

## Index

absence of unlawfulness, liability in 78-80, compensation claims 39, 42, 44, 45, 46, 49, 148-9, 172 58-71, 100, 119, 124, 137 application of liability regime to breach of international law 58-64, 179 situation of retaliation victims conditions for EU liability developed by 159-71, 189-95 EU courts 50-8 actual and certain damage 161 causal link 57, 69, 71, 81, 121-4 damage not being justified by general conferral of rights 56-7, 68-71, 81, economic interest 169-71 114-19, 179 special damage 167-9 damage 57, 69, 71, 81, 119-21 unusual damage 161-7 sufficiently serious breach of law 51-6, critical evaluation 154-9 64-5, 81, 179 effect of principle on political scope for consistency with principle of Member State liability 76-8 different aim of action 75-6 manoeuvre 193 EU system of legal protection and judicial remedies 191-2 discretion and its limits 65-7 FIAMM et al. case 148, 149, 150-4, 159. EU and WTO laws as two separate legal 161, 162, 165, 167, 169, 170, 189-91 orders and no right to compensation good governance and use of discretionary powers 194-5 EU courts and international law 62-4 accountability 197 EU membership in international legal actual damage 161 regimes and 67-8 administration, proper 138, 140 grounds 81 annulment of measures 6, 37, 39, 47, 49, insufficient competence to breach 74, 97, 99, 139, 176 international law 65-7 association agreements 88 liability see liability for unlawful conduct nature of infringed rule 68-71 bananas, trade in 13-19, 174 need for full judicial protection 74-5 relevance of Francovich decision 76-7 relevance of Köbler decision 77-8 Canada EU ban on hormones in meat and meat sufficiently serious breach of law 64-5, products and 9, 10, 11, 12, 13 81, 112-14, 179 position of individuals in WTO law suggestion of new approach 72-8 183-4, 186 competence norm, breach of 110-25 carousel 168 conferral of rights 114-19 case law see jurisprudence of the EU sufficiently serious breach 112-14 conferral of rights 56-7, 68-71, 81, 114-19, causation liability for unlawful conduct and causal link 57, 69, 71, 81, 121-4 consistent interpretation principle 110-25 certain damage 161 conferral of rights 114-19 certainty, legal 132, 140 sufficiently serious breach 112-14

218



INDEX

219

cooperation agreements 88 conferral of rights 114-19 sufficiently serious breach 112-14 countermeasures 166 see also retaliation constitutional law and retaliation criminal offences 132 victims 187-95 EU and WTO laws as two separate legal damage orders and no right to compensation actual and certain damage 161 175 - 80gravity of 167 as global actor 195-9 liability for unlawful conduct and 57, 69, human rights and 37, 39, 127, 130, 132, 71, 81, 119-21 137, 197, 198, 199 not justified by general economic infringement of EU general principles interest 169-71 126-8, 147, 148-9, 187-9 special damage 167-9 actual and certain damage 161 unusual damage 161-7 application of liability regime to inherent versus exogenous risk 163-6 situation of retaliation victims sectoral versus market risk 162-3 159-71, 189-95 damages 37, 39, 47-9 critical evaluation 154-9 see also compensation claims damage not justified by general democracy 194 economic interest 169-71 direct effect 95 effect of external dimension of EU EU law 45, 69, 71 conduct on applicability of general WTO law 82, 84, 85, 87, 91, 92, 93, 96, principles of EU law 128-37 101, 102, 103, 104, 112, 116, 177, effect of external dimension of EU 182, 184 conduct on scope of general exceptional direct effect of WTO principles of EU law 138-40 primary law 105-10 existence of liability principle in discretion granted to EU institutions 39, 97, absence of unlawfulness under EU 112, 113, 124, 187 law 149, 172, 189-95 discretion and its limits 65-7 FIAMM et al. case 131-30, 134, 136, 141, 142, 143, 148, 149, 150-4, 159, 161, 162, 165, 167, 169, 170, 177, 187-91 EU membership in international legal regimes and 67-8 good governance and use of general principles, role of in discretionary powers 194-5 international trade disputes 134 insufficient competence to breach Intertanko case 130, 188 international law 65-7 Kadi case 132-3, 134, 136, 137, 188 discrimination 57 prevailing international legal right to non-discrimination 140, 146-7 obligations 136-7 Dispute Settlement Understanding (DSU) 7, principle of legitimate expectations 138, 140, 143-6 86, 106 right to non-discrimination 140, 146-7 disputes see international trade disputes right to property and principle to economic activities, right to pursue 140, pursuit of economic activity 140, 141-3 141-3 Ecuador scope of general principles of EU law invoked by retaliation victims EU preferential trade in bananas and 13, 140-7, 188 14, 16, 17, 18 special damage 167-9 European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) 127, 199 unusual damage 161-7 European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) 94 vertical relationship between EU and European Free Trade Area (EFTA) 95 traders 134-6 European Union (EU) 42 international trade disputes see international trade disputes ban on hormones in meat and meat products 8-13, 174 jurisprudence 19-20 compensation for successful claim see case law on effect of WTO law as benchmark for validity of EU compensation claims

measures 20-30

courts' approach with regard to GATT 22

consistent interpretation principle

110 - 25



## 220 INDEX

European Union (EU) (cont.)	implementation principle 25-6, 105-10
courts' approach with regard to WTO	Bananas case 107-9
Agreements 22–30	Hormones case 109-10
implementation principle 25-6	infringement of EU general principles
liability cases 30–3, 37	126-8, 147, 148-9, 187-9
review in light of DSB rulings 27-30	effect of external dimension of EU
review in light of mixed agreements 26	conduct on applicability of general
review in light of primary WTO law 22-5	principles of EU law 128-37
legal discretion granted to EU	FIAMM et al. case 131-30, 134, 136, 141
institutions 39, 97, 112, 113, 124, 187	142, 143, 148, 149, 150-4, 159, 161,
discretion and its limits 65-7	162, 165, 167, 169, 170, 177, 187-91
EU membership in international legal	general principles' role in
regimes and 67-8	international trade disputes 134
good governance and use of	Intertanko case 130, 188
discretionary powers 194-5	Kadi case 132–3, 134, 136, 137, 188
insufficient competence to breach	prevailing international legal
international law 65-7	obligations 136–7
nature of infringed rule 68-71	vertical relationship between EU and
liability for infringements of WTO law	traders 134-6
37, 42	effect of external dimension of EU
liability for unlawful conduct see liability	conduct on scope of general
for unlawful conduct	principles of EU law 138-40
as member of WTO 7	existence of liability principle in absence
obligations under international law 60,	of unlawfulness under EU law
100, 111, 136-7	149, 172
obligations under WTO law 89, 97, 114	actual and certain damage 161
political scope for manoeuvre 193	application of liability regime to situation of retaliation victims
preferential trade in bananas 13–19, 174 relationship with WTO 7	159–71, 189–95
review of EU conduct 37–42	critical evaluation 154-9
exogenous risk 163-6	damage not justified by general
expectations, legitimate 138, 140, 143–6	economic interest 169-71
expectations, regitimate 150, 140, 145-0	effect of principle on political scope
France	for manoeuvre 193
liability in absence of unlawfulness 157,	EU system of legal protection and
160	judicial remedies 191-2
freedom to pursue economic activities 140,	FIAMM et al. case 148, 149, 150-4, 159,
141-3	161, 162, 165, 167, 169, 170, 189-91
	good governance and use of
General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade	discretionary powers 194-5
(GATT) 7, 22, 185	special damage 167-9
General Agreement on Trade in Services	unusual damage 161-7
(GATS) 7	scope of general principles of EU law
Germany	invoked by retaliation victims
liability in absence of unlawfulness 158	140-7, 188
governance 194-5	principle of legitimate expectations
grace periods, breach of WTO law after	138, 140, 143-6
expiry of 98-104, 124	right to non-discrimination 140, 146-7
gravity of damage 167	right to property and principle to
Guatemala	pursuit of economic activity 140,
EU preferential trade in bananas and 14	141-3
	inherent risk 163-6
Honduras	insurance 165
EU preferential trade in bananas and 14	intellectual property
hormones in meat and meat products 8–13	Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual
human rights	Property Rights (TRIPS) Agreement 24
EU and 37, 39, 127, 130, 132, 137, 197,	International Court of Justice 94
198, 199	international law 196-9



INDEX

221

compensation for breach 58-71, 179 liability for unlawful conduct 42, 44-5, breach of international law 58-64 80, 81 consistency with principle of Member background 45-7 breach of WTO law 82-3 State liability 76-8 different aim of action 75-6 breach after expiry of grace period discretion and its limits 65-7 98-104, 124 breach before dispute is brought EU courts and international law 62-4 before DSB 89-93 EU obligations under international law breach identified by DSB 93-8 60, 100 grounds 81 breach of primary WTO law 83-105 need for full judicial protection 74-5 corollary breach of competence norm relevance of Francovich decision 76-7 because of principle of consistent relevance of Köbler decision 77-8 interpretation 110-25 suggestion of new approach 72-8 current reasoning of EU courts 84-5 obligations under 60, 100, 111, 136-7 implementation principle 105-10 international trade disputes 6, 7-8, 42, 43 compensation for breach of Bananas case 13-19, 30-1, 34, 94, 96, international law 58-71, 179 98, 174 breach of international law 58-64 implementation principle in 107-9 conferral of rights 114-19 compensation claims see compensation consistency with principle of Member State liability 76-8 EU law general principles' role in 134 different aim of action 75-6 prevailing international legal discretion and its limits 65-7 obligations 136-7 EU courts and international law 62-4 vertical relationship between EU and EU membership in international legal traders 134-6 regimes and 67-8 Hormones case 8-13, 31, 94, 95, 98, 174 EU obligations under international law 60, 100 implementation principle in 109-10 liability see liability for unlawful conduct grounds 81 position of individuals in WTO law 173-86 insufficient competence to breach EU and WTO laws as two separate legal international law 65-7 orders and no right to compensation nature of infringed rule 68-71 need for full judicial protection 74-5 175 - 80international comparison 180-6 relevance of Francovich decision 76-7 relevance of Köbler decision 77-8 review of EU conduct 37-42 interpretation, consistent 110-25 sufficiently serious breach of law 64-5, conferral of rights 114-19 81, 112-14, 179 sufficiently serious breach 112-14 suggestion of new approach 72-8 conditions for EU liability developed by EU courts 50-8 position of individuals in WTO law 184-6 causal link 57, 69, 71, 81, 121-4 jurisprudence of EU 19-20 conferral of rights 56-7, 68-71, 81, case law on effect of WTO law as 114-19, 179 benchmark for validity of EU damage 57, 69, 71, 81, 119-21 sufficiently serious breach of law 51-6, measures 20-30 courts' approach with regard to GATT 22 64-5, 81, 179 courts' approach with regard to WTO independence and complementarity of Agreements 22-30 legal actions in EU legal order 47-9 implementation principle 25-6 liability cases 30-3, 37 liability cases 30-3, 37 Bananas case 30-1, 34 review in light of DSB rulings 27-30 brought by retaliation victims 34-7 review in light of mixed agreements 26 Hormones case 31 review in light of primary WTO law 22-5 liability due to infringement of EU general principles 126-8, 147, legal certainty 132, 140 148-9, 187-9 legal discretion see discretion granted to EU effect of external dimension of EU institutions conduct on applicability of general legitimate expectations 138, 140, 143-6 principles of EU law 128-37



## 222 INDEX

liability for unlawful conduct (cont.) Panama effect of external dimension of EU EU preferential trade in bananas and 17 partnership agreements 88 conduct on scope of general principles of EU law 138-40 political scope for manoeuvre 193 FIAMM et al. case 131-30, 134, 136, 141, preferential trade in bananas 13-19, 174 142, 143, 148, 149, 150-4, 159, 161, proper administration principle 138, 140 162, 165, 167, 169, 170, 177, 187-91 property rights 140, 141-3 Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual general principles, role of in Property Rights (TRIPS) Agreement 24 international trade disputes 134 Intertanko case 130, 188 proportionality principle 140, 142 Kadi case 132-3, 134, 136, 137, 188 prevailing international legal remedies 138 obligations 136-7 see also compensation claims; damages principle of legitimate expectations retaliation 7, 74, 100, 111, 117, 122 138, 140, 143-6 application of liability regime in absence right to non-discrimination 140, 146-7 of unlawfulness to situation of right to property and principle to pursuit retaliation victims 159-71, 189-95 of economic activity 140, 141-3 actual and certain damage 161 scope of general principles of EU law damage not justified by general invoked by retaliation victims economic interest 169-71 140-7, 188 special damage 167-9 vertical relationship between EU and unusual damage 161-7 EU ban on hormones in meat and meat traders 134-6 liability in absence of unlawfulness products and 10 78-80, 148-9, 172, 189-95 EU constitutional law and retaliation actual and certain damage 161 victims 187-95 application of liability regime to EU liability for infringements of WTO law 37, 42 situation of retaliation victims 159-71, 189-95 EU preferential trade in bananas and critical evaluation 154-9 14-16 damage not justified by general liability cases brought by retaliation economic interest 169-71 victims 34-7 effect of principle on political scope position of individuals in WTO law for manoeuvre 193 173 - 86EU and WTO laws as two separate legal EU system of legal protection and judicial remedies 191-2 orders and no right to compensation FIAMM et al. case 148, 149, 150-4, 159, 161, 162, 165, 167, 169, 170, 189-91 175 - 80international comparison 180-6 good governance and use of discretionary powers 194-5 special damage 167-9 inherent versus exogenous risk 163-6 unusual damage 161-7 sectoral versus market risk 162-3 wording of article and leeway for EU rule of law 74, 128, 138, 140 courts 50 Lomé Convention 13 Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures (SPS) Ågreement 7 marine pollution 131 EU ban on hormones in meat and meat market risk 162-3 products and 9 scope for manoeuvre 101 Mexico EU preferential trade in bananas and 14 sectoral risk 162-3 Spain liability in absence of unlawfulness 158 Nicaragua EU preferential trade in bananas and 17 special damage 167-9 no-fault liability 42 subsidiarity principle 66 see also absence of unlawfulness, sufficiently serious breach of law 51-6, liability in 64-5, 81, 112-14, 179

supremacy of EU law 45

non-discrimination, right to 140, 146-7



INDEX 223

Technical Barriers to Trade (TBT)
Agreement 7
terrorism 132
trade, right to 140, 141-3
trade disputes see international trade
disputes
Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual
Property Rights (TRIPS) Agreement 24

the Sea 115, 131, 132
United States of America (USA) 123
EU ban on hormones in meat and meat products and 8, 10, 11, 12, 13
EU preferential trade in bananas and 13, 14–16, 17, 18
position of individuals in WTO law 180–3, 186
unlawful conduct, liability for see liability

United Nations Convention on the Law of

for unlawful conduct unusual damage 161-7 inherent versus exogenous risk 163-6

vertical relationship between EU and traders 134-6

sectoral versus market risk 162-3

World Trade Organization (WTO)
Agreement 7, 91
breach of WTO law
breach after expiry of grace period
98–104, 124
countermeasures 166
see also retaliation
direct effect of WTO law 82, 84, 85, 87,
91, 92, 93, 96, 101, 102, 103, 104,
112, 116, 177, 182, 184
exceptional direct effect of WTO
primary law 105–10

Dispute Settlement Body (DSB) 6 disputes in see international trade disputes EU as member of 7 EU case law on effect of WTO law as benchmark for validity of EU measures 20-30 courts' approach with regard to GATT 22 courts' approach with regard to WTO Agreements 22-30 implementation principle 25-6 liability cases 30–3, 37 review in light of DSB rulings 27–30 review in light of mixed agreements 26 review in light of primary WTO law 22-5 EU liability for infringements of WTO law 37, 42 obligations under WTO law 89, 97, 114 position of individuals in WTO law 173-86 EU and WTO laws as two separate legal orders and no right to compensation 175 - 80international comparison 180-6 relationship with EU 7 unlawful conduct in breach of WTO law 82 - 3breach before dispute is brought before DSB 89-93 breach identified by DSB 93-8 breach of primary WTO law 83-105 corollary breach of competence norm because of principle of consistent interpretation 110-25 current reasoning of EU courts 84-5 implementation principle 105-10