

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## CHINESE JUSTICE

This volume analyzes whether China's thirty years of legal reform have taken root in Chinese society by examining how ordinary citizens are using the legal system in contemporary China. It is an interdisciplinary look at law in action and at legal institutions from the bottom up – that is, beginning with those at the ground level who are using and working in the legal system. It explores the emergent Chinese conception of justice – one that seeks to balance Chinese tradition, socialist legacies, and the needs of the global market. Given the political dimension of dispute resolution in creating, settling, and changing social norms, this volume contributes to a greater understanding of political and social change in China today and of the process of legal reform generally.

Margaret Y. K. Woo is Professor of Law at Northeastern University School of Law and co-director of the law school's program on Human Rights in the Global Economy. She has written and spoken widely on U.S. procedural justice and the issue of Chinese legal reform. She was formerly a Fellow at the Bunting Institute of Radcliffe College and is a research associate with the Program on East Asian Legal Studies at Harvard Law School. Her publications include *Litigating in America* (2006) and *East Asian Law – Universal Norms and Local Cultures* (2003).

Mary E. Gallagher is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Michigan, where she is also the director of the Center for Chinese Studies. She is also a faculty associate at the Center for Comparative Political Studies at the Institute for Social Research. Gallagher is the author of *Contagious Capitalism: Globalization and the Politics of Labor in China* (2005) and the forthcoming *The Rule of Law in China: If They Build It, Who Will Come?*, which was funded by the Fulbright Association and the National Science Foundation.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# Chinese Justice

CIVIL DISPUTE RESOLUTION  
IN CONTEMPORARY CHINA

Edited by

**Margaret Y. K. Woo**

Northeastern University School of Law

**Mary E. Gallagher**

University of Michigan, Department of Political Science



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,  
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107006249](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107006249)

© Cambridge University Press 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Contemporary Chinese Justice : civil dispute resolution in China / [edited by] Margaret  
Y. K. Woo, Mary E. Gallagher.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-00624-9 (hardback)

1. Justice, Administration of – China. 2. Dispute resolution (Law) – China. 3. Civil  
procedure – China. 4. Law reform – China. I. Woo, Margaret Y. K. II. Gallagher,  
Mary Elizabeth, 1969–

KNQ1572.C656 2011

347.51'09 – dc22 2010045090

ISBN 978-1-107-00624-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs  
for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not  
guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Contents

|  |                 |
|--|-----------------|
| <i>Tables and Figures</i>  | <i>page</i> vii |
| <i>Contributors</i>  | xi              |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>   | xiii            |
| <i>Abbreviations</i>   | xv              |
| <i>Glossary</i>  | xvii            |
| Introduction   | I               |
| <i>Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher</i>  |                 |
| PART I: LEGAL DEVELOPMENT AND INSTITUTIONAL TENSIONS   |                 |
| 1 From Mediatorial to Adjudicatory Justice: The Limits of<br>Civil Justice Reform in China               | 25              |
| <i>Fu Hualing and Richard Cullen</i>   |                 |
| 2 Judicial Disciplinary Systems for Incorrectly Decided<br>Cases: The Imperial Chinese Heritage Lives On | 58              |
| <i>Carl Minzner</i>  |                 |
| 3 Legalizing the Local State: Administrative “Legality”<br>at China’s Grassroots                         | 91              |
| <i>Douglas B. Grob</i>   |                 |
| 4 Economic Development and the Development of the Legal<br>Profession in China                           | 114             |
| <i>Randall Peerenboom</i>  |                 |

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

*Contents*PART II: *PU FA* AND THE DISSEMINATION OF LAW  
IN THE CHINESE CONTEXT

- 5 The Impact of Nationalist and Maoist Legacies  
on Popular Trust in Legal Institutions 139  
*Pierre F. Landry*
- 6 Public Attitudes toward Official Justice in Beijing  
and Rural China 169  
*Ethan Michelson and Benjamin L. Read*
- 7 Users and Non-Users: Legal Experience and Its Effect  
on Legal Consciousness 204  
*Mary E. Gallagher and Yuhua Wang*
- 8 With or without the Law: The Changing Meaning  
of Ordinary Legal Work in China, 1979–2003 234  
*Sida Liu*

## PART III: LAW FROM THE BOTTOM UP

- 9 A Populist Threat to China's Courts? 269  
*Benjamin L. Liebman*
- 10 Dispute Resolution and China's Grassroots Legal Services 314  
*Fu Yulin*
- 11 The Constitution in the Courtroom: Constitutional  
Development and Civil Litigation in China 340  
*Thomas E. Kellogg*
- Conclusion: Chinese Justice from the Bottom Up 380  
*Margaret Y. K. Woo*
- Index* 403

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Tables and Figures

### TABLES

|      |  |                |
|------|--|----------------|
| 1.1  | When, Where, and How Shenzhen Judges Conducted Mediation   | <i>page</i> 35 |
| 5.1  | Multilevel Variance of Trust in Legal Institutions   | 153            |
| 5.2  | Summary of the Evolution of Legal Institutions in 87 ILRC Counties   | 156            |
| 5.3  | Ordered Probit Model of Trust in Legal Institutions  | 166            |
| 6.1  | Experience-Based Assessments of Official Justice, Chicago (1984), Beijing (2001), and Rural China (2002)   | 179            |
| 6.2  | Overlap between Experience-Based Assessments of Official Justice Outcomes and Procedures, Chicago (1984), Beijing (2001), and Rural China (2002) | 180            |
| 6.3  | Prevalence of Direct Experience with Official Justice, Chicago (1984), Beijing (2001), and Rural China (2002)                                    | 190            |
| A6.1 | Perceptions of the Courts  | 198            |
| A6.2 | Perceptions of the Police  | 201            |
| 7.1  | Judgment of a Vignette: Work-Unit Actions Legal or Not   | 215            |
| 7.2  | Reasons Provided for Saying Illegal  | 216            |
| 7.3  | If You Were Mr. Chen, What Would You Do?   | 217            |
| 7.4  | Use Mediation?   | 218            |
| 7.5  | Use Administrative Methods?  | 218            |
| 7.6  | Use Arbitration?   | 219            |
| 7.7  | Use Litigation?  | 219            |
| 7.8  | Which Method Would You Use First?  | 219            |
| 7.9  | Which Method Is Most Effective?  | 220            |
| 7.10 | Political Identity and Mobilization  | 225            |

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

*Tables and Figures*

|     |   |     |
|-----|---|-----|
| 8.1 | Distribution of Case Types (Percentage), DALSLegal-Advice Column, 1979–2003 | 244 |
| 8.2 | Statutes Cited More than Ten Times in the DALSColumn, 1979–2003             | 247 |

## FIGURES

|     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 1.1 | Percentage of Civil Cases Concluded by Mediation (1956–2006)   | 43  |
| 5.1 | Distribution of KMT Membership by Province, 1937   | 143 |
| 5.2 | Scatterplots of Trust in Legal Institutions, Aggregated by County (1–4 scale)  | 152 |
| 5.3 | Comparison of Random Effects at the Province and County Levels   | 155 |
| 5.4 | Respondents' Exposure to Their County of Residence   | 160 |
| 5.5 | Mentions of Legal Institutions in the <i>People's Daily</i> (1946–2006)  | 162 |
| 6.1 | General Perceptions of Official Justice, Chicago (1984), Beijing (2001), and Rural China (2002)  | 176 |
| 6.2 | General Perceptions of the Performance of Courts and Police by Economic Development, Beijing (2001) and Rural China (2002)                 | 177 |
| 6.3 | Experience-Based Assessments by Competing Sources of Help, Beijing (2001) and Rural China (2002)   | 182 |
| 6.4 | Incidence of Negative Experience-Based Assessments of Court Performance by Locality, Beijing (2001) and Rural China (2002)                 | 183 |
| 6.5 | General Perceptions of Courts, by Personal Experience, Chicago (1984), Beijing (2001), and Rural China (2002)                              | 185 |
| 6.6 | General Perceptions of Police by Personal Experience, Chicago (1984), Beijing (2001), and Rural China (2002)                               | 186 |
| 6.7 | General Perceptions of Official Justice, by Personal Experience, Disaggregated by Evaluations of Personal Experience, Chicago (1984)       | 186 |
| 6.8 | General Perceptions of Courts by Personal Experience, Disaggregated by Experience-Based Assessments, Beijing (2001) and Rural China (2002) | 187 |
| 6.9 | General Perceptions of Police by Personal Experience, Disaggregated by Experience-Based Assessments, Beijing (2001) and Rural China (2002) | 188 |

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Tables and Figures*

ix

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| 6.10 | Incidence of Escalating Grievances to Lawyers and Courts, by Locality, Beijing (2001) and Rural China (2002) | 191 |
| 7.1  | Dispute “Pyramid”  | 208 |
| 8.1  | Changes in the Average Number of Cases per Issue, 1979–2003  | 242 |
| 8.2  | Average Number of Statutes Cited per Year, 1979–2003   | 246 |



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Contributors

### *Editors*

**Margaret Y. K. Woo** Professor of Law, School of Law, Northeastern University

**Mary E. Gallagher** Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, University of Michigan

### *Contributors*

**Richard Cullen** Visiting Professor, Department of Law, University of Hong Kong

**Fu Hualing** Associate Professor and Head, Department of Law, University of Hong Kong

**Fu Yulin** Associate Professor of Civil Procedure and Legal Practice, School of Law, Peking University

**Douglas B. Grob** Assistant Professor, Department of Government and Politics, University of Maryland

**Thomas E. Kellogg** Program Officer and Advisor to the President, Open Society Institute

**Pierre F. Landry** Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, Yale University

**Benjamin L. Liebman** Professor of Law and Director, Center for Chinese Legal Studies, Columbia Law School

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

xii

*Contributors*

**Sida Liu** Assistant Professor of Law and Sociology, Department of Sociology, University of Wisconsin

**Ethan Michelson** Associate Professor, Department of Sociology and Department of East Asian Languages and Cultures and Associate Professor of Sociology and Law, Maurer School of Law, Indiana University Bloomington

**Carl Minzner** Associate Professor of Law, Washington University in St. Louis School of Law

**Randall Peerenboom** Associate Fellow, Oxford University Centre for Socio-Legal Studies; Director, Oxford Foundation for Law, Justice and Society China Rule of Law Programme; and Professor of Law, La Trobe University, Melbourne

**Benjamin L. Read** Assistant Professor, Politics Department, University of California, Santa Cruz

**Yuhua Wang** Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, University of Pennsylvania

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Acknowledgments

This book is the result of a workshop generously funded by the Chiang Ching Kuo Foundation for International Scholarly Exchange and the Center for Chinese Studies at the University of Michigan. We also benefited tremendously from the wise counsel and encouragement of Merle Goldman. Professor Goldman has been an unfailing intellectual force behind the efforts of many young and women scholars, and we are truly grateful to have such a path breaker at the Fairbank Center at Harvard. Similarly, we would like to thank Professor William Alford and the Program for East Asian Legal Studies of Harvard Law School for their financial support. Under the directorship of Professor Alford, the Program on East Asian Legal Studies has been an active intellectual base for Asian scholars here and abroad. Additionally, we would like to thank Professor Elizabeth Perry and the Lam Fund, whose enthusiasm and generosity made the workshop possible. Of course, the workshop discussion greatly benefited from all those who participated as well as from the thoughtful comments by discussants Cai Yanmin, Donald Clarke, Jerome Cohen, Sally Merry, Frank Upham, and Robert Weller. Nancy Hearst provided excellent editorial expertise, as usual. Finally, we would like to acknowledge the institutional support of the Fairbank Center for Chinese Research, Harvard University, who graciously hosted the workshop.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Abbreviations

|      |   |
|------|---|
| ALL  | Administrative Litigation Law                           |
| ARL  | Administrative Reconsideration Law                      |
| ARR  | Administrative Reconsideration Regulation               |
| BPC  | basic people's court                                    |
| CASS | Chinese Academy of Social Sciences                      |
| CCP  | Chinese Communist Party                                 |
| DALS | <i>Democracy and the Legal System (Minzhu yu fazhi)</i> |
| FZB  | legal affairs office ( <i>fazhi bangongshi</i> )        |
| HLM  | hierarchical linear modeling                            |
| HPC  | higher people's court                                   |
| ICS  | individual case supervision                             |
| ILCR | Institutionalization of Legal Reforms                   |
| IPC  | intermediate people's court                             |
| KMT  | Guomindang (Kuomintang)                                 |
| LAO  | legislative affairs office                              |
| LPC  | local people's congress                                 |
| MoJ  | Ministry of Justice                                     |
| NPC  | National People's Congress                              |
| PLC  | Political-Legal Committee                               |
| PRC  | People's Republic of China                              |
| PSB  | Public Security Bureau                                  |
| PSU  | primary sampling unit                                   |
| SFT  | local justice department ( <i>sifa ting</i> )           |
| SOE  | state-owned enterprise                                  |
| SPC  | Supreme People's Court                                  |
| SPP  | Supreme People's Procuratorate                          |

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Glossary

*bangong bumen*

办公厅

operational department of government

*baogao qingkuang*

报告情况

reporting

*bei'an (review)*

备案

file the case record (for review)

*bijiao xinren*

比较信任

somewhat trust

*butai xinren*

不太信任

somewhat distrust

*chouxiang xingzheng xingwei*

抽象行政行为

abstract administrative acts

*dang de zuzhibu*

党的组织部

Party Organization Department

*dang zhengban*

党政办

party political office

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xviii

Glossary

*dang zhibu*

党支部

party branch

*diaocha yanjiu, tiaojie wei zhu, jiu di jiejie*

调查研究, 调解为主, 就地解决

investigate and research, taking mediation as the principal method, and solving disputes where they arise

*diaopan jiehe, anjie liaoshi*

调判结合, 案结了事

combine adjudication and mediation; resolve the dispute and conclude the litigation

*difang zhengfu*

地方政府

local government

*diji chengshi*

地级城市

prefectural level city

*fazhi bangongshi or fazhiban*

法制办公室 or 法制办

legal affairs office

*fazhichu*

法制处

legal affairs section

*fazhiyuan*

法制员

legal affairs officer

*feichang xinren*

非常信任

trust a great deal

*feinongye hukou*

非农业户口

urban registration

*fugaimiande*

覆盖面的

overlay

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Glossary

xix

*fu xianzhang*

副县长

deputy county head

*fuyi keyi jiejie xinfang de bu fangbian*

复议可以解决信访的不方便

reconsideration can solve many of the inconveniences of *xinfang*  
(petition)*gaodeng fayuan*

高等法院

high court

*gaodeng fayuan fenyuan*

高等法院分院

divisional courts of high court

*gongan sifa*

公安司法

public security and justice

*gongshang*

工商

Industry and Commerce (Bureau)

*guizhang*

规章

administrative rules

*guoshui and dishui*

国税 and 地税

national and real estate tax

*hai you kongbaidian*

还有空白点

bare patches

*he li*

合理

be reasonable (a rule)

*jiandu*

监督

supervise, inspect, review

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xx

Glossary

*jiaoda de shi*

较大的市

large cities

*jiguan*

籍贯

native place

*jingji hetong zhongcai weiyuanhui*

经济合同仲裁委员会

economic contract arbitration committees

*jishu jiandu*

技术监督

Technical Supervision (Bureau)

*nengdiao zediao, dangpan zepan, diaopan jiehe, anjie liaoshi*

能調則調, 當判則判, 調判結合, 案結了事

mediate cases that can be mediated, adjudicate cases that should be adjudicated, combine mediation with adjudication to resolve the dispute and conclude the litigation

*paichu*

派出

sent out (an individual)

*pu fa*

普法

(legal) awareness

*renda fagui chu*

人大法規處

legislative affairs office of the people's congress

*shefa*

涉法

law related

*shizhang or xianzhang*

市长 or 县长

head (of a city or a county)



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Glossary

xxi

*shuofa*

说法

an explanation

*sifa bu*

司法部

Ministry of Justice

*sifa jiguan*

司法机关

legal organs

*sifasuo*

司法所

local justice office

*sifa ting*

司法厅

local justice departments

*sifa weimin*

司法为民

legality serving the people

*wanquan buxinren*

完全不信任

completely distrust

*xian*

县

county

*xianshi gongzheng*

显失公正

manifest lack of fairness

*xianzhi*

县志

County gazetteer

*xinfang*

信访

petition

*xingzheng fuyi*

行政复议

administrative reconsideration

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xxii

Glossary

*xingzheng fuyi fa*

行政复议法

Administrative Reconsideration Law

*xingzheng fuyi weiyuanhui*

行政复议委员会

Administrative Reconsideration Committee

*xingzheng shenpan ting*

行政审判庭

administrative trial court

*yantaohui*

研讨会

seminar/discussion group

*yifa banshi*

依法办事

do things according to law

*yifa xingzheng*

依法行政

administrate according to law

*yikao qunzhong, diaocha yanjiu, jiaojie weizhu, jiudi jieju*

依靠群众, 调查研究, 调解为主, 就地解决

rely on the masses, investigate and research, take mediation as the principal method, solve disputes where they arise

*yizhi*

一致

consistency

*you fazhi yishi de guanyuan*

有法制意识的官员

those officials with a sense of acting according to the law

*zhengfa wei*

政法委

Political and Legal Affairs Committee (of the CCP)

*zhengfazu*

政法组

political and legal committee

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00624-9 - Chinese Justice: Civil Dispute Resolution in Contemporary China

Edited by Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*Glossary*

xxiii

*zhengfu bangong huiyi*

政府办公会议

government working conference

*zhengfu changwei hui [fu]huizhang*

政府常委会(副)会长

chairman (or vice chairman) of the standing committee of the government

*zhengfu xinxi gongkai*

政府信息公开

open government information

*zhineng bumen*

职能部门

administrative department

*zhuren*

主任

head (of the local FZB)