

EXTRALEGAL GOVERNANCE

Drawing on insights from sociology and new institutional economics, *Extralegal Governance* provides the first comprehensive account of China's illegal markets by applying a socio-economic approach. It considers social legitimacy and state repression in examining the nature of illegal markets. It examines how power dynamics and varying levels of punishment shape exchange relationships between buyers and sellers. It identifies context-specific risks and explains how private individuals and organizations address these risks by developing extralegal governance institutions to facilitate social cooperation across various illegal markets. Adopting a multiple case study design to sample China's illegal markets, this book utilizes four cases – street vending, small property rights housing, corrupt exchanges, and online loan sharks – to examine how market participants foster cooperation and social order in illegal markets.

Peng Wang is Associate Professor in the Department of Sociology, the University of Hong Kong. He is the author of *The Chinese Mafia: Organized Crime, Corruption, and Extra-Legal Protection* (2017). His research interests include organized crime, illegal markets, corruption, economic sociology, bureaucracy, and governance.

Wanlin Lin is Associate Professor at the School of Law, Sun Yat-sen University, Guangzhou, China. Her current research applies institutional economics, law and economics, and game theory to the study of informal property rights, illegal markets, and knowledge governance in China, and interactions between formal and informal institutions.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN ECONOMICS, CHOICE, AND SOCIETY

Founding Editors

Timur Kuran, *Duke University*
 Peter J. Boettke, *George Mason University*

This interdisciplinary series promotes original theoretical and empirical research as well as integrative syntheses involving links between individual choice, institutions, and social outcomes. Contributions are welcome from across the social sciences, particularly in the areas where economic analysis is joined with other disciplines such as comparative political economy, new institutional economics, and behavioral economics.

Books in the Series:

PAUL DRAGOS ALIGICA, *Public Entrepreneurship, Citizenship, and Self-Governance*

TERRY L. ANDERSON AND GARY D. LIBECAP, *Environmental Markets: A Property Rights Approach*

ADAM CREPELLE, *Becoming Nations Again: The Journey Towards Tribal Self-Determination*

SHELBY GROSSMAN, *The Politics of Order in Informal Markets: How the State Shapes Private Governance*

MORRIS B. HOFFMAN, *The Punisher's Brain: The Evolution of Judge and Jury*

RANDALL G. HOLCOMBE, *Political Capitalism: How Political Influence Is Made and Maintained*

ROGER KOPPL, *Expert Failure*

PETER T. LEESON, *Anarchy Unbound: Why Self-Governance Works Better Than You Think*

MICHAEL C. MUNGER, *Tomorrow 3.0: Transaction Costs and the Sharing Economy*

JENNIFER BRICK MURTAZASHVILI, AND ILIA MURTAZASHVILI, *Land, the State, and War Property Institutions and Political Order in Afghanistan*

ALEX NOWRASTEH AND BENJAMIN POWELL, *Wretched Refuse?: The Political Economy of Immigration and Institutions*

BENJAMIN POWELL, *Out of Poverty: Sweatshops in the Global Economy (First Edition)*

BENJAMIN POWELL, *Out of Poverty: Sweatshops in the Global Economy (Second Edition)*

JEAN-PHILIPPE PLATTEAU, *Islam Instrumentalized: Religion and Politics in Historical Perspective*

JARED RUBIN, *Rulers, Religion, and Riches: Why the West Got Rich and the Middle East Did Not*

VERNON L. SMITH AND BART J. WILSON, *Humanomics: Moral Sentiments and the Wealth of Nations for the Twenty-First Century*

CASS R. SUNSTEIN, *The Ethics of Influence: Government in the Age of Behavioral Science*

ANDREAS THIEL, WILLIAM A. BLOMQUIST, AND DUSTIN E. GARRICK, *Governing Complexity: Analyzing and Applying Polycentricity*

CAROLYN M. WARNER, RAMAZAN KILINÇ, CHRISTOPHER W. HALE, AND ADAM B. COHEN, *Generating Generosity in Catholicism and Islam: Beliefs, Institutions, and Public Goods Provision*

TAIZU ZHANG, *The Laws and Economics of Confucianism: Kinship and Property in Preindustrial China and England*

TAISU ZHANG, *The Ideological Foundations of Qing Taxation: Belief Systems, Politics, and Institutions*

Extralegal Governance

The Social Order of Illegal Markets in China

PENG WANG

University of Hong Kong

WANLIN LIN

Sun Yat-sen University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-62214-1 — Extralegal Governance
Peng Wang, Wanlin Lin
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009622141
DOI: 10.1017/9781009622158

© Peng Wang and Wanlin Lin 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009622158

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Wang, Peng (Assistant professor of criminology) author | Lin, Wanlin author

Title: Extralegal governance : the social order of illegal
markets in china / Peng Wang, Wanlin Lin.

Description: Cambridge ; New York : Cambridge University
Press, 2025. | Series: Cambridge studies in economics, choice, and
society | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2024061866 | ISBN 9781009622141 hardback | ISBN 9781009622158 ebook

Subjects: LCSH: Black market – China | Black marketeers –
Social aspects – China | China – Social conditions

Classification: LCC HF5482.65.C5 W36 2025 | DDC 381.0951–dc23/eng/20250505

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2024061866>

ISBN 978-1-009-62214-1 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-009-62217-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
1 Introduction	1
2 Developing a Socio-economic Approach for Analyzing the Social Order of Illegal Markets	16
3 Unmasking China’s Illegal Markets: Research Design and Fieldwork	42
4 Unlicensed Street Vending	59
5 The Small Property Right Housing Market	81
6 Corrupt Transactions	110
7 The Illegal Online Lending Market	140
8 Conclusion	163
<i>Bibliography</i>	175
<i>Index</i>	203

Figures

2.1 Mechanisms of extralegal governance.	<i>page 19</i>
3.1 Urban management officers confiscating an unlicensed street vendor's stall and merchandise (author's photo).	48
3.2 Small property right housing in Zheng Ge Zhuang, one of the largest informal housing communities in Beijing (author's photos).	49
3.3 An illegal peer-to-peer lending company's post announcing its expansion to over seventy universities and inviting new business partners to join it (author's photo).	56
4.1 Uncertainties encountered by street vendors.	60
4.2 The establishment of private governance organizations by street vendors to redress uncertainties.	64
4.3 Sharing information about well-priced supplies and risk avoidance strategies in a QQ group.	65
4.4 Sharing information about well-priced supplies in a QQ group.	66
4.5 Street vendors avoid selling similar goods (author's photos).	68
4.6 Sprayed words in Chinese meaning "occupied" (author's photos).	70
4.7 A vendor's posts in an online chat group warning his friends of city administrators' strict enforcement.	72
4.8 The purchase of third-party protection by street vendors.	75
4.9 The authorized "license" showing the monthly rental payment.	76
4.10 A summary of major strategies employed by street vendors.	79
5.1 China's dual-track land system.	85

Tables

3.1	The use of analytical dimensions to identify core features of cases selected	<i>page 44</i>
7.1	Predatory lenders’ interest calculation method	153
7.2	Equal principal payment method	153
7.3	Equal total payment (amortization) method	154
7.4	An online student loan	155

Acknowledgments

This book is the intellectual outcome of a cross-disciplinary research collaboration between two scholars: One is a qualitative criminologist specializing in utilizing sociological concepts and theories in explaining illegal transactions and the underworld economy, while the other is an institutional economist whose PhD dissertation used fieldwork data to examine informal property rights and community governance in China. The first author has spent the past decade investigating illegal transactions and unlawful markets. He has managed to “plant several trees” (i.e., publishing several journal articles, each of which focuses on the essential institutions developed by the participants in a specific market). However, his efforts are far from enough to “nurture a grove/forest” (i.e., publishing a book), which requires a systematic examination of illegal markets and extralegal institutions as well as detailed and comprehensive theoretical discussions and empirical analyses. The idea of writing this book appeared when the second author joined the first author’s research team. Continuous discussions and long-term debates on extralegal governance institutions, along with a combination of fieldwork data from several illegal markets, have made this book possible.

The book has greatly benefited from comments and feedback given by a number of outstanding researchers. Ilia Murtazashvili, David Skarbek, Jingyi Wang, and Shitong Qiao read Chapters 1 and 2 and provided constructive comments. Li Ding, Shitong Qiao, and George Lin provided important insights that helped us complete Chapter 5. Cheris Shun-ching Chan, Ling Li, Li Li, and Jack Barbalet helped us build up a theoretical framework for studying corrupt transactions and intermediaries, which are the focuses of Chapter 6. Jianhua Xu and Paul Joosse read Chapter 7 and provided very helpful suggestions. Federico Varese, Xiaoying Qi, Jiangnan Zhu, Ling Li, Li Li, Jing Vivian Zhan, Xiaoli Tian, David Palmer, Sylvia Martin, Hualing

Fu, Ming Wen, Yahong Li, Xiaojun Yan, Hanyu Xiao, Eric Fong, William Hayward, Rebecca Wong, Mark Pennington, Emily Skarbek, Peter J. Hill, Jennifer Murtazashvili, and John Meadowcroft offered helpful suggestions and support at different stages. Special thanks go out to our research collaborators, including Anli Jiang, Jingyi Wang, Mei Su, Mengliang Dai, and Li Li, for sharing their valuable data with us. We also extend our gratitude to our interviewees for participating in our research and sharing their knowledge and experiences with us. Extracts from interviews originally in Chinese have been translated into English by us.

We are grateful for the financial support of the Research Grants Council in Hong Kong (Project Nos. 27615017, 17608821, and 17613224). This support, along with research leave from the University of Hong Kong (HKU), enabled us to conduct fieldwork in China. We are also grateful to the Faculty of Social Sciences at HKU for allowing us to use the Research Clusters PDF Scheme to fund the second author's research position for more than two years at HKU. Several rounds of Seed Fund for Basic Research supplied by HKU enabled us to recruit research assistants for transcribing the interviews and conducting preliminary analyses. Our heartfelt thanks go to Zhang Xiang, president and vice-chancellor of HKU, and his senior management team members for their immense efforts in safeguarding academic freedom and protecting HKU researchers who conduct research on politically sensitive topics. Without President Zhang's support, it would have been impossible for us to complete this book.

At Cambridge University Press, we would like to extend special thanks to Peter Boettke and Timur Kuran, general editors of Cambridge Studies in Economics, Choice, and Society, as well as to our editorial assistant, Sable Gravesandy. Their unwavering support throughout all stages of publishing this book is greatly appreciated. We also want to thank the external reviewers for their anonymous reports and constructive reviews. For our academic writing, we are grateful to Hilary Wright for her long-term help in editing and proofreading all our writings.

Most of all, we would like to thank our family members, who have unconditionally supported us. The first author would like to express his sincere appreciation to his wife, Jingyi, along with his parents and parents-in-law, for their dedicated care of him and his two lovely sons, Hairui and Shichong. The second author would like to thank her parents, Deping Lin and Chujuan Wang, and her close friend Li Ding for their support and encouragement.

PERMISSIONS

Chapter 4 is an updated version of “Governance and informal economies: Informality, uncertainty and street vending in China” (coauthored with Anli Jiang), which was published in the *British Journal of Criminology*, volume 62, issue 6 (November 2022); Chapter 7 is an updated version of “Organized crime in cyberspace: How traditional organized criminal groups exploit the online peer-to-peer lending market in China” (coauthored with Mei Su and Jingyi Wang), which was published in the *British Journal of Criminology*, volume 61, issue 2 (March 2021). The coauthors kindly allowed us to reuse them in this book. The two chapters are reproduced with the permission of Oxford University Press.