

THE LAW AND POLITICS OF INTERNATIONAL LEGITIMACY

This book examines the significance of the issue of political legitimacy at the international level, focusing on international law. It adopts a descriptive, critical, and reconstructive approach. In order to do so, the book clarifies what political legitimacy is in general and in the context of international law. The book analyzes how international law contributes to a sense of legitimacy through notions such as international membership, international rights holding, fundamental principles and hierarchy of rights holding, rightful conduct, and international authority. In addition, the book stresses the severe limitations of the legitimacy of international law and of the current international order that it contributes to regulate and manage. This leads the book to identify the conditions under which international order and international law could overcome their problems of legitimacy and become more legitimate. The book is interdisciplinary in nature, mobilizing international law, political and legal theory, philosophy, history, and political science.

JEAN-MARC COICAUD is Distinguished Professor of Law and Global Affairs at Rutgers School of Law, New Jersey, USA, and Fellow of Academia Europaea. He is also Fudan Distinguished Visiting Chair Professor at the Fudan Institute for Advanced Study in Social Sciences (Shanghai, China). Prior to being at Rutgers, Coicaud served as a senior official with the United Nations, including in the Executive Office of the United Nations Secretary-General, New York, USA, and the United Nations University, Tokyo, Japan. He has graduate degrees in philosophy, political science, law, literature, and linguistics and has studied at Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne University, Sciences Po Paris, and Harvard University. He has authored, co-authored, and co-edited more than fifteen books.

THE LAW AND POLITICS OF INTERNATIONAL LEGITIMACY

JEAN-MARC COICAUD

Rutgers University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-00827-4 — The Law and Politics of International Legitimacy
 Jean-Marc Coicaud
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107008274

DOI: 10.1017/9781139026420

© Jean-Marc Coicaud 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781139026420

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Coicaud, Jean-Marc author

Title: The law and politics of international legitimacy / Dr. Jean-Marc Coicaud, Rutgers University,
 New Jersey, USA

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2025. |
 Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2025002974 (print) | LCCN 2025002975 (ebook) | ISBN 9781107008274
 hardback | ISBN 9781139026420 epub

Subjects: LCSH: Legitimacy of governments—Political aspects | Government liability
 (International law) | State, The

Classification: LCC KZ4041 .C549 2025 (print) | LCC KZ4041 (ebook) |
 DDC 341.26–dc23/eng/20250130

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2025002974>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2025002975>

ISBN 978-1-107-00827-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

For EU product safety concerns, contact us at Calle de José Abascal, 56, 1º,
 28003 Madrid, Spain, or email eugpsr@cambridge.org.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-107-00827-4 — The Law and Politics of International Legitimacy

Jean-Marc Coicaud

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

To Jin, Joseph Tao, and Haibo Louis-Henri

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments xi

Introduction 1

PART I Setting the Stage

1 Political Legitimacy as an Intellectual Journey 11
 Political Legitimacy and “Authoritarian Democracy” 11
 Political Legitimacy as Political Responsibility 13
 The Question of Political Legitimacy in the International Context 20

2 Orders in Transition and Implications for Political Legitimacy 24
 The Challenge of Integration and Disintegration 24
 The Financial and Economic Challenge 26
 The Geopolitical Challenge 27
 The Normative Challenge 29
 The Technological Challenge 31
 The Reassessment of Globalization Challenge 33
 The Crisis of Democracy Challenge 34
 The Governance Challenge 37

3 The Legitimacy–Law Nexus 39
 The Paradoxical Character of the Relationship between Legitimacy
 and Law 41
 Values in Legitimacy and Law 42
 Legitimacy and Law and Their Relationship with Power 44
 Legitimacy and Law and the International Context 45

PART II Political Legitimacy and Theory of Politics

4 Theory of Politics and Political Legitimacy 49
 The Place of Political Legitimacy in Social Sciences 49
 On Theory and Theory of Social Phenomena 52
 On Politics as Community 58
 From Politics as Community to Political Legitimacy 62

vii

viii	CONTENTS	
5	Political Legitimacy as Evaluation and Judgment	68
	On the Meaning of Values and Consent in General	69
	Challenges Associated with Values and Consent	75
	Values and Consent as Criteria of Evaluation and Judgment of Political Legitimacy	80
6	Implications for Political Legitimacy and the Theory of Legitimacy	92
	Conservative versus Progressive Approaches to Political Legitimacy	92
	Scope of Evaluation and Judgment of Legitimacy	94
	Evidence behind the Evaluation and Judgment of Legitimacy	96
	Special Relevance of Contemporary Politics with Respect to Legitimacy	97
	PART III The Question of Legitimacy at the International Level	
7	Political Legitimacy: From the National to the International	101
	The National Level as the Focus of Political Legitimacy	101
	The Importance of Political Legitimacy at the International Level	108
	Key Distinctions of National/International Legitimacy	110
	Applications of Distinctions of National/International Legitimacy	114
8	Specificities of the International Community and Legitimacy	121
	Ambiguity of International Community and Legitimacy	121
	National Bent of International Life and Legitimacy	128
	Cultural Diversity, Disparity of Development, and Legitimacy	134
	Hegemony, Fragmentation, Contestation, and Legitimacy	143
	Ownership and Legitimacy	151
	General Functions of International Legitimacy	154
	PART IV Construction of Legitimacy in International Law	
9	Legitimacy and International Membership	161
	Legitimate Membership and Nature of the International System	161
	Universality of Access to International Membership	165
	Limits of Universality and Pluralism of International Membership	166
10	Legitimacy and International Rights Holding	173
	International Rights Holding and Being “In” versus Being “Out”	173
	Rights Holding and the Dark Side of International Law and Legitimacy	177
	Selective Universalism and the Gaps of Rights Holding	187

11	Key Principles of International Law and Hierarchy of Rights Holding	202	
	Fundamental Principles/Values of International Law and Legitimacy		202
	Relations among Key Principles of International Law: Compatibility, Competition, and Hierarchy	212	
	Dominant Fundamental Principle: Sovereign Equality of States		219
12	International Legitimacy and Rightful Conduct	226	
	Rightful Conduct and Interstate Relations	226	
	Rightful Conduct and the Rise of the Individual		231
13	International Legitimacy and International Authority	242	
	The United Nations as an International Authority	242	
	The Role of the United Nations as an International Authority		245
	PART V International Legitimacy and Change		
14	International Legitimacy as a System of Reference and Meaning	259	
	Beginning of an International Order and Legitimacy	259	
	International Legitimacy and Its Influence on Actors	267	
	Scope and Depth of International Legitimacy		274
15	Scope and Depth of International Legitimacy, Modernity, and the West	283	
	Position of Power Dominance	284	
	Means of Penetration and Integration	285	
	Values as Bridges	286	
	Secularization and Democratization		286
16	Change and International Legitimacy	301	
	Change and International Legitimacy: Scholarly View of Stability	301	
	International Legitimacy and the Socialization of Instability	313	
	Characteristics of International Order, Change, and Legitimacy		316
17	Change of International Order and Legitimacy	318	
	Reasons for a Change of International Order and Legitimacy	318	
	Modalities and Processes of Change of International Order and Legitimacy	337	
	Redefinition of the International System and Its Legitimacy		348
18	Change in International Order and Legitimacy	350	
	Characteristics of Change in an International System and Its Legitimacy	350	
	Adaptation in the International System and Legitimacy	355	
	Today's International Order and Systemic Risk	357	

19	Evaluation of the Validity of International Legitimacy	361
	Reasonableness of the Evaluation of the Validity of International Legitimacy	361
	Criteria of Evaluation of the Validity of International Legitimacy	362
	Application of the Criteria of Evaluation of International Legitimacy	370
	PART VI Criticism and Reconstruction of the Legitimacy of International Law	
20	Elements of a Critical History of International Law	373
	International Law and History	373
	The Ambiguous Globalization of International Law	381
21	Elements of a Critical Philosophy of International Law	392
	The Status of the Philosophy of International Law	392
	The Assumptions at the Heart of International Law	395
	Characteristics of the Assumptions at the Heart of International Law	405
	Assumptions/Distinctions and the Pillars of International Legitimacy	410
22	Toward a More Just International Law	413
	Relevant Lessons from the Past	413
	Principles of Agency as Requirements of Legitimacy of International Law	415
	From the Principles to the Thematic Issues of Legitimacy in International Law	430
23	From International Legitimacy to Global Justice	462
	Celebrating Human Rights versus Treating People as Disposable	463
	Making the Global Justice Agenda More Feasible and More Global	469
	Global Justice and Cosmopolitan State and Sovereignty	481
	Three Thoughts on Institutional Reform and Innovation	485
	Conclusion	488
	Globalization	489
	Emotions and Passions in Social Life	490
	Geopolitics of Tomorrow	491
	Afterword	492
	<i>Bibliography</i>	494
	<i>Index</i>	528

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First, I want to thank John Berger, previously a senior editor with Cambridge University Press, for believing in the book project from the beginning. It has truly been a pleasure to work with John. Later on, after John retired, I worked with Marianne Nield, whom I also thank for her support. I also want to thank Sheila Sybrant. In the final stage of the project, Sheila's linguistic and editing expertise helped to improve the style and readability of the manuscript.

Writing a book is an enterprise that takes a lot of time and that cannot be completed without the help and support of many people in various ways. Among these people, I want to thank Tony Addison, Emanuel Adler, Antony Anghie, Daniel A. Bell, Olivier Broche, Chia-Ming Chen, Yifeng Chen, Ariel Colonos, Franck Debié, Jacques deLisle, Chantal Delsol, Michael W. Doyle, Yale H. Ferguson, Patricia Georget, Jeffrey Gross, Sujian Guo, Kristinn Helgason, Jimmy Chia-Shin Hsu, Ian Hurd, Charles A. Kupchan, Didier Louvel, Stephanie L. Mick, Eva-Maria Nag, Olivier Nay, Alexandra Novosseloff, Sergio Peña-Neira, Eric Pomes, Bertrand Ramcharan, Henry Rousseau, Jean-Michel Roy, Hal Salzman, Daniel Schlein, Lynette E. Sieger, Amy Soled, Andrés Solimano, Hendrik Spruyt, Guodong Sun, Rahul Sur, Ramesh Thakur, Takeo Uchida, Juha Ilari Uitto, Marc Uzan, Benoît Vermander, Patrick Weil, Dwayne Woods, and Tzung-Mou Wu.

I have had the occasion to present some of the ideas developed in this book at a variety of institutions, such as, in chronological order from a few years ago to recently, University of Lausanne, Columbia University, Beijing University, European University Institute, Naval War Academy in Chile, University of California Los Angeles (UCLA), Tsinghua University, University of Helsinki, Chuo University, École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales (EHESS), University of Montréal, Cambridge University, Sciences Po in Paris, Academia Sinica in Taipei, Maastricht University, Sun Yat-Sen University, and City University of Hong Kong. Each time, the feedback that I received was very helpful.

In 2017–2018, I spent a sabbatical year in Shanghai at the Fudan Institute for Advanced Study in Social Sciences. The lecture series that I delivered there helped my research and thinking, and the feedback that I received from Fudan University faculty colleagues, Fudan visitors, and Fudan students was

beneficial. A conference that I co-organized in May 2018 at the Fudan Institute for Advanced Study in Social Sciences on national interests and global justice, and the discussions it generated among participants, also encouraged me to think further about the links between legitimacy and justice at the global level.

Rutgers Law School has been my professional home since 2011, and it has proven to be a welcoming and supportive institution. In the last stretch of the preparation of the manuscript, Associate Dean David L. Noll and Co-Dean Rose Cuison-Villazor secured financial support from the law school for final language editing. I have also benefited from the administrative support given by Mayra Caraballo, for which I am grateful. Over the years, university professor and former dean Stuart Deutsch, now retired, has also been supportive of my work and research, and I am extremely appreciative.

More generally, I will add that it is a pleasure to find at Rutgers Law School an intellectual community with many good colleagues and friends, which contributes greatly to making my work as a faculty member there a meaningful experience.

In this regard, the courses that I teach to Juris Doctor (JD) students, as well as Master's and Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) students, have allowed me to benefit from their intellectual curiosity.

In France, Les Herbiers, in Vendée, was a big village when I was a child. It has changed a lot in the last decades, but I still feel at home there. I thank old friends and close neighbors – Gabriel Girard in particular, as well as Luce and Patrice Martineau, Guy Bibard, Jacqueline Poupet, Serge Bonnin, Daniel Boudaud, Christian Challet, Jean-René Charrier, Joseph Liard, Christian Préaud, Jean-Bernard Sire, and Bernard and Maryse Verrier, to name just a few.

At home both in France and in the United States, the love, support, and understanding of my family have been essential to me in being able to complete this book. In Vendée, I thank my parents, Joseph and Juliette Coicaud, for their unconditional love and support. I owe them everything; without them, nothing would have been possible. I also thank my sisters, Catherine and Françoise, and their families. My family in France has been a source of warmth and a motivation for me to go back to Vendée again and again. In New York City, my wife, Jin, our two sons, Joseph Tao and Haibo Louis-Henri, and my parents-in-law, Yixian Zhang and Yourong Cao, have played a big part in making this book possible. This book is dedicated to Jin, Joseph Tao, and Haibo Louis-Henri – with all my love.