A and others (ECHR), 340 A v Australia (UNHCR), 161-2, 163, 165, 333, 336 A v Secretary of State for Home Department (Belmarsh decision, UK), 222-31, 248, 253, 312, 327, 332, 342 ACLU (American Civil Liberties Union), 236 Act to Regulate Immigration 1882 (US), 11–13 Agamben, G., 300-1 Ahsan and others, R v Governor of Brixton Prison, ex parte (UK), 82, 83, 84 airport detentions, 146-8, 289 Akrich (ECJ), 201 Al Kateb v Godwin (Australia), 104-7, 324, 341, 343 Alexseev, M. A., 274 Algerian Wars, French detentions during, 108, 109 Aliens Act 1793 (UK), 36, 39 Alien Act 1798 (US), 3-4, 29 Aliens Act 1905 (UK), 36-43 aliens power Australia, constitutionality of aliens power in, 98, 100, 103, 105 - 6concept of, xi, xiv ECHR, detention viewed as ancillary to aliens power in, 140-1 French Constitution, status of aliens power under, 108 historical establishment of, 6-8, 57

modern flowering of illiberal potential of, 57 permanent emergency power, as, 207-8, 209-12 state sovereignty and, 224 war power, as extension of, 57, 209, 266-9 Aliens Restriction Act 1914 (UK), 45 alternatives to detention, 337-8 America. See United States American Civil Liberties Union (ACLU), 236 Amuur v France (ECHR), 147-8 anarchists, historical fears regarding, 36, 207 Angel Island, 19 anti-terrorism. See terrorism and immigration detention Anti-terrorism and Effective Death Penalty Act 1996 (US), 212 Anti-terrorism Crime and Security Act 2001 (ACSA; UK). See under terrorism and indefinite detention arbitrary power, immigration detention as residue of, xix-xx Arenc, French detention centre at, 109, 111 Arendt, Hannah, 301, 303 Asian boat people Australia, in. See under Australia Hong Kong, Vietnamese boat people in, 143, 158, 159 asylum seekers. See refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons

377

Australia, 98-107, 116 Asian boat peoples crisis, 98-9 ICCPR, UNHCR challenges to detention policies under, 158, 161 - 3indefinite detention of, 101-3 Nauru and Maunus, detention centres on, 103 non-punitive nature of detention of, 100–1, 103 bonding bail, and parole, removal of option of, 100 constitutionality of aliens power in, 98, 100, 103, 105-6 detention centres, poor conditions and unrest at, 283-5 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, rejection of, 105, 107 extra-territorial jurisdiction over aliens in, 38 goal of immigration detention as end in itself in, 334 habeas corpus tradition in, 99, 107 legislative origins of mandatory detention in, 325 non-white alien workers, historical restrictions on, 38, 98 political expediency, abandonment of individual liberty to, 314 proportionality in, 333 remoteness, effects of, 98 segregation of aliens, Al Kateb decision regarding, 104-7 UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, criticism of, 164 vulnerable groups, detention of, 294, 295 authorized aliens concept of, xii in EU, 182–5 Refugee Convention on lawfully versus unlawfully present refugees, 128-9, 138 Azam v Secretary of State (UK), 83

Baban v Australia (UNHCR), 162 bail, bond, or parole. *See* bonding, bail, and parole

## INDEX

- Bakhtiyari v Australia (UNHCR), 294
- Baumbast (ECJ), 177
- Beatty, David, 331–2 Bechta case (France), 113
- Polyageah desision (A y Sa
- *Belmarsh* decision (*A v Secretary of State for Home Department*), UK, 222–31, 248, 253, 312, 327, 332, 342
- Benhabib, S., 303, 317
- 'blame' testing of detention cases by ECHR, 141–6, 153–5, 156, 157 boat people
- Australia, in. *See under* Australia Cuban and Haitian flotillas arriving in US, mandatory detention for, 67–9, 77, 132, 240–2, 250, 273, 281
- Hong Kong, Vietnamese boat people in, 143, 158, 159
- bonding, bail and parole, xxi as alternatives to detention, 337–8 Australia, boat people crisis and, 100 Cold War detention and denial of, 62, 63
  - Cuban and Haitian flotillas arriving in US, adoption of mandatory detention for, 67–9
  - historical US practice of, 14, 17–18, 32
  - Immigration Act 1952 (US), range of alternatives under, 64–5
  - 9/11, refusal of bail to immigrants jailed in US after, 234
  - right to seek bail and routine bail hearings in UK, 88, 91
  - Russian Revolution, potential anarchists detained in wake of, 31
- WW One, during, 32

border controls

- EU common code on border movements, 184
- foreign relations power, as aspect of, 310
- fundamental rights, without sacrifice of, 303–7
- goal of immigration detention, as, 334

historical development of, 1, 6-8 state sovereignty encouraging, 258 Bosniak, L., 350 Boumediene (US Supreme Court), 246-9 Britain. See United Kingdom Buchanan, A., 259 bureaucratic process, immigration detention as, xiii-xiv, xix-xx, 57,79 Burlingame Treaty, 20, 119 C v Australia (UNHCR), 162, 165, 166, 296, 336 Cain, Attorney General for Canada v (UK), 38 Cambodian boat people in Australia. See under Australia Canada, historical restrictions on non-white alien workers in, 38 Caprino v United Kingdom (ECHR), 142, 150, 176 Carens, J., 260 Carlson v Landon (US Supreme Court), 62-3 Carpenter (ECJ), 201 Casati (ECJ), 177 Castles, S., 269 CEDAW (Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of **Discrimination Against** Women), 167 centres for detention. See detention centres Cesarani, D., 45 Chae Chan Ping v United States (US Supreme Court), 24, 120 Chahal (ECHR), xvi, 144, 148-50, 156, 198, 214, 219, 320 children, detention of, 290-6 Chinese migrant labourers to US, 18-29, 119 Churchill, Winston, 39, 43 civil unrest in detention centres, 279-87 Claghorn, K. H., 31 Clark v Martinez (US Supreme Court),

77–9, 154, 326

## 379

Clinton, William Jefferson, 241 Cold War Communists, US detention of, 59-64,207 Refugee Convention and, 127 Refugee Convention (1951) and, 298 refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons during, 125 Cole, D., 239, 341 Commonwealth citizens, UK immigration controls aimed at, 79,80-5 Communist subversion, US detentions due to fear of, 59-64, 207 communities of character, 264 Constitution, Australian, aliens power under, 98, 100, 103, 105-6 Constitution, French equal liberty of aliens and citizens ensured under, 110-12 extension of detention period and, 114-15 international transit zones, extra-legal detention in, 112 status of aliens power under, 108 Constitution, US Mariel boat peoples' right to parole consideration, 68 unadmitted aliens viewed as beyond constitutional protection, 60-2, 77 constitutional right to liberty in Britain, 91 in EU, 195, 197-201 judicial review and, 326 unauthorized persons generally, of, 313 constitutional status of aliens, lack of clarity regarding, 323-4 constitutional traditions, immigration detention in conflict with, xii, xiii-xiv Contract Labour Act of 1885 (US), 13 control order regime in UK replacing indefinite detention of suspected terrorists, 231-3 Convention Against Torture, 167

Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), 167 Convention on the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War (1949), 127 Convention on the Rights of Migrant Workers, 122 Convention on the Rights of Migrants Workers and their Families, 123 Convention on the Rights of the Child, 167, 291, 292–3, 294, 295 Council of Europe anti-terrorism and non-discrimination standards, 224 detention, interpretation of rules regarding, 187-9, 191 duration of detention, on, 194 ECHR. See European Convention on/Commission/Court of Human Rights on interpretation of rules regarding detention, 187-9, 191 counter-terrorism. See terrorism and immigration detention courts. See judicial review, and specific international courts CPT (European Committee on the Prevention of Torture), 145, 287 crime and criminals administrative detention, criminal sanctions as alternative to, 349 - 50EU citizens, detention within EU, 175-8 failure to comply with removal process, US criminalization of, 65 - 7French due process requirements, immigrants, association of moral panic with, 207 legal status of detainees approximating, xvii nationality, criminal law applicable without regard to, 210 political visibility of criminal

immigrants, 277

## INDEX

proportionality in treatment of, 340-2 security concerns as political tool, 271-2 UK foreign prisoners emergency, 95 - 7UN on criminalization of unauthorized aliens, 167-8 undesirable aliens, early detention of, x–xi Cuban American Bar Association and others v Christopher (US), 241 Cuban and Haitian flotillas arriving in US, mandatory detention for, 67-9, 77, 132, 240-2, 250, 273, 281 D and E v Australia (UNHCR), 163 damages for detention of suspected terrorists after 9/11 in US, 236 for mistaken detention of EU citizens, 179 for unlawful imprisonment in UK, 93, 94-5 Danyal Safiq v Australia (UNHCR), 163 Dauvergne, C., 253, 318 defence powers applied to enemy aliens in wartime, 210 Demore v Kim (US Supreme Court), 75-7, 327 deportation continuing link between detention and, 6, 28 EU citizens requiring social assistance, of, 178 EU Returns Directive, 185, 190-7 non-compliance with. See non-compliance with removal process possibility of, detention as conditional upon, 194 security-based detention divorced from, 208 torture, aliens at risk of, 214, 317 detention as means of immigration control. See immigration detention

detention centres conditions at, 278-9, 282-3, 285-7, 288-90 extra-legal spaces, as. See extra-legal spaces, detention centres as unrest in, 279-87 Dicey, A. V., 37 Dublin Convention (1990), 189 due diligence test, ECHR, 141-6, 152-4, 156, 230 due process British proposals around time of French Revolution to restrict alien entry without, 5 equal right to liberty and access to, 342-3 French requirements for arrest and detention of immigrants, ICCPR requirements, 319-20 in United States Alien Act 1798, 4 Cold War concerns about Communist aliens, 62 Demore v Kim on, 76 Dummett, A., 36 duration of immigration detention. See also indefinite detention EU member states, in, 191 EU Returns Directive, under, 193–6 fair balance between community and individual interests, striking, 338-40 in United States Chinese immigrant labourers, 21 - 3East Coast, limited duration of historical detentions on, 15-17 Immigration Act 1952, time limits imposed by, 65 unauthorized aliens under mandatory detention, 70 Dworkin, R., 248, 253, 323, 328 Dyzenhaus, D., 315, 322, 329, 348 ECHR. See European Convention on/Commission/Court of Human Rights

ECJ. See European Court of Justice

### INDEX

381

economic migration EU citizens within EU, of, 174-9 free movement, liberal principle of, ix-x, 1, 257 legal aliens, concept of, xii migrant workers, defined, 122 modern international trade liberalization mostly not applicable to, xiv post-WW Two encouragement of, 57, 58, 121 Refugee Convention delegates on, 129 restrictions from 1970s, 121 Russian Revolution, immigration fears related to, 30-1 unauthorized aliens and, xi Elias, A., 40 Ellis Island, 15, 16, 30, 36, 60, 64 emergency powers, xvii, 207-8, 209-12, 347-8 enemy aliens. See war and immigration detention England. See United Kingdom 'entry fiction,' in US Immigration Act 1891, 13 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, 124 Australian rejection of, 105, 107 border control administration without sacrifice of, 303-7 disabilities imposable upon unauthorized persons, 350 due process rights for all deprivations of liberty, 342-3 ECHR on, 149-55, 319 EU, in, 195, 197-201 France, in, 110-12 human right, as, 123 ICCPR, under, 319 other fundamental rights apart from those relating to detention, 253 'prison with three walls' argument, 112-13, 146-8, 155, 227 proportionality in treatment of genuinely dangerous detainees and, 340-2

security-based detention and denial of, 208–9, 252–5

#### INDEX

equal liberty for aliens (cont.) terrorist threat, indefinite detention for purposes of, 252-5 UK, in, 222, 224-6, 228 US, in, 243, 246-9 UK assertion of, 86-8, 222, 224-6, 228 EU. See European Union European Charter of Fundamental Rights, 198 European Commission asylum detention, interpretation of, 187-9 on duration of detention, 193 European Committee on the Prevention of Torture (CPT), 145, 287 European Convention on/Commission/Court of Human Rights (ECHR), 140-57, 319-20 ACSA (UK), indefinite detention of suspected terrorists under, 216-17, 218, 219, 220, 222, 230 - 1airport detentions, on, 146-8, 289 aliens power, detention viewed as ancillary to, 140-1 Belmarsh decision, confirmation of, 230 - 1'blame' testing, on, 141-6, 153-5, 156, 157 deportation, detention as conditional on possibility of, 194 due diligence test, 141-6, 152-4, 156, 230 emergency powers, Court on, 347 equal right to liberty, on, 149-55, 319 EU legislation's compliance with fundamental rights under, 197, 199 ICCPR compared to Convention, 158, 159 judicial review requirements, 331

necessity test, 148–50, 153, 155

on non-compliance with removal process, 153-5 Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation of 2002, 155 proportionality in, 332 purely administrative detention, restraints on, 150-6 torture, Convention forbidding of deportation of aliens at risk of, 214, 317 UK incorporation of Convention, 80 vulnerable groups, detention of, 292-3 European Court of Justice (ECJ) asylum seekers, case law on detention of, 186 on free movement rights of EU citizens, 176-8 principles of EU law evolved by, 171 proportionality in, 332 review of EU legislation for compliance with fundamental rights by, 197-201 rights of non-citizens, failure to address, 195 European Parliament on duration of detention, 193 on interpretation of rules regarding detention, 187-9, 191 Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation of 2002, 155 European Union (EU), 171–206 See also specific Member States free movement and non-detention of EU citizens, 172-3, 174-9, 317 Member State control of immigration and detention, loss of, 202-4 non-EU citizens, control over movement of, 173-4, 182 asylum seekers, 182, 185-9 authorized alien immigration left to Member States, 182-5 constitutional right to liberty, 195, 197-201 divergence between EU Member States as to detention practices, 187, 191

383

duration of detention, 193-6 evolution of supranational EU powers, 179-82 non-compliance with removal process, 193, 196, 350 rule of law, avoidance of, 196-7 security concerns as key feature of, 180, 181 unauthorized aliens, 182, 185, 190-3, 199-201 Schengen Treaty (1985) and system, 180 security concerns, 171, 172, 173 EU citizens, 174-9 non-EU citizens, 180, 181 unauthorized aliens, 185 social assistance, expulsion of EU citizens requiring, 178 state sovereignty and, 171, 172, 173 European Union (EU) Asylum Procedures Directive, 185, 187-9 European Union (EU) border agency, creation of, 203 European Union (EU) common code on border movements, 184 European Union (EU) Directive on Long-Term Residents, 183 European Union (EU) Directive on **Temporary Protection**, 183 European Union (EU) Family Reunification Directive, 183, 199 European Union (EU) Reception Conditions Directive, 185-7, 189, 196 European Union (EU) Returns Directive, 185, 190-7, 313, 333, 350 European Union (EU) Students Directive, 184 Ewing, K., 53 Executive Committee Conclusion 44, 134-6, 139, 148, 151, 188 executive versus legislative detention, judicial review of, 79, 325-6

expulsion. See deportation

extra-legal space, detention centres as, xviii-xix, 299-303. See also outsourcing/offshoring of detainees airport detentions, 146-8, 289 civil and criminal protections available to detainees, 301 disembarked detained passengers under UK Aliens Act 1905, 41 'entry fiction', US Immigration Act 1891, 13 French law on international transit zones, 112-13 judicial review, detention outside of, 302 'prisons with three walls', 112–13, 146 - 8security-based detentions, 209 extra-territorial jurisdiction, 302 Australia, in, 38 Cubans and Haitians detained at Guantanamo Bay, challenges to, 241 - 2facilities for detention. See detention centres Fallon, R. H., 249

Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI),

US, 233–6

Finnis, J., 228

Fletcher, G. P., 248

Fong Yue Ting v United States (US Supreme Court), 26

Ford Committee, 12

foreign relations power, immigration control viewed as aspect of, 310

France, 107–16, 117–18 aliens power, constitutional status of, 108

Article 120, internments under, 108–10

criminal due process requirements for arrest and detention of immigrants,

deportation targets, adoption of, 115

duration of detention, limits on, 191

# France (cont.) equal liberty for aliens and citizens, constitutional safeguards for, 110 - 12extension of constitutional detention period, 114-15 international transit zones, extra-legal detention in, 112 - 13number of unauthorized aliens, asylum seekers and detainees in, 115 police powers, immigration detention viewed as exercise of, 58,108 pre-legislative scrutiny of detention policy in, 108–10, 325 free movement EU citizens, of, 172-3, 174-9, 317 liberal tradition of, ix-x, 1, 257 French Revolution, immigration fears related to, 3, 5 Galloway, D., 264-6, 307, 322

Gearty, C., 53 Geary Act of 1892 (US), 26 Geneva Conventions, 210, 240 Germans during WW One and WW Two, UK and US detention of, 29, 45-8, 50, 211 Germany duration of detention, limits on, 191 UNCHR criticism of detention in West Germany, 133 Gibney, M. J., 259 Global Commission on International Migration, 167 Global Detention Project, 257 Golove, D., 245 Goodwin-Gill, G., 133 Great Britain. See United Kingdom Great War. See World War One Gross, O., 229 'group' detention individualized detention decisions, importance of, 336

modern tendency toward, 58

### INDEX

political visibility of large influxes, 277, 278 UK, in, 93, 279 US, in, 59, 63 Guantanamo Bay, 209, 213, 239-50, 302, 312, 327, 330, 343 Guild, E., 198, 200 Guiraudon, V., 275 Gulf War detentions in UK, 212 habeas corpus tradition Australia, in, 99, 107 citizens and aliens not distinguished in, ix criminal law, detention under, 210 historical guarantee against unlawful immigration measures, loss of, 2, 5, 55 judicial reconciliation of migration controls with, 322 politicization of immigration detention eroding, 57, 58 UN concern over adequacy of, 159 United Kingdom, in citizens detained under Reg. 14B of Defence of the Realm Regulations during WW One, 50 detainees without status, right to liberty of, 91 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, assertion of, 86 United States, in Chinese immigrant labourers, 19-21,24 East Coast, immigration applications on, 17 Guantanamo detainees, jurisdiction over, 243, 246, 330 plenary powers undermining, 25 Russian Revolution, detention of potential anarchists in wake of, 31 unlimited/indefinite detention, challenges to, 71-5

385

Haddad, E., 126, 139, 269 Haitian and Cuban flotillas arriving in US, mandatory detention for, 67-9, 77, 132, 240-2, 250, 273, 281 Halliday, R v (UK), 50 Hamdan v Rumsfeld (US Supreme Court), 246, 247, 248 Hamdi v Rumsfeld (US Supreme Court), 244-6, 248 Hardial Singh, R v Governor of Durham Prison ex parte (UK), 89, 96, 103 Hassan, R v Governor of of Risley ex parte (UK), 84-5 Hathaway, J. C., 128 Held, D., 288 Henderson v Mayor of New York (US Supreme Court), 9 Hill Maher, K., 317 historical development of immigration detention, 1-56 border as site of regulation, 1, 6-8 centralized state control over aliens, development of, 6-8 in UK, 36-54. See also under United Kingdom in US, 8-36. See also under United States expulsion and detention, continuing link between, 6, 28 French Revolution, immigration fears related to, 3, 5 in international law, 119-21, 124-6 liberal tradition of free movement of aliens, ix-x, 1, 257 undesirable aliens, early detention of, x-xi WW One and WW Two. See World War One; World War Two Hobbes, Thomas, 266, 268, 314 Hong Kong, Vietnamese boat people in, 143, 158, 159 human rights, 121-4 border control administration without sacrifice of, 303-7 ECHR. See European Convention on/Court/Commission of

Human Rights

liberty, right to, 123 migration, qualified right of, 124 of refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons, xvi, 121-3 sovereignty concept in conflict with, 121 unauthorized aliens, of, xv-xvii, 121 - 4UNHRC (UN Human Rights Committee) and ICCPR. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights universality of. See equal liberty for aliens and citizens Hutchinson, E. P., 17 Hutto, In Re (US), 293 ICCPR. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights ID and others v Home Office (UK), 95 illegal aliens. See unauthorized aliens Immigration Act 1891 (US), 13-14 Immigration Act 1893 (US), 14-15 Immigration Act 1917 (US), 32 Immigration Act 1952 (US), 64-5 Immigration Act 1971 (UK), 81, 83, 84-5,88 Immigration and Nationality Act, US, 238 Immigration and Naturalization Service (INS), US, 234, 235 immigration detention, ix-xxiii aliens power, concept of, xi, xiv. See also aliens power arbitrary power, as residue of, xix-xx as bureaucratic process, xiii-xiv, xix-xx, 57, 79 constitutional traditions in conflict with, xii, xiii-xiv EU, in, 171–206. See also European Union expulsion never unhinged from, 6 extra-legal nature of detention centres, xviii-xix. See also extra-legal space, detention centres as

goals of, determining, 333-6

INDEX

immigration detention (cont.) growth in scope and scale of, ix, xii, 116 historical development of, 1-56. See also historical development of immigration detention international law and, 119-70. See also international law and immigration detention judicial system and. See judicial system legal status of detained foreigners, xvii–xviii, xix–xx liberal tradition of free movement of aliens and, ix-x, 1, 257 modern practice of, 57-118. See also modern immigration detention practice since WW Two political issue, as, xix-xxi. See also political issue, immigration detention as rule of law and, xxii-xxiii, 310-53. See also rule of law and immigration detention security measure, as, 207-55. See also security and immigration detention unauthorized aliens, of. See unauthorized aliens impartialists, 259-62 indefinite detention Australia, modern policy of mandatory indefinite detention in, 98-107 ECHR due diligence approach to and 'blame' testing of, 141-6 terrorism, as means of combating. See terrorism and indefinite detention UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention on, 165 United Kingdom, in as counter-terrorist measure. See under terrorism and indefinite detention damages for unlawful imprisonment, 93, 94-5

foreign prisoners emergency, 95-7 historical development during WW One and post-war period, 45-54 restrictions on, 88–91 United States, in as counter-terrorist measure. See under terrorism and indefinite detention current practice, effect of Zadvydas and Martinez cases on, 77-9 historical development during WW One and post-war period, 33-4 of Mariel boat people, 68 modern challenges to, 71-5 Supreme Court's Cold War deference to government on, 62 individualized detention decisions, importance of, 336 INS (Immigration and Naturalization Service), US, 234, 235 international cooperation on immigration controls, ix International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 167, 224 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 157-66 ACSA (UK), indefinite detention of suspected terrorists under, 222, 224 Article 9 prohibiting arbitrary detention, 159-61 due process requirements, 319 ECHR compared, 158, 159 equal right to liberty under, 319 EU legislation's compliance with fundamental rights under, 197 extreme nature of cases handled by, 320 growing concerns from mid-1990s and, 158-9, 163-5 proportionality under, 161-3

US detention of aliens after 9/11 as violation of, 237 Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, 159, 163-5 International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights, 167, 224 international law and immigration detention, 119-70 absence of legal framework for migration and migrant rights, xiv-xv bureaucratic rather than judicial process, immigration detention as, xiii criminalization of unauthorized aliens, on, 167-8 ECHR. See European Convention on/Court/Commission of Human Rights Executive Committee Conclusion 44 on, 134-6, 139, 148, 151, 188 historical development of, 119-21, 124-6 human rights. See human rights ICCPR and. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 'outlaw' status of detainees in international law, 296-9 political pressure for accountability, 287-90 proportionality guidelines. See proportionality Refugee Convention (1951). See **Refugee** Convention rule of law, limits on guardianship of, 316-21 state sovereignty, concept of, 120. See also state sovereignty UK Royal Commission of 1905 on, 36, 38 UNHCR on, 131-8 WW Two and Cold War refugee crisis, 124-6 International Refugee Organization, 125

### INDEX

387

Ireland, no limits on duration of detention in, 191 irregular aliens. See unauthorized aliens Italy conditions for detainees in, 286 outsourcing of detainees to Libya, 287 Jackson, J., 313, 330 Japan, UN criticism of detention policies under, 158 Jean v Nelson (US Supreme Court), 67, 73, 272 Iews French detentions during WW Two, 108 UK immigrants, nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, 36, 43, 44 Johnson v Eisentrager (US Supreme Court), 242, 243 Joppke, C., 275 Ju Toy, United States v (US Supreme Court), 25 judicial review, 321-31. See also habeas corpus tradition Australia, exclusion of judicial review of detention of boat people in, 101 damages for unlawful imprisonment, UK cases seeking, 93, 94-5 ECHR on judicial review of detention decisions, 155-6 equality of protection for aliens and citizens by UK courts, 86-8 EU, detention of non-EU citizens in, 192 - 3extra-judicial treatment of immigration detention, xiii-xiv, 55, 79 France, prompt judicial approval of detention required in, 110 global tendency toward requiring, 330-1 involvement in rights of entry and stay, xix-xx

INDEX

judicial review (cont.) legal entitlements of aliens, scrutiny of, xxi of legislative versus executive detention, 325-6 outline of statutory system for, 343-7 plenary powers of Congress to control immigration in US, 23-7,75-7 proportionality as basis for, 331-3 refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons, rights of, xiii UN consideration of need for, 159, 164, 165 Kadzoev (ECJ), 195, 201, 202, 204 Kansas v Hendricks (US Supreme Court), 72 Kanstroom, D., 4, 28, 326 Kant, Immanuel, 261 Kaoru Yamataya v Fisher (US Supreme Court), 27 Khawaja case (UK), 86-8, 90, 95, 105, 219 Kolompar (ECHR), 144 Kosopud, In Re (US), 33 Kurds detained in UK, 279 labour migration. See economic migration legal aliens. See authorized aliens legislative versus executive detention, judicial review of, 325-6 liberalism free movement of aliens as tradition of, ix-x, 1, 257 fundamental rights, border control administration without sacrifice of, 303-7 illiberal outcomes in relation to detention produced by, 257-66 impartialists, 259-62 partialists, 259, 262-6 liberty, right to. See equal liberty for aliens and citizens; free

movement

Libya, Italian detainees outsourced to, 287 Liebmann, R v Superintendent of Vine Street Police Station ex parte (UK), 48 Lim case (Chu Kheng Lim and others v Minister for Immigration, Local Government and Ethnic Affairs and another; Australia), 103, 106 Lubbers, Ruud, 137 Lusitania, sinking of, 46, 50 Lynas v Switzerland (ECHR), 141 Maastricht Treaty, 177 Madafferi v Australia (UNHCR), 295 Madison, James, 3-4, 6, 27, 314 Magna Carta, 1 Malta conditions for detainees in, 286 duration of detention, no limits on, 191 mandatory detention in Australia, 98-107, 117 in EU, 192 political and psychological effects of, 302 US, in, 116 for Cuban and Haitian flotillas, 67-9, 77, 132, 240-2, 250, 273, 281 historical development of, 14-15 legislative origins of, 325 suspected terrorists, 238-9 unauthorized aliens, as tool to control, 69-71 Mariel boat people, 67-9, 77, 241, 250, 273, 281 Martin, David, 236 Maurus Island, Australian asylum camps on, 103, 302 May, Erskine, 5, 6, 37 Meltzer, D. J., 249 membership, migration issues viewed as problem of, 303 mental health, effects of detention on, 286, 290, 294, 295, 338

CAMBRIDGE

#### INDEX

mental health problems, detention of persons with, 290-6 Mexican immigrants to US, mandatory detention of, 70 Mezei, Ignatz, and Mezei case (US Supreme Court), 60–2, 64, 68, 73, 74, 112, 227, 250, 330, 343 migrant workers, defined, 122 n20. See also economic migration migration, qualified right of, 124 Mikolenko v Estonia (ECHR), 153, 333 Miller, M. J., 269 modern immigration detention practice since WW Two, 57-118. See also World War Two Australia, in, 98-107, 117. See also Australia bureaucratic control of immigration process, 57 France, in, 107–16, 117–18. See also France political issue, as, 57, 58, 114, 116 political issue, detention as, 57, 58 security, aliens as permanent threat to, 57 UK, in, 79-97, 117. See also United Kingdom US, in, 58-79, 116. See also United States Mubilanzila Mayeka and Kaniki Mitunga v Belgium (ECHR), 292 Muskhadziyeva v Belgium (ECHR), 293 Nafziger, James, 120 Nauru, Australian asylum camps in, 103, 302 necessity test ECHR on, 148-50, 153, 155 individualized detention decisions, importance of, 336 UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention on, 164 Netherlands conditions for detainees in, 286 duration of detention, no limits on, 191 Neuman, G., 4, 243, 315

## 389

New Zealand,	interpretation	of Refugee
Conve	ntion by, 138	

Nicol, A., 36

- 9/11, 212–13, 215–18, 233–7. See also terrorism and immigration detention
- Nishimura Ekiu v United States (US Supreme Court), 25, 120
- non-compliance with removal process ECHR on, 153–5
  - in EU, 193, 196, 350
  - UK criminalization of, 350
  - US criminalization of, 65–7, 350
- non-immigration objectives, use of aliens powers to achieve, 207–8
- Office of the Inspector General (OIG), US, 235–6
- Ogata, Sadako, 135
- Oklahoma bombings, 238
- Oulane (ECJ), 177–9, 184
- 'outlaws,' detainees as, xviii, xix–xx, xxi, 209, 296–9
- outsourcing/off-shoring of detainees by Australia, 103

EU proposals, 203, 287

- Guantanamo Bay, 209, 213, 239–50, 302, 312, 327, 330, 343
- Italy, by, 287
- legal position of detainees weakened by, 302
- Panayi, P., 52
- Papua New Guinea, Australian asylum camps in, 103, 302
- parole, bail, or bond. See bonding, bail, and parole

partialists, 259, 262–6

- pathogenic nature of detention, 286
- Peers, S., 200
- PENTTBOM, 233, 235, 236
- physical detention facilities. See detention centres
- plenary powers doctrine, US development of, 23–7 modern retention of, 75–7 *Plyer v Doe* (US Supreme Court), 351

#### INDEX

police powers, immigration detention in France viewed as exercise of, 58,108 political activists, detention of anarchists, 36, 207 Communist subversion, 59-64, 207 French Revolution, 3, 5 Russian Revolution, 30-1 political issue, immigration detention as, xix-xxi, 256-309. See also liberalism Belmarsh decision (UK) on indefinite detention of terrorists and, 228-30 conditions in detention centres, 278-9, 282-3, 285-7, 288-90 ECHR and, 153 extra-legal political spaces, detention centres as. See extra-legal space, detention centres as free movement of aliens, liberal tradition of, ix-x, 1, 257 fundamental rights, border control administration without sacrifice of, 303-7 impartialists, 259-62 international pressure and accountability, 287-90 in modern detention regimes, 57, 58, 114, 116 non-immigration objectives, use of aliens powers to achieve, 207-8 non-liberal political theory, 266-9 'outlaw' status of detainees, 296-9 partialists, 259, 262-6 security-based detention, political problems arising from, 251, 255 security concerns as political tool, 269-75 traditional left/right groupings, migration issues cutting across, 276 unrest in detention centres, 279-87 visibility of problem and controls, 275-8

vulnerable groups, detention of, 290–6

'prisons with three walls' argument, 112-13, 146-8, 155, 227 proportionality disabilities imposed upon unauthorized persons, of, 350 - 2ECHR on, 155 fair balance between community and individual interests, striking, 338-40 genuinely dangerous detainees, treatment of, 340-2 ICCPRR, under, 161-3 Refugee Convention on, 136-8 rule of law and, 331-3 psychological problems, detention of persons with, 290-6 psychological stresses of detention, 286, 290, 294, 295, 338 punishment, status of immigration detention as Australia, in, 100-1, 103 Chinese immigrant labourers in US, 20 criminal sanctions as alternative to administrative detention, 349-50 deterrent effect of detention, 278 ECHR on, 153, 154 in EU Returns Directive, 196 Madison and Alien Act 1798 (US) on, 3–4 security-based detention and, 209 US Supreme Court rulings that detention is not legally imprisonment, 27-9, 60 racism and immigration Australian and Canadian historical restrictions on non-white alien

workers, 38, 98 Chinese migrant labourers to US, 18–29

Commonwealth citizens, UK immigration controls aimed at, 81

detention, racist abuses during, 289

Jewish immigrants to UK in 19th century, 36 partialist view of, 265 Rasul v Bush (US Supreme Court), 243, 244, 245, 246, 247, 248, 249 Rawls, John, 258 Refugee Convention (1951) criminal punishment, exemptions from, 349 emergency situations, on, 348 EU, movement of non-EU citizens within, 181, 187 international law and immigration detention, xvi, 122, 126-31, 138-40, 317 post-WW Two/Cold War and, 298 US detention of Cuban refugees at Guantanamo as violation of, 241 refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons Australian boat people crisis. See under Australia criminalization of failure to comply with removal process in US and, 65–7 EU detention powers aimed at, 182, 185-9 Executive Committee Conclusion 44 on, 134-6, 139, 148, 151, 188 growth in British use of detention for, 91-4 Haitian and Cuban flotillas arriving in US, mandatory detention for, 67-9, 77, 132, 240-2, 250, 273, 281 human rights of, xvi, 121-3 international law, under, xiv judicial rights of, xxi lawfully versus unlawfully present, 128-9, 138 political visibility of, 277 proportionality guidelines for. See proportionality unauthorized aliens as, xi UNHCR on detention of, 131-8, 288

#### INDEX

391

WW One and post-war period, 33-4,56 WW Two and Cold War, 124-6 release on bail, bond, or parole. See bonding, bail, and parole remote controls on immigration, 277 removal. See deportation Riad and Idiab v Belgium (ECHR), 289 Richard, Alain, 109 Rubio-Marín, R., 306 rule of law and immigration detention, xxii-xxiii, 310-53 alternatives to detention, 337-8 constitutional status of aliens, lack of clarity regarding, 323-4 criminal sanctions as alternative to administrative detention. 349 - 50disabilities imposable upon unauthorized persons, 350-2 due process rights for all deprivations of liberty, 342-3 emergency powers and, 347-8 EU Returns Directive avoiding, 196 - 7fair balance between community and individual interests, striking, 338-40 general principles of, 343 genuinely dangerous detainees, treatment of, 340-2 goals of detention, determining, 333-6 individualized detention decisions, 336 international law, limitations of, 316-21 judicial review of government power of detention, 321-31, 343-7 proportionality requirements, 331-3 security concerns and, 207, 311-16 Russian Revolution, immigration fears related to, 30-1 Saadi and Others, Secretary of State for the Home Department ex parte

(UK), 93

INDEX

Saadi and Others v United Kingdom (ECHR), 151, 164, 333, 347 Sale v Haitian Centers Council v US (US Supreme Court), 241 Sarno, R v Governor of Brixton Prison ex parte (UK), 48 Sassen, S., 55, 316 Schengen Treaty (1985) and system, 180 Schmitt, Carl, 262, 266-8, 296, 300, 314, 315 Schuck, P., 304 security and immigration detention, 207–55. See also terrorism and immigration detention aliens power as permanent emergency power for purposes of, 207-8, 209-12 ASCA (UK) as security rather than immigration measure, 223-4 de-legitimation of all aliens for security purposes, xx-xxi deportation, security-based detention divorced from, 208 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, denial of, 208-9, 252-5 EU, in. See under European Union extra-legal space, detention centres as, 209 fundamental rights, border control administration without sacrifice of, 303-7 modern permanent sense of aliens as security threats, 57 political problems arising from security-based detention, 251, 255 political tool, security concerns as, 269-75 proportionality in treatment of genuinely dangerous detainees, 340 - 2Refugee Convention delegates on refugees as security threats, 129 rule of law and, 207, 311-16 undesirable aliens, early detention of, x-xi

segregation of aliens in Australia, Al Kateb decision regarding, 104–7 Sen, Amartya, 305 September 11, 2001, 212–13, 215–18, 233-7. See also terrorism and immigration detention Shamsa v Poland (ECHR), 156, 331 Sharpe, R. J., 51 Sibley, N. W., 40 Simpson, B., 50, 51, 211 Singer, P., 260 Singh v Czech Republic (ECHR), 145 social assistance, expulsion of EU citizens requiring, 178 Somersett's Case (UK), 86 sovereignty. See state sovereignty Spanish Civil War refugees, French internment of, 108, 129 Special Immigration Appeals Commission (SIAC), UK, 219-20 state sovereignty aliens power and, 224 border control as manifestation of, 258 concept of, 120 EU and, 171, 172, 173 free movement tradition affected by rise of, 258 globalized world, in, 318 goal of immigration detention, as, 335 human rights and migration controls, conflict between, 121 justification of immigration detention, as, 169 political pressure for accountability and, 287-90 stateless persons. See refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons Steel, Z., 338 Sunstein, C., 313 Switzerland, UN criticism of detention policies of, 158

Tamil asylum seekers in UK, 135, 279 Tampere European Council meeting of 1999, 181

393

Tan Te Lam v Superintendent of Tai A Chau Detention Centre (British Hong Kong), 90 territorial sovereignty. See state sovereignty terrorism and indefinite detention, xi, 212 - 13emergency powers, 348 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, 252 - 5UK assertion of, 222, 224-6, 228 US assertion of, 243, 246-9 EU concerns regarding non-EU citizens, 181 political problems arising from, 251, 255 political tool, security concerns as, 274 September 11, 2001, 212-13, 215-18, 233-7 UK, in Belmarsh decision (A v Secretary of State for the Home Department), 222-31, 248, 253, 312, 327, 332, 342 control order regime replacing detention, 231-3 drafting and passage of ACSA, 215-18 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, assertion of, 222, 224-6,228 first detentions and litigation under ACSA, 219-22 Gulf War detentions, 212 provisions of ASCA, 218–19 security rather than immigration measure, ACSA as, 223-4 torture, aliens undeportable due to threat of, 213-15 US, in citizens, detention of, 244-6 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, assertion of, 243, 246-9 Guantanamo Bay, 209, 213, 239-50

initial detention of immigrants after 9/11, 233-7 Oklahoma bombings, 238 removable aliens, mandatory indefinite detention of, 238-9 Supreme Court rulings on, 243–9 US PATRIOT Act, 233, 238 three walls, prisons with, 112-13, 146-8, 155, 227 Torpey, J., 7 torture Convention Against Torture, 167 CPT, 145, 287 detention of aliens undeportable due to threat of, 213-15, 317 Tudor period, alien rights during, 1 Turkish Kurds detained in UK, 279, 280 UN Commission on Human Rights (UNCHR), 167 UN Conventions and Covenants. See entries at Convention; International Convention; International Covenant UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), 131-8, 284, 288, 337 UN Human Rights Committee (UNHRC) and ICCPR. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights UN Relief and Rehabilitation Agency, 125 UN Special Rapporteur on the Human Rights of Migrants, 123, 167-8, 288, 289, 291, 299 UN standards on anti-terrorism and non-discrimination, 224 UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention (WGAD), 159, 163-5, 236, 252 unauthorized aliens Australian boat people crisis. See under Australia authorized/unauthorized divide replacing citizen/alien divide, xii–xiii

concept of, xi-xii

unauthorized aliens (cont.) constitutional right to liberty of, 313 EU, in, 182, 185, 190-3, 199-201 human rights of, xv-xvii, 121-4 in international law, 167-8 legal entitlements of, xxi legal status of, xviii, xix-xx 'outlaws', as, xviii, xix-xx, xxi, 209, 296-9 proportionality of disabilities imposed upon, 350-2 re-authorization of, xx-xxi Refugee Convention on lawfully versus unlawfully present refugees, 128-9, 138 US concerns regarding, 69-71 undocumented aliens. See unauthorized aliens United Kingdom bonding, bail and parole, right to seek, 88, 91 children, detention of, 291 Commonwealth citizens, immigration controls aimed at, 79,80-5 criminalization of failure to comply with removal process, 350 damages for unlawful imprisonment, cases seeking, 93, 94-5 deportation, detention as conditional on possibility of, 194 detention centres, poor conditions and unrest at, 279-81 disabilities imposable upon unauthorized persons in, 351 duration of detention, no limits on, 191 equal liberty for aliens and citizens, assertion of, 86-8, 222, 224-6, 228 European Convention on Human Rights, incorporation of, 80 executive rather than legislative control of detention matters in, 79,325

foreign prisoners emergency, 95-7

### INDEX

'group' detention in, 93, 279 growing use of detention in, 86 habeas corpus tradition in. See under habeas corpus tradition historical development of centralized state control over aliens, 5-6, 36-54 Aliens Act 1793, 36, 39 anarchists, fears regarding, 36, 207 burden of justification placed on alien rather than state, 52 citizens detained under 14B of Defence of the Realm Regulations, 49-51 immigrant receiving house, establishment of, 43-4 Jewish immigrants, 36, 43, 44 Magna Carta, 1 mid-ninteenth century, 5-6, 36 Royal Commission, Bill and Aliens Act 1905, 36-43 Tudor period, in, 1 WW One and post-war period, 45-54, 212 Hong Kong, Vietnamese boat people in, 143, 158, 159 Immigration Act 1971, effects of, 81, 83, 84–5, 88 indefinite detention in. See under indefinite detention modern detention practice since WW Two, 79-97, 117 refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons in, 187 terrorism and detention in. See under terrorism and indefinite detention UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, criticism of, 107, 163 United States children, detention of, 293 Communists, Cold War detentions of, 59-64, 207 constitutional protection, unadmitted aliens viewed as beyond, 60-2

criminalization of failure to comply with removal process, 65-7, 350 Cuban and Haitian flotillas, adoption of mandatory detention for, 67-9, 77, 132, 240-2, 250, 273, 281 deportation, detention as conditional on possibility of, 194 detention centres, poor conditions and unrest at, 281-3 disabilities imposable upon unauthorized persons in, 350 due process in. See under due process duration of detention in. See duration of detention 'group' detention in, 59, 63 Guantanamo Bay detainees, 209, 213, 239–50, 302, 312, 327, 330, 343 habeas corpus tradition in. See under habeas corpus tradition historical development of centralized state control over aliens, 8-36 Act to Regulate Immigration 1882, no detention in, 11-13 Alien Act 1798, 3-4, 29 bonding of immigrants, 14, 17 - 18Chinese migrant labourers, 18–29, 119 detention centres, institution of, 13 - 14East coast, limited duration of detentions on, 15-17 imprisonment, Supreme Court ruling that detention not legally regarded as, 27-9 mandatory detention, 14-15 plenary powers doctrine, development of, 23-7 unlimited detention, allowance of, 33 - 4WW One and post-war period, 29-34

Immigration Act 1952, 64-5

indefinite detention in. See under indefinite detention mandatory detention in. See under mandatory detention modern detention practice since WW Two, 58-79, 116 paradox of massive immigration with tough detention policy, 58-9 plenary powers doctrine development of, 23-7 modern retention of, 75-7 proportionality in, 332, 333 security concerns as political tool in, 270 - 4terrorism and detention in. See under terrorism and indefinite detention unauthorized aliens, mandatory detention as tool to control,  $69_{-71}$ Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948), 124, 224 universality of human rights. See equal liberty for aliens and citizens unrest in detention centres, 279-87 US PATRIOT Act, 233, 238 utilitarianism, 260

395

Van Alphen v Netherlands (UNHCR), 160, 161 Vattel, Emmerich de, 4, 261 Venicoff, R v Inspector of Leman Street Police Station ex parte (UK), 53 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 160 Vietnamese boat people in Australia. See under Australia in Hong Kong, 143, 158, 159 V.M.R.B. v Canada (UNHCR), 160 vulnerable groups, detention of, 290–6 Waldron, J., 291, 305

Walzer, M., 263

war and immigration detention. *See also* specific wars and conflicts aliens power as extension of war power, 57, 209, 266–9

#### INDEX

war and immigration detention (cont.) defence powers applied to enemy aliens in wartime, 210 historical distinction between 'enemy' and 'friend', 1 international immigration treated as inherently equivalent to armed conflict, 24 legal status of detainees as enemy aliens, xvii non-liberal political theory, links between view of aliens and war powers in, 266-9 prisoner of war status and protections contrasted with detainees, 296 undesirable aliens, early detention of, xi Weber, ex parte (UK), 47, 48 Weber, Max, 7 Weiler, J. H. H., 202 Weis, Paul, 130 Welch, M., 270, 273 West Germany, UNCHR criticism of detention in, 133 WGAD (UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention), 159, 163-5, 236, 252 Wong Wing v United States (US Supreme Court), 27-9 Working Group on Arbitrary Detention (WGAD), 159, 163-5, 236, 252

World War One and post-war period, 55 Germans, UK and US detention of, 29, 45-8, 50 Refugee Convention (1951) and, 298 refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons, 33–4, 56 UK, in, 45-54, 212 US, in, 29-34 World War Two economic migration encouraged following, 57, 58 French detention of Jews during, 108 Germans, UK and US detention of, 211 Refugee Convention and, 127 refugees, asylum seekers and stateless persons after, 124-6 X v United Kingdom (ECHR), 142 Zadig, Arthur, 50 Zadvydas v Davis (US Supreme Court), 71-5, 76, 77-9, 89, 103, 104, 154, 209, 233, 238, 254, 325, 326, 341, 342 Zaireans detained in UK, 279 Zamir v Secretary of State for the Home Department (UK), 85, 86

Zimbabweans detained in UK, 280 Zolberg, A., 26