

### TYRANNY

This is the first comprehensive exploration of ancient and modern tyranny as a central theme in the history of political thought. Waller R. Newell argues that modern tyranny and statecraft differ fundamentally from the classical understanding. Newell demonstrates a historical shift in emphasis from the classical thinkers' stress on the virtuous character of rulers and the need for civic education to the modern emphasis on impersonal institutions and cold-blooded political method. The turning point is Machiavelli's call for the conquest of nature. Newell traces the lines of influence from Machiavelli's new science of politics to the rise of Atlanticist republicanism in England and America, as well as the totalitarian regimes of the twentieth century and their effects on the present. By diagnosing the varieties of tyranny from erotic voluptuaries like Nero, the steely determination of reforming conquerors like Alexander the Great and Julius Caesar, and modernizing despots such as Napoleon and Ataturk to the collectivist revolutions of the Jacobins, Bolsheviks, Nazis, and Khmer Rouge, Newell shows how tyranny is every bit as dangerous to free democratic societies today as it was in the past.

Waller R. Newell is Professor of Political Science and Philosophy at Carleton University. He is the author of *The Soul of a Leader: Character*, Conviction, and Ten Lessons in Political Greatness (2009); The Code of Man: Love, Courage, Pride, Family, Country (2003); What Is a Man? 3,000 Years of Wisdom on the Art of Manly Virtue (2000); and Ruling Passion: The Erotics of Statecraft in Platonic Political Philosophy (2000).





## **TYRANNY**

# A New Interpretation

WALLER R. NEWELL Carleton University





## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107610736

© Waller R. Newell 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data

Newell, Waller Randy.

Tyranny: a new interpretation / Waller R. Newell, Carleton University. pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-01032-1 (hardback) 1. Despotism. I. Title.

JC381.N43 2012

321.9-dc23 2012028449

ISBN 978-1-107-01032-1 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-61073-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## CONTENTS

	Acknowledgments	page ix
	Introduction: The Conquest of Eros	I
	The Debate about Ancient and Modern Tyranny	12
	Remarks on Method	20
ı.	Is There an Ontology of Tyranny?	26
	The Primordial and the Transcendental as Fundamental	
	Perspectives on Political Existence	32
	Education and Imitation: Images of the Soul in Plato's	
	Dialogues	35
	The Modern Point of Departure for the New Science of	
	Politics	63
	The Hobbesian Narrowing of Machiavelli's New	
	Science of Politics	75
2.	The Tyrant and the Statesman in Plato's Political	
	Philosophy and Machiavelli's Rejoinder	81
	The Lover of the City	83
	The Hidden Tyrant	94
	The Hidden Founding	108
	Paradoxes of the Tyrannical Founding	119
	Machiavelli and the Sophists	131
3.	Superlative Virtue, Monarchy, and Political Community	
	in Aristotle's <i>Politics</i>	141
	Monarchy and the Political Community	143

V



### CONTENTS

	The Claim of Superlative Virtue in the Debate about	
	Justice	156
	A Godlike Man in the City?	162
	Monarchy, Reason, and Nature	169
	Arendt on the Household and the Community	180
	The Global Household	183
4.	Tyranny and the Science of Ruling in Xenophon's	
	Political Thought	186
	Roads to the Education of Cyrus: The Distinctiveness of	
	Xenophon's Political Thought	187
	Cyrus's Imperialistic Revolution	199
	The Peloponnesian War and the Thucydidean Context	210
5.	Machiavelli, Xenophon, and Xenophon's Cyrus	228
	Virtue Defined as the Mastery of Fortuna	232
	Cyrus the Great in Machiavelli's Discourses	236
	Subverting the Traditional Catalogue of the Virtues	246
	Machiavelli's Rhetorical Employment of Xenophon in	
	the Appeal to Antiquity	257
6.	Glory and Reputation: The New Prince	271
	How Original Is Machiavelli? The Relationship of	
	Virtue and Fortuna	274
	Sundering Diotima's Ladder: The City of Man, the City	
	of God, and Machiavelli's New Synthesis	296
	The Three Stages of Mastering Fortuna	325
7.	The Republic in Motion: Machiavelli's Vision of the New	
,	Rome	345
	The Classical Understanding of Imperialism as a Mode	
	of Tyranny	347
	Virtue, Necessity, and Choice in the Founding of Cities	351
	The Cycle of Regimes	363
	The Republic Perfected by Chance	383
	The Rise and Fall of the New Rome	406
	Interlude: Machiavelli and Religion	419
	Conclusion: Tyranny Ancient and Modern	433
	The Many Faces of Machiavelli	433



### **CONTENTS**

The Two Corridors to Modernity (Dark and Light)	445
The Torture of Nature?	456
The Phenomenology of Tyranny	478
The Transition to Totalitarianism and the Will of the	
People: The Limits of This Study	498
Epilogue: The Hermeneutical Problem of Tyranny	513
Bibliography	519
Index	537





### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

As I was nearing the completion of this book, the world was being inspired by the struggle for freedom unfolding across the Arab lands. During that same period and for some time preceding it, according to Freedom House, the world's democracies had been in retreat while tyrannical forces were on the rise. We seem to be living through an era in which expectations for freedom and the proliferation of tyranny are intensifying simultaneously. More than ever, then, it is incumbent on us to study tyranny, attempt to identify its varieties, and try to anticipate its emergence and hostility to the forces of freedom. Tyranny is generally an unpleasant subject, but one does not think about tyranny because one wants to think about unpleasant things. Rather, if one wants to think, it must be about both pleasant and unpleasant things.

This book grew out of many years of reflection, and some of the chapters (1, 3, 4, 5, and a portion of 6) contain greatly transformed and lengthened versions of earlier articles. The Introduction, Chapters 2 and 7, and the Conclusion are entirely new. None of the chapters, however, simply duplicates the content of the earlier articles, because I only arrived at the central thesis of this book through writing them. They have now been reshaped in light of that thesis, which I set forth in the Introduction. This book can be read entirely on its own, independent of my other writings. At the same time, it does draw on, and is the scholarly culmination of, my earlier books on Plato, the manly virtues, and political leadership.

Earlier versions of some of the chapters were presented at Peterhouse College Cambridge, Yale University, and the University of Toronto. I gratefully acknowledge the stimulation and the hospitality I received



#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

on those occasions. I also have the pleasure and the honor of acknowledging the critical insight and support that I have received from many colleagues over the years. Although they share no responsibility for the book's shortcomings, they have contributed to whatever of value readers may find in it. They include, in no special order, the following: Charles H. Fairbanks, Thomas L. Pangle, Lorraine Pangle, Clifford Orwin, Ryan Balot, Nalin Ranasinghe, Stanley Rosen, Catherine Zuckert, Barry Strauss, Paul Rahe, Robert Sibley, Steven Smith, Travis Smith, Graham Howell, Jarrett Carty, Geoffrey Kellow, Peter Ahrensdorf, Harvey C. Mansfield, Lynette Mitchell, Jeff Sikkenga, Norman Doidge, Kenneth Green, Michael Zuckert, Gregory MacIsaac, Peter Emberley, Tom Darby, Samuel Abraham, H. D. Forbes, Edward Andrew, and Gary McDowell. I also have the especially gratifying obligation to acknowledge the insights I derived from discussing the political philosophies examined in this book with students past and present, some of whom are now embarked on their own careers. Finally, I owe special thanks to my editor at Cambridge University Press, Robert Dreesen, and to the anonymous reviewers for the original proposal, who prompted me to address many important issues in advance that I had neglected.

This book is dedicated to my best friend and collaborator, my wife Jacqueline Etherington Newell.