

THE LEGAL REGIME OF STRAITS

The right of transit passage in straits and the analogous right of archipelagic sea lanes passage in archipelagic States, negotiated in the 1970s and embodied in the 1982 UNCLOS, sought to approximate the freedom of navigation and overflight while expressly recognizing the sovereignty or jurisdiction of the coastal State over the waters concerned. However, the allocation of rights and duties of the coastal State and third States is open to interpretation. Developments in State practice, such as Australia's requirement of compulsory pilotage in the Torres Strait, the bridge across the Great Belt and the proposals for a bridge across the Strait of Messina, the enhanced environmental standards applicable in the Strait of Bonifacio and Canada's claims over the Arctic Route, make it necessary to reassess the whole common law of straits. *The Legal Regime of Straits* examines the complex relationship between the coastal State and the international community.

HUGO CAMINOS is a former judge (1996–2011) at the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea and a member of the Institut de droit international. He was Deputy Director of the Office of the Special Representative of the Secretary-General of the United Nations for the Third United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea and Legal Counsel for the Organization of American States.

VINCENT P. COGLIATI-BANTZ holds a doctorate in international law from the Graduate Institute of International Studies, Geneva. He lectures on the law of the sea, international organizations, European Union law and comparative law at the TC Beirne School of Law, University of Queensland, Australia.





THE LEGAL REGIME OF STRAITS

Contemporary Challenges and Solutions

HUGO CAMINOS VINCENT P. COGLIATI-BANTZ





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107003767

© Hugo Caminos and Vincent P. Cogliati-Bantz 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Caminos, Hugo, author.

The legal regime of straits : contemporary challenges and solutions / Hugo Caminos, Vincent P. Cogliati-Bantz.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-00376-7 (hardback)

1. Straits. I. Cogliati-Bantz, Vincent P., author. II. Title.

KZ3760.C36 2014

341.4'46 - dc23 2014034073

ISBN 978-1-107-00376-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> "What I dream of is an art of balance." Henri Matisse



To Susana
To R., M. N., T.
and our families
To our masters



CONTENTS

	Acknowledgements xiii
	Introduction 1
	PART I Law of peace and law of war 9
1	Straits and the law of war 11 1.1 General remarks 11
	1.2 Treaty regimes 15
	1.3 A law of war for straits? 19
	1.3.1 States bordering straits as belligerents 20
	1.3.1.1 Relations with enemy vessels and aircraft 20
	1.3.1.2 Relations with neutral vessels and aircraft 24
	1.3.2 States bordering straits as neutrals 30
	PART II Right of transit passage ratione loci: straits used for international navigation 37
2	Applicability of the right of transit passage under UNCLOS Part III: exclusions 41
	2.1 Straits where freedom of navigation applies: Article 36 and the 'similar convenience' exception to the inapplicability of Part III 42
	2.2 Straits where non-suspendable innocent passage applies 46
	2.2.1 Island exception: Article 38(1) and the 'similar convenience' condition 46
	2.2.2 Straits used for international navigation ending in the
	territorial sea of a foreign State: Article 45(1)(b) 54
	2.3 Internal waters within straits 58
	2.3.1 General principle 58
	2.3.2 Exception to the general principle: Part III affects internal waters enclosed by straight baselines which did not have the status of internal waters 64
	2.4 Straits in which passage is regulated in whole or in part by
	long-standing international conventions in force specifically relating

vii



viii		CONTENTS
		to such straits and straits regulated by international agreement compatible with the UNCLOS 71
		2.4.1 Article 35(c): issues of construction 72
		2.4.2 The Turkish Straits 77
		2.4.3 The Danish Straits 89
		2.4.4 The Strait of Magellan 98
		2.4.5 The Åland Strait 104
		2.4.6 Straits regulated by international agreement compatible with the UNCLOS 107
	3	Applicability of the right of transit under Part III: straits used for international navigation defined 109
		3.1 Natural passages 109
		3.2 Legal geography 112
		3.3 Legal functionality: used for international navigation 115
		3.3.1 International navigation 117
		3.3.2 Use 122
		3.3.2.1 Use as additional requirement 122
		3.3.2.2 Use as scalar concept 127 3.3.2.2.1 Future use 128
		3.3.2.2.2 Natural and assisted navigation 131
		3.3.2.2.3 Amount and type of use 135
		PART III Right of transit ratione materiae: definition of
		transit passage 151
	4	Transit passage and other passage rights 153
		4.1 Transit passage and freedom of navigation and overflight 153
		4.2 Transit passage and innocent passage 159
		4.3 Transit passage and archipelagic sea lanes passage 168
		4.3.1 Concept of archipelagic waters 168
		4.3.1.1 Emergence of a new regime 168 4.3.1.2 Archipelagic waters in the UNCLOS 176
		4.3.1.2 Archipelagic waters in the UNCLOS 176 4.3.2 Navigational rights in archipelagic waters 181
		4.3.2.1 Innocent passage 181
		4.3.2.2 Archipelagic sea lanes passage 184
		4.3.2.2.1 General 184
		4.3.2.2.2 The geographical scope of the right: the
		designation of sea lanes 187 4.3.2.2.3 Application: Indonesian archipelagic sea
		lanes 194
		4.3.2.3 Further developments and conclusions 201
	5	Transit passage defined 206



	CONTENTS	X
	 5.1 Continuous and expeditious passage 206 5.2 Geographical scope 208 5.3 Recipients of the right of transit: all ships and aircraft 211 5.4 Loss of the right of transit? 217 	
	PART IV Allocation of jurisdiction over the right of transit passage and archipelagic sea lanes passage 225	
6	Sovereignty of States bordering straits and archipelagic States 227	
7	Limitations to the sovereignty of States bordering straits and archipelagic States: rights and duties of coastal States 231 7.1 General 231 7.2 Adoption of archipelagic sea lanes, sea lanes, traffic separation schemes and other routeing measures: joint process 234 7.3 Limitations to the prescriptive jurisdiction of States bordering straits and archipelagic States regarding passage: scope of content 243 7.3.1 General 243 7.3.2 Article 42(1)(a) 246 7.3.3 Article 42(1)(b) 251 7.3.3.1 Scope 251 7.3.3.2 Applicable international regulations: definition 254 7.3.4 Article 42(1)(c) 257 7.3.5 Article 42(1)(d) 259 7.3.6 Publicity 260 7.3.7 Scope ratione personae of laws and regulations 263	
	 7.3.7 Scope ratione personae of laws and regulations 263 7.4 Limitations to the prescriptive jurisdiction of States bordering straits and archipelagic States relating to passage: scope of effect 266 7.4.1 Non-discrimination 266 7.4.2 Negative effects on transit 267 7.5 The special case of Articles 51 and 47(6) 268 7.5.1 General rights granted to all States 268 7.5.1.1 Existing agreements 268 7.5.1.2 Rights relating to submarine cables 270 7.5.2 Special rights granted to immediately adjacent neighbouring States 272 7.5.3 The special case of Malaysia 275 	
	7.6 Limitations to the enforcement jurisdiction of States bordering straits and archipelagic States 280	



 \mathbf{X}

	CONTENTS
	7.6.1 Enforcement and right of transit or archipelagic sea lanes passage 280 7.6.1.1 Principle 280 7.6.1.2 Exceptions 281 7.6.1.2.1 United Nations Charter 281 7.6.1.2.2 Article 233 282 7.6.1.2.3 Article 233 and the Malacca and Singapore straits under-keel clearance requirement 288 7.6.1.2.4 Article 234 291 7.6.2 General remedies available to the coastal State 292 7.7 International responsibility of the coastal State 296
8	Duties of ships and aircraft in transit 298
Ü	8.1 General compliance duties of ships and aircraft in transit 298
	8.2 Specific duties of ships 301
	8.2.1 Article 40 301
	8.2.2 Article 41(7) 304
	8.2.3 Article 42(4) 304
	8.2.4 Article 39(2) 304
	8.2.4.1 Scope 305
	8.2.4.2 Generally accepted international regulations, procedures and practices 307
	8.3 Specific duties of aircraft 313
	8.3.1 Duty relating to radio frequency 314
	8.3.2 Duties relating to the Rules of the Air and safety of navigation 316
	8.4 Enforcement of the duties of ships and aircraft 322
	8.4.1 Immune ships and aircraft 322
	8.4.2 Private vessels and civil aircraft 323
9	Striking a balance between the sovereignty of States bordering
	straits and the right of transit 326
	9.1 Measures that create a physical impediment to passage 327
	9.1.1 Termination of the right of transit 327
	9.1.2 Restriction of the right of transit 328
	9.1.2.1 Land reclamation 328 9.1.2.2 Bridges and other structures 331
	9.1.2.3 Areas to be avoided 341
	9.2 Measures that create requirements to be met by
	transiting ships 343
	9.3 Elements for a balanced approach 352



	CONTENTS
	PART V International co-operation for the safety of navigation and the prevention, reduction and control of pollution in straits 357
10	Preliminary remarks and genesis of Article 43 of the UNCLOS 359
11	Scope of Article 43: interpretation and suggested implementation 371 11.1 Fees for service in the territorial sea, straits and archipelagic waters 371 11.2 Co-operation by agreement 376 11.3 Who are the users? 379 11.4 Burden sharing and implementation of Article 43 382
12	Co-operative schemes: the special case of the Straits of Malacca and Singapore 391
	PART VI Multiple regimes for straits? 403
13	UNCLOS as general framework 405
14	Marine protected areas 410 14.1 UNCLOS 411 14.1.1 Article 211(6) 411 14.1.2 Article 234 413 14.2 MARPOL 73/78 420 14.3 Other conventional instruments 423 14.4 Particularly Sensitive Sea Areas (PSSAs) 424 14.4.1 General observations 424 14.4.2 Impact on straits 430
	PART VII Conclusions 443
15	Straits and dispute settlement 445 15.1 Settlement of disputes under the UNCLOS: brief overview 445 15.2 Disputes over the straits regime 448
16	Transit passage and customary law 452 16.1 International custom and international conventions 452 16.2 The UNCLOS, transit passage and customary international law 460 16.2.1 Opinion of writers 460

xi



xii contents

16.2.2 Practice and *opinio juris* 46216.2.3 Archipelagic sea lanes passage 470

17 Concluding remarks 473

Bibliography 476 Index 498



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Authors wish to acknowledge the assistance of the Library of the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea, Hamburg and the Library of the University of Queensland, Brisbane, as well as the Staff at Cambridge University Press for their kindness.