

GOVERNING RISK IN GM AGRICULTURE

This book addresses the issues and methods involved in governing risks posed by genetically modified (GM) agriculture. It examines the evolution of policies intended to ensure the safety of GM crops and food products in the United States and Europe, and the regulatory approaches and other social controls employed to protect human health, the environment, conventional farming and foods, and the interests and rights of consumers.

Discussion encompasses the cultural, political, and economic forces that shape the design and application of the methods of risk governance, as well as other contextual features such as the influence of multinational companies seeking acceptance of their GM ventures. This discussion also examines the influence of the dynamic public discourse fostered by progressive concepts of risk governance and the approaches taken to meet its demands for transparency, public participation, and appropriate consideration of public perceptions and values despite conflicting views of experts.

Michael Baram is Professor Emeritus at Boston University School of Law. He is the author of seven books and more than 110 articles on the social control of hazardous technologies in the United States and Europe. His research, publications, and legal and advisory activities have dealt with regulation, liability, and industrial management of risks to public and worker health and safety and the environment in several technological sectors.

Mathilde Bourrier is Professor of Sociology at the University of Geneva, Switzerland. She is the author of three books and has published numerous articles in international journals. Her research, publications, and advisory activities deal with the social construction of safety, safety management, and organizational reliability in medical, nuclear, and other technological risk sectors.



Governing Risk in GM Agriculture

Editors

Michael Baram

Boston University, School of Law

Mathilde Bourrier

University of Geneva







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107001473

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2011

First paperback edition 2014

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data Governing risk in GM agriculture / edited by Michael Baram, Mathilde Bourrier.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-00147-3 (hardback)

Genetically modified foods – Law and legislation.
 Genetically modified foods – Safety measures.
 Risk. I. Baram, Michael S. II. Bourrier, Mathilde, 1966 – III. Title: Governing risk in genetically modified agriculture.

1700– III. Title. Governing risk in genetically modified agric

K3927.G68 2010

344.04´232 – dc22 2010031498

ISBN 978-1-107-00147-3 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-44002-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	Preface	<i>page</i> vii
	Contributors	ix
1	Governing Risk in GM Agriculture: An Introduction Michael Baram and Mathilde Bourrier	1
Pa	art I: Risk Governance and Public Discourse	
2	Governance of GM Crop and Food Safety in the United States Michael Baram	15
3	The European Union's Regulatory Framework: Developments in Legislation, Safety Assessment, and Public Perception Marianna Schauzu	57
4	The Dutch Approach to Safety Governance of GM Agriculture Hubert P. J. M. Noteborn and Freija H. van Duijne	85
5	Evolution of the Regulatory System for GM Crops in Brazil Paulo José Leite Farias and Juliana Mezzomo Allain	113

٧



> **CONTENTS** νi Part II: Future Challenges 6 Coexistence and Traceability of GMOs in the **Agro-Food Sector** 139 Klaus Menrad, Tobias Hirzinger, and Daniela Reitmeier 7 The "Pharming" Challenge 169 Armin Spök 8 GMO as a Sustainability Issue: The Role of the Global Reporting Initiative 201 Philip J. Vergragt and Halina Szejnwald Brown 9 Applying Safety Science to Genetically Modified **Agriculture** 235 Mathilde Bourrier Index 268



Preface

New technologies may provide a vast array of societal benefits but may also threaten established interests and values, and human and environmental well-being. Thus, modern democratic societies strive to address their potential, reduce uncertainties, exploit their benefits, and minimize risks by a variety of means. Such is the case with the introduction of perhaps the most challenging technology of all, biotechnology, which provides methods of genetic manipulation that are being introduced into the agricultural and food systems of nations across the globe.

This book aims to illuminate the issues and methods involved in addressing the uncertainties and risks of genetically modified (GM) agriculture. It therefore deals with the evolution of policies intended to ensure the safety of GM crops and food products, and the diverse regulatory approaches and other social controls they employ to protect human health, the environment, conventional farming and foods, and the interests and rights of consumers.

Discussion of the policies encompasses cultural, political, and economic forces that shape their design and application, as well as other contextual features such as the influence of multinational companies seeking acceptance of their GM ventures. This discussion also examines the influence of the dynamic public discourse that is fostered by progressive concepts of risk governance, and approaches taken to meet its demands for transparency, public participation, and appropriate consideration of public perceptions and values despite conflicting views of experts.

vii



viii PREFACE

The contributors to this book were brought together and encouraged to undertake this multidisciplinary effort by the late Professor Bernhard Wilpert of the Technical University of Berlin. Our efforts were carried out under the aegis of NeTWork, an international consortium of faculty and professionals from various organizations and disciplines that he conceived and directed for twenty-six years. Over this period, NeTWork activities have led to many workshops and publications on issues arising from the introduction of new technologies and methods of analysis and social control, including the publication of fourteen books, six special issues of professional journals, and numerous papers by the many participants inspired by their involvement in NeTWork. Further NeTWork activities are under the direction of Professor Gudela Grote, Swiss Federal Institute of Technology (ETH-Zurich); Professor Mathilde Bourrier, University of Geneva; Dr. Babette Fahlbruch, TUV Nord (Berlin); and Dr. Gilles Motet of the Fondation pour une Culture de Securite Industrielle (Toulouse).

The coeditors wish to gratefully acknowledge the support of Professor Wilpert and his staff at the Technical University of Berlin, and the several organizations that provided the resources needed to sustain NeT-Work over the years: the Werner Reimers Foundation (Bad Homburg), the Maison des Sciences de l'Homme (Paris), Eindhoven University, the Technical University of Berlin, the Netherlands Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment, and now the Fondation pour une Culture de Securite Industrielle (Toulouse).

Finally, we dedicate this book to the memory of our distinguished colleague and humanistic mentor, Bernhard Wilpert.

Professors Michael Baram and Mathilde Bourrier



Contributors

Juliana Mezzomo Allain is a social psychologist at the Federal University do Santa Catarina, Brazil. Her articles and research focus on social representations of science, technology, and environment.

Michael Baram is Professor Emeritus, Boston University School of Law. His research, publications, legal, and advisory activities have dealt with regulation, liability, and industrial management of risks to public and worker health and safety and the environment in several technological sectors, including chemical and biotechnological processes and products, and nuclear and other energy-related activities.

Mathilde Bourrier is Professor of Sociology, University of Geneva, Switzerland. Her research, publications, and advisory activities deal with the social construction of safety, safety management, and organizational reliability in medical, nuclear, and other technological risk sectors.

Halina Szejnwald Brown is Professor of Environmental Science and Policy at Clark University, Worcester, Massachusetts, and was previously a chief toxicologist for state government. Her research and publications deal with the corporate role in sustainability transition, sociotechnical innovation, and environmental policy.

Paulo José Leite Farias is a public prosecutor in the Department for the Protection of Environmental and Urban Interests of the Federal District and Territories of Brazil (MPDFT) and Law Professor (IDP and IESB).

ix



x CONTRIBUTORS

He is the author of works on constitutional, environmental, water, and urban law.

Tobias Hirzinger holds a Ph.D. in Economics and has conducted research on the organization and costs of GMO-related traceability measures in the food industry.

Klaus Menrad is Professor of Marketing and Management at the Straubing Center of Science, which involves five German universities. His research and publications deal with innovations in the agro-food chain and the coexistence of GM and non-GM crops in agriculture and food processing.

Hubert P. J. M. Noteborn is Deputy Director, Office for Risk Assessment of the Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority (VWA) in the Netherlands. He develops strategies for addressing risks in the food and feed chains through proactive risk management and stakeholder engagement, and has published on plant genetic breeding, food safety, and risk analysis.

Daniela Reitmeier of the German Biogas Association has conducted research on coexistence between GM and non-GM crops at the Straubing Center.

Marianna Schauzu, Department of Food Safety, Federal Institute for Risk Assessment in Berlin, is responsible for coordinating safety assessments of GMO and derived food and feed. She is a member of German delegations to the OECD Task Force for the Safety of Novel Foods and Feeds and to the CODEX Task Force on Foods Derived from Biotechnology.

Armin Spök is head of the biotechnology research unit at IFZ – Inter-University Research Centre for Technology, Work, and Culture in Graz, Austria. A member of expert groups at EFSA and OECD, and a lecturer at several universities, he specializes in technology assessment of biotechnology and risk governance.



CONTRIBUTORS xi

Freija H. van Duijne holds a Ph.D. on Risk Perception in Consumer Product Use and is a member of the Office for Risk Assessment of the Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority (VWA) in the Netherlands. Her work addresses consumer behavior and risk perception with regard to innovative products.

Philip J. Vergragt is a Professor Emeritus of Technology Assessment at Delft University of Technology, Senior Associate at Tellus Institute, and a Research Professor at Clark University. His research interests are technological innovation for sustainability, sustainable consumption and system innovation, and small-scale experimentation and learning. He has published more than seventy academic papers and book chapters, and coauthored two books.