THE LEGAL REGIME OF STRAITS

The right of transit passage in straits and the analogous right of archipelagic sea lanes passage in archipelagic States, negotiated in the 1970s and embodied in the 1982 UNCLOS, sought to approximate the freedom of navigation and overflight while expressly recognizing the sovereignty or jurisdiction of the coastal State over the waters concerned. However, the allocation of rights and duties of the coastal State and third States is open to interpretation. Developments in State practice, such as Australia’s requirement of compulsory pilotage in the Torres Strait, the bridge across the Great Belt and the proposals for a bridge across the Strait of Messina, the enhanced environmental standards applicable in the Strait of Bonifacio and Canada’s claims over the Arctic Route, make it necessary to reassess the whole common law of straits. *The Legal Regime of Straits* examines the complex relationship between the coastal State and the international community.

**Hugo Caminos** is a former judge (1996–2011) at the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea and a member of the Institut de droit international. He was Deputy Director of the Office of the Special Representative of the Secretary-General of the United Nations for the Third United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea and Legal Counsel for the Organization of American States.

**Vincent P. Cogliati-bantz** holds a doctorate in international law from the Graduate Institute of International Studies, Geneva. He lectures on the law of the sea, international organizations, European Union law and comparative law at the TC Beirne School of Law, University of Queensland, Australia.
THE LEGAL REGIME OF STRAITS

Contemporary Challenges and Solutions

HUGO CAMINOS
VINCENT P. COGLIATI-BANTZ
“What I dream of is an art of balance.”

Henri Matisse
To Susana
To R., M. N., T.
and our families
To our masters
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements xiii

Introduction 1

PART I Law of peace and law of war 9

1 Straits and the law of war 11
1.1 General remarks 11
1.2 Treaty regimes 15
1.3 A law of war for straits? 19
1.3.1 States bordering straits as belligerents 20
1.3.1.1 Relations with enemy vessels and aircraft 20
1.3.1.2 Relations with neutral vessels and aircraft 24
1.3.2 States bordering straits as neutrals 30

PART II Right of transit passage ratione loci: straits used for international navigation 37

2 Applicability of the right of transit passage under UNCLOS Part III: exclusions 41
2.1 Straits where freedom of navigation applies: Article 36 and the 'similar convenience' exception to the inapplicability of Part III 42
2.2 Straits where non-suspendable innocent passage applies 46
2.2.1 Island exception: Article 38(1) and the 'similar convenience' condition 46
2.2.2 Straits used for international navigation ending in the territorial sea of a foreign State: Article 45(1)(b) 54
2.3 Internal waters within straits 58
2.3.1 General principle 58
2.3.2 Exception to the general principle: Part III affects internal waters enclosed by straight baselines which did not have the status of internal waters 64
2.4 Straits in which passage is regulated in whole or in part by long-standing international conventions in force specifically relating
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 Article 35(c): issues of construction</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 The Turkish Straits</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.3 The Danish Straits</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.4 The Strait of Magellan</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.5 The Åland Strait</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.6 Straits regulated by international agreement compatible with the UNCLOS</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2 Use</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2.1 Use as additional requirement</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2.2 Use as scalar concept</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2.2.1 Future use</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2.2.2 Natural and assisted navigation</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2.2.3 Amount and type of use</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3 International navigation</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3.2 Use</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3.2.1 Use as additional requirement</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3.2.2 Use as scalar concept</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3.2.2.1 Future use</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3.2.2.2 Natural and assisted navigation</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3.2.2.3 Amount and type of use</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3.2.2.2 Natural and assisted navigation</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3.2.2.3 Amount and type of use</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PART III Right of transit <em>rationes materiae</em>: definition of transit passage</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Transit passage and archipelagic sea lanes passage</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.1 Concept of archipelagic waters</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.1.1 Emergence of a new regime</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.1.2 Archipelagic waters in the UNCLOS</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.2 Navigational rights in archipelagic waters</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.2.1 Innocent passage</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.2.2 Archipelagic sea lanes passage</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.2.2.1 General</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.2.2.2 The geographical scope of the right: the designation of sea lanes</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.2.2.3 Application: Indonesian archipelagic sea lanes</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.2.3 Further developments and conclusions</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Transit passage defined</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

5.1 Continuous and expeditious passage 206
5.2 Geographical scope 208
5.3 Recipients of the right of transit: all ships and aircraft 211
5.4 Loss of the right of transit? 217

PART IV Allocation of jurisdiction over the right of transit passage and archipelagic sea lanes passage 225

6 Sovereignty of States bordering straits and archipelagic States 227

7 Limitations to the sovereignty of States bordering straits and archipelagic States: rights and duties of coastal States 231

7.1 General 231
7.2 Adoption of archipelagic sea lanes, sea lanes, traffic separation schemes and other routeing measures: joint process 234
7.3 Limitations to the prescriptive jurisdiction of States bordering straits and archipelagic States regarding passage: scope of content 243

7.3.1 General 243
7.3.2 Article 42(1)(a) 246
7.3.3 Article 42(1)(b) 251
7.3.3.1 Scope 251
7.3.3.2 Applicable international regulations: definition 254
7.3.4 Article 42(1)(c) 257
7.3.5 Article 42(1)(d) 259
7.3.6 Publicity 260
7.3.7 Scope ratione personae of laws and regulations 263
7.4 Limitations to the prescriptive jurisdiction of States bordering straits and archipelagic States relating to passage: scope of effect 266
7.4.1 Non-discrimination 266
7.4.2 Negative effects on transit 267
7.5 The special case of Articles 51 and 47(6) 268
7.5.1 General rights granted to all States 268
7.5.1.1 Existing agreements 268
7.5.1.2 Rights relating to submarine cables 270
7.5.2 Special rights granted to immediately adjacent neighbouring States 272
7.5.3 The special case of Malaysia 275

7.6 Limitations to the enforcement jurisdiction of States bordering straits and archipelagic States 280
## CONTENTS

7.6.1 Enforcement and right of transit or archipelagic sea lanes passage 280
   7.6.1.1 Principle 280
   7.6.1.2 Exceptions 281
      7.6.1.2.1 United Nations Charter 281
      7.6.1.2.2 Article 233 282
      7.6.1.2.3 Article 233 and the Malacca and Singapore straits under-keel clearance requirement 288
      7.6.1.2.4 Article 234 291
   7.6.2 General remedies available to the coastal State 292
7.7 International responsibility of the coastal State 296

8 Duties of ships and aircraft in transit 298
   8.1 General compliance duties of ships and aircraft in transit 298
   8.2 Specific duties of ships 301
      8.2.1 Article 40 301
      8.2.2 Article 41(7) 304
      8.2.3 Article 42(4) 304
      8.2.4 Article 39(2) 304
      8.2.4.1 Scope 305
      8.2.4.2 Generally accepted international regulations, procedures and practices 307
   8.3 Specific duties of aircraft 313
      8.3.1 Duty relating to radio frequency 314
      8.3.2 Duties relating to the Rules of the Air and safety of navigation 316
   8.4 Enforcement of the duties of ships and aircraft 322
      8.4.1 Immune ships and aircraft 322
      8.4.2 Private vessels and civil aircraft 323

9 Striking a balance between the sovereignty of States bordering straits and the right of transit 326
   9.1 Measures that create a physical impediment to passage 327
      9.1.1 Termination of the right of transit 327
      9.1.2 Restriction of the right of transit 328
         9.1.2.1 Land reclamation 328
         9.1.2.2 Bridges and other structures 331
         9.1.2.3 Areas to be avoided 341
   9.2 Measures that create requirements to be met by transiting ships 343
   9.3 Elements for a balanced approach 352
CONTENTS

PART V International co-operation for the safety of navigation and the prevention, reduction and control of pollution in straits 357

10 Preliminary remarks and genesis of Article 43 of the UNCLOS 359

11 Scope of Article 43: interpretation and suggested implementation 371
  11.1 Fees for service in the territorial sea, straits and archipelagic waters 371
  11.2 Co-operation by agreement 376
  11.3 Who are the users? 379
  11.4 Burden sharing and implementation of Article 43 382

12 Co-operative schemes: the special case of the Straits of Malacca and Singapore 391

PART VI Multiple regimes for straits? 403

13 UNCLOS as general framework 405

14 Marine protected areas 410
  14.1 UNCLOS 411
    14.1.1 Article 211(6) 411
    14.1.2 Article 234 413
  14.2 MARPOL 73/78 420
  14.3 Other conventional instruments 423
  14.4 Particularly Sensitive Sea Areas (PSSAs) 424
    14.4.1 General observations 424
    14.4.2 Impact on straits 430

PART VII Conclusions 443

15 Straits and dispute settlement 445
  15.1 Settlement of disputes under the UNCLOS: brief overview 445
  15.2 Disputes over the straits regime 448

16 Transit passage and customary law 452
  16.1 International custom and international conventions 452
  16.2 The UNCLOS, transit passage and customary international law 460
    16.2.1 Opinion of writers 460
CONTENTS

xii

16.2.2 Practice and *opinio juris* 462
16.2.3 Archipelagic sea lanes passage 470

17 Concluding remarks 473

Bibliography 476
Index 498
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Authors wish to acknowledge the assistance of the Library of the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea, Hamburg and the Library of the University of Queensland, Brisbane, as well as the Staff at Cambridge University Press for their kindness.