

Index

- Ação Declaratória de Constitucionalidade*, ADC. *See* Supreme Court, Brazil, judicial review, abstract, Declaratory Action of Constitutionality
- Ação Direta de Inconstitucionalidade por Omissão*, ADIn *por Omissão*. *See* Supreme Court, Brazil, judicial review, abstract, Direct Action of Unconstitutionality by Omission
- Ação Direta de Inconstitucionalidade*, ADIn. *See* Supreme Court, Brazil, judicial review, abstract, Direct Action of Unconstitutionality
- accommodation pattern of inter-branch interaction. *See* Brazil, inter-branch interactions in
- Administración Nacional de Seguridad Social*, ANSES. *See* Social Security Administration, Argentina
- Alfonsín, Raúl, 39, 45, 73–4, 84, 131–3, 141–2
- amparo*, 42n19, 149
- Arantes, Rogério Bastos, 10n14, 53n59, 178n42, 182n57, 193n1
- Argentina
 bank freezes, 2–3, 46, 47, 72
 cases concerning economic policy. *See* Court cases, Argentina
 civil service, 49
 civil society, 41
 Codes. *See* Codes, Argentina
 Constitution of 1853, 41, 42, 126
 constitutional reform. *See* Argentina, legal transition
 Decrees. *See* Decrees, Argentina
 economic collapse 1989, 45, 143
 economic collapse 2001, 40, 46, 149
 economic transition, 44–50
 civil service and labor reform, 49–50
 economic context, 45–6
 opening the economy and privatization, 48
 social security reform, 48, 140
 stabilization plans and monetary policy, 46–7
 Austral Plan, 46, 132, 141
 Bonex Plan, 47n40, 144
 Convertibility Plan (*peso*), 47, 146
 tax and fiscal reform, 49
 inter-branch interactions in, 5, 32, 121–2, 123–33, 139–52, 195–6
 Court character thesis, 133–9, 142–3, 145–6, 148–9, 151–2, 195–6
 elected branch compliance and retaliation, 130–1, 232–3; *See also* Court cases, Argentina
 patterns of
 confrontation, 8, 131, 133, 140–3, 146–52
 Court submission, 8, 131, 137, 142, 143–52
 Supreme Court approaches to decision-making, 128–30, 224–31
 deferential, 129, 131, 135, 145, 153
 pragmatic, 130
 principled, 129
 self-protective, 130
 Supreme Court selective assertiveness, 121, 127–8, 222–3
 judicial centralization in, 70–3
 appeals as tactic of, 70–1
 laws facilitating, 72
 need for, 70
 Supreme Court as participant, 72–3
 judicialization of economic governance, 50
 labor reform, 49
 labor unions, 49
 Laws. *See* Laws, Argentina
 legal transition, 39–44
 constitutional reform, 39, 41–3, 74, 83–4
 social and economic rights, 42
 inclusion on agenda of rule of law issues, 39–41
 increasing concern with rights, 41
 judicial reform, 43
 judicialization, 43–4

- Argentina (*cont.*)
 military trials, 39, 40
 Ombudsman (*Defensor del Pueblo*), 42
piqueteros, 40
 political parties. *See* Peronist Party; Radical Party
 politicization of the Supreme Court.
See Supreme Court, Argentina,
 politicization of
 Social Security Administration. *See* Social Security Administration, Argentina
Arguição de Descumprimento de Preceito Fundamental, ADPF. *See* Supreme Court, Brazil, judicial review,
 abstract, Argumentation of Failure to Comply with a Fundamental Precept
- bank freeze, 1–3
 in Argentina, 2–3, 46, 47, 72
 in Brazil, 1–2, 59
 Baum, Lawrence, 14n22, 20
 Bianchi, Alberto, 73, 73n15, 79, 91n60, 148n45, 151, 152
- Brazil
 bank freeze, 1–2, 59
 cases concerning economic policy. *See* Court cases, Brazil
 civil society, 51
 Constitution of 1988, 52–4, 53n56, 59n71, 60, 63, 98, 98n12, 155, 170, 178, 178n41, 181
 Constitutional Amendments. *See* Constitutional Amendments, Brazil
 constitutional reform. *See* Brazil, legal transition
 economic transition, 57–63
 civil service reform, 62
 economic context, 57–8
 opening the economy and privatization, 60
 social security reform, 60–1
 stabilization plans, 58–60, 182–3
 Collor, Plans I and II, 59
 Cruzado Plan, 59
 Real Plan, 57–8, 59
 tax and fiscal reform, 61–2, 99n17, 177–81
 inter-branch interactions in, 5, 32, 156–70, 176–88, 196
 Court character thesis, 170–6, 181–2, 187–8, 190, 196
 elected branch compliance and retaliation, 168, 260–1; *See also* Court cases, Brazil
- patterns of
 accommodation, 8, 157, 159–61, 168–70, 177–88
 Supreme Court approaches to
 decision-making, 166–7, 251–9
 deferential, 167
 pragmatic, 166, 189
 principled, 166, 176
 self-protective, 166
 support-building, 167
 Supreme Court selective assertiveness, 164–5, 247–50
 judicial centralization in, 95–100
 appeals as tactics of, 96–7
 concentrating authority in the STF, 100
 need for, 95–6
 Supreme Court as participant, 100
 judicialization of economic governance, 63, 155–6
- Laws. *See* Laws, Brazil
- legal transition, 50–6
 constitutional reform, 52–4, 98–9, 178
 reform to economic order articles, 53–4, 60
 inclusion on agenda of rule of law issues, 51
 increasing concern with rights, 51–2
 judicial reform, 54–6, 99, 104n36
 judicialization, 56
 lower courts, 98n14
 Office of the Federal Prosecutor, 54n64, 147n43
 party system fragmentation, 110–12, 175
 political parties. *See* Worker's Party, Brazil; Brazilian Democratic Movement Party
 professionalization of the Supreme Court.
See Supreme Court, Brazil
 (*Supremo Tribunal Federal*, STF),
 professionalization of
- Brazilian Democratic Movement Party
 (*Partido do Movimento Democrático Brasileiro*, PMDB), 111
- Brinks, Daniel, 34, 96n7, 193n1, 200, 208, 208n20
- Cardoso, Fernando Henrique, 57–8, 60
 Carrió, Alejandro, 42, 144, 144n30, 145n36
 Cavallo, Domingo, 46, 47
 Chavez, Rebecca, 74n17, 88n47, 193n1, 197, 200
 Codes, Argentina

Index

285

- Civil and Commercial Procedural Code, 71, 72
- Codes, Brazil
 - Civil Code, 99
- Collor de Mello, Fernando, 2, 51, 59, 60
- compliance with judicial decisions, 19–21
- measuring, 19
- theories of, 20
 - communications, 20
 - external actors, 20
 - legitimacy, 20
 - normative, 20
- CONADEP. *See* National Commission on Disappeared Persons
- confrontation pattern of inter-branch interactions. *See* Argentina, inter-branch interactions in
- Constitutional Amendments, Brazil
 - No. 12, 62
 - No. 19, civil service reform, 63
 - No. 20, social security reform, 61
 - No. 3, constitutionality and fiscal reform, 55, 99, 177, 178, 179
 - No. 41, pension reform, 61
 - No. 45, judicial reform, 99
 - No. 45, judicial reform, 55
- constitutional reform. *See* Argentina, legal transition; Brazil, legal transition
- constitutions. *See* Argentina, Constitution of 1853; Brazil, Constitution of 1988
- Contribuição Provisória sobre Movimentação Financeira*, CPMF. *See* Provisional Contribution on Financial Transactions; Court cases, Brazil
- corralito*. *See* Argentina, bank freezes
- Corte Suprema de Justicia de la Nación*, CSJN. *See* Supreme Court, Argentina
- Court cases, Argentina, 123–7, 139–52, 216–33
 - Guida, Liliana contra Poder Ejecutivo Nacional*, 146–52, 206–7, 220, 222, 226
 - Peralta, Luis Arcenio y otro contra Nación Argentina*, 124, 143–6, 217, 222, 224
 - Porcelli, Luis A. contra Banco de la Nación Argentina*, 132–3
 - Rolón Zappa, Victor contra Estado Nacional*, 124, 140–3, 216, 223, 230, 232–3
 - Tobar, Leonidas contra Ministerio de Defensa – Contaduría General del Ejército*, 125, 146–52, 206–7, 221, 223, 229, 232–3
- Court cases, Brazil, 158–64, 176–88, 234–61
 - CPMF, ADIns 1497 and 2031, 160, 169, 177–82, 242, 248, 249, 256, 260–1
 - FGTS, RE 22855, 161, 169, 182–8, 207, 240, 249, 257, 260–1
 - IPMF, ADIns 926 and 939, 159, 169, 177–82, 237, 259, 260–1
- Court character, 21, 66, 201
 - four features of, 27–8, 87
 - in Argentina. *See* Supreme Court, Argentina, political character of
 - in Brazil. *See* Supreme Court, Brazil, statesman character of
 - institutional cohesion, 28
 - perceived legitimacy, 27
 - professional profile, 27
 - stability, 27
 - thesis, 3, 22–3, 30–3, 35, 122, 133–4, 137–9, 156, 170, 189, 193, 196–7
- Court crafting, 23–7, 69, 194–5, 201–3
 - in Argentina. *See* Supreme Court Argentina, politicization of
 - in Brazil. *See* Supreme Court, Brazil, professionalization of
 - strategic explanations, 25, 78
 - theories of judicial appointment, 25–6
 - theory of, 26–7, 69–70, 78–9, 94, 118, 199–200
 - path dependency in, 26, 83, 108
- Court submission pattern of interaction. *See* Argentina, inter-branch interaction in
- CPMF tax case. *See* Court cases, Brazil
- currency plans. *See* Argentina, economic transition; Brazil, economic transition
- Dahl, Robert, 12, 19
- De la Rúa, Fernando, 2, 40, 45, 85, 148
- Declaratory Action of Constitutionality. *See* Supreme Court, Brazil, judicial review, abstract; *See also* Constitutional Amendments, Brazil, No. 3
- Decrees, Argentina
 - Decree of Necessity and Urgency 1819, 150
 - Decree of Necessity and Urgency 2196, 141–2
 - Decree of Necessity and Urgency 290, 146–8
 - Decree of Necessity and Urgency 36, 144
 - Decree of Necessity and Urgency 430, 147, 149
 - Decree of Necessity and Urgency 896, 149–50

- Decrees, Argentina (*cont.*)
 Decrees of Necessity and Urgency (*Decretos de Necesidad y Urgencia*, DNUs), 47n41, 145n36
- Direct Action of Unconstitutionality.
See Supreme Court, Brazil, judicial review, abstract
- Direct Action of Unconstitutionality by Omission. *See* Supreme Court, Brazil, judicial review, abstract
- Domingo, Pilar, 25, 37n4, 37n2, 40, 44n29, 67, 78
- Duhalde, Eduardo, 1, 2–3, 40, 46, 74, 85, 149
- economic reform, 38
- elected branch compliance. *See* compliance with judicial decisions
- elected branch retaliation. *See* retaliation against judicial decisions
- Epstein, Lee, 16, 17, 24, 24n45, 29, 29n58, 137, 138, 174, 175n37, 197
- Faro de Castro, Marcus, 10n14, 56n68, 99, 163n15
- FGTS, RE 22855. *See* Court cases, Brazil
- Finkel, Jodi, 19n36, 20, 25, 37, 42, 42n18, 42n17, 42n16, 42n15, 43n25, 43n24, 43n22, 68, 74n17, 81, 85n42, 193n1
- Gargarella, Roberto, 10n14, 18, 20, 37n4, 79, 144, 145, 146, 209
- Gelli, María Angélica, 132n19
- Gibson, James L., 20
- Gillman, Howard, 16, 17n31, 197, 199
- Ginsburg, Tom, 5, 17, 17n31, 29, 67, 68, 68n4, 137, 138, 174, 193n1, 197, 204, 204n16
- Guida, *Liliana contra Poder Ejecutivo Nacional*. *See* Court cases, Argentina
- Helmke, Gretchen, 6, 10, 18, 24n44, 34, 42n19, 42n15, 74n17, 81, 83, 85, 129, 132, 193n1, 197, 200
- high court decision-making. *See* judicial decision-making
- Hilbink, Elisabeth, 5, 6, 16n30, 24, 34, 68, 193n1, 197n3, 200, 200n10, 201, 202
- Hirschl, Ran, 37n4, 68, 193n1
- Imposto Provisório sobre Movimentação Financeira*, IPMF. *See* Provisional Tax on Financial Transactions; Court cases, Brazil
- informal institutions, 33–4, 200–1
- inter-branch interactions, 1–3, 7, 23, 197–9
 Court character account of. *See* Court character, thesis
 in Argentina. *See* Argentina, inter-branch interactions in
 in Brazil. *See* Brazil, inter-branch interactions in
 patterns of, 4, 11, 30, 32, 121
 accommodation, 8
 confrontation, 8
 Court domination, 8, 9
 Court submission, 8, 148
 strategic explanation of, 28–30, 33, 174–6
 based on Court-society relations, 29–30, 138–9, 175
 based on political divisions, 29, 137–8
- inter-branch relations. *See* inter-branch interactions
- IPMF tax case. *See* Court cases, Brazil
- judicial activism, 11n17
- judicial appointments, 202–3
 in Argentina. *See* Supreme Court, Argentina, politicization of
 in Brazil. *See* Supreme Court, Brazil, professionalization of
 in Chile, 202
 in Colombia, 202
 in Costa Rica, 203
 in Mexico, 202
 theories of, 24–5
 theory of court crafting. *See* Court crafting, theory of
- judicial assertiveness, 6, 192, 197–9
 definition of, 11
 measuring, 11–12
 selective assertiveness, 4, 164
- judicial behavior. *See* judicial decision-making
- judicial centralization, 23n42, 67, 194
 in Argentina. *See* Argentina, judicial centralization
 in Brazil. *See* Brazil, judicial centralization
- judicial decision-making, 13, 197–9
 approaches to, 12–18, 128–9, 197
 deferential, 17, 129
 pragmatic, 18, 129
 preference-driven, 16, 128
 principled, 15, 128
 self-protective, 16, 129
 support-building, 17, 129
 theoretical models of, 14
 attitudinal, 16

Index

287

- legal, 15
 - strategic, 17, 137–9
- judicial empowerment
- theories of, 67–8
 - credible commitment, 67
 - governance, 67
 - hegemonic preservation, 68
 - insurance, 67
 - power consolidation, 67–8
- judicial independence, 22, 181–2
- judicial power, 19–20
- judicial reform
 - in Argentina. *See* Argentina, legal transition
 - in Brazil. *See* Brazil, legal transition
- judicial strategy, 67
 - Court crafting. *See* Court crafting
 - judicial centralization. *See* judicial centralization
- judicialization of economic governance, 4, 38–9, 120–1, 194, 203–8
 - in Argentina. *See* Argentina, judicialization of economic governance
 - in Brazil. *See* Brazil, judicialization of economic governance
- judicialization of politics, 2, 18, 26, 66, 192
 - in Argentina. *See* Argentina, legal transition
 - in Brazil. *See* Brazil, legal transition
- Kagan, Robert A., 17n31
- Kingstone, Peter, 36, 57, 59
- Kirchner, Néstor, 40, 76, 78, 86
- law and economics, 203–8
 - law and development movement, 203–4
- Laws, Argentina
 - Educators' Statute (Law 14.473), 140
 - Integrated Pension System Law (Law 24.241), 48
 - Law of Economic Emergency (Law 23.697), 47
 - Law of Fiscal Responsibility (Law 25.152), 49
 - Law of Pension Solidarity (Law 24.463), 48, 72, 218
 - Law of Public Emergency (Law 25.561), 47
 - Law of State Reform (Law 23.696), 48, 217
 - Law of Zero Deficit (Law 25.453), 49, 149–50
 - New System of Retirements and Pensions (Law 18.037), 140, 218
- Laws, Brazil
 - Law of Fiscal Responsibility (Complementary Law 101), 62, 246
 - Law of the ADIn and ADC (Law 9.868), 55, 98, 100
 - Law of the ADPF (Law 9.882), 55, 98
 - Rita Camata Law (Complementary Law 77), 177, 178, 236
- legal transition, 37–8, 205
- Levitsky, Steven, 24n44, 34, 49n44, 200, 200n11
- lower courts, 70n5, 95n5
- Lula da Silva, Luiz Inácio, 51, 58, 102
- Menem, Carlos, 40, 45, 47, 48, 74, 85
 - “automatic majority”, 88, 125, 128, 145
- Miller, Jonathan, 123n4, 140n26, 145n36, 145n33
- Ministério Público*, MP. *See* Brazil, Office of the Federal Prosecutor
- National Commission on Disappeared Persons (CONADEP), 39, 41
- National Judicial Council, Brazil (*Conselho Nacional de Justiça*, CNJ), 99
- Neves, Tancredo, 51, 52
- Nino, Carlos Santiago, 101n4, 18, 39, 39n6, 77, 146
- O'Donnell, Guillermo, 34, 36, 41, 42, 126n5, 205, 206n18
- Partido do Movimento Democrático Brasileiro*, PMDB. *See* Brazilian Democratic Movement Party
- Pellet Lastra, Arturo, 50, 74, 81–2, 88n47, 141, 142, 146
- Peralta, Luis Arcenio y otro contra Nación Argentina*. *See* Court cases, Argentina
- Pérez-Liñán, Aníbal, 25
- Peronist Party, Argentina, 42, 49n44, 50n46
- piqueteros*, 40
- politicization of high courts. *See* Supreme Court, Argentina
- Porcelli, Luis A. contra Banco de la Nación Argentina*. *See* Court cases, Argentina
- professionalization of high courts. *See* Supreme Court, Brazil
- Provisional Contribution on Financial Transactions (*Contribuição Provisória sobre Movimentação Financeira*, CPMF), 62
- Provisional Tax on Financial Transactions (*Imposto Provisório sobre Movimentação Financeira*, IPMF), 61, 177

Radical Party, Argentina, 42
 retaliation against judicial decisions, 21–2
 institutional, 21
 policy, 21
Rolón Zappa, Victor contra Estado Nacional.
 See Court cases, Argentina
 Rosenn, Keith S., 14n21, 37, 41, 51, 51n47,
 53, 53n58, 57, 59, 102, 105n40

 Santiago, Alfonso, 44, 48, 90, 127, 141, 142,
 144, 145n36, 146
 Sarney, José, 52
 Shapiro, Martin M., 14n22, 37n4, 67,
 193n1
 Smulovitz, Catalina, 17, 18, 41, 44n29, 47
 Social Security Administration, Argentina
 (ANSES), 72
stare decisis, 66, 70
 Staton, Jeffrey, 17, 20, 30, 138–9, 175, 192,
 193n1, 202
Superior Tribunal de Justiça. *See* Superior
 Tribunal of Justice, Brazil
 Superior Tribunal of Justice, Brazil (*Superior*
Tribunal de Justiça, STJ), 55, 99
 Supreme Court, Argentina (*Corte Suprema de*
Justicia de la Nación, CSJN), 2–3, 8,
 31, 70–4
 approaches to decision-making in
 economic policy cases. *See* Argentina,
 inter-branch interactions in, Supreme
 Court approaches to decision-making
 arbitrary ruling doctrine (*sentencia*
 arbitraria), 73
 assertiveness in economic policy cases.
 See Argentina, inter-branch
 interactions in, Supreme Court
 selective assertiveness
 case load, 44
 impeachment, 74, 75, 84–6, 149, 151–2
 institutional importance doctrine (*gravedad*
 institucional), 72
 inter-branch interactions. *See* Argentina,
 inter-branch interactions
 per saltum, 73
 political character of, 31, 87–91, 133–9,
 142–3, 145–6, 148–9, 151–2, 207
 institutional instability, 87, 145, 151
 lower perceived legitimacy, 87–9, 142,
 146, 148, 152
 weaker institutional cohesion, 89–91,
 142, 149
 collegiality, 90
 consensus on role, 89
 leadership, 90
 procedural continuity, 90

weaker professional profile, 87, 145
 politicization of, 26, 31, 69, 70, 73–8, 81–3,
 87–91, 134, 194–5
 Court crafting theory of, 78–87
 formal institutional influences on, 83–4
 historical institutional influence on, 81–3
 partisan politics influences on, 84–6
 manipulation of size and membership,
 73–6
 need for, 79–80
 weakening professional profile, 76–8
 requirements to become justice, 83
 selective assertiveness. *See* Argentina, inter-
 branch interactions in
 size, 75, 81–2
 Supreme Court, Brazil (*Supremo Tribunal*
Federal, STF), 1–2, 8, 31, 55,
 93–119
 approaches to decision-making in economic
 policy cases. *See* Brazil, inter-branch
 interactions in, Supreme Court
 approaches to decision-making
 assertiveness in economic policy cases.
 See Brazil, interbranch interactions
 in, Supreme Court selective
 assertiveness
 case load, 55, 56, 96–7, 162
 impeachment, 110
 inter-branch interactions. *See* Brazil, inter-
 branch interactions
 judicial review, 55–6, 95
 judicial review, abstract
 Argumentation of Failure to Comply with
 a Fundamental Precept (*Arguição*
 de Descumprimento de Preceito
 Fundamental, ADPF), 55, 98
 Declaratory Action of Constitutionality
 (*Ação Declaratória de*
 Constitucionalidade, ADC), 99
 Direct Action of Unconstitutionality
 (*Ação Direta de*
 Inconstitucionalidade, ADIn), 55,
 56, 98
 Direct Action of Unconstitutionality
 by Omission (*Ação Direta de*
 Inconstitucionalidade por Omissão,
 ADIn *por Omissão*), 98
 legalist and consequentialist justices, 113,
 114, 171–2, 187, 190
 professionalization of, 26, 33, 94, 100–3,
 171, 195
 Court crafting, theory of, 94, 104,
 106–12
 formal rules, 109–10
 historical institutional influences, 106–9

Index

289

- party system fragmentation, 110–12, 175
 - maintaining size and composition, 101
 - need for, 104–6
 - strengthening professional profile, 101–3, 107
- requirements to become justice, 109
- selective assertiveness. *See* Brazil,
 - inter-branch interactions, Supreme Court selective assertiveness
- size, 106, 109
- statesman character of, 5, 31–3, 112–17, 170–6, 181–2, 187–8, 207
 - institutional stability, 112–13
 - justices' professional qualifications, 112–13
 - perceived legitimacy, 113–14, 176
 - strong institutional cohesion, 114–17
 - collegiality, 115
 - consensus on role, 114
 - leadership, 115
 - procedural continuity, 116
- simula vinculante*, 55, 99
- Supremo Tribunal Federal*. *See* Supreme Court, Brazil
- Taylor, Matthew, 10114, 1933, 34, 37n4, 51, 53, 54, 55, 56, 58, 59, 60, 61, 61n76, 62, 63, 63n84, 95, 96n7, 97, 98n16, 106, 112, 116, 162, 164, 174n35, 193n1, 198n4, 199
- Tobar, Leonidas contra Ministerio de Defensa – Contaduría General del Ejército*. *See* Court cases, Argentina
- Trochev, Alexei, 5, 20, 21, 24, 25, 68, 78, 193n1
- Vanberg, Georg, 20, 29, 138, 175, 193n1, 197
- Vilhena Vieira, Oscar, 52, 53, 95n5, 98n14, 98n12, 99n18, 177, 178n42, 179, 182n57
- Whittington, Keith, 16, 67, 68, 199
- Workers' Party, Brazil, *Partido dos Trabalhadores* (PT), 51, 103
- Zakaria, Fareed, 37n2, 126n5, 205