

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xvii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xix
<i>Preface</i>	xxi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxv
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xxix
<i>Glossary</i>	xxxii
1 Introduction	1
Who Shall Govern the Family? Outlining Two Approaches	5
Research Questions	9
Case Selection	9
A General Outline of the Developments in the Indian Case	11
The Study in the Indian Context	24
The Context of Inquiry	25
Research Site	29
Methods	29
Feminist Deliberations	31
Sampling in State Courts	32
Data Collection in State Courts	34
Sampling and Data Collection in Informal Courts	35
Organization of the Book	37

2. The Shared Adjudication Model: Theoretical Framework and Arguments	41
Introduction	41
Theoretical Framework: State-Society Interactions at the Interface of Personal Laws	42
Arguments	49
The Indian Model: Juristic Diversity in the Legal Landscape	50
<i>Formal Legal Organizations and Actors: The Lower Courts</i>	51
<i>Legal Organizations and Actors in Society: An Overview of Typologies, Structures, and Functions</i>	52
<i>Formal Organizations</i>	52
<i>The Doorstep Courts – Informal Associations, Groups, and Networks</i>	55
<i>Individual Legal Actors</i>	55
Interactions between State and Societal Organizations and Actors	56
<i>The Question of Legal and Extralegal Authority and Accountability</i>	56
An Open-Ended Conception of State-Society Relations among Heterogeneous Legal Actors	60
The Paradoxical Movement between State Laws and Societal Laws	60
<i>The Centralization of Law in the Formal Legal System</i>	61
<i>Fragmentation and Societalization of Law in State Courts</i>	63
<i>Centralization of Law in Informal Legal Forums</i>	64
<i>The Decentralization of Law in Society</i>	65
Characterizing the Legal Landscape: Legal Flexibility, Fragmentation, and Change	66
<i>Dispelling Myths about Contesting Areas in Hindu and Muslim Personal Laws: Not So Different After All?</i>	66
Balancing Cultural Accommodation and Gender Justice	68
<i>Normative Heterogeneity and Cultural Accommodation: Making and Unmaking Religious Communities, the Conjugal Family, and Gender</i>	69

CONTENTS

xi

<i>Preventing the Ossification of the Boundaries of Religious Groups</i>	69
<i>Accommodating Intragroup Difference and Facilitating Intersocietal Dialog</i>	70
<i>Making and Unmaking the Conjugal Family</i>	72
Hindu and Muslim Personal Laws and the Question of Gender Equality	74
Conceiving Agency and Its Limit	78
<i>The Agency of Litigant Women</i>	78
<i>Individual Women's Agency: Forum Switching and Gender Justice</i>	79
<i>Structural Change through Individual Agency: Hindu and Muslim Women Litigants and Changes in Personal Laws</i>	80
<i>Envisaging Legal Change through Collective Socio-Legal Processes</i>	82
<i>Women's Transformative Collective Agency in Contouring the Socio-Legal Processes in Society</i>	83
<i>Women's Transformative Collective Agency: Everyday Processes of Adjudication and Visions of Change</i>	85
The Question of Gender Equality in the Shared Adjudication Model	88
Conclusion	89
3. State Law and the Adjudication Process: Marriage, Divorce, and the Conjugal Family in Hindu and Muslim Personal Laws	91
Introduction	91
The Functioning of the Family Court	92
<i>An Overview of Cases Filed in the Family Court</i>	95
The Disposal of Cases in the Family Court	97
The Nature of Justice in the Family Court: Consensual Rather than Adversarial?	100
Adjudication in Hindu and Muslim Personal Laws	104
Determining "Marriage" – Outlining Boundaries of the Community, Protecting Individual Rights	104

<i>Void and Voidable Marriages: Streamlining Family Laws and Protecting Individual Rights</i>	109
The Provision of Restitution of Conjugal Rights and the Standardization of Hindu and Muslim Personal Laws	114
The Regulation of Polygyny under Hindu and Muslim Personal Laws	116
Divorce in Hindu and Muslim Personal Laws	120
Divorce under Muslim Personal Law: The Debate over Triple Talaq	131
Divorce under Muslim Personal Law: Issues in Statutory Divorce	137
Women and Property in Marriage and Divorce Laws	139
<i>Legal Provisions Applicable to Hindu and Muslim Women under State Laws</i>	139
<i>Maintenance and Alimony under Hindu Personal Law</i>	141
<i>Muslim Women's (Protection of Rights on Divorce) Act 1986</i>	145
<i>Maintenance under Section 125 CrPC</i>	151
<i>Implementation of Maintenance Orders</i>	158
<i>Injunction for Property</i>	162
<i>Negotiating the Retrieval of Stridhan</i>	168
Conclusion	172
4. Making and Unmaking the Conjugal Family: The Administration of Hindu Law in Society	175
Introduction	175
Caste Formation and Lawmaking among Meghwals	177
<i>Migration to Mumbai and the Statist Construction of the "Caste"</i>	178
<i>Nationalist Movement, Naming the Community, and Attempts at Lawmaking</i>	181
<i>Exposure to Democratic Politics, Creating Structures of Governance, Constructing Identity through Laws</i>	184
<i>Democratizing Panchayats, Civic Awareness, and Law Reforms: From the Panch System to the Panchayat</i>	187

CONTENTS

xiii

<i>Attempts at Repoliticization and the Conflict over Caste Constitution</i>	189
<i>The Decade of the 1990s: Consolidating the Caste Identity, Social Regulation, and Lawmaking</i>	192
Summary of the Constitutional Provisions: Commonalities, Continuities, and Discontinuities	195
The Gendered Sphere among the Meghwals	198
Innovative Legal Process: Democratic Participatory Justice	200
<i>Structure and Organization of the Meghwal Caste Panchayat</i>	202
<i>Process of Adjudication in the Meghwal Caste Panchayat and the Provision for Appeal</i>	202
Similarities, Dissimilarities, and Hybridity in State Law and Nonstate Law	203
<i>Who Is a Hindu, Who Is a Meghwal?</i>	203
<i>Consent</i>	205
<i>Differing Conceptions of Marriage and Divorce: Marriage as Fixed or Fluid?</i>	209
<i>Validity of Marriage</i>	211
<i>Procedural Aspects of Defining Valid Marriages</i>	212
<i>Divorce in Caste Laws</i>	213
<i>Economic Rights within Marriage and upon Divorce</i>	216
Interactions between Diverse Societal Organizations and Actors	218
<i>Contestations among Informal Legal Actors</i>	218
<i>Women's Organizations as Informal Forums of Justice: Implementing State Law without Litigation</i>	220
<i>Women's Organization as Moral Watchdogs: Women's Organizations and Caste Authorities</i>	221
<i>Bargaining for Women's Rights vis-à-vis the State and the Caste</i>	222
The Caste Panchayat among the Sai Suthars	224
<i>Internal Governance of Family Matters among the Sai Suthars</i>	224

<i>The Gendered Sphere among the Sai Suthars</i>	227
<i>Fragmented Caste Panchayat and the Adjudication of the Family within the Caste</i>	229
<i>The Caste Is the Public Sphere and the State Private</i>	231
<i>In the Shadow of State Law and Courts</i>	232
<i>Justice through “Other Means”</i>	232
<i>Women’s Experiences in State Courts</i>	233
<i>Dual Patriarchies of the Family and the State</i>	234
Struggles for Legal Autonomy in Family Matters among the Kutchi Visa Oswals (KVOs)	237
<i>The KVOs and the History of Migration to Mumbai</i>	238
<i>Forming a Panchayat</i>	239
<i>Family, Capital, and Religio-Cultural Organization</i>	242
<i>Gendered Sphere within the Caste</i>	244
<i>Protecting the Good Woman: Denial of Divorce in the Family Court</i>	245
<i>Rubber-Stamping Informal Settlements</i>	247
<i>Social Movement around Marriage and Divorce – Reaction to State-Led Reforms</i>	251
State-Society Encounters in Law: Comparison of Caste-Based Legal Forums	252
Other Societal Legal Bodies: Women’s Organizations	254
Legal Actors in Society: Notaries, Lawyers, Middlemen	259
Leveraging Authority: Strongmen and Political Parties in the Adjudication of Hindu Law in Society	261
Conclusion	265
5. Juristic Diversity, Contestations over “Islamic Law,” and Women’s Rights: Regulation of Matrimonial Matters in Muslim Personal Law	267
Introduction	267
The Nature of Muslim Personal Law and the Classification of Legal Actors and Institutions in Societal Arena	268
<i>Individual Legal Actors and “Private” Divorce</i>	269

CONTENTS

xv

<i>Interlawyer Negotiations</i>	273
<i>The Clergy</i>	274
<i>Strongmen</i>	276
Organized Legal Bodies, Doorstep Courts, and Processes of Adjudication	278
<i>The Administration of Muslim Personal Law in the Dar ul Qaza</i>	278
<i>Residential Committees</i>	281
<i>Civil Society and the Administration of Muslim Personal Law</i>	284
<i>The Doorstep Courts</i>	290
<i>Dispute Resolution among Organized Sects: The Khojas Sociopolitical Changes in the Community between the 1950s and the 1990s</i>	292
<i>Family Laws among the Ithana Ashari Khojas</i>	296
<i>Interaction with Other Forums</i>	298
The Question of Representation: Who Represents the Community?	300
Divergent Opinions on the Establishment of Religious “Courts”	302
Conflict and Convergence between Statutory Muslim Personal Law and Societal Laws	303
Agency and Its Constraints: Muslim Women’s Rights in the Legally Plural Sphere	312
The Campaign around <i>Nikahnama</i> : Reforms from Within	316
Competing Ideologies and Interests among Socio-Legal Actors and Institutions	320
Conclusion	323
6. Conclusion	325
What Factors Would Bring About a Change in This Model?	333
The Shared Adjudication Model Compared to Other Proposals for Accommodating Communities and Ensuring Gender Equality	335

xvi**CONTENTS**

Discussing Law Reform in Personal Laws	343
Conclusion	346
<i>Appendix</i>	349
<i>Bibliography</i>	351
<i>Index</i>	387