

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01048-2 - Regime Interaction in International Law: Facing Fragmentation

Edited by Margaret A. Young

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## REGIME INTERACTION IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

This major extension of existing scholarship on the fragmentation of international law utilises the concept of 'regimes' from international law and international relations literature to define functional areas of legal specialisation and institutional activity. Responding to prevailing approaches, which focus on the resolution of conflicting norms between regimes, it explores the way in which norms and institutions from disparate regimes overlap and interact. Leading scholars reflect on how, in situations of legal pluralism and concurrent activity, such interaction shapes and controls knowledge and norms at the domestic, transnational and international level, in often hegemonic ways. The contributors draw on topical examples of interacting regimes, including climate, trade, intellectual property and investment regimes, to argue for new methods and understanding of regime interaction. Together, the essays combine historical, doctrinal, critical and sociological forms of legal analysis to provide important insights into an issue that continues to challenge international legal theory and practice.

MARGARET A. YOUNG is a senior lecturer at the Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne, Australia. She was formerly based at the University of Cambridge, where she was the inaugural Research Fellow of Public International Law at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law and Pembroke College.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01048-2 - Regime Interaction in International Law: Facing Fragmentation

Edited by Margaret A. Young

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01048-2 - Regime Interaction in International Law: Facing Fragmentation

Edited by Margaret A. Young

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# REGIME INTERACTION IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

Facing Fragmentation

Edited by

MARGARET A. YOUNG



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01048-2 - Regime Interaction in International Law: Facing Fragmentation

Edited by Margaret A. Young

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,  
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107010482](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107010482)

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 978-1-107-01048-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in  
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,  
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
Introduction: the productive friction between regimes	1
MARGARET A. YOUNG	
<b>PART I Contexts</b>	<b>21</b>
1 Two kinds of legal pluralism: collision of transnational regimes in the double fragmentation of world society	23
GUNTHER TEUBNER AND PETER KORTH	
2 International regimes and domestic arrangements: a view from inside out	55
CHERYL SAUNDERS	
3 Regime interaction in creating, implementing and enforcing international law	85
MARGARET A. YOUNG	
<b>PART II Communities</b>	<b>111</b>
4 Legal regimes and professional knowledges: the internal politics of regime definition	113
ANDREW T. F. LANG	
5 A new approach to regime interaction	136
JEFFREY L. DUNOFF	
6 Structural ambiguity: technology transfer in three regimes	175
STEPHEN HUMPHREYS	

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-01048-2 - Regime Interaction in International Law: Facing Fragmentation  
Edited by Margaret A. Young  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

<b>PART III</b>	<b>Control</b>	<b>199</b>
7	Norm interpretation across international regimes: competences and legitimacy	201
	NELE MATZ-LÜCK	
8	Relations between international courts and tribunals: the 'regime problem'	235
	JAMES CRAWFORD AND PENELOPE NEVILL	
9	Importing other international regimes into World Trade Organization litigation	261
	JAMES FLETT	
10	Hegemonic regimes	305
	MARTTI KOSKENNIEMI	
	<i>Index</i>	325

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01048-2 - Regime Interaction in International Law: Facing Fragmentation

Edited by Margaret A. Young

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## CONTRIBUTORS

JAMES CRAWFORD SC, FBA, is Whewell Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge and a Fellow of Jesus College. He was Director of the Lauterpacht Centre for ten years between 1995 and September 2010. He was a Member of the United Nations International Law Commission from 1992 to 2001 and Special Rapporteur on State Responsibility from 1997 to 2001. In addition to scholarly work on statehood, self-determination, collective rights and international responsibility, he has appeared frequently before the International Court of Justice including in the Advisory Opinions on Nuclear Weapons (1996) and the Israeli Wall/Barrier (2004). He has also appeared before other international tribunals, and is actively engaged as an international arbitrator.

JEFFREY L. DUNOFF is Professor of Law and Director, Institute for International Law & Public Policy at Temple University Beasley School of Law. He has served as Visiting Professor at Harvard Law School and Princeton University, a Visiting Fellow at the Lauterpacht Centre, a Law and Public Affairs Fellow at the Woodrow Wilson School, a member of the Warwick Commission on the Future of the Trade System, a consultant for the World Bank, and on the editorial board of the *Yearbook of International Environmental Law*. His scholarship focuses on public international law, international regulatory regimes, and interdisciplinary approaches to international law. Recent publications include *Ruling the World? Constitutionalism, International Law and Global Governance* (with Trachtman) and *International Law: Norms, Actors, Process* (with Ratner and Wippman).

JAMES FLETT works in the World Trade Organization (WTO) and Trade Policy team of the European Commission Legal Service. He has represented the European Commission in 120 cases before the European Court of Justice, and the EC in 90 proceedings before the WTO. He regularly advises the Commission on WTO law. Before joining the Commission Legal Service in 1995 Mr Flett spent several years working

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01048-2 - Regime Interaction in International Law: Facing Fragmentation

Edited by Margaret A. Young

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

for the international law firms Clifford Chance and Van Bael & Bellis, in London and Brussels, with a particular emphasis on international trade law.

STEPHEN HUMPHREYS is Lecturer in Law at the London School of Economics. Prior to joining the LSE in 2009, he was Research Director at the International Council on Human Rights Policy in Geneva. He previously acted as publications director for the Open Society Justice Initiative in New York, and before that oversaw a project monitoring minority rights and discrimination in ten EU accession countries for the Open Society Institute in Budapest. He conducted research on climate change and the Kyoto mechanisms with ENDA Tiers Monde in Dakar, Senegal. He is the editor of *Human Rights and Climate Change* (2009) and the author of *Theatre of the Rule of Law* (2010).

PETER KORTH is an Associate at Hengeler Mueller, Berlin. His recent writings include *Dritthaftung von Ratingagenturen* (2010) and ‘Quasi-vertragliche Expertendritthaftung und “soziologische Jurisprudenz”’ in Graf-Peter Calliess (ed.), *Soziologische Jurisprudenz – Festschrift für Gunther Teubner* (2009).

MARTTI KOSKENNIEMI is Professor of International Law at the University of Helsinki and Global Professor of Law at New York University. From 2008 to 2009 he was the Arthur Goodhart Visiting Professor of Legal Science at the University of Cambridge. Professor Koskenniemi was appointed as a member of the United Nations International Law Commission in 2002 and he was Chair of the Study Group on the *Fragmentation of International Law: Difficulties arising from the Diversification and Expansion of International Law*, which produced a report and recommendations to the General Assembly in 2006. From 1997 to 2003 he served as a judge of the Administrative Tribunal of the Asian Development Bank. He was counsellor for legal affairs at the Finnish Ministry for Foreign Affairs from 1978 to 1994. His main publications include *From Apology to Utopia. The Structure of International Legal Argument* (1989), *The Gentle Civilizer of Nations. The Rise and Fall of International Law 1870–1960* (2002) and *La politique du droit international* (2007).

ANDREW LANG is a Senior Lecturer in Law at the London School of Economics. Formerly, he was the Gott Research Fellow in Law at Trinity Hall, at the University of Cambridge. He is a co-founder, with Colin Picker, of the Society of International Economic Law. He sits on the Editorial Boards of the *Modern Law Review*, the *Journal of International Economic*



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01048-2 - Regime Interaction in International Law: Facing Fragmentation

Edited by Margaret A. Young

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

ix

*Law and the Law and Development Review*, and is a Book Review Editor for the *International and Comparative Law Quarterly*. He is the author of *World Trade Law After Neoliberalism: Re-imagining Global Economic Governance* (2011).

NELE MATZ-LÜCK is Professor for the Law of the Sea, University of Kiel, Germany. Formerly, she was a Senior Research Fellow at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law in Heidelberg. From 2005 to 2007 she was a research fellow at the German Federal Constitutional Court where she was mainly engaged in cases related to public international law. She is author of the book *Wege zur Koordinierung völkerrechtlicher Verträge* (2005) and co-author of *Conflicts in International Environmental Law* (2003).

PENELOPE NEVILL is in practice at the Bar of England and Wales at 20 Essex Street Chambers, London, where she specialises in public international law and related areas before domestic and international courts and tribunals. She is a Visiting Tutor in public international law at King's College, London, and a former Fellow of the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law and Law Fellow of Downing College in the University of Cambridge. She is a graduate of the Universities of Auckland (BA, LLB (Hons)) and Cambridge (LLM) and a Barrister and Solicitor of the High Court of New Zealand. She is currently completing professional qualifications in the United Kingdom at 20 Essex St Chambers, London, with a view to continuing her work in public international law and international arbitration.

CHERYL SAUNDERS is a laureate professor at the University of Melbourne, with a personal chair in law. She has specialist research interests in public law and comparative public law, with particular reference to intergovernmental relations, constitutional design and comparative constitutional method. In 2005/06, she held the position of Arthur Goodhart Visiting Professor of Legal Science at the University of Cambridge and in 2009 was a visiting fellow at Corpus Christi College, Oxford. She is President Emeritus of the International Association of Constitutional Law, a Fellow of the Australian Academy of Social Sciences and a member of the Advisory Board of International IDEA. In 1994 she was appointed an officer in the Order of Australia, for services to the law and to public administration.

GUNTHER TEUBNER is Professor of Private Law and Legal Sociology, Goethe Universität Frankfurt and Professor, International University

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01048-2 - Regime Interaction in International Law: Facing Fragmentation

Edited by Margaret A. Young

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## X

## LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

College, Torino. He was Centennial Professor, London School of Economics, from 1998 to 2009. His research fields include social theory of law and comparative private law. He is the author of *Networks as Connected Contracts* (2008); *Regime-Kollisionen: Zur Fragmentierung des Weltrechts* (2006); *La cultura del diritto nell'epoca della globalizzazione: L'emergere delle costituzioni civili* (2005); *Il diritto possibile* (2005); *Direito, Sistema, Policontextualidade* (2005); *Diritto policontesturale* (1999); *Droit et réflexivité* (1994); *Law as an Autopoietic System* (1993) (translated into nine languages). He is the editor and co-author of *Contractual Networks* (2008); *Nach Jacques Derrida und Niklas Luhmann* (2008); *Paradoxes and Inconsistencies in the Law* (2006); *Transnational Governance and Constitutionalism* (2004); *Global Law Without A State* (1997); *Environmental Law and Ecological Responsibility* (1994); *State, Law and Economy as Autopoietic Systems* (1992); *Paradoxes of Self-Reference in the Humanities, Law and the Social Sciences* (1991).

MARGARET YOUNG is Senior Lecturer of the Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne, Australia. She was the inaugural Research Fellow in Public International Law at Pembroke College and the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge from 2006 to 2008. Her fields of research and teaching include international and domestic public law and she is the author of *Trading Fish, Saving Fish: The Interaction between Regimes in International Law* (2011).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01048-2 - Regime Interaction in International Law: Facing Fragmentation

Edited by Margaret A. Young

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is the product of much collaboration, the most significant of which was a conference at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, the University of Cambridge, in June 2009. The conference was both an examination and an exercise of ‘regime interaction’, bringing together international law scholars and practitioners, adjudicators from international tribunals, secretariat staff and advisors to states and non-governmental organisations. Several people who are distinguished by their generosity and academic rigour (and their general resistance to any one ‘functional specialisation’) have made significant contributions throughout this project, and I wish to express my deepest thanks to Georges Abi-Saab, James Crawford, Françoise Hampson, David Kennedy, Martti Koskeniemi, Sol Picciotto, Cheryl Saunders, Joanne Scott, Eleanor Sharpston and Gunther Teubner. I am equally indebted to the other speakers at the conference who have each contributed chapters to this volume.

At Cambridge, Anita Rutherford, Tara Grant and Karen Fachechi of the Lauterpacht Centre were indispensable in organisational matters, and I am also grateful to my former college, Pembroke College, for co-hosting the event. Thanks are also due to the lively conference participants and especially to Sophie Chapman, Yseult Marique, Francesco Messineo, Brendan Plant and Chris Thomas for their assistance with note-taking. At Melbourne Law School, the Institute for International Law and the Humanities provided encouragement and support, and I am grateful to its Director, Anne Orford. Alissa Sputore and her staff at the Law Research Service provided excellent editorial and research assistance at the final stages of the book production. Finally, I wish to thank the two anonymous peer reviewers from Cambridge University Press as well as Finola O’Sullivan for her continuing support.

Margaret Young

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01048-2 - Regime Interaction in International Law: Facing Fragmentation

Edited by Margaret A. Young

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---