

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00250-0 - Buying Defence and Security in Europe: The EU Defence and Security Procurement Directive in Context

Martin Trybus

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	page xvi
<i>Table of cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of legislation and other instruments</i>	xxx
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xliv

Introduction	1
--------------	---

## PART I The context of the Defence Directive 15

1	The political and economic context of the Defence Directive Buyers, sellers, and national security	17
1	Introduction	17
2	The economic context	18
2.1	Who is buying? Demand of defence and security goods and services in the EU	18
2.2	Who is selling? The structure of the European defence and security market	21
2.2.1	The European defence market: prime contractors	22
2.2.2	The European security market: prime contractors	26
2.2.3	Subcontractors	27
2.3	Economic characteristics of defence procurement	27
2.3.1	Buying European as a last resort: protectionism or buy American	28
2.3.2	Monopsony	31
2.3.3	Monopolies	33
2.3.4	Duplication	33
2.3.5	High costs	35
2.3.6	State ownership and control	37
2.3.7	Inefficiency	38
3	The political and military background	39
3.1	Sovereignty and autarky	40

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00250-0 - Buying Defence and Security in Europe: The EU Defence and Security Procurement Directive in Context

Martin Trybus

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

viii

## CONTENTS

3.2	National security	41
3.2.1	Security of supply	42
3.2.2	Security of information	43
3.2.3	The military security cost of non-Europe in defence	44
3.3	The pull and push towards deeper European defence and security integration	45
4	Technological and contractual characteristics of defence procurement	49
4.1	Research and development	50
4.1.1	Off-the-shelf purchases	50
4.1.2	Research and development procurement	51
4.2	Long life cycles	52
4.3	Collaboration	53
4.4	Offsets	54
4.5	Long supply chains	57
4.6	Public-private partnerships	57
4.7	Corruption	58
5	Conclusions	58
2	The legal base of the Defence Directive in EU Internal Market law: Prohibitions, exemptions and proportionality	61
1	Introduction	61
2	The EU Internal Market and defence and security procurement	62
2.1	The free movement of goods	63
2.2	The free movement of services and the freedom of establishment	67
2.3	The prohibition of discrimination on grounds of nationality	70
2.4	The public security exemption	70
2.4.1	Public security	72
2.4.2	The narrow interpretation: <i>Johnston, Sirdar, Kreil, and Dory</i>	73
2.4.3	The proportionality test: <i>Campus Oil</i> and <i>Greek Petroleum Law</i>	76
2.4.3.1	Proportionality	76
2.4.3.2	<i>Campus Oil</i>	79
2.4.3.3	<i>Greek Petroleum Law</i>	80
2.4.4	Intensity of scrutiny – a real, specific and serious risk: <i>Albore</i>	81
3	Internal Market legal bases of the Defence Directive	82
4	Conclusions	83

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00250-0 - Buying Defence and Security in Europe: The EU Defence and Security Procurement Directive in Context

Martin Trybus

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

ix

3	Defence derogations from the Treaty: Articles 346 and 347 TFEU	85
1	Introduction	85
2	The armaments exemption of Article 346(1) (b) TFEU	87
2.1	The List of armaments according to Article 346(2) TFEU	88
2.1.1	Armaments on the List	90
2.1.2	Material not on the List	94
2.1.3	Military use: the <i>Agusta</i> case law and <i>Finnish Turntables</i>	96
2.1.4	Armaments intended for exports: <i>Fiocchi Munizioni</i>	103
2.2	The effect of Article 346 (1)(b) TFEU	104
2.2.1	Not necessary for national security: <i>Spanish Weapons</i> and beyond	108
2.2.1.1	Intensity of scrutiny	110
2.2.1.2	Proportionality	113
2.2.2	Burden of proof	119
2.2.3	Derogation on a case-by-case basis	120
2.2.4	Procedural requirements and hard defence material intended for export	121
2.2.5	When the review procedure under Article 348 TFEU is used	122
2.3	The Commission's 2006 Interpretative Communication	125
2.4	Summary: the interpretation of Article 346(1)(b) TFEU	127
3	The secrecy exemption of Article 346 (1) (a) TFEU	128
3.1	Abuse of Article 346(1)(a) TFEU	129
3.2	Intensity of scrutiny: <i>German Military Exports</i>	131
4	The crisis situations exemption in Article 347 TFEU	133
5	Conclusions	134
4	The EU law and policy context beyond the Defence Directive: Intra-Community transfers, exports, standardisation, competition law, mergers, and State aid	136
1	Introduction	136
2	Trade in armaments and dual use goods	138
2.1	Customs duties	139
2.2	Intra-Community transfers	139
2.2.1	Intra-Community transfers of armaments	140
2.2.1.1	Situation before the ICT Directive	143
2.2.1.2	Intra-Community transfers and procurement	146
2.2.1.3	The ICT Directive	147

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00250-0 - Buying Defence and Security in Europe: The EU Defence and Security Procurement Directive in Context

Martin Trybus

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

x

## CONTENTS

2.2.2	Intra-Community transfer of dual-use goods: Regulation 428/2009/EC	156
2.3	Defence exports	160
2.3.1	Exports of dual-use goods	161
2.3.2	Exports of armaments: Common Position 2008/944/CFSP	163
3	Standardisation	166
4	Competition (anti-trust) law: Articles 101 and 102 TFEU	169
5	Merger control	172
6	State aid	176
6.1	State aid practices in the defence sector	176
6.2	Legality of State aid practices under the TFEU	181
7	Other activities	182
8	Conclusions	183
5	European armaments law and policy outside the EU Internal Market: EDA, OCCAR, Letter of Intent and NATO	185
1	Introduction	185
2	The European Defence Agency	186
2.1	The organisational structure of the EDA	187
2.2	The tasks of the EDA	189
2.2.1	Development of policies	189
2.2.1.1	The EDA Procurement Code	191
2.2.1.2	Offsets and subcontracting	198
2.2.1.3	Enforcement and remedies	207
2.2.1.4	Compatibility of the EDA Procurement Code with the Defence Directive	209
2.2.2	Evaluation of national capability commitments	217
2.2.3	Pooling and sharing	218
2.2.4	Collaborative projects and joint research programmes	218
2.3	The EDA as part of the CSDP of the Treaty of Lisbon	221
3	OCCAR	222
4	Letter of Intent	225
4.1	The LoI Framework Agreement Treaty	226
4.2	Tasks	227
4.3	Yet another framework	230
5	Bilateral initiatives	231
6	Overcoming the fragmentation of defence procurement frameworks	232
6.1	Going the way of the WEAO: overcoming external fragmentation	233

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00250-0 - Buying Defence and Security in Europe: The EU Defence and Security Procurement Directive in Context

Martin Trybus

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

xi

6.2	Overcoming internal fragmentation	237
7	NATO Agencies	239
8	Conclusions	240

## PART II The contents of the Defence Directive 243

6	Inside or outside the Defence Directive: Limitation of scope	245
1	Introduction	245
2	The personal scope of the Defence Directive: covered contracting entities	248
2.1	The abstract definition of contracting authorities	248
2.1.1	The State, regional or local authorities	249
2.1.1.1	Ministries of Defence and the armed forces	249
2.1.1.2	Contracting authorities other than Ministries of Defence and the armed forces	251
2.1.2	Bodies governed by public law	252
2.1.3	Utilities	253
2.1.4	Central purchasing bodies	255
2.1.4.1	Is the EDA a central purchasing body?	256
2.1.4.2	Are OCCAR and LOI central purchasing bodies?	258
2.2	The lack on an Annex IV for the Defence Directive	259
3	The material scope of the Directive: covered contracts	260
3.1	Military equipment	261
3.2	Sensitive contracts	263
3.3	Other included contracts	265
3.4	The Defence Directive and the other procurement Directives	266
4	The material scope of the Directive: excluded contracts	267
4.1	In-house contracts	268
4.2	The thresholds of the Defence Directive	269
4.3	Exceptions	272
4.3.1	Article 12 Defence Directive: contracts awarded under international rules	272
4.3.2	Article 13 Defence Directive: specific rules	276
4.3.2.1	Secrecy	278
4.3.2.2	Intelligence activities	281
4.3.2.3	Cooperative programmes	283
4.3.2.4	Contracts of forces deployed outside the territory of the Union	288
4.3.2.5	Government-to-government contracts	292
4.3.2.6	Contracts for R&D services	299

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00250-0 - Buying Defence and Security in Europe: The EU Defence and Security Procurement Directive in Context

Martin Trybus

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xii

## CONTENTS

4.3.3	Article 11 Defence Directive: the safeguard clause?	301
4.4	The Defence Directive and the TFEU	303
4.5	The Defence Directive and the Public Sector Directive	305
4.6	The Defence Directive and the Utilities Directive	307
5	Transposition	307
6	Conclusions	308
7	Security through flexibility: The procurement procedures of the Defence Directive	310
1	Introduction	310
2	No open procedure	312
3	The restricted procedure	318
4	The (default) negotiated procedure with prior publication of a contract notice	322
5	Competitive dialogue	331
6	Negotiated procedure without prior publication of a contract notice	336
6.1	Situations <i>not</i> specific to the Defence Directive	338
6.2	Situations specific to the Defence Directive	341
6.2.1	Urgency resulting from a crisis	342
6.2.2	Armed forces deployed abroad	344
6.2.3	Research and development services	345
6.2.4	Summary	346
6.3	Control mechanism	347
7	Other procedures in the Defence Directive	347
7.1	Framework agreements	348
7.2	Electronic auctions	350
7.3	Dynamic purchasing systems	350
8	Cooperative programmes based on research and development (R&D)	351
8.1	European Space Agency	352
8.2	The Defence Directive	355
8.3	Public Sector Directive 2014/24/EU: innovation partnerships	355
9	Conclusions	356
8	Security of supply and security of information: Description in the specifications, contract conditions, qualification and award criteria	358
1	Introduction	358
1.1	Security of supply	359
1.2	Security of Information	361
2	Contract notice, technical specifications and contract conditions	362
2.1	Technical specifications	364

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00250-0 - Buying Defence and Security in Europe: The EU Defence and Security Procurement Directive in Context

Martin Trybus

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

xiii

2.2	Contract performance conditions	366
2.2.1	Security of supply	368
2.2.1.1	Export, transfer and transit of goods associated with the contract	368
2.2.1.2	Restrictions on disclosure, transfer or use	370
2.2.1.3	Organisation of the supply chain	371
2.2.1.4	Additional needs resulting from a crisis	373
2.2.1.5	Maintenance, modernisation and adaptation	375
2.2.1.6	Industrial changes	376
2.2.1.7	Ceasing of production	376
2.2.1.8	Conclusions on contract conditions concerning security of supply	377
2.2.2	Security of information	379
2.2.2.1	Commitment to safeguard confidentiality	379
2.2.2.2	Information on subcontractors	380
2.2.3	Description	381
2.3	National transposition	381
3	Qualification of bidders	382
3.1	Exclusion of unsuitable candidates	383
3.1.1	Professional conduct	384
3.1.2	Grave professional misconduct	384
3.1.3	Risks to the security of the Member State	386
3.2	Economic and financial standing and technical and professional capacity	388
3.2.1	Study and research facilities	389
3.2.2	Geographical location of sources	390
3.2.3	Classified information and security clearances	392
3.2.4	Security of supply and information as technical capacity criteria	397
3.3	Invitation to bid or negotiate: selection	398
3.4	National transposition	400
4	Award criteria	400
5	Conclusions	403
9	Addressing the structure of the European defence industries: Substituting offsets with subcontracts?	406
1	Introduction	406
2	Offsets and subcontracts in defence procurement	406
3	Offsets in EU Internal Market law and the Defence Directive	410
3.1	Offsets under the TFEU	411
3.2	Offsets and the Defence Directive	418
3.3	Commission Guidance Notes	422
3.4	National laws of the Member States	425

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00250-0 - Buying Defence and Security in Europe: The EU Defence and Security Procurement Directive in Context

Martin Trybus

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xiv

## CONTENTS

4	The subcontracting regime of the Defence Directive	428
4.1	Options for subcontracting	430
4.1.1	Option A: the prime contractor is free to choose subcontractors	431
4.1.2	Option B: awarding subcontracts on the basis of competitive procedures	432
4.1.3	Option C: awarding minimum percentage of subcontracts on the basis of competitive procedures	434
4.1.4	Option D: requirement of minimal percentage to be subcontracted and competition for subcontract beyond the minimal percentage	436
4.2	Subcontracting requirements in the prime contract award procedure	438
4.3	Title III: rules applicable to subcontracting	440
4.3.1	Scope	440
4.3.2	Principles	441
4.3.3	Thresholds and advertising	445
4.3.4	Framework agreements	446
4.3.5	Qualitative selection	447
4.3.6	Exception clause	448
4.3.7	Award criteria	450
4.3.8	Subcontracts awarded by prime contractors which are contracting authorities or entities	451
4.4	The new Public Sector Directive 2014/24/EU	451
5	Conclusions	452
10	The ‘hidden Remedies Directive’: Review and remedies in the Defence Directive	455
1	Introduction	455
2	The need for review and remedies	456
2.1	The “hidden” Remedies Directive	458
2.2	Security derogations in the TFEU	460
3	Adapting Public Sector Directive 2004/18/EC	462
3.1	Limitation	462
3.2	Flexibility	464
3.3	Description	465
3.4	Substitution	466
4	Adapting the Public Sector Remedies Directive	467
4.1	Review bodies	468
4.2	Security in the review bodies	471



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00250-0 - Buying Defence and Security in Europe: The EU Defence and Security Procurement Directive in Context

Martin Trybus

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

---

CONTENTS

xv

4.3	Interlocutory proceedings	474
4.4	Ineffectiveness	477
5	Conclusions	481
	Conclusions and recommendations	484
	<i>Bibliography</i>	493
	<i>Index</i>	503