

A Legal History of the Civil War and Reconstruction

Although hundreds of thousands of people died fighting in the Civil War, perhaps the war's biggest casualty was the nation's legal order, A Legal History of the Civil War and Reconstruction explores the implications of this major change by bringing legal history into dialogue with the scholarship of other historical fields. Federal policy on slavery and race, particularly the three Reconstruction Amendments, are the best-known legal innovations of the era. Change, however, permeated all levels of the legal system, altering Americans' relationship to the law and allowing them to move popular conceptions of justice into the ambit of government policy. The results linked Americans to the nation through individual rights, which were extended to more people and, as a result of new claims, were reimagined to cover a wider array of issues. But rights had limits in what they could accomplish, particularly when it came to the collective goals that so many ordinary Americans advocated. Ultimately, Laura F. Edwards argues, this new nation of rights offered up promises that would prove difficult to sustain.

Laura F. Edwards is the Peabody Family Professor of History at Duke University. Her book *The People and Their Peace: Legal Culture and the Transformation of Inequality in the Post-Revolutionary South* was awarded the American Historical Association's 2009 Littleton-Griswold Prize for the best book in law and society and the Southern Historical Association's Charles Sydnor Prize for the best book in southern history.





New Histories of American Law

Series Editors

Michael Grossberg *Indiana University* Christopher L. Tomlins *University of California-Irvine*

New Histories of American Law is a series of bold, synthetic, and concise interpretive books that will cover all the key topics in American legal history, written by leading scholars in the field and intended for student use in colleges and law schools.

Other Books in the Series

Elizabeth Dale, Criminal Justice in the United States, 1789–1939 Jack P. Greene, The Constitutional Origins of the American Revolution Barbara Young Welke, Law and the Borders of Belonging in the Long Nineteenth Century United States





A Legal History of the Civil War and Reconstruction

A Nation of Rights

LAURA F. EDWARDS

Duke University





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107401341

© Laura F. Edwards 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data Edwards, Laura F., author.

A legal history of the Civil War and Reconstruction : a nation of rights / Laura F. Edwards, Duke University.

pages cm – (New histories of American law)
Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-00879-3 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-40134-1 (paperback)
I. Law – United States – History – 19th century.
19th century.
2. Civil rights – History – 19th century.
19th century.
4. United States – History – Civil War, 1861–1865 – Law and legislation.
5. Reconstruction (U.S. history, 1865–1877)
I. Title.

KF366.E39 2015 349.7309'034-dc23 2014033240

ISBN 978-1-107-00879-3 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-40134-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> For John, Again.





Contents

Acknowledgments Introduction		page xi
2	The Confederacy and Its Legal Contradictions	42
3	Enslaved Americans, Emancipation, and the Future Legal Order	64
4	The Federal Government and the Reconstruction of the Legal Order	90
5	The Possibilities of Rights	120
6	The Power of Law and the Limits of Rights	146
Conclusion		174
Bibliographic Essay		177
Bibliography		191
Index		205





Acknowledgments

When Chris Tomlins and Mike Grossberg invited me to write the chapter on the Civil War and Reconstruction for The Cambridge History of Law in America, I resisted. I had just published my first book on Reconstruction, was finishing my second book on women in the Civil War era, and wanted to leave the period behind and move on to a new project. I tried to say no. In fact, if memory serves (which, admittedly, it often does not), I said no twice. Chris and Mike, however, kept coming back, and I finally agreed to the project. At the time, I was unsure about that decision, Now I cannot thank them enough for their persistence or their faith in me. Handing over the chapter on the Civil War and Reconstruction, with its voluminous and contentious historiography, to a then-junior scholar whose work had focused more on gender than on legal history was a gamble that others would not have taken. In fact, I realize now that my initial hesitance was as much about my own doubts about this particular intellectual challenge as it was about my eagerness to move on to a new project that I thought – mistakenly – was unconnected to this one. I am now grateful that I took on The Cambridge History of Law in America essay. The essay and this book (which is based on that essay) have challenged me in ways I never anticipated and have changed the way I think about the nineteenth century more generally. I am even more grateful to Chris and Mike, whose encouragement and support saw me through.

I also owe a huge debt to the undergraduate students who have taken my U.S. legal history courses and my U.S. women's history courses. I worked through the ideas in this book through those



xii

Acknowledgments

courses over the past fifteen years. My students were, unknowingly, engaged in the process of revision with each comment they made and each question they asked. Their input has added immeasurably to this book.

Nancy MacLean, Lisa Levenstein, and Jacquelyn Hall read the first half of the manuscript at a critical moment, and their feedback was crucial in framing the book's analysis, setting its tone, and keeping its author on track. Greg Downs, Kate Masur, and Mike Ross generously read and commented on drafts of the entire manuscript. and their comments have strengthened the analysis enormously. The conference "The World the Civil War Made," organized by Kate and Greg with Bill Blair at Penn State University, provided a particularly important intellectual space for thinking through some of the big issues in the book toward the end of the writing process. I also benefited from feedback at a workshop at the University of Oregon Law School, the Third Biennial UnCivil Wars Conference at the University of Georgia, and a seminar at the History Department, University of Tennessee. The comments of two anonymous readers on the initial proposal were particularly engaged and thoughtful, and they helped me enormously in crafting this manuscript.

I may have resisted the project initially, but I had more fun writing this book than I have had writing any other book. The opportunity to read widely, explore connections among various strands of the scholarship, and put all those ideas together in narrative form was incredibly rewarding. That experience owes to the uninterrupted time made possible by a John Simon Guggenheim Postdoctoral Fellowship, and I thank the Guggenheim Foundation for seeing the promise in this project and providing the opportunity to realize its potential. I also thank Duke University for providing leave that allowed me to take a full year to write.

This book is dedicated to my husband, John McAllister, as are my last book and my first book. That is because he has been and always will be the center of my world.