

The History Written on the Classical Greek Body

This book challenges historians of all periods to come to terms with the distortions that they systematically introduce into their work by relying on what has been written on paper, without looking at what was and was not written on the body. Historians use textual evidence to try to understand what people did in the past. But in interpreting that textual evidence they make assumptions about what past peoples could see. In particular they make assumptions about the way in which the classifications of language were visible to the eye, as well as conceivable in the mind. This book is concerned with the ways in which texts relating to classical Greece, and in particular to classical Athens, classified people, and with the extent to which those classifications could be seen by the eye. It compares the qualities distinguished in texts with those distinguished in sculpture and painted pottery and emphasises the frequent invisibility of the categories upon which historians have laid most stress - the citizen, the free person, the foreigner, even the god. The frequent impossibility of seeing who belonged to which category has major political, social and theological implications which are variously explored here. It also has implications for how history is written which go far beyond the case of classical Greece. Nothing short of a revolution in what historians are prepared to treat as source material will be required to take account of the findings of this book.

ROBIN OSBORNE is Professor of Ancient History at the University of Cambridge, a Fellow and Senior Tutor of King's College, and a Fellow of the British Academy. His research ranges broadly across Greek history, Greek archaeology and the history of Greek art. Along with numerous edited and co-edited volumes, he has written monographs on Demos: the Discovery of Classical Attika (Cambridge, 1985), Classical Landscape with Figures: the Ancient Greek City and its Countryside (1987), Greece in the Making, 1200–479 BC (1996, 2nd edn 2009), Archaic and Classical Greek Art (1998) and Greek History (2004). A collection of his papers has been published as Athens and Athenian Democracy (Cambridge, 2010). This book was written as a contribution to a project on 'Changing Beliefs of the Human Body' funded by the Leverhulme Trust.



The History Written on the Classical Greek Body

ROBIN OSBORNE





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521176705

© Robin Osborne 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Osborne, Robin, 1957–

The history written on the classical Greek body / Robin Osborne.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-00320-0 (hbk.) – ISBN 978-0-521-17670-5 (pbk.)

1. Human body – Social aspects – Greece – History – To 1500 – Historiography.

2. Greece – History – To 146 B.C. – Historiography. 3. Social classes – Greece –

History – To 1500 – Historiography. 4. Greece – Social conditions – Historiography. 5. Human body – Social aspects – Greece – History – To 1500 – Sources. 6. Greece –

History – To 146 B.C. – Sources. 7. Social classes – Greece – History – To 1500 – Sources.

8. Greece – Social conditions – Sources. 9. Historiography – Psychological aspects.

10 Historiagraphy Social conacts I Title

DF78.O83 2011

938.0072 - dc22 2011008370

ISBN 978-1-107-00320-0 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-17670-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of illustrations [page vii] Preface [xiii] *List of abbreviations* [xv] Introduction [1] 1 Writing history on the classical body [6] The history incorporated in words, and the history embodied in images [6] The words have a Greek for them [18] 2 The appearance of the classical Greek body [27] Greek athletics and the Greek body [27] The medical writers' body [37] The sculpted body [40] Drawing on the body [44] Bodies of thought [52] 3 The distinguished body [55] Distinguishing bodies in red-figure pottery [57] Distinguished men and distinguished women on gravestones [65] Social distinction? [75] 4 The citizen body [85] The citizenship debate [85] Aristotle and the classical concept of the citizens [88] Citizenship terminology in classical Greece [92] The invisible citizen body [105] 5 Foreign bodies [124] 6 Dirty bodies [158] 7 Godsbodies [185] Describing godsbodies [185] The theology of godsbodies [189]

v



vi Contents

The history of godsbodies [194] The Pheidian revolution and the alternatives [203]

8 Telling bodies [216]

References [231] Index [249]



Illustrations

- 1.1 Mask from Artemis Orthia Sanctuary, Sparta. Reproduced with permission of the British School at Athens [page 22]
- 2.1 Votive statue of a youth, ascribed by modern scholars to the hand of the sculptor Kritios. Acropolis Museum. Courtesy of Jeffrey Hurwit [28]
- 2.2 Roman copy identified as of the *Doryphoros* ('Spear-carrier') of the classical Greek sculptor Polykleitos. From Pompeii. Naples Museum. Reproduced with permission of the Soprintendenza Speciale per i Beni Archeologici di Napoli e Pompei [42]
- 2.3 Copy identified as of the *Diadoumenos* ('Athlete crowning himself') of the classical Greek sculptor Polykleitos. From Delos. National Archaeological Museum, Athens. © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund [43]
- 2.4 Écorche figure in pose of Herakles from the Athenian red-figure amphora in Havana ascribed to the Berlin Painter. Courtesy of Professor Donna Kurtz [46]
- 2.5 Herakles from an Athenian red-figure hydria from Vulci, ascribed to the Berlin Painter, c. 480 BC. Havana Lagunillas Collection, ARV 209.163. Colección Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes [47]
- 2.6 Satyr from the Athenian red-figure amphora from Vulci after whom the Berlin Painter is named, *c.* 480 BC. Berlin Staatliche Museen 2160, *ARV* 196.1. Courtesy of Hirmer Fotoarchiv, Munich [48]
- 2.7 Drawing of the so-called Apollo Belvedere by Bandinelli, *c.* 1516–17. Biblioteca Ambrosiana, Milan [51]
- 3.1 Athenian red-figure amphora found at Vulci ascribed to the Andokides Painter, *c.* 520 BC. © Bildarchiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz, Berlin, 2010 [57]
- 3.2 Scene of athletes on the exterior of an Athenian red-figure cup signed by Pheidippos as painter and Hischylos as potter. ARV 166.11.© Trustees of the British Museum [58]
- 3.3 Scene of hieroscopy from an Athenian red-figure amphora from Vulci ascribed to the Kleophrades Painter, *c.* 500 BC. *ARV* 181.1. Martin von Wagner Museum der Universität Würzburg [60]

vii



viii List of illustrations

- 3.4 Scene of revelling from the other side of the amphora shown in Fig. 3.3. Martin von Wagner Museum der Universität Würzburg [60]
- 3.5 Scene of confrontation between women and male figures on a hydria attributed to the Harrow painter from Vulci. *ARV* 276.70. Tampa Museum of Art. Joseph Veach Noble Collection, purchased in part with funds donated by Mr and Mrs James L. Ferman, Jr [62]
- 3.6 Athenian red-figure cup attributed to the Euaion Painter, showing a woman spinning, *c.* 470 BC. Berlin, Staatliche Museen 31426, *ARV* 795.100. © Bildarchiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz, Berlin, 2010 [64]
- 3.7 Grave stele of Ktesileos of Erythrai and Theano from Athens,
 c. 400 BC. CAT 2.206. National Archaeological Museum, Athens.
 © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund [66]
- 3.8 Grave stele of Agakles son of Phrynichos from Khasani (Argyropolis),
 c. 400 BC. CAT 1.100. National Archaeological Museum, Athens.
 © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund [68]
- 3.9 Grave stele of Stephanos from Tanagra, *c.* 400 BC. *CAT* 2.214. National Archaeological Museum, Athens. © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund [69]
- 3.10 Grave stele of Pausimache from Paiania, first half of the fourth century BC. *CAT* 1.283. National Archaeological Museum, Athens. © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund [71]
- 3.11 Grave stele said to have been found in Athens or Attica, *c.* 400 BC. *CAT* 1.182. National Archaeological Museum, Athens. © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund [72]
- 4.1 Athenian red-figure pelike after which the Pig Painter is named, c. 460 BC. ARV 564.27. Reproduction by permission of the Syndics of the Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge [107]
- 4.2 Athenian kouros from Anavyssos, Athens National Museum 3851. Courtesy of Hirmer Fotoarchiv Munich [109]
- 4.3 Roman copy of statues of the Athenian 'tyrannicides', Harmodios and Aristogeiton. Naples, Museo Nazionale. Bartl, D-DAI-Rom 1958.1789 [112]
- 4.4 'Warrior A' recovered from the sea off Riace Marina, Calabria, *c.* 460 BC. Reggio Museum. Courtesy of Alinari [114]
- 4.5 'Warrior B' recovered from the sea off Riace Marina, Calabria, *c.* 460 BC. Reggio Museum. Courtesy of Alinari [115]
- 4.6 Roman copy of a portrait of the comic poet Poseidippos of Kassandreia, after an original of the mid third century BC.



List of illustrations

ix

- Reproduced with permission of Direzione dei Musei, Città del Vaticano [119]
- 4.7 Plaster reconstruction of the portrait statue of the Athenian comic poet Menander, of the early third century BC. Archäologisches Institut der Universität Göttingen, Collection of Plaster Casts, Photo Stephan Eckardt [120]
- 4.8 Grave stele of Hegeso from Kerameikos Cemetery, Athens. Athens National Museum. Courtesy of Hirmer Fotoarchiv, Munich [121]
- 5.1 Grave stele of Antipatros of Sidon, from Athens, *CAT* 3.410. Courtesy of Marie Mauzy [125]
- 5.2 Athenian red-figure amphora from Vulci, name-vase of the Copenhagen Painter, *c.* 470 BC. Department of Classical and Near Eastern Antiquities, National Museum of Denmark, inv. no. ChrVIII320 [131]
- 5.3 Athenian red-figure column krater from Sicily attributed to the Pan Painter, *c.* 470 BC. Thracian women attacking Orpheus. *ARV* 551.9. Staatliche Antikensammlungen und Glyptothek München [131]
- 5.4 Athenian red-figure pelike related to the workshop of the Niobid Painter, *c.* 460 BC, height 44 cm (17 5/16 in.). Andromeda between two black Africans. Museum of Fine Arts, Boston. Arthur Tracy Cabot Fund. 63.2663 [132]
- 5.5 Athenian red-figure pelike from Boiotia, ascribed to the Pan Painter, c. 470 BC. ARV 554.82. National Archaeological Museum, Athens. © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund [133]
- 5.6 One side of an Athenian red-figure pelike attributed to the manner of the Altamura Painter, *c.* 460 BC. *ARV* 596.1. Bernisches Historisches Museum (BHM). Photo Y. Hurni [134]
- 5.7 The other side of the Athenian red-figure pelike shown in Fig. 5.6. *ARV* 596.1. Bernisches Historisches Museum (BHM). Photo Y. Hurni [135]
- 5.8 Athenian red-figure cup from Chiusi attributed to Douris, *c.* 480 BC. *ARV* 432.55. Reproduced with permission of the Archivio Fotografico SBAT [136]
- 5.9 Athenian red-figure krater attributed to the Pan Painter, *c.* 460 BC. Naples Museum. *ARV* 551.15. Reproduced with permission of the Soprintendenza Speciale per i Beni Archeologici di Napoli e Pompei [137]
- 5.10 Athenian white-ground alabastron showing a black African, *c.* 480 BC. *ARV* 269 (ascribed to the Painter of New York 21.131).



x List of illustrations

- Staatliche Museen zu Berlin Preussischer Kulturbesitz Antikensammlung, inv. 3382 [139]
- 5.11 Athenian black-figure 'head vase' *c.* 500 BC. *ARV* 1529.1. Museum of Fine Arts, Boston. Pierce Fund. 00.332 [140]
- 5.12 Athenian red-figure hydria attributed to the Aegisthos Painter, *c.* 470 BC. Thracian women slaves at a fountain. *ARV* 506.29. Paris, Louvre. © RMN / Hervé Lewandowski [141]
- 5.13 Satyr dressed up in Thracian cloak and boots as the god Hermes on a psykter (wine-cooler) signed by the painter Douris, *c.* 470 BC. *ARV* 446.262. © Trustees of the British Museum [142]
- 5.14 Cavalry in Thracian caps from the frieze of the Parthenon, North XLIV. © Trustees of the British Museum [143]
- 5.15 Revellers on Athenian red-figure cup from Vulci attributed to Douris, c. 470 BC. ARV 438.132. Staatliche Antikensammlungen und Glyptothek München [146]
- 5.16 A pipe-player wearing an *ependutēs* over a sleeveless chiton, Athenian red-figure amphora attributed to the Kleophrades Painter, *c.* 480 BC. *ARV* 183.15. © Trustees of the British Museum [148]
- 5.17 Small child wearing a *kandus* on an Athenian red-figure chous, c. 400 BC. National Archaeological Museum, Athens. © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund [150]
- 5.18 Athenian grave stele (the 'Kamini' stele) with Persian iconography, c. 350 BC. National Archaeological Museum, Athens. © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund [150]
- 5.19 Athenian white-ground lekythos, name-vase of the so-called Beldam Painter, c. 460 BC. National Archaeological Museum, Athens.
 © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund [153]
- 6.1 Athenian red-figure column krater from Bologna, attributed to the Painter of Brussels R330, *c.* 440 BC. *ARV* 930.104. © Bologna, Museo Civico Archeologico. From Bologna, Certosa graveyard, tomb 218 (inv. no. 18845) [159]
- 6.2 Grave stele from Oropos, of Plangon who died in childbirth,
 c. 320 BC. CAT 4.470. National Archaeological Museum, Athens.
 © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund
 [160]
- 6.3 White-ground lekythos attributed to the Sabouroff Painter, *c.* 450 BC. *ARV* 846.190. © The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Rogers Fund, 1907 (07.286.40) [161]



List of illustrations

xi

- 7.1 Roman Imperial bronze coin minted in Elis in the reign of Hadrian representing Pheidias' statue of Zeus. After *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 28 (1908) 49 [186]
- 7.2 Protoattic amphora from Eleusis attributed to the Polyphemos Painter. Eleusis Museum. © Hellenic Ministry of Culture / Archaeological Receipts Fund [195]
- 7.3 Mantiklos' Apollo, Late Geometric or Early Orientalising Period,
 c. 700–675 BC, Thebes. Bronze figure, height 20.3 cm (8 in.).
 Museum of Fine Arts, Boston. Francis Bartlett Donation of 1900.
 03.997 [197]
- 7.4 Late archaic Apollo from Peiraieus. Photograph: Eva-Maria Czakó, DAI Athens, Neg. D-DAI-ATH-NM 5568 [199]
- 7.5 Chryselephantine head from the Halos Deposit (restored), late sixth century BC. Delphi Museum. Efa / Ph. Collet [201]
- 7.6 Plan of Parthenon. Courtesy of Professor Manolis Korres [203]
- 7.7 Reconstruction of the Athena Parthenos. With permission of the Royal Ontario Museum © ROM [205]
- 7.8 Late fifth-century BC statue of Aphrodite from the Athenian Agora. American School of Classical Studies at Athens: Agora Excavations [210]
- 7.9 Roman copy of Praxiteles' Aphrodite of Knidos, *c.* 350 BC. Vatican. Courtesy of Hirmer Fotoarchiv, Munich [211]
- 7.10 Roman copy of Praxiteles' Apollo Sauroktonos, *c.* 350 BC. Paris Louvre. © RMN / Hervé Lewandowski [212]
- 7.11 Fragment of an Apulian pot, fourth century BC. Allard Pierson Museum Amsterdam 2579 [213]
- 7.12 Statue of Demeter from Knidos, second half of fourth century BC.
 © Trustees of the British Museum [214]
- 8.1 Terracotta statuette of a comic actor, fourth century BC. Courtesy of New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art 13.225.18 [229]



Preface

Many histories have been and could be written on the classical Greek body. That I have written this particular history is owed in the first instance to the initiative of my colleague John Robb, who enlisted me to be part of a research project on 'Changing Beliefs of the Human Body from the Palaeolithic to Modern Medical Anthropology', and to the generosity of the Leverhulme Foundation in funding that project. In second place it is due to the kind invitation of the Wiles Trust to deliver the Wiles Lectures at Queen's University Belfast in May 2008. For any historian the invitation to deliver Wiles Lectures is an honour and a privilege, but for an ancient historian it is a particularly daunting prospect to follow the trail blazed by E. R. Dodds, whose *Pagan and Christian in an Age of Anxiety* (Cambridge, 1965), and M. I. Finley, whose *Politics in the Ancient World* (Cambridge, 1983) formed the Wiles Lectures in 1963 and 1980 respectively.

It is the precious peculiarity of the Wiles Lectures that not only are the lectures extensively discussed but the members of the History Department at Queen's are joined for those discussions by scholars invited from elsewhere. I am therefore most grateful not only to David Hayton, David Whitehead and the Queen's University department but to Roger Brock, Ashley Clements, James Davidson, Nick Fisher, Lin Foxhall, Oswyn Murray, Boris Rankov, Claire Taylor and Stephen Todd, who gave up a week of their own research time to listen to these lectures and debate their ideas and arguments. They will see from the text that follows how much I am in their debt.

This book has grown out of research and teaching ancient Greek history and Greek art and archaeology over many years. But this particular development of my ideas has been stimulated by the rich academic interactions of my Cambridge environment, both within the Leverhulme research project and outside it. More conversations than I can reasonably record have left their mark on my text and on my vision. I am particularly grateful to Catherine Osborne, Michael Squire and Caroline Vout for reading and commenting on drafts of the lectures and the additional chapters of this book. My research assistants, Ben Keim and Philippa Steele, played an invaluable part in preparing the book for publication, and Philippa prepared the index. I am grateful to them, and to the valiant copy-editor, Jan Chapman.

xiii



Abbreviations

ABL C. H. Haspels (1936) Attic Black-figure Lekythoi.

Paris.

ARV J. D. Beazley (1963) Attic Red-figure Vase-painters.

Second edition. Oxford.

Bekker, Anecdota Graeca I. Bekker (1814–21) Anecdota Graeca. 3 vols. Berlin.

CAT C. W. Clairmont (1993) Classical Attic Tombstones.

8 vols. Kilchberg.

GDI F. Bechtel and others (eds.) (1884–8) Sammlung der

griechischen Dialekt-Inschriften. 5 vols. Göttingen.

IG Inscriptiones Graecae. Berlin.

LGPN P. M. Fraser and others (eds.) (1987–) Lexicon of

Greek Personal Names. 5 vols. to date. Oxford.

LIMC L. Kahil and others (eds.) (1981–99) Lexicon

 $iconographicum\ mythologiae\ classicae.\ 17\ vols.\ Zurich.$

ML R. Meiggs and D. M. Lewis (eds.) (1969) A Selection

of Greek Historical Inscriptions to the End of the Fifth

Century BC. Oxford. Revised edition (1988).

RO P. J. Rhodes and R. Osborne (eds.) (2003) Greek

Historical Inscriptions 404-323 BC. Oxford.

SEG Supplementum epigraphicum Graecum (1923–)
SIG W. Dittenberger (ed.) (1915–24) Sylloge

Inscriptionum Graecarum. Third edition. Leipzig.