CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01033-8 - Collective Wisdom: Principles and Mechanisms
Edited by Hélène Landemore and Jon Elster
Frontmatter
More information

Collective Wisdom

Principles and Mechanisms

James Madison wrote, "Had every Athenian citizen been a Socrates, every Athenian assembly would still have been a mob." The contributors to this volume discuss and for the most part challenge this claim by considering conditions under which many minds can be wiser than one. With backgrounds in economics, cognitive science, political science, law, and history, the authors consider information markets, the Internet, jury debates, democratic deliberation, and the use of diversity as mechanisms for improving collective decisions. At the same time, they consider voter irrationality and paradoxes of aggregation as possibly undermining the wisdom of crowds. Implicitly or explicitly, the volume also offers guidance and warnings to institutional designers.

Hélène Landemore is a graduate of the École Normale Supérieure in Paris, Sciences Po Paris, and Harvard University (PhD 2008). After holding postdoctoral positions at the Collège de France in Paris, Brown University, and MIT, she is now an assistant professor of political science at Yale University. She is the author of *Hume: probabilité et choix raisonnable* and *Democratic Reason: Politics, Collective Intelligence, and the Rule of the Many*. Her work has appeared in the *Journal of Moral Philosophy*, *Raison Publique*, *Synthese*, *Journal of Public Deliberation, Critical Review*, and *Political Psychology*.

Jon Elster is Robert K. Merton Professor of Political Science at Columbia University. He was previously a professor at the University of Chicago. From 2005 to 2011, he held the Chaire de Rationalité et Sciences Sociales at the Collège de France in Paris. He is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, Academia Europaea, and the Norwegian Academy of Science and is a Corresponding Fellow of the British Academy. He holds honorary doctorates from the universities of Valencia, Stockholm, Trondheim, Bogotá, Torcuata di Tella, and Louvain-la-Neuve. Elster is the author of twenty-three monographs, which have been translated into eighteen languages. The most recent of these include *L'Irrationalité*; *Alexis de Tocqueville: The First Social Scientist*; *Le Désintéressement*; *Explaining Social Behavior*; *Agir contre soi*; *Closing the Books*; and *Alchemies of the Mind*.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01033-8 - Collective Wisdom: Principles and Mechanisms
Edited by Hélène Landemore and Jon Elster
Frontmatter
More information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01033-8 - Collective Wisdom: Principles and Mechanisms
Edited by Hélène Landemore and Jon Elster
Frontmatter
More information

Collective Wisdom

Principles and Mechanisms

Edited by
HÉLÈNE LANDEMORE
Yale University

JON ELSTER
Columbia University and (Emeritus) Collège de France

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01033-8 - Collective Wisdom: Principles and Mechanisms
Edited by Hélène Landemore and Jon Elster
Frontmatter
More information

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107010338

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Collective wisdom : principles and mechanisms / [edited by] Hélène Landemore, Jon Elster.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-01033-8 (hardback)
1. Group decision making. 2. Social choice. I. Landemore, Hélène, 1976–
II. Elster, Jon, 1940–
HM746.C654 2012
302.3–dc23 2011036711

ISBN 978-1-107-01033-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01033-8 - Collective Wisdom: Principles and Mechanisms
Edited by Hélène Landemore and Jon Elster
Frontmatter
More information

Contents

List of Contributors *page* vii

Collective Wisdom: Old and New 1
Hélène Landemore

1 Prediction Markets: Trading Uncertainty for Collective Wisdom 21
Emile Servan-Schreiber

2 Designing Wisdom through the Web: Reputation and the Passion for Ranking 38
Gloria Origgi

3 Some Microfoundations of Collective Wisdom 56
Lu Hong and Scott E. Page

4 What Has Collective Wisdom to Do with Wisdom? 72
Daniel Andler

5 Legislation, Planning, and Deliberation 95
John Ferejohn

6 Epistemic Democracy in Classical Athens: Sophistication, Diversity, and Innovation 118
Josiah Ober

7 The Optimal Design of a Constituent Assembly 148
Jon Elster

8 Reasons and Preferences in Medicine Evaluation Committees 173
Philippe Urfalino

9 Collective Wisdom: Lessons from the Theory of Judgment Aggregation 203
Christian List

10 Democracy Counts: Should Rulers Be Numerous? 230
David Estlund

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01033-8 - Collective Wisdom: Principles and Mechanisms
Edited by Hélène Landemore and Jon Elster
Frontmatter
More information

11 Democratic Reason: The Mechanisms of Collective Intelligence in Politics 251
Hélène Landemore

12 Rational Ignorance and Beyond 290
Gerry Mackie

13 *The Myth of the Rational Voter* and Political Theory 319
Bryan Caplan

14 Collective Wisdom and Institutional Design 338
Adrian Vermeule

15 Reasoning as a Social Competence 368
Dan Sperber and Hugo Mercier

Conclusion 393
Jon Elster

Index 405

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01033-8 - Collective Wisdom: Principles and Mechanisms
Edited by Hélène Landemore and Jon Elster
Frontmatter
More information

Contributors

Daniel Andler is Professor of Philosophy of Science and Epistemology at Université Paris–Sorbonne and a senior member of Institut Universitaire de France. He taught in mathematics departments before moving to positions in philosophy. His main interests lie in cognitive science, extending from foundational issues to the impact on social science and on societal issues, education in particular. He is the author and/or editor of several books (including *Philosophie des sciences*, Gallimard, 2002; *Introduction aux sciences cognitives*, Gallimard, 2004) and numerous papers. His new book, *Critical Naturalism*, will be published in 2012.

Bryan Caplan is Professor of Economics at George Mason University and blogger for EconLog. He is the author of *The Myth of the Rational Voter: Why Democracies Choose Bad Policies* (Princeton University Press, 2007), named the "best political book of the year" by the *New York Times*, and *Selfish Reasons to Have More Kids: Why Being a Great Parent Is Less Work and More Fun Than You Think* (Basic Books, 2011). He has published in the *New York Times*, *Washington Post*, *Wall Street Journal*, *American Economic Review*, *Economic Journal*, *Journal of Law and Economics*, and *Intelligence*.

Jon Elster is Robert K. Merton Professor of Social Sciences at Columbia University. He was previously a professor at the University of Chicago and the Collège de France in Paris. Elster is the author of twenty-three monographs translated into eighteen languages. The most recent of these include *L'Irrationalité* (Seuil, 2010); *Alexis de Tocqueville: The First Social Scientist* (Cambridge University Press, 2009); *Le Désintéressement* (Seuil, 2009); *Explaining Social Behavior* (Cambridge University Press, 2007); *Agir contre soi* (Odile Jacob, 2006); *Closing the Books* (Cambridge University Press, 2004); and *Alchemies of the Mind* (Cambridge University Press, 1999).

David Estlund is Lombardo Family Professor of Humanities in the Departments of Philosophy and Political Science at Brown University, where he has

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01033-8 - Collective Wisdom: Principles and Mechanisms
Edited by Hélène Landemore and Jon Elster
Frontmatter
More information

been teaching since 1991. He edited the collection *Democracy* (Blackwell, 2001) and is the author of *Democratic Authority: A Philosophical Framework* (Princeton University Press, 2008). He is the editor of the *Oxford Handbook in Political Philosophy* (Oxford University Press, 2012) and is writing a book about whether normative political theories must be realistic.

John Ferejohn is the Samuel Tilden Professor of Law at New York University. He was formerly a Professor of Social Sciences at the California Institute of Technology (1972–83) and a Professor of Political Science at Stanford University and a Senior Fellow of the Hoover Institution (1983–2009). He is the author of *Pork Barrel Politics* (Stanford University Press, 1974), as well as many scholarly articles in political science, economics, and philosophy, and the coeditor of *Information and Democratic Processes* (University of Illinois Press, 1990), *Constitutional Culture and Democratic Rule* (Cambridge University Press, 2001), and *The New Federalism: Can the States be Trusted?* (Hoover Institution Press, 1997). He recently coauthored *A Republic of Statutes* (Yale University Press, 2010).

Lu Hong is Professor of Economics in the Loyola University Graduate School of Business. She writes on implementation theory and mechanism design. Her work has appeared in leading economic theory journals as well as in the proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences.

Hélène Landemore is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Yale University. She is the author of *Hume: probabilité et choix raisonnable* (Presses Universitaires de France, 2004) and *Democratic Reason: Politics, Collective Intelligence, and the Rule of the Many* (Princeton University Press, 2012). Her work has appeared in the *Journal of Moral Philosophy*, *Raison Publique*, *Synthese*, *Journal of Public Deliberation*, *Critical Review*, and *Political Psychology*.

Christian List is Professor of Political Science and Philosophy at the London School of Economics. He works on the theory of democracy, individual and collective agency, and the relationship between reductive and nonreductive explanations in the social sciences. He was awarded a Philip Leverhulme Prize, the Fifth Social Choice and Welfare Prize (jointly with Franz Dietrich), a Laurence S. Rockefeller Visiting Fellowship at Princeton University, and a Visiting Fellowship of the Swedish Collegium for Advanced Study. Jointly with Philip Pettit, he recently published *Group Agency: The Possibility, Design, and Status of Corporate Agents* (Oxford University Press, 2011).

Gerry Mackie is Associate Professor of Political Science and founding Co-director of the Center on Global Justice at the University of California, San Diego. He is a political theorist interested in contemporary political theory, the history of political thought, and problems of collective action. His main area of interest is democracy, particularly democratic voting. He is the author of *Democracy Defended* (Cambridge University Press, 2003). Since 1998 he has worked with the nongovernmental organization Tostan in Senegal, which

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01033-8 - Collective Wisdom: Principles and Mechanisms
Edited by Hélène Landemore and Jon Elster
Frontmatter
More information

has organized unprecedented mass abandonment of female genital cutting (FGC) in 6,200 communities in seven countries. Since 2004 he has worked closely with UNICEF on the issue, helping devise an internationally distributed best-practices publication and a global abandonment strategy. The "common approach" to the practice endorsed in 2009 by eleven United Nations agencies was influenced by his scholarship. The work on FGC leads him to further study of the sociology of norms, moral psychology, and international human rights.

Hugo Mercier is a Postdoctoral Fellow in the Philosophy, Politics, and Economics Program at the University of Pennsylvania. His work has focused on reasoning and argumentation. He has written a series of articles that cover this issue from different perspectives – moral, developmental, cross-cultural, and political.

Josiah Ober, Constantine Mitsotakis Professor of Political Science and Classics at Stanford University, works on political institutions, culture, and theory, especially the thought and practice of the ancient Greek world. His 2008 book, *Democracy and Knowledge: Innovation and Learning in Classical Athens* (Princeton University Press), analyzes ancient Athenian democracy as a system for aggregating, aligning, and codifying useful knowledge. The book seeks to explain the close correlation between the development of democratic institutions and state performance in the age of Thucydides, Plato, and Aristotle. His current projects concern the relationship between cooperation and knowledge in Greek political thought, the relationship between civic and human dignity, and the role of expertise in democratic decision making.

Gloria Origgi is a tenured researcher at the Institut Nicod, Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, Paris. Her main areas of interest are social epistemology, philosophy of social and cognitive sciences, and Web studies. Among her most recent publications are *Qu'est-ce que la confiance?* (VRIN, 2008) and (with Frédéric Darbellay) *Repenser l'interdisciplinarité* (Slatkin, 2010). She has conceived and is the chief editor of the platform for virtual conferences www.interdisciplines.org.

Scott E. Page is the Leonid Hurwicz Collegiate Professor of Complex Systems, Political Science, and Economics at the University of Michigan–Ann Arbor. He works on questions related to the role of diversity in institutional design and performance. He is the author of *The Difference: How the Power of Diversity Creates Better Groups, Firms, Schools, and Societies* (Princeton University Press, 2007). His most recent book, *Diversity and Complexity* (Princeton University Press, 2010), explores the role of diversity in complex systems.

Emile Servan-Schreiber founded and ran the NewsFutures prediction market from 2000 to 2010. He is now a managing director of Lumenogic, a consulting firm specializing in corporate applications of collective intelligence and prediction markets. Trained in the cognitive sciences at Carnegie Mellon University (PhD, 1991), he is the coauthor of two award-winning multimedia CD-Roms

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01033-8 - Collective Wisdom: Principles and Mechanisms
Edited by Hélène Landemore and Jon Elster
Frontmatter
More information

featuring the collective intelligence of dozens of world-class scientists: *The Challenge of the Universe* (Hypermind/Oxford University Press, 1996) and *Secrets of the Mind* (Hypermind/Montparnasse, 1998).

Dan Sperber is Professor of Philosophy and Cognitive Science at the Central European University (Budapest) and Directeur de Recherche Emeritus at the Institut Jean Nicod (CNRS, ENS, and EHESS, Paris). He is the author of *Rethinking Symbolism* (Cambridge University Press, 1975), *On Anthropological Knowledge* (Cambridge University Press,1985), and *Explaining Culture* (Blackwell, 1996); the coauthor with Deirdre Wilson of *Relevance: Communication and Cognition* (Blackwell, 1986; 2d ed., 1995) and *Meaning and Relevance* (Cambridge University Press, 2012); the editor of *Metarepresentations: A Multidisciplinary Perspective* (Oxford University Press, 2000); the coeditor with David Premack and Ann James Premack of *Causal Cognition: A Multidisciplinary Debate* (Oxford University Press, 1995) and, with Ira Noveck, of *Experimental Pragmatics* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2004).

Philippe Urfalino is a Senior Researcher at the French Centre National pour la Recherche Scientifique and Professor at the École des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales in Paris. He is also Director of the Raymond Aron Center for Political and Sociological Studies (UMR CNRS/EHESS). Urfalino has written several books on French cultural policies and on pharmaceutical agencies. His most recent books are *L'invention de la politique culturelle* (Pluriel-Fayard, 2004) and *Le grand méchant loup pharmaceutique* (Textuel, 2005). He is currently writing a book on collective decision conceived as a normative phenomenon.

Adrian Vermeule is John H. Watson Professor of Law at Harvard Law School. His research has examined problems in constitutional law and theory, administrative law, and collective decision making. His most recent book is *The System of the Constitution* (Oxford University Press, 2011).

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org