

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with Visual Examples

Helen C. Purchase

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Experimental Human–Computer Interaction

Experiments that require the use of human participants are time consuming and costly: it is important to get the process right the first time. Planning and preparation are key to success. This practical book takes the human–computer interaction researcher through the complete experimental process – from identifying a research question, to designing and conducting an experiment, to analyzing and reporting the results.

The advice offered in this book draws on the author’s 20 years of experience in conducting experiments. In describing general concepts of experimental design and analysis, she refers to worked examples that address the real practicalities and problems of conducting an experiment, such as managing participants, obtaining ethical approval, preempting criticism, choosing a statistical method, and dealing with unexpected events.

DR. HELEN C. PURCHASE is a Senior Lecturer in the School of Computing Science, University of Glasgow. She is the recipient of Teaching Excellence awards from both the University of Queensland and the University of Glasgow. Her research has been published in numerous journals, including *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics*, *International Journal of Human–Computer Studies*, *Information Visualization*, *Graph Drawing Conference*, and *ACM SIGCSE Bulletin*. Her research focuses on visual aesthetics, collaborative learning in higher education, and sketch tools for design.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with
Visual Examples

Helen C. Purchase

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with
Visual Examples

Helen C. Purchase

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Experimental Human–Computer Interaction

A Practical Guide with Visual Examples

HELEN C. PURCHASE

University of Glasgow



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with
Visual Examples
Helen C. Purchase
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City
Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA
www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521279543

© Helen C. Purchase 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Purchase, Helen C.
Experimental human-computer interaction : a practical guide with
visual examples / Helen C. Purchase, University of Glasgow.
pages cm
ISBN 978-1-107-01006-2 (hardback)
1. Human-computer interaction. I. Title.
QA76.9.H85P87 2012
004.01'9–dc23 2012004419
ISBN 978-1-107-01006-2 Hardback
ISBN 978-0-521-27954-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs
for external or third-party Internet web sites referred to in this publication and does not
guarantee that any content on such web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with
Visual Examples
Helen C. Purchase
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

To my father

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with
Visual Examples

Helen C. Purchase

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Experiments</i>	<i>page xi</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xv</i>
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Assessing the worth of an HCI idea	1
1.2 Experiments: Assessing worth by comparison	3
1.3 Evaluations: Assessing worth by use	4
1.4 Focus of this book	5
1.5 Structure of this book	6
2 Defining the research	8
2.1 The research question	9
2.2 Conditions for comparison	10
2.3 Designing experiments	15
2.4 Generalisability	16
2.5 Experimental objects	18
2.6 Experimental tasks	28
2.7 Experimental trials	36
2.8 Nature of the domain	40
2.9 Evaluations	46
2.10 Summary	50
3 Experimental procedure	51
3.1 Allocating participants to conditions	51
3.2 The experimental process: Defining the participant experience	58
3.3 Pilot experiments	68
3.4 Experimental materials: Software	71

3.5	Additional experimental processes	72
3.6	Practical issues	76
3.7	Ethical approval	87
3.8	Evaluations	91
3.9	Summary	94
4	Data collection and qualitative analysis	95
4.1	The data and the research question	96
4.2	Some principles of qualitative data collection and analysis	98
4.3	Nature of data collected	102
4.4	Collecting a variety of data	111
4.5	Evaluations	112
4.6	Summary	114
5	Statistics	116
5.1	Statistical analysis	116
5.2	Parametric analysis (for normally distributed data)	129
5.3	Nonparametric analysis (for nonnormally distributed data)	141
5.4	Analysis of preference data	154
5.5	Further analyses	159
5.6	Role of qualitative data	176
5.7	Evaluations	177
5.8	Summary	177
6	Reporting	182
6.1	Reviewers' concerns	182
6.2	Justifying design decisions	183
6.3	Presenting results and conclusions	187
6.4	The overall story	190
6.5	Evaluations	191
6.6	Summary	192
7	Problems and pitfalls	193
7.1	Problems	193
7.2	Pitfalls	195
7.3	Evaluations	198
7.4	Summary	198
8	Six principles for conducting experiments	199
8.1	A model of the experimental process	199
8.2	Six key principles for conducting experiments	199
8.3	Concluding remarks	201

Contents ix

Appendix A1	Independent measures examples	203
A1.1	Parametric analysis	203
A1.2	Nonparametric analysis (for nonnormally distributed data)	209
A1.3	Summary	215
Appendix A2	Statistical formulae	216
A2.1	Parametric tests	217
A2.2	Nonparametric tests	222
Appendix A3	Factor analysis example	227
A3.1	Multiway factor analysis	227
A3.2	Selective factor analysis	231
<i>Bibliography</i>		235
<i>References</i>		237
<i>Index</i>		241

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with
Visual Examples

Helen C. Purchase

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of experiments

1 Orthogonal Corners	<i>page</i> 11
2 Web Page Aesthetics	12
3 Metabolic Pathways	13
4 Graph Algorithms	19
5 DAGMap	23
6 Euler Diagrams	24
7 Shortest Path	27
8 Aural Tables	31
9 Screen Layout	32
10 Spring Dynamic Graph	33
11 Graph Aesthetics	37
12 Small Multiples/Animation	41
13 Entity-Relationship Diagrams	43
14 UML Notation	43
15 Aropä Evaluation	49
16 Smalltalk	53
17 Mental Model	62
18 Clustering	72
19 Lettersets	80
20 Visual Complexity	82
21 Metro Maps	84

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with
Visual Examples

Helen C. Purchase

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with Visual Examples

Helen C. Purchase

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgements

This book emerged from a tutorial that was prepared and delivered in 2009 at the Laboratoire Bordelais de Recherche en Informatique at the University of Bordeaux. I am grateful to Guy Melançon, who funded that visit (and others besides), and to Mats Daniels, who kindly provided resources at Uppsala University for an intensive writing period over the summer of 2011.

Over the past 10 years, I have attended several seminars and workshops at the Leibniz Center for Informatics at Schloss Dagstuhl. Many of the discussions I had there with colleagues in graph drawing, information visualisation, and aesthetic computing have inspired this book, and I am thankful to the German federal government, which generously funds this excellent facility for computer science research.

This book (and indeed much of my research career) would not be possible without the encouragement of Peter Eades and Julie McCredden, who first set me on an experimental research path; the support of other research colleagues (in particular David Carrington and John Hamer); and students who allowed me to use their assessed projects as a way of trying out different experimental ideas (in particular, Irvin Colquhoun, Eve Hoggan, Carolyn Salimun, Amanjit Samra, and Joshua Worrell).

Several colleagues generously gave me permission to use their experiments as examples in this book, in many cases permitting the reproduction of data and images: Daniel Archambault, Romain Bourqui, Johan Kildal, Pierre-Yves Koenig, Guy Melançon, and Peter Rodgers.

In the production of this book, I have greatly benefitted from the help and advice of Allan Brown, Alistair Donaldson, Euan Freeman, John Hamer, Mhari Macdonald, Marilyn McGee-Lennon, Paddy O'Donnell, and Oliver Rundell. John Hamer prepared many of the images. Lauren Cowles, David Jou, and their Cambridge team have been both efficient and very helpful in the production of my first book.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with
Visual Examples

Helen C. Purchase

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv

Acknowledgements

The cover image was inspired by the work of New Zealand artist Holly Mackinven. I extend my thanks to her, to the Sanderson Gallery in Parnell (which, through its own “experiment” brought her work to my attention), and to Susan Brown for permission to use this image on the cover.

With personal thanks to friends who have seen less of me and are still friends (Adam, Alex, Alice, Andrew, Jennifer, and Olly), and to John (who does the cooking).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with
Visual Examples

Helen C. Purchase

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Preface

Some years ago, I presented a retrospective of the graph drawing (and related) experiments I had conducted since 1995 to an audience of information visualisation researchers, describing the process I went through in defining a new experimental research area and learning to run human–computer interaction experiments. This was an honest and reflective seminar in which I highlighted the mistakes I had made, the good and bad decisions, and how my knowledge of experimental design had increased and improved with every experiment. At the end of my presentation, a member of the audience asked, “So, Helen, what is the ‘Black Art’? What is it that you have learned about running experiments that we should all know?”

This started me thinking about how much expertise is embodied in experience and seldom communicated apart from in a master/apprentice model. PhD supervisors can advise students on how to formulate and conduct experiments, psychology and HCI research texts can be read, and other experiments in the research literature can be copied, but the actual step-by-step process of designing and running an experiment is rarely written down and communicated widely. Although I believe that one can never understand the process of conducting experiments without experiencing the process oneself, I also believe that experiences can (and should) be shared and that advice resulting from others’ experiences can always be useful.

This, therefore, is my “Black Art” book. Based on my own experimental experiences, it aims to introduce researchers to the process of defining and running formal human–computer interaction experiments. It is a practical book, taking the reader through the entire process from the initial research idea, through experimental design and procedure and data analysis, and, finally, to reporting.

The material in this book is based on my own experiences, rather than on any textbook material (apart from a few basic common concepts) or other research

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01006-2 - Experimental Human–Computer Interaction: A Practical Guide with Visual Examples

Helen C. Purchase

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

available in the literature. It is therefore unique in that all examples are primary sources: I was personally involved in some way in all 21 of the experiments described here. Taking this approach allowed me to discuss the challenges and complexities of putting together these experiments, including the successes, mistakes, and failures. Such behind-the-scenes insight is seldom presented in secondary-source research publications. Most of these experiments have been published elsewhere, but some have not – they are included as a means of illustrating the experimental concepts and processes that I have adopted in my journey of learning how to conduct effective experiments.

As a consequence, the examples naturally relate to my own research area: information visualisation, and, in particular, the representation of relational information using graphs. However, the experimental principles illustrated by these examples are widely applicable to other HCI areas, including (but not limited to) mobile and multimodal devices, collaborative systems, games technology, and interface design.

Some advice offered here may seem trivial (e.g., clearly define a research question, ensure that there are no interruptions to the experiments, make sure that the software is robust, verify that data are being collected and stored correctly). Such seemingly trite advice is included here simply because I have suffered by NOT doing these things and then paid for it later (typically by having to throw away hard-fought-for data).

This book does not claim to be the only or final word on the topic of experimental design or statistical analysis – indeed, there are several other fine books in this area, most notably, Field and Hole's *How to Design and Report Experiments* (2003), Cairns and Cox's *Research Methods for Human–Computer Interaction* (2008), and Hinton's *Statistics Explained: A Guide for Social Science Students* (2nd ed.) (2004). As with any endeavour, advice from a wide range of other sources is recommended.

This book aims to be useful to anyone who wants to enter the exciting world of experimentation in HCI, and, in particular, PhD students, early career researchers, and industrial research scientists. It will also be useful as a text for an advanced undergraduate or taught postgraduate course in experimental HCI.