

After Equality

After Equality tackles one of the biggest challenges facing LGBT activists in many parts of the world: how to move beyond inclusive legislation to ensure that LGBT people can exercise their newly acquired rights. Drawing from in-depth interviews and ethnographic observation with two lesbian organizations in Buenos Aires, Argentina, and Cape Town, South Africa, Julie Moreau explores the ways that organizations use identity to make rights useful. Engaging interdisciplinary scholarship and intersectional theory, Moreau develops a novel approach to identity strategizing that explains how activists engage multiple identities to challenge the relationships between identity categories and address the ways interlocking systems of power affect their constituents. By analyzing sexual identity as always constructed through race, class, and gender, the book transforms how scholars understand the role of identity in the strategic repertoires of social movement organizations and illuminates dimensions of identity politics that surface in the aftermath of legal inclusion.

Julie Moreau is an assistant professor of Political Science and Sexual Diversity Studies at the University of Toronto. She specializes in LGBTQ politics, social movements, and citizenship.

Cambridge Studies in Gender and Politics

Cambridge Studies in Gender and Politics addresses theoretical, empirical, and normative issues at the intersection of politics and gender. Books in this series adopt incisive and comprehensive approaches to key research themes concerning the construction and impact of sex and gender, as well as their political and social consequences, across all subfields of political science.

General Editors

Lisa Baldez, *Dartmouth College* (Lead)
 Karen Beckwith, *Case Western Reserve University*
 Christina Wolbrecht, *University of Notre Dame*

Editorial Advisory Board

Phillip Ayoub, *University College London*
 Abby Cordova, *University of Notre Dame*
 Kristin Goss, *Duke University*
 Chryl Laird, *University of Maryland, College Park*
 Danielle Thomsen, *University of California, Irvine*
 Vesla Weaver, *Johns Hopkins University*
 Laurel Weldon, *Simon Fraser University*

Books in the Series

Aili Mari Tripp, *Women and Power in Postconflict Africa*
 Mala Htun, *Inclusion without Representation in Latin America: Gender Quotas and Ethnic Reservations*
 J. Kevin Corder and Christina Wolbrecht, *Counting Women's Ballots: Female Voters from Suffrage through the New Deal*
 Mala Htun and S. Laurel Weldon, *The Logics of Gender Justice: State Action on Women's Rights Around the World*
 Kristin N. Wylie, *Party Institutionalization and Women's Representation in Democratic Brazil*
 Rachel E. Brulé, *Women, Power, and Property: The Paradox of Gender Equality Laws in India*
 Ana Catalano Weeks, *Making Gender Salient: From Gender Quota Laws to Policy*
 James N. Druckman and Elizabeth A. Sharrow, *Equality Unfulfilled: How Title IX's Policy Design Undermines Change to College Sports*
 Margaret Perez Brower, *Intersectional Advocacy: Redrawing Policy Boundaries Around Gender, Race, and Class*
 Julie Moreau, *After Equality: LGBT Activism in Argentina and South Africa*

After Equality

LGBT Activism in Argentina and South Africa

JULIE MOREAU

University of Toronto



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-009-59300-7 — After Equality
 Julie Moreau
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009593007

DOI: 10.1017/9781009592963

© Julie Moreau 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the
 DOI 10.1017/9781009592963

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Moreau, Julie author

TITLE: After equality : LGBT activism in Argentina and South Africa / Julie Moreau.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge
 University Press, 2025. | Series: Cambridge studies in gender and
 politics | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2024055819 | ISBN 9781009593007 hardback |
 ISBN 9781009592963 ebook

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Gay rights – Argentina | Gay rights – South Africa | Gay
 liberation movement – Argentina | Gay liberation movement – South Africa |
 Gay people – Argentina – Social conditions | Gay people – South
 Africa – Social conditions | Group identity – Argentina | Group
 identity – South Africa

CLASSIFICATION: LCC HQ76.5 .M67 2025 | DDC 306.760968–dc23/eng/20250428
 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024055819>

ISBN 978-1-009-59300-7 Hardback
 ISBN 978-1-009-59301-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

To Mom and Dad

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page ix</i>
Introduction	I
1 An Intersectional Approach to Citizenship and Identity Strategizing	4
2 LGBT Inclusion: From Outcasts to Citizens	8
3 Intersectionality and the Construction of Sexuality	12
4 Strategizing Identity	14
5 The Research Process: Case Selection and Methods	15
6 Organization of the Book	19
I Intersectionality and the Strategic Use of Identity in Social Movements	22
1.1 Understanding Identity in Social Movements	24
1.2 An Intersectional Approach to Identity Strategizing	32
1.3 Outcomes of Identity Strategizing	36
1.4 Conclusion	40
2 Identity in Context: Situating Lesbian Activism in Argentina and South Africa	42
2.1 Argentina: Colonialism and the Consolidation of the State	44
2.2 Argentina: Political and Discursive Opportunities	47
2.3 Argentina: Intramovement and Organizational Dynamics	55
2.4 Argentina: Opposition and Oppositional Discourse	61
2.5 South Africa: Colonialism and the Consolidation of the State	65
2.6 South Africa: Political and Discursive Opportunities	68
2.7 South Africa: Intramovement and Organizational Dynamics	73
2.8 South Africa: Opposition and Oppositional Discourse	79
2.9 Conclusion	85

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
3	Making Identity Work: Comparing Identity Strategies of Commensurability and Visibility	87
3.1	Commensurability in Free Gender	89
3.2	Lesbian Visibility in La Fulana	102
3.3	Conclusion	117
4	Dilemmas of Success: Identity Strategies and State Engagement	119
4.1	Becoming Agents of the State: Working in Argentina’s INADI	122
4.2	Autonomy, Cooptation, and Clientelism	130
4.3	Ambivalent Engagement with State Institutions in South Africa	133
4.4	NGOization and Social Change	145
4.5	Offloading Opportunity? Negotiating Neoliberal Inclusion	146
5	In the Flesh: Embodying Rights in the Public Sphere	149
5.1	“To Give Support”: Identity Strategy and Public Mourning	152
5.2	Connecting the Personal to the Political: Lesbian Visibility at the Buenos Aires Pride March	163
5.3	Conclusion: Embodying Identity, Living Rights	173
6	Intersectionality, Identity Strategizing, and the Future of LGBT Inclusion	175
6.1	Implications	179
6.2	Applications, Extensions, and Limitations	181
6.3	The Fragility of Inclusion	185
6.4	Suggestions for Future Research	189
	<i>Appendix: Methodological Choices</i>	193
	<i>References</i>	197
	<i>Index</i>	229

Acknowledgments

This project would not have been possible without the support of generous editors, advisors, colleagues, friends, and family.

I would like to thank my editor at Cambridge University Press, Rachel Blaifeder, for her guidance and advice. I am grateful to three anonymous reviewers of my manuscript for their insightful comments and suggestions, all of which improved the book tremendously. I am also grateful to the editors of the Cambridge Studies in Gender and Politics series: Karen Beckwith, Christina Wolbrecht, and Lisa Baldez. I am especially indebted to Lisa for her patient reading, generous feedback, and sustained belief in this project.

This project began as a dissertation. My deepest thanks go to my supervisor Philip Oxhorn, for years of advice, pep-talks, inspiration, and direction. Kathleen Fallon has been a mentor, friend, and source of support for over a decade. I cannot express how fortunate I am to have met Ashley Currier, who, aside from being an intellectual powerhouse, showed me the academic ropes again and again. Without Ashley I would not have had the academic opportunities that allowed me to write this book. I am very grateful to my colleagues and friends in the Political Science Department at McGill: Ora Szekey, Ece Atikcan, Melanee Thomas, Marc-Andre Bodet, Theo McLauchlin, Erin Crandall, Aviad Rubin, Merouan Mekouar, Sarah Malik, Andrea Lawlor, Jeff Sachs, John Hutchings, and Douglas Hanes.

This project would not have been possible without the more than 100 people who took the time to talk to me and share their insights and experiences. I am above all grateful to Claudia Castro and Funeka Soldaat for having faith in me, inspiring me with their courage and commitment to

activism, and for their incredible senses of humor. I would also like to thank scholars from the University of Buenos Aires: Aluminé Moreno, Josefina Brown, Patricia Schwartz, and Renata Hiller. In Cape Town, advice and intellectual inspiration came from scholars Natasha Distiller, Zethu Matebeni, Susan Holland-Muter, and Mikki van Zyl.

My colleagues and friends at Northern Arizona University, Meredith Heller and Stephen Nuño-Pérez, have been incredible sources of support. I am forever grateful to my amazing colleagues and mentors at Washington University in St. Louis: Rebecca Wanzo, Amber Musser, Jeffry McCune, Mary Ann Dzuback, Jordache Ellapen, and my postdoctoral supervisor Andrea Friedman. The time I spent at Wash U enriched the manuscript immensely. Thank you to other colleagues and friends who offered advice, support and inspiration at all stages of this process: Dana Seitler, Natalie Oswin, Phillip Ayoub, Jordi Díez, Xavier Livermon, TJ Tallie, Nancy Whittier, and Cricket Keating. I could not have finished this book without the patient reading and brilliant comments of my colleagues in the Political Science Department at the University of Toronto: Kate Neville, Janine Clark, Emily Nacol, Linda White, Melissa Williams, Ed Schatz, and Kanta Murali, and writing-and-reading-group comrades Filiz Kahraman, Martha Balaguera, Nadège Camporé, María Méndez, Diana Fu, Laura García Montoya, Jessica Neame, and Yujia Shi. Invaluable research assistance came from Alfonso Manolo, Natalia Peña, and Joel Canto-Roche. The manuscript would never have made it to completion without the moral support and developmental editing of Leanne Powner. I am also grateful to Lucy Metzger for her skillful copy-editing. I would like to thank all my students of LGBTQ politics over the years for their intellectual curiosity that kept me motivated and helped me imagine an audience for this book.

I am the luckiest person in the world for the family that I have. Thank you to Chris, Rachael, Henry, and Heidi Moreau for your encouragement. To my mom and dad, thank you for your unconditional love and support. Remi, Loretta, and Deacon, thank you for your faithful companionship and gentle nudging to go outside. Finally, my partner and best friend, Avni Shah, thank you for accompanying me on this (very) long journey and for your relentless optimism along the way.

Acknowledgments

xi

Sections of Chapter 3 appear in Moreau, Julie. 2015. “Intersectional citizenship, violence, and lesbian resistance in South Africa.” *New Political Science* 37(4): 494–508. Reprinted by permission of the publisher (Taylor & Francis Ltd, www.tandfonline.com/).

Sections of Chapter 4 appear in Moreau, Julie & Ashley Currier. 2017. “Overlapping publics and the negotiation of legitimacy in South African and Namibian sexual politics.” *Space and Polity* 21(1): 27–42. Reprinted by permission of the publisher (Taylor & Francis Ltd, www.tandfonline.com/).

Sections of Chapter 5 appear in Moreau, Julie. 2017. “‘Homophobia hurts’: Mourning as resistance to violence in South Africa.” *Journal of Lesbian Studies* 21(2): 204–218. Reprinted by permission of the publisher (Taylor & Francis Ltd, www.tandfonline.com/).