dinniss





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City
Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK
Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107011083

© Heather Harrison Dinniss 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Dinniss, Heather Harrison.

Cyber warfare and the laws of war / Heather Harrison Dinniss.

p. cm. - (Cambridge studies in international and comparative law) Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-01108-3 (hardback)

- 1. Information warfare (International law) 2. War (International law)
- 3. Cyberterrorism. I. Title.

KZ6718.D56 2012

341.6'3-dc23 2012013369

ISBN 978-1-107-01108-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Marc
Thank you ... for everything





Contents

	Acknowledgements Table of cases List of abbreviations				
Lis					
1	Tł	1			
	1	Comp	4		
	2	Law a	and war in the internet age	8	
	3	3 Societal trends generally		11	
		3.1	The information revolution and digitisation	11	
		3.2	Globalisation, interdependency and the		
			changing world order	17	
		3.3	The rise of the knowledge economy	20	
	4	Milita	ary trends	21	
			A change of purpose	23	
		4.2	Network-centric warfare and effects-based		
		(operations	24	
		4.3	Outsourcing and civilianisation	25	
	5		inology and definitions	27	
		5.1	New laws for old?	28	
		5.2	Methodology	30	
			A word about examples and hypotheticals	31	
	6	Concl	lusion	32	
			PART I Jus ad bellum		
2	Co	mput	ter network attacks as a use of force in		
	in	37			
	1	Force	defined as armed force	40	
	2	Defin	ition of armed force	49	
				vii	



vii	i	i CONTENTS			
		2.1 State actions	53		
		2.2 Theories of force – scholastic writings	58		
	3	Computer network attacks as a use of force	62		
		3.1 Characteristics of computer network attacks	65		
	4	Conclusion	74		
3	Aı	Armed attack and response in the digital age			
	1	111110 # ######	76		
		1.1 Anticipatory self-defence	82		
		1.2 Pinprick attacks or accumulation of events theory	93		
	2				
	3	Attribution	99		
	4	Necessity and proportionality	102		
	5	Countermeasures against unlawful acts	105		
	6	Security Council authorisation and collective measures	109		
	7	Conclusion	113		
		PART II Jus in bello			
4	The applicability of the laws of armed conflict to				
	computer network attacks				
	1	111110 # 001111101	118		
		1.1 The requirement of armed force	122		
		1.2 Intervention of the armed forces	123		
	2	11	126		
		2.1 Application during conventional armed conflict	127		
		2.2 Computer network attack on its own	129		
		2.3 Computer network attacks in support of	40.		
	_	conventional attacks	134		
	3	J	134		
	4		137		
5	Participants in conflict: combatant status, direct participation and computer network attack				
	_	Combatant status	139 140		
	1	1.1 Requirements of combatant status	144		
		1.2 Saboteurs and spies	151		
	2	Direct participation by civilians	159		
	_	2.1 Requirements of direct participation	161		
		2.2 Offensive computer network attack	167		
		2.3 Computer network attack system support	167		
		2.4 Generic IT support	170		



		CONTENTS	ix			
		2.5 Mercenaries	172			
	3	Child soldiers	175			
	4	Conclusion	178			
6	Ta	Targeting and precautions in attack				
	1	The principle of distinction	180			
	2	Legitimate military objectives	184			
		2.1 Nature, location, purpose or use	185			
		2.2 Effective contribution to military action	188			
		2.3 Definite military advantage	190			
	3	Dual-use technology	193			
	4	Protection of civilian objects	195			
		4.1 Attacks and operations	196			
		4.2 Indiscriminate attacks	202			
	5	Proportionality	205			
		5.1 Knock-on effects	207			
		5.2 Dual-use systems	208			
	6	Precautions in attack	209			
		6.1 Verification of military objectives	211			
		6.2 Choice of weapons	212			
		6.3 Choice of targets	216			
	7	Precautions against the effects of attacks	217			
7	M	easures of special protection	220			
	1	The environment	221			
		1.1 Additional Protocol I	222			
		1.2 ENMOD Convention	224			
		1.3 Other protections	226			
	2	Cultural property	227			
		2.1 The legal framework	228			
		2.2 Attacks on, and damage to, digital works	233			
		2.3 Theft, pillage or misappropriation of digital works	235			
	3	Installations containing dangerous forces				
	4	Objects indispensable to the survival of the				
		civilian population				
	5	Hospitals and other medical units	244			
		5.1 Location and access to medical databases	244			
		5.2 Hospital ships	247			
	6	Non-defended localities and demilitarised zones	247			
		6.1 Non-defended localities	248			
		6.2 Demilitarised zones	248			



X CONTENTS

8	Mea	ans and methods of warfare	250			
1	Law	of weaponry	251			
	1.1	General principles	252			
	1.2	Explicit prohibitions of weapons	258			
	1.3	Article 36 obligations	260			
2	Perf	idy and ruses of war	261			
	2.1	Ruses of war	261			
	2.2	Perfidy	263			
	2.3	Misuse of protected symbols and emblems	264			
3	Destruction and seizure of property		265			
	3.1	Booty	270			
	3.2	Occupied territory	272			
		Pillage and plunder	274			
		Enemy-owned property on the territory of				
		a belligerent	276			
4	Con	clusion	277			
Concluding remarks						
Appendix 1 Selected computer network attack examples Appendix 2 Glossary of selected computing terms						
						Bibliography
Index						



Acknowledgements

The writing of a Ph.D. thesis and the task of turning it into a book necessarily requires assistance from many individuals and there are a number of people who have helped me both in the formation of my ideas and in the writing of this book. First and most importantly, my thanks go to my Ph.D. supervisor, Christopher Greenwood, for his insightful comments and suggestions, and for keeping me focused on the danger of being too technical at the expense of the law. Special thanks are also due to Christine Chinkin, my supervisor during Chris's sabbatical, who also commented on a draft of the manuscript. Her perceptive insights form the basis of my methodology section, a contribution for which I am profoundly grateful. I am indebted to Michael Schmitt and Chaloka Beyani for examining the original thesis and particularly to Mike, who has offered numerous comments and suggestions for this subsequent published edition. He has been a supportive and encouraging mentor, always willing to discuss ideas and offer advice.

Although the media seems full of new reports of cyber warfare (some worthy of the title, many not), at the time that the original thesis was written there were very few examples in the public domain of computer network attacks. My thanks are also due to those specialists in information technology and network design who patiently reviewed my hypothetical examples and advised on the feasibility of particular computer network attack scenarios, in particular Andy Batchelor, Karon James and Michelle Ellis. I am grateful for their assistance, and the fault for any errors or inaccuracies remains entirely mine. Special mention must also go to Andrew Ladley of Victoria University of Wellington, for his encouragement to continue postgraduate study and for the stories of his adventures that proved so inspirational. I would also like to thank all of my colleagues in the law department of the London School of Economics and Political Science; it is often remarked that the drafting of a Ph.D. thesis can be a lonely experience and I am



xii ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

grateful to all my friends for making sure that this was not the case, and for making my time at the LSE so rewarding both personally and academically.

The thesis on which this book is based was funded in part by the generous Freyberg Scholarship provided by the New Zealand Defence Force and the Research Studentships of the London School of Economics and Political Science.

Finally, and most importantly, I would like to thank my family. My parents for their support and encouragement throughout this process; my mother, Ann Dinniss, who painstakingly proofread the original manuscript, and my father, David Dinniss, who sadly did not live to see it completed. Above all, my thanks go to my wonderful husband Marc; without his support, patience, sense of humour, and steadfast belief, the thesis and this subsequent book would not have happened. This book is dedicated to him



Table of cases

- Nawar v. Minister of Defence et al. (1985) 39(3) Piskei Din 449, Israel Supreme Court. 268, 270, 271, 272
- The Caroline Case (1837) 29 BFSP 1137-1138. 84-5, 87, 92, 102
- Case Concerning Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Uganda) (2005), International Court of Justice. 40, 95, 97, 99, 102
- Case Concerning Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v. United States of America) (Merits) (1986) ICJ 14, International Court of Justice. 40, 46–8, 50, 52, 60, 66, 76–9, 85, 94, 96, 103, 105–6, 151
- Case Concerning Oil Platforms (Islamic Republic of Iran v. United States of America) (2003), International Court of Justice. 77, 79–80, 95, 102–3, 106
- Case Concerning the Gabcikovo-Nagymoros Project (1997) ICJ Reports 3, International Court of Justice. 107
- Case Concerning the Land and Maritime Boundary between Cameroon and Nigeria (Cameroon v. Nigeria: Equatorial Guinea Intervening) (2002) ICJ Reports 303, International Court of Justice. 95
- Case Concerning the United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran (United States v. Iran) (1980) 74 AJIL 746, International Court of Justice. 52
- Cession of Vessels and Tugs for Navigation on the Danube Case (1921) 1 RIAA 97. 271
- Corfu Channel Case (UK v. Albania) (Merits) (1949) ICJ Reports 4, International Court of Justice. 47, 71
- Cuba Submarine Telegraph Co. (1923) 6 RIAA 118. 273
- Eastern Extension, Australasia and China Telegraph Co. Claim (1923) 6 RIAA 112. 273

xiii



xiv TABLE OF CASES

- Ex p Quirin et al. (1942) 317 US 1, Supreme Court of the United States. 152-3
- Finding of the International Commission of Inquiry Organized under Article 9 of the Convention for the Pacific Settlement of International Disputes, of July 29, 1899 (the Dogger Bank Incident) (1905) 2 AJIL 931–936, The International Commission of Inquiry between Great Britain and Russia arising out of the North Sea incident. 120, 133
- Re Flesche (1949) 16 International Law Reports 266, Holland, Special Court of Cassation. 157, 159
- Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in Occupied Palestinian Territory (2004) ICJ 136, International Court of Justice. 40, 85, 97, 99
- Legality of the Threat and Use of Nuclear Weapons (1996) ICJ 226, International Court of Justice. 28, 30, 59, 64–5, 102, 128–9, 139, 180, 195, 205, 226, 252–3, 256–8, 273
- Legality of the Use by a State of Nuclear Weapons in Armed Conflicts (1996) ICJ 26, International Court of Justice. 86
- The Lotus (1927) Series A No. 10, Permanent Court of International Justice. 155
- Osman Bin Haji Mohamed Ali and Another v. the Public Prosecutor (1969) 1 AC 430, Privy Council (Malaysia). 144, 152-3
- Partial Award, Civilians Claims, Eritrea's Claims 15, 16, 23 & 27–32 between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (2004), Eritrea Ethiopia Claims Commission. 276–7
- Partial Award, Loss of Property in Ethiopia Owned by Non-Residents, Eritrea's Claim 24 between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (2005), Eritrea Ethiopia Claims Commission. 276
- Prosecutor v. Dario Kordic and Mario Cerkez (Appeal) (2004) Case No. IT-95–14/2-A, International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, Appeals Chamber. 234–5
- Prosecutor v. Dragoljub Kunarac et al. (2002) Case No. IT-96–23 and 23/1, International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia. 135
- Prosecutor v. Drazen Erdemovic (1997) Case No. IT-96–22-A, International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, Appeals Chamber. 31
- Prosecutor v. Dusko Tadic (1997) 36 ILM 908, International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia. 97, 161
- Prosecutor v. Dusko Tadic (Interlocutory Appeal on Jurisdiction) (1995) Case No. IT-94–1-AR, International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, Appeals Chamber. 122, 124, 130, 151, 180, 209, 253, 263



TABLE OF CASES

χV

- Prosecutor v. Jean-Paul Akayesu (1998) Case No. ICTR-96–4-T, International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda. 124, 150, 159
- Prosecutor v. Kupreškic´ (2000) Case No. IT-95–16-T, International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia. 202, 209, 218
- Prosecutor v. Miodrag Jokic (Sentencing Judgment) (2004) Case No. IT-01–42/1-S, International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia. 234
- Prosecutor v. Mladen Naletilic and Vinko Martinovic (2003) Case No. IT-98–34-T, International Criminal Court for the Former Yugoslavia. 274
- Prosecutor v. Moinina Fofana and Allieu Kondewa (Decision on Preliminary Motion Based on Lack of Jurisdiction (Child Recruitment)) (2004) Case No. SCSL-04-14-T, Special Court for Sierra Leone. 275
- Prosecutor v. Norman (Decision on Preliminary Motion Based on Lack of Jurisdiction (Child Recruitment)) (2004) Case No. SCSL-04–14-AR72(E)-131, Special Court for Sierra Leone. 177
- Prosecutor v. Zejnil Delalic et al. (Celebici) (1998) Case No. IT-96-21-T, International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia. 237
- The Public Committee against Torture in Israel et al. v. the Government of Israel et al. (2007) 46 ILM 375, Supreme Court of Israel. 161
- Public Prosecutor v. Koi et al. (1968) AC 829, Privy Council. 144, 150
- R v. Boden (2002) QCA 164, Court of Appeal of the Supreme Court of Queensland (Australia). 221–2, 243, 285
- R v. Wilkinson (1999) 1 NZLR 403, Court of Appeal (New Zealand). 21 Rivard v. United States (1967) 375 F. 2d 882, United States Court of Appeals, 5th Circuit. 156, 158
- Trial of Alfred Felix Alwyn Krupp von Bohlen und Halbach and Eleven Others (Krupp Trial) (1948) X Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals 69, United States Military Tribunal, Nuremburg. 236, 238, 265–7
- Trial of Alois and Anna Bommer and Their Daughters (1947) IX Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals 62, Permanent Military Court at Metz. 274-5
- Trial of Carl Krauch and Twenty-Two Others (I.G. Farben Trial) (1948) X Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals 1, United States Military Tribunal, Nuremburg. 236
- Trial of Friedrich Flick and Five Others (Flick Trial) (1947) IX Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals 1, United States Military Tribunal, Nuremburg. 233, 275



List of abbreviations

ADIL Annual Digest and Reports of Public Inter-

national Law Cases

Additional Protocol I Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conven-

also API tions of 12 August 1949, and relating to

the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I), 8 June 1977

Additional Protocol II Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conven-

also APII tions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the

Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II), 8 June 1977

AFJ Log. Air Force Journal of Logistics

AFL Rev. Air Force Law Review

AJIL American Journal of International Law Am. U. L. Rev. American University Law Review

ASIL Proc. American Society of International Law Proceedings

BFSP British and Foreign State Papers.

BMJ British Medical Journal

BU Int'l L. J. Boston University International Law

Journal

BU J. Sci. & Tech. L. Boston University Journal of Science and

Technology

BYBIL British Yearbook of International Law

Case W. Res. J. Int'l L. Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law

Chi. J. Int'l L. Chinese Journal of International Law
CNA Computer Network Attack

Col. J. Trans. L. Columbia Journal of Transnational Law
Conventional Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional

xvi



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS XVII

Weapons Which May Be Deemed to Be Excessively Injurious or to Have Indiscriminate Effects, 10 October 1980

CPU central processing unit

DCS distributed control system

DDoS distributed denial of service

EJIL European Journal of International Law

EMP electromagnetic pulse

ENMOD Convention on the Prohibition of Military or Any Other Hostile Use of Environmental

Modification Techniques, 10 December 1976

FRY Federal Republic of Yugoslavia

Geneva Convention I Geneva Convention for the Amelioration

of the Condition of the Sick and Wounded in Armed Forces in the Field of August 12,

1949

Geneva Convention II Geneva Convention for the Amelioration

of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at

Sea of August 12, 1949

Geneva Convention III Geneva Convention relative to the Treat-

ment of Prisoners of War of August 12,

1949

Geneva Convention IV Geneva Convention relative to the Protec-

tion of Civilian Persons in Time of War of

August 12, 1949

GJIA Georgetown Journal of International Affairs

GovExec Government Executive

Hague Convention 1899 Hague Convention Concerning the Laws

and Customs of War on Land

Hague Regulations Regulations Annexed to the 1907 Hague

Convention IV Respecting the Laws and

Customs of War on Land

Harv. Int'l L.J. Harvard International Law Journal Hous. J. Int'l L. Houston Journal of International Law

HPCR Harvard Program on Humanitarian Policy

and Conflict Research

IAEA International Atomic Energy Agency
ICBL International Campaign to Ban Landmines

ICI International Court of Justice



XVIII LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ICRC International Committee of the Red Cross

ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for

Rwanda

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal for the

Former Yugoslavia

IFF Identification Friend or Foe
 IMF International Monetary Fund
 IO Information Operations
 IP Address Internet Protocol Address

IRRC International Review of the Red Cross Israel Y.B. Hum. Rts Israeli Yearbook of Human Rights

IWInformation WarfareJ. Legal Stud.Journal of Legal Studies

JC&SL Journal of Conflict and Security Law
JSTARS Joint Surveillance Target Attack Radar

System

Keesings Keesings Record of World Events
LOAC Laws of Armed Conflict
Mil. L. Rev. Military Law Review

NIL Rev. Netherlands International Law Review

NYU J. Int'l L. & Pol. New York University Journal of International Law

and Politics

NZLR New Zealand Law Reports

OAS Organization of American States
OAU Organisation of African Unity

Ottawa Convention Convention on the Prohibition of the Use,

Stockpiling, Production and Transfer of Anti-Personnel Mines and on Their Destruction.

PMC Private Military Company

RIAA Reports of International Arbitral Awards SCADA Supervisory Control and Data Acquisition

SCSL Special Court for Sierra Leone Stan. J. Int'l L. Stanford Journal of International Law

T. Jefferson L. Rev. Thomas Jefferson Law Review

Tex. L. Rev. Texas Law Review

Tulsa J. Comp. & Int'l L. Tulsa Journal of Comparative & International Law

UAV Unmanned Aerial Vehicle

UN United Nations

UNCIO Documents of the United Nations Confer-

ence on International Organisation



UNTS

US

Yale Hum. Rts & Dev. L.J.

Yale J. Int'l L.

ZaöRV

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01108-3 - Cyber Warfare and the Laws of War Heather Harrison Dinniss Frontmatter More information

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

xix

United Nations Treaty Series

UN Y. B. Int'l L. Comm'n United Nations Yearbook of the International

Law Commission

URL Universal Resource Locator (a web address)

United States (of America)

USAF Acad. J. Legal Stud.
US Air Force Academy Journal of Legal Studies
Vand. J Transnat'l L.
Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law

Yale Human Rights and Development Law Journal

Yale Journal of International Law

Zeitschrift für ausländisches öffentliches Recht

und Völkerrecht