

Contents

<i>List of Figures, Tables, and Boxes</i>	<i>page</i> xii
<i>Preface</i>	xv
1 Modelling as a Method of Enquiry	1
PART I: CHANGING THE PRACTICE OF ECONOMIC SCIENCE	1
1. From Laws to Models, From Words to Objects	1
2. The Naturalization of Modelling in Economics	6
3. Practical Reasoning Styles	14
3.i Modelling as a Style of Reasoning	14
3.ii Modelling as a Reasoning Style in Economics	17
PART II: MAKING MODELS, USING MODELS	19
4. Making Models to Reason With: Forms, Rules, and Resources	19
4.i Giving Form	20
4.ii Becoming Formal	26
4.iii Reasoning Resources	27
5. Modelling as a Method of Enquiry: The World in the Model, Models of the World	30
6. Conclusion	37
2 Model-Making: New Recipes, Ingredients, and Integration	44
1. Ricardo, The “Modern” Economist?	44
2. Ricardo, His Economy, and the Economy of His Day	47
2.i David Ricardo, Esq.	47
2.ii Economics Matters, Experimental Farming Matters	51
3. Constructing Ricardo’s Numerical Model Farm and Questions of Distribution	56
3.i The Numbers in Ricardo’s <i>Principles</i> and Experimental Accounts	58
3.ii The Spade-Husbandry Debate	69
4. Ricardo’s Model Farm and Model Farming	73

4.i	Three Model Farms in One	74
4.ii	A Model Farm that Worked According to Ricardo's Economic Ideas	75
4.iii	A Model of an Individual Farm in the Period	76
4.iv	A Model Farm for the Whole Agricultural Sector	78
5.	Model-Making: Creating New Recipes	79
5.i	Ingredients	79
5.ii	Fitting Things Together: Integration and Reasoning Possibilities	81
	Appendix 1: Numerical Argument in Ricardo's 1815 Essay	83
3	Imagining and Imaging: Creating a New Model World	91
1.	Introduction	91
2.	Acts of Translation or a New Way of World-Making?	93
3.	Making the Mathematical Economic World in Models	96
4.	The Artist's Space versus the Economist's Space	98
5.	The History of the Edgeworth Box Diagram – as Told by Itself	106
5.i	Edgeworth's Imagination and Image	107
5.ii	Pareto's Imagination and Images	115
6.	The World Newly Made in the Model: Questions of Representation?	118
6.i	Visualization	118
6.ii	Newness	126
7.	Seeing the World in the Model	129
8.	Conclusion	131
4	Character Making: Ideal Types, Idealization, and the Art of Caricature	136
1.	Introduction	136
2.	Characterizing Economic Man: Classical Economists' <i>Homo Economicus</i>	138
3.	Concept Forming: Weber's Ideal Types and Menger's Human Economy	141
4.	Symbolic Abstraction: Jevons' Calculating Man	145
5.	Exaggerating Qualities: Knight's Slot-Machine Man	150
6.	Making a Cartoon into a Role Model: Rational Economic Man	153
7.	The Art of Caricature and Processes of Idealization	157
8.	Model Man's CV: De-Idealization and the Changing Roles of Economic Man	164
5	Metaphors and Analogies: Choosing the World of the Model	172
1.	From Metaphors to Analogical Models	172
2.	The Newlyn-Phillips Machine	176
3.	The Machine's Inventors: Walter Newlyn and Bill Phillips	184

<i>Contents</i>		ix
4.	Inventing the Newlyn-Phillips Machine	187
	<i>Step 1: Phillips chooses the analogy for his supply/demand model</i> <i>(early 1949)</i>	189
	<i>Step 2: Newlyn designs the blueprint for a monetary circulation</i> <i>machine (Easter 1949)</i>	194
	<i>Step 3: Phillips and Newlyn build the prototype Machine</i> <i>(Summer 1949)</i>	200
5.	Analogical Models and New Things	204
6	Questions and Stories: Capturing the Heart of Matters	217
1.	Introduction	217
2.	Stories to Shape Model Resources: Frisch's Macro-Dynamic Scheme	218
3.	Questions and Stories Capturing Keynes' <i>General Theory</i>	221
	3.i Modelling Keynes' <i>General Theory</i> : Meade	222
	3.ii Reasoning with Models: The External and Internal Dynamics	225
	3.iii Modelling Keynes' <i>General Theory</i> : Samuelson	228
4.	Finding New Dimensions and Telling New Stories	232
	4.i Modelling Keynes' <i>General Theory</i> : Hicks	232
	4.ii Demonstrations, Variety, and Fruitfulness	236
5.	Capturing the Heart of the Matter with Narratives	239
	5.i Narratives and Identity in the World of the Model	239
	5.ii Model Narratives and Making Sense of the Economic World	242
	5.iii Narrative as a Testing Bed for Models	246
6.	Where Next?	251
7	Model Experiments?	256
1.	Introduction	256
2.	Experiments in the World of the Model	258
	2.i Mangoldt and Jenkin	259
	2.ii Marshall	267
	2.iii Conceptual Work: Defining Generic Categories	270
3.	Models in 'Laboratory' Experiments	272
4.	Comparison: Model Experiments and Laboratory Experiments	277
	4.i Controls and Demonstration	277
	4.ii Experimental Validity and The Inference Gap	282
5.	Hybrids	288
	5.i Virtually Experiments	288
	5.ii The Status of Hybrids	292
6.	Materials Matter: Surprise versus Confoundment	293

8	Simulation: Bringing a Microscope into Economics	301
1.	The Birth of a New Technology	301
2.	Simulation: Content and Context	304
3.	Shubik and Simulation	307
3.i	Martin Shubik's History	307
3.ii	Models, Simulated Environments, and Simulated Behaviour	311
4.	Guy Orcutt's History and "Microsimulation"	315
5.	Bringing a Microscope into Economics	320
5.i	Introducing the Analogy	322
5.ii	Matters of Scale and Kind	323
5.iii	Specimens = Models	325
6.	How Do Simulations Work as Microscopes?	327
7.	The Observation–Inference Problem	331
8.	Conclusion	336
9	Model Situations, Typical Cases, and Exemplary Narratives	344
1.	Introduction	344
2.	War Games	345
3.	The Exemplary Narrative	348
3.i	The Prisoner's Dilemma: Collaborate or Defect?	348
3.ii	The Economists' Dilemma: Individual Rationality or Invisible Hand?	351
4.	The Commentator's Dilemma: Fitting Together Situations, Narratives, and Cases	357
4.i	Reasoning about Situations	357
4.ii	Explanatory Depth: The Roles of Narratives	361
4.iii	Explanatory Breadth: Taxonomies, Kinds, and Cases	368
5.	Conclusion	372
10	From the World in the Model to the Model in the World	378
1.	Introduction	378
2.	Models: The New Working Objects of Economics	380
2.i	Model Worlds and Working Objects	380
2.ii	Small Worlds, Miniature Worlds, Compressed Worlds?	384
3.	The Work of Working Objects	387
3.i	Materials for Describing and Theorizing	387
3.ii	"Abstract Typical Representations" and Model Inductions	389
4.	Modelling: The New Way of Practising Economics	393
4.i	Assumptions in Practices	394
4.ii	Network of Models	396
4.iii	Community Matters	399

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00297-5 - The World in the Model: How Economists Work and Think

Mary S. Morgan

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

	<i>Contents</i>	xi
5.	Models in the World	400
5.i	Models: New Instruments for Acting in the World	400
5.ii	Seeing Small Worlds in the Big World	405
	<i>Index</i>	413

Colour plate section appears between pages 126 and 127

Figures, Tables, and Boxes

Figures

1.1	Quesnay's <i>Tableau Économique</i> (1767)	page 4
1.2	The Prehistory of Models	7
1.3	First-Generation Models	9
1.4	Second-Generation Models	11
1.5	Models: The Variety of Forms	22
1.6	The Reasoning Resources in Models	29
1.7	The Phillips-Newlyn Hydraulic Machine	35
2.1	Gatcomb Park, Country Home of David Ricardo	49
2.2	Ricardo's Model Farm Showing His Laws of Distribution	67
2.3	Newspaper Report of a Farming Experiment with Spade Husbandry	71
2.4	Ricardo's Table from His 1815 Essay	85
3.1	Humphrey's Modern Version of the Edgeworth Box	92
3.2	The Artist's Edgeworth Box by Koen Engelen	99
3.3	The Artist's vs the Modern Economist's Version of the Box	104
3.4	Historical Sequence of Original Box Diagrams Part I	110
3.5	Historical Sequence of Original Box Diagrams Part II	119
3.6	Matching the Modern Economist's Diagrams to the Original Box Diagrams	124
4.1	Menger's Consumption Schedule	143
4.2	Jevons' Utility Curve (1871)	147
4.3	Philippon's Art of Caricature (1834)	161
5.1	Walter Newlyn Demonstrating the Prototype Machine 1950	177
5.2	Drawing of the Mark II Machine	179
5.3	Cartoon of the Machine from <i>Punch</i> , 1953, by Rowland Emmett	182
5.4	Bill Phillips' Undergraduate Essay Diagrams and the Inspiration from Boulding, 1948/9	190

Figures, Tables, and Boxes

xiii

5.5	Bill Phillips' Undergraduate Monetary-Circulation Diagram, 1948/9	193
5.6	Walter Newlyn's Blueprint Design for the Machine, May 1949	197
5.7	Bill Phillips (left) and Walter Newlyn (right) Complete the First Tank of the Machine, Summer 1949	202
5.8	Irving Fisher's Arithmetical, Mechanical, and Accounting Versions of His Monetary Balance	205
6.1	Samuelson's Arithmetic Simulation	229
6.2	Samuelson's Model Solution Graph	231
6.3	Hicks' IS-LL "Little Apparatus"	235
7.1	Mangoldt's Supply and Demand Model Experiments	260
7.2	Mangoldt's Model Experiment for Complementary Goods	263
7.3 & 7.4	Fleeming Jenkin's Supply and Demand Curve Experiments	265
7.5	Marshall's Diagrammatic Model Experiments	269
7.6	Chamberlin's "Real-Model" Experimental Results	274
7.7	Smith's First Classroom Experimental Results with the Market Model	276
8.1	Shubik's 1960 Bibliography: Subject Map for "Simulation" and "Gaming"	305
8.2	Shubik's 1960 Bibliography: Subject Map for "Monte Carlo" and "Systems"	306
8.3	Martin Shubik's Experiences of Simulation	311
8.4	Guy Orcutt's New Micro-Simulation Recipe	319
8.5	Slutsky's Random Shock Simulation	332
9.1	Game Theory in Tosca	346

Tables

Table 7.1	Model Experiments and Laboratory Experiments	279
Table 7.2	Model Experiments, Laboratory Experiments, and Inferential Scope	283

Box

Box 9.1	Koertge's Schema	358
---------	------------------	-----