

PERFORMING GREEK COMEDY

Alan Hughes presents a new complete account of production methods in Greek comedy. The book summarizes contemporary research and disputes, on such topics as acting techniques, theatre buildings, masks and costumes, music and the chorus. Evidence is reinterpreted, and traditional doctrine overthrown. Comedy is presented as the pan-Hellenic, visual art of theatre, not as Athenian literature. Recent discoveries in visual evidence are used to stimulate significant historical revisions. The author has directly examined 350 vase scenes of comedy in performance and actor-figurines, in 75 collections, from Melbourne to St Petersburg. Their testimony is applied to acting techniques and costumes, and women's participation in comedy and mime. The chapters are arranged by topic, for convenient reference by scholars and students of theatre history, literature, classics and drama. Overall, the book provides a fresh practical insight into this continually developing subject.

ALAN HUGHES is Professor Emeritus, University of Victoria, a theatre historian and professional who has operated his own repertory company. Published research includes *Henry Irving, Shakespearean*, an account of the actor-manager's productions, and his edition of *Titus Andronicus* in the New Cambridge Shakespeare series. In 2006 the T.B.L. Webster Fellowship recognized his contributions to the archaeology of Greek theatre, leading to the completion of *Performing Greek Comedy*.

PERFORMING GREEK COMEDY

ALAN HUGHES
University of Victoria



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-00930-1 — Performing Greek Comedy
 Alan Hughes
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107009301

© Alan Hughes 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2012

Reprinted 2012

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Hughes, Alan, Ph.D.

Performing Greek comedy / Alan Hughes.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-00930-1

1. Theater – Greece – History – To 500. 2. Greek drama (Comedy) – History
 and criticism. I. Title.

PA3201.H84 2011

792.2'30938 – dc23 2011027499

ISBN 978-1-107-00930-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	<i>page</i> x
<i>Preface</i>	xiii
1 Comedy in art, Athens and abroad	1
The evidence	3
Vases	3
Figurines	4
Is this evidence reliable?	5
Festival and competition	7
The profession of actor	10
Touring	12
2 Poets of Old and Middle Comedy	17
Archaic comedy	17
Old Comedy and festival	19
Mages	19
The Sicilian connection	20
Epicharmos	20
Mature Old Comedy	21
Kratinos	22
Krates	23
Pherekrates	24
Eupolis	24
Aristophanes	25
Aristophanic comedy	27
Lost Aristophanes	29
Middle Comedy	30
Professional theatre	30
Navigating Middle Comedy	31
Aristophanes' Middle Comedies	32
Decline of the chorus?	32
Poets and types of Middle Comedy	33
Myth and tragedy upside-down	33

	City comedy	34
	Satire	36
	The archaeological record	36
	Archaeology, uses and limitations	37
	Vases, changing comic styles	37
	Figurines, stage characters	38
	Beyond Athens	39
3	Theatres	59
	Athens: the earliest theatre	59
	<i>Orchestra</i> and <i>theatron</i>	61
	<i>Skene</i>	62
	Second phase, 446–440	63
	Theatres outside Attica	65
	Lost theatres	66
	Fourth-century stages in the Greek west	69
	Taras	71
	Paestum	72
	Sicily	73
	Athens: the stone theatre	73
	<i>Theatron</i> and <i>orchestra</i>	74
	<i>Skene</i>	75
	Special effects	76
	<i>Ekkyklema</i>	76
	<i>Mechane</i>	77
	<i>Skene</i> painting	78
4	The comic chorus	81
	Early comedy in writing	82
	Early comedy in pictures	84
	Fat men	84
	Archaic choruses	85
	Presenting the chorus	87
	Enter the actor	89
	The chorus in later art	90
	Choric dance	92
	Formation and size	92
	The chorus in the Greek west	93
	Decline of the chorus?	94
5	Music in comedy	95
	The <i>aulos</i>	95
	Musicians at festivals	96
	Musicians and convention	97

Contents

vii

Musical language	99
Choral music	101
The New Music	101
Song and dance	103
6 Acting, from lyric to dual consciousness	106
Beginners on stage	107
From poet to actor	108
First comic actors	109
Plot and the rising actor	110
Actors in society	112
Casting	113
How many actors?	113
Doubling opportunities	113
Nothing to do with Stanislavsky	114
Voice, speech, movement	115
Aesthetics, process	116
Believing characters	117
Transitions	118
7 Technique and style of acting comedy	146
Physical characterization	146
The evidence	149
Attitude, gesture	151
Types of gesture	154
Emblems	154
Affective gestures	155
Manipulators	156
Acting women	157
The maiden	158
The wife	160
The crone	160
Problems of interpretation	162
Helping the sick	162
Mistaken identity	163
Terracotta husbandmen	164
8 The masks of comedy	166
What masks were like	166
Significance of the mask	168
Spiritual or practical?	168
Mask and metatheatre	170
Actor and mask	170
Symbolism	171

How masks were made	172
Origins	172
Fabric and plaster	173
Wood	175
Mask types	175
9 Costumes of Old and Middle Comedy	178
Choruses	178
Archaic	178
Later choruses	179
The actor's undercostume	180
Outer costume: evidence	182
The comic costume controversy	182
Evidence in two media	183
Women's costume	183
Tunics	183
Outerwear: cloaks, headgear	186
Shoes	186
Men's costume	187
Tunics	187
Cloaks	187
Shoes	189
Headgear	190
Development and transition	190
10 Comedy and women	201
Imaginary women	201
<i>Protagonist</i> roles: Lysistrata, Praxagora	203
Deities	205
Real women	206
Women in the audience	207
Poets	208
Design and production	209
Women performing	209
Musicians	209
Women on stage	210
Mutes	211
11 New Comedy	215
Canonical poets	217
Fame and fortune	218
New theatres	219
<i>Orchestra</i>	220
<i>Logeion</i>	221
The detached chorus	223

	<i>Contents</i>	ix
Hellenistic theatres		225
Costumes, masks		225
Identifying mask types		228
Epilogue		229
<i>Catalogue of objects discussed</i>		232
Vases		232
Terracottas		243
Other media		247
<i>Notes</i>		248
<i>Glossary</i>		287
<i>Bibliography</i>		292
<i>Index</i>		309

Illustrations

1	Lucanian <i>skyphos</i> fragment, Dolon Painter, Metaponto 29062	<i>page</i> 42
2	Early Sicilian actor-figurine, Siracusa 23001	43
3	Apulian Gnathia <i>kalyx krater</i> , Compiègne Painter, Geneva	44
4	Attic terracotta figurine, Amsterdam 881	45
5	<i>Orchestra</i> and <i>skene</i> , Theatre of Dionysos, Athens 446–440	46
6	Apulian bell <i>krater</i> , Reckoning Painter, St Petersburg Б1661	47
7	Reconstruction of a stage in Taras	48
8	Apulian <i>kalyx krater</i> , Varrese Painter, Naples 118333	48
9	Apulian Gnathia fragments, Konnakis Group, Würzburg H4696, H4701	49
10	Paestan <i>kalyx krater</i> , Asteas, Berlin F3044	50
11	<i>Skene</i> , Theatre of Dionysos, c.325	51
12	Aphrodisias, <i>logeion</i> of the Hellenistic theatre	52
13	Reconstruction of the <i>mechane</i>	53
14	Attic black-figured cup, Komast Group, Paris E742	54
15	Attic black-figured amphora, Swing Painter, Christchurch 41–57	54
16	Attic <i>lekythos</i> , Gela Painter, London 1842.7–28.979 (B658)	55
17	Archaic dolphin-rider c.486	56
18	Attic <i>oinochoe</i> from Cyrenaica, Nikias Painter, Paris N3408 (M9)	57
19	Apulian <i>oinochoe</i> , unattributed, whereabouts unknown	58
20	Lucanian volute <i>krater</i> , Karneia Painter, Taranto 8263	120
21	Attic <i>lebes</i> , Painter of the Athens Dinos, Athens 13027	121
22	Apulian <i>kalyx krater</i> , Suckling-Salting Group, Rome private collection 52	122
23	Paestan bell <i>krater</i> by Asteas, Salerno Pci812	123
24	Attic black-figured <i>skyphos</i> , Heron Group, Boston 20.18	124
25	Profiles, <i>phaulos</i> and ideal	125

List of illustrations

xi

26 Apulian <i>oinochoe</i> , unattributed, Toronto 972.182.1	126
27 Apulian bell <i>krater</i> , Jason Painter, Copenhagen 15032	127
28 Attic terracotta figurine, London 1879.3–6.5	128
29 Attic terracotta figurine, London 1842.7–28.752	128
30 Attic terracotta figurines, Berlin TC8405	129
31 Corinthian terracotta figurine, London 1867.2–5.22	130
32 Apulian <i>oinochoe</i> , unattributed, whereabouts unknown	131
33 Apulian Gnathia <i>situla</i> , Konnakis Group, Malibu 96.AE.118	132
34 Apulian bell <i>krater</i> , Iris Painter, St Petersburg B299	133
35 Attic terracotta figurine, St Petersburg Γ1432	134
36 Attic <i>oinochoe</i> , near Felton Painter, Geneva private collection	135
37 Apulian bell <i>krater</i> , Adolphseck Painter, Malibu 96.AE.238	136
38 Hand gestures used in comedy	137
39 Sicilian <i>kalyx krater</i> , Manfria Group, Messina 11039	138
40 Boiotian terracotta figurine, Copenhagen 4738	139
41a–d Attic figurines a) Heidelberg TK47 b) St Petersburg Б166 c) St Petersburg П1874.34 d) British Columbia private collection	140
42 Apulian <i>oinochoe</i> , Truro Painter, Sydney NM75.2	141
43 Attic terracotta figurine, Paris N4878	142
44 Apulian <i>oinochoe</i> , unattributed, Göttingen Hu582a	143
45 Sicilian <i>kalyx krater</i> , Manfria Group, Lentini 2B	144
46 Boiotian terracotta figurine, Paris CA239	145
47 Apulian Gnathia <i>oinochoe</i> , unattributed, British Columbia private collection	192
48 Apulian bell <i>krater</i> , Cotugno Painter, Malibu 96.AE.113	193
49 Apulian Gnathia <i>pelike</i> , unattributed, Berlin F3444	194
50 Paestan <i>kotyle</i> , Asteas, Oxford AN1945.43	195
51 Attic terracotta figurine, Tarquinia RC1764	196
52 New Comedy scene, relief, Naples 6687	197
53 Marble relief, Vatican 9985	198
54 Mosaic from Pompeii, Dioskourides, Naples 9985	199
55 Mosaic from Pompeii, Dioskourides, Naples 9987	200

Preface

The need for a book like this one became apparent shortly after I was appointed as the theatre historian in a university Department of Theatre. Qualified for the job only because I had written a book about the theatre in nineteenth-century London, I was expected to teach the history of theatre from Greeks to Grotowski. This was, and still is, the normal state of affairs wherever there are broad studies of classical or western literature and drama, history of the theatre, ancient or western art. Few instructors in any of these disciplines command the leisure to master the current state of knowledge in a succession of fields of study which are no more than contiguous with their own. Three or four weeks are allocated to the Greeks; then one must get on to the Romans, Middle Ages, Renaissance. Teaching theatre history, my students and I needed a book which would summarize the state of contemporary research on the performance practice of Greek theatre, arranged systematically by topic. Since nothing of the sort was available, I was obliged to turn to the relevant chapters of Bieber's obsolete *History of the Greek and Roman Theatre*, first published in 1939. For many instructors and students, it remains the last resort.

That was why I conceived the notion of writing a book that would supersede Bieber. I am an historian of the theatre, not a classicist. It may be asked, where I found the temerity to write about Greeks. I approach the subject pragmatically, as a working theatre not unlike others. I examine it as a composite art, in which the text is only one component. For costume, masks, music, theatre buildings and equipment, acting style, I turn to the visual sources provided by archaeology. And to interpret what I see, I refer to a lifetime of experience in the living theatre and a working knowledge of how things are done, and made.

Research on eighteenth-century acting showed me that pictures are more reliable evidence than texts. While descriptions of style degenerate into assertions that the acting of the writer's time is 'more natural' than that of the previous generation, painters are fellow-artists, sympathetic and

observant. Eighteenth-century artists faithfully document actors, costumes, stage sets, theatres and audiences of their time. When I turned to the Greek theatre, however, there seemed to be little equivalent evidence.

Tragedy dominated the reading list, in which comedy was represented only by *Frogs*, which is about tragedy. In practice, ‘Greek theatre’ seemed to mean ‘Athenian tragedy in the fifth century’, for which surviving material evidence is inadequate. There was not one statue of a tragic actor, but some lively terracotta figurines seemed to be comic actors, masked and indecently costumed; and a handful of pots and fragments offered blurred and broken glimpses of comedy.

The breakthrough came in 1986, at my Faculty Club. Since nobody wanted to be seen lunching with the acting Dean, lest they be suspected of currying favour, I was free to look through a new issue of *Phoenix*. Thus I read Eric Csapo’s account of a vase in Würzburg, with a detailed picture of a performance of a scene in Aristophanes. Yet the vase had been painted in Italy, in the fourth century. It was ‘new’ evidence, because its relevance had not hitherto been understood.

Many similar scenes were known, but they had been dismissed because they were thought to show crude Italian farces known as *phlyakes*. Now it seemed likely that many represented fourth-century performances of Athenian comedy, or something similar. And indeed, so it proved. More scenes have come to light, and their relevance to comedy has become widely accepted.

As far as possible, I have examined the primary material evidence, the vases and figurines, rather than photographs. This practice avoids mistakes, when smudged paint is interpreted as horns on a mask, a mysterious pyramid turns out to be cracks in the fabric, or an incised inscription is overlooked. I have never examined a comedy vase without learning something new. For research of this kind, a good deal of travel is required: I have visited 75 museums and private collections, and studied 350 artifacts.

This book deals only with comedy, for which vase painters used a highly realistic technique; tragic subjects were idealized. Most of the vases were painted in the Greek cities of southern Italy and Sicily, in the fourth century BCE. No doubt many of the comedies were written in Athens, but some may have been composed in Syrakousai or Taras, cities with a native dramatic tradition.

The Würzburg scene was painted many years after Aristophanes wrote the comedy it represents, and vases twenty years apart have scenes from the same comedy: evidently these were either local or touring performances of

Preface

xv

old plays. By the fourth century, Athenian comedy was performed everywhere Greek-speakers lived; it had truly become 'Greek theatre'. Encouraged by the acknowledged relevance of *phlyax* scenes to 'legitimate' comedy, I have taken into account associated pictures from some of the same workshops, to extend the meaning of 'theatre' beyond the three official genres of the Athenian festivals. These feature performers in dramatic entertainments like the 'mime' described by Xenophon. These too may be termed Greek theatre; and its performers extend those boundaries farther still, because many are women.

Colleagues, curators, students and friends have assisted and advised me in the twenty-five years since I began the research leading to this book. I have accumulated a continuing debt to Sarah Stanton of Cambridge University Press, for concealing her consternation when an author she knew as a Shakespearean proposed a book about Greek comedy, and persevering in her faith that I would somehow bring it to a conclusion.

Richard Green, the master of this discipline, has been unfailing with advice and encouragement. I owe an equal debt to Grigoris Sifakis, for his wisdom and guidance as I ventured upon ground sometimes reserved for Classicists, and for helping me to win a T.B.L. Webster Fellowship, for which I am grateful to Michael Edwards and the Institute of Classical Studies. Jeffrey Rusten has been most generous with his assistance, and Eric Csapo encouraged me to press on, and to add New Comedy to my topics.

My research has been supported by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, ICS and the University of London. The University of Victoria provided preliminary faculty research grants, which brought me the aid of research assistants Erec Hassell, Sylvia Diaz-Denz and Don DeMille.

This work has benefited from the generosity of private collectors Guido and Giovanna Malaguzzi Valeri, William Knight Zewadski, Alessandro Ragusa, Leonardo and Paula Mustilli, and George Ortiz, all of whom have graciously permitted me to examine and publish their treasures; and of James Ede, who provided me with two antiquities which illustrate this book.

Curators and superintendents of public collections have admitted me to the close examination of the unique artifacts which are the foundation of this book, and granted permission to publish them. Amongst the most helpful have been Giuseppe Andreassi and Teresa Cinquantequattro, Puglia; Elena Lattanzi, Calabria; Amalia Curcio, Siracusa; Elio Galasso,

Benevento; Antonio De Siena, Metaponto; Maurizio Sannibale, Vaticano; and Francesco Valenti, Lentini. In Athens, Nikolaos Kaltsas and Irini Papa-georgiou; Mary Louise Hart in Malibu, Elena Ananich in St Petersburg and Ursula Kästner in Berlin. In the midst of a devastating earthquake, Penelope Minchin-Garvin in Christchurch far exceeded the call of duty.

I owe two of the illustrations to the talents of my daughter Katie. And the debt I owe to my wife Mary cannot be adequately acknowledged here. She has lived with Greek pots as long as she has lived with me. She accompanied every research trip, to Caltanissetta where the lights went out, and into the roof at Naples where she discovered a picture of one of the women whose acrobatic feats are exceeded only by Mary's feats of patience.

Finally, please note that dates are BCE, and approximate, unless otherwise indicated.