

## Contents

|  |                 |
|--|-----------------|
| <i>List of abbreviations</i>   | <i>page</i> xiv |
| <i>Table of cases</i>  | xvii            |
| <i>Table of treaties</i>   | xxxiv           |
| Introductory observations  | 1               |
| <br><b>Part I Setting the framework</b>                                    |                 |
| 1 Changing winds – three signs   | 9               |
| 1.1 The first sign – conceptual evolution                                  | 9               |
| 1.2 The second sign – integrating the environment into investment treaties | 14              |
| 1.3 The third sign – the environment breaks into investment disputes       | 17              |
| <br>2 Conceptualising interactions   | <br>24          |
| 2.1 Foreign investment and the environment                                 | 24              |
| 2.2 Synergies  | 27              |
| 2.3 Conflicts  | 28              |
| 2.3.1 Basic definitions  | 28              |
| 2.3.2 Normative and legitimacy conflicts in theory                         | 29              |
| 2.3.3 Normative and legitimacy conflicts in treaty practice                | 34              |
| 2.4 Levels and sectors   | 39              |
| 2.4.1 Levels   | 39              |
| 2.4.2 Sectors  | 39              |

## viii CONTENTS

|       |   |     |
|-------|---|-----|
| 3     | Synergies – harnessing foreign investment to promote environmental protection | 41  |
| 3.1   | The form of synergies – environmental project finance and PPPs                | 42  |
| 3.1.1 | Environmental project finance   | 42  |
| 3.1.2 | Environmental PPPs  | 47  |
| 3.2   | The substance of synergies – climate change and biodiversity as examples      | 50  |
| 3.2.1 | Foreign investment in climate change initiatives                              | 50  |
| 3.2.2 | Foreign investment in biodiversity-related activities                         | 54  |
| 4     | Conflicts I – Soft control mechanisms   | 59  |
| 4.1   | Standards of conduct  | 60  |
| 4.1.1 | Direct standards affecting multinational enterprises                          | 60  |
| 4.1.2 | Indirect standards affecting financial intermediaries                         | 65  |
| 4.2   | Contractual approaches  | 67  |
| 4.2.1 | Regulatory angle  | 68  |
| 4.2.2 | Components of environmental contracts   | 69  |
| 4.3   | Accountability mechanisms   | 71  |
| 4.3.1 | Controlling companies – direct mechanisms                                     | 72  |
| 4.3.2 | Controlling the controllers – indirect mechanisms                             | 79  |
| 5     | Conflicts II – adjudication mechanisms  | 83  |
| 5.1   | The adjudication of environment-related disputes                              | 83  |
| 5.2   | Jurisdictional matters  | 86  |
| 5.2.1 | Jurisdictional bases in investment arbitration                                | 86  |
| 5.2.2 | Environmental claims  | 89  |
| 5.2.3 | Investments in accordance with (environmental) law                            | 95  |
| 5.3   | Applicable law  | 100 |
| 5.3.1 | Preliminary observations  | 100 |
| 5.3.2 | Choice of law and other indications   | 101 |
| 5.3.3 | Relevance   | 108 |
| 5.4   | Procedural matters  | 113 |
| 5.4.1 | Role of non-disputing parties   | 113 |
| 5.4.2 | Evidentiary issues  | 118 |
| 5.5   | Damages   | 123 |
| 5.5.1 | The irrelevance thesis  | 124 |
| 5.5.2 | The police powers thesis  | 125 |
| 5.5.3 | Middle grounds  | 126 |

**Part II Normative conflicts**

|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| 6     | Normative priority in international law  | 133 |
| 6.1   | Fragmentation as it concerns the relations between environmental and investment protection | 134 |
| 6.2   | Specific conflict norms  | 136 |
| 6.3   | General conflict norms   | 140 |
| 6.3.1 | Sequential application   | 140 |
| 6.3.2 | <i>Lex superior</i>  | 141 |
| 6.3.3 | <i>Lex specialis</i>   | 144 |
| 6.3.4 | <i>Lex posterior</i>   | 146 |
| 6.3.5 | Interpretation techniques  | 148 |
| 7     | Foreign investment and the international regulation of freshwater                          | 158 |
| 7.1   | International regulation of freshwater – an analysis of collision points                   | 158 |
| 7.1.1 | Overview   | 158 |
| 7.1.2 | The regulatory approach  | 160 |
| 7.1.3 | The human rights approach  | 164 |
| 7.2   | Decisions from adjudicatory and quasi-adjudicatory bodies                                  | 167 |
| 7.2.1 | Overview   | 167 |
| 7.2.2 | Water allocation   | 168 |
| 7.2.3 | Pollution and depletion of water-bodies  | 171 |
| 7.2.4 | Procedural requirements  | 175 |
| 7.2.5 | Access to clean and affordable water   | 179 |
| 7.3   | Assessing contemporary practice  | 182 |
| 7.3.1 | Conceptual findings  | 182 |
| 7.3.2 | Some practical problems  | 184 |
| 8     | Foreign investment and the protection of biological and cultural diversity                 | 189 |
| 8.1   | The protection of biological and cultural diversity – an analysis of collision points      | 189 |
| 8.1.1 | Overview   | 189 |
| 8.1.2 | The regulatory approach  | 191 |
| 8.1.3 | The human rights approach  | 197 |

|        |  |     |
|--------|--|-----|
| x      | CONTENTS   |     |
| 8.2    | Decisions from adjudicatory and quasi-adjudicatory bodies                                  | 198 |
| 8.2.1  | Overview   | 198 |
| 8.2.2  | Protected areas and species  | 198 |
| 8.2.3  | Protection of minorities and indigenous peoples  | 204 |
| 8.2.4  | Other environmental obligations  | 211 |
| 8.3    | Assessing contemporary practice  | 214 |
| 8.3.1  | Conceptual findings  | 215 |
| 8.3.2  | Some practical problems  | 216 |
| 9      | Foreign investment and the international regulation of dangerous substances and activities | 222 |
| 9.1    | The regulation of dangerous substances and activities – an analysis of collision points    | 222 |
| 9.1.1  | Overview   | 222 |
| 9.1.2  | The regulatory approach  | 225 |
| 9.1.3  | The human rights approach  | 229 |
| 9.2    | Decisions from adjudicatory and quasi-adjudicatory bodies                                  | 231 |
| 9.2.1  | Overview   | 231 |
| 9.2.2  | Administrative permits   | 232 |
| 9.2.3  | Safety standards   | 236 |
| 9.2.4  | Restriction of movement  | 239 |
| 9.2.5  | Protection of the rights of individuals and minorities                                     | 242 |
| 9.3    | Assessing contemporary practice  | 246 |
| 9.3.1  | Conceptual findings  | 246 |
| 9.3.2  | Some practical problems  | 247 |
| 10     | Foreign investment and the climate change regime   | 253 |
| 10.1   | Climate change policies – an analysis of collision points                                  | 253 |
| 10.1.1 | Overview   | 253 |
| 10.1.2 | The regulatory approach  | 254 |
| 10.1.3 | The human rights approach  | 258 |
| 10.2   | Decisions from adjudicatory and quasi-adjudicatory bodies                                  | 260 |
| 10.2.1 | Overview   | 260 |
| 10.2.2 | Cap-and-trade systems  | 261 |
| 10.2.3 | Command-and-control regulation   | 265 |

|  | CONTENTS | xi  |
|--|----------|-----|
| 10.2.4 Differentiation (subsidies and duties)                                  |          | 267 |
| 10.2.5 The use of a human rights approach                                      |          | 271 |
| 10.3 Assessing contemporary practice   |          | 273 |
| 10.3.1 Conceptual findings   |          | 273 |
| 10.3.2 Some practical problems   |          | 274 |
| <b>Part III Legitimacy conflicts</b>   |          |     |
| 11 Normative priority between different legal systems                          |          | 281 |
| 11.1 Legitimacy conflicts  |          | 281 |
| 11.2 Specific conflict norms   |          | 283 |
| 11.2.1 Types of specific conflict norms  |          | 283 |
| 11.2.2 Some illustrations  |          | 283 |
| 11.2.3 Effects   |          | 286 |
| 11.3 General conflict norms  |          | 287 |
| 11.3.1 Relations between domestic and international law                        |          | 287 |
| 11.3.2 Conflicts of (domestic) laws  |          | 290 |
| 11.3.3 Regulatory powers as general conflict norms                             |          | 291 |
| 12 Environmental measures and expropriation clauses                            |          | 293 |
| 12.1 Three strands of cases  |          | 294 |
| 12.2 Direct environmental expropriation  |          | 295 |
| 12.3 Targeted environmental measures   |          | 297 |
| 12.3.1 Targeted measures v. general regulation                                 |          | 297 |
| 12.3.2 Targeted environmental measures amounting to an expropriation           |          | 299 |
| 12.3.3 Targeted environmental measures not amounting to an expropriation       |          | 301 |
| 12.4 Regulatory environmental measures   |          | 305 |
| 12.4.1 Rule or exception?  |          | 305 |
| 12.4.2 Reasons why environmental regulation rarely amounts to an expropriation |          | 307 |
| 13 Environmental measures and non-discrimination standards                     |          | 316 |
| 13.1 Non-discrimination in foreign investment law                              |          | 317 |
| 13.1.1 Conceptual distinctions   |          | 317 |
| 13.1.2 The components of non-discrimination standards                          |          | 318 |

|        |   |     |
|--------|---|-----|
| xii    | CONTENTS  |     |
| 13.2   | Differentiation at various stages of the investment cycle               | 320 |
| 13.2.1 | Green investment protectionism  | 320 |
| 13.2.2 | Pre-establishment environmental differentiation                         | 322 |
| 13.3   | The concept of 'like circumstances' from an environmental perspective   | 324 |
| 13.3.1 | 'Like circumstances' in trade and investment                            | 324 |
| 13.3.2 | 'Like circumstances' and the relevance of environmental considerations  | 327 |
| 13.4   | The objective test of differential treatment                            | 330 |
| 13.5   | Justifying differential treatment of similar situations                 | 332 |
| 13.5.1 | Rule or exception?  | 332 |
| 13.5.2 | The relevance of purpose  | 333 |
| 13.5.3 | Justification clauses   | 333 |
| 13.5.4 | Other justifying factors  | 335 |
| 14     | Environmental measures, stability and due process                       | 337 |
| 14.1   | The protection of stability and environmental regulatory change         | 338 |
| 14.1.1 | The legal anatomy of stability commitments                              | 338 |
| 14.1.2 | Stabilising clauses and environmental regulation                        | 339 |
| 14.1.3 | Legitimate expectations under the FET standard                          | 350 |
| 14.2   | Environmental regulatory change and due process                         | 355 |
| 14.2.1 | The link between due process and environmental regulatory change        | 355 |
| 14.2.2 | Procedural fairness under FET clauses                                   | 357 |
| 14.2.3 | Denial of justice   | 363 |
| 15     | Defence arguments based on environmental considerations                 | 366 |
| 15.1   | The police powers doctrine  | 367 |
| 15.1.1 | Sources   | 367 |
| 15.1.2 | The use of the police powers doctrine to justify environmental measures | 369 |
| 15.1.3 | Specific assurances and environmental measures                          | 371 |
| 15.1.4 | Circumscribing the scope of specific assurances                         | 374 |

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00638-6 - Foreign Investment and the Environment in International Law

Jorge E. Viñuales

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

|        | CONTENTS   | xiii |
|--------|--|------|
| 15.2   | The margin of appreciation doctrine                          | 376  |
| 15.2.1 | Sources  | 376  |
| 15.2.2 | Applicability in the context of investment disputes          | 377  |
| 15.2.3 | Margin of appreciation and police powers                     | 379  |
| 15.3   | Emergency and necessity clauses                              | 381  |
| 15.3.1 | Sources  | 381  |
| 15.3.2 | Asserting the defence  | 383  |
| 15.3.3 | Environmental justifications between emergency and necessity | 384  |
| 15.3.4 | Effects  | 389  |
|        | <i>Concluding observations</i>                               | 391  |
|        | <i>Bibliography</i>  | 394  |
|        | <i>Index</i>   | 409  |