## FREEDOM AND PERFECTION

Leibniz, this study argues, is the genuine initiator of German Idealism. His analysis of freedom as spontaneity and the relations he establishes among freedom, justice, and progress underlie Kant's ideas of rightful interaction and his critiques of Enlightened absolutism. Freedom and Perfection offers a historical examination of perfectionism, its political implications and transformations in German thought between 1650 and 1850. Douglas Moggach demonstrates how Kant's followers elaborated a new ethical-political approach, 'post-Kantian perfectionism', which, in the context of the French Revolution, promoted the conditions for free activity rather than state-directed happiness. Hegel, the Hegelian School, and Marx developed this approach further with reference to the historical process as the history of freedom. Highlighting the decisive importance of Leibniz for subsequent theorists of the state, society, and economy, Freedom and Perfection offers a new interpretation of important schools of modern thought and a vantage point for contemporary political debates.

DOUGLAS MOGGACH is Distinguished University Professor in Political Studies and Philosophy at the University of Ottawa, and Honorary Professor, School of Humanities at the University of Sydney. His publications, in nine languages, include *Philosophy and Politics of Bruno Bauer* (Cambridge, 2003); *The New Hegelians* (Cambridge, 2006); *Politics, Religion, and Art* (Northwestern, 2011); and (as co-editor), *The 1848 Revolutions and European Political Thought* (Cambridge, 2018).

### IDEAS IN CONTEXT

# *Edited by* DAVID ARMITAGE, RICHARD BOURKE, ADOM GETACHEW and JENNIFER PITTS

The books in this series will discuss the emergence of intellectual traditions and of related new disciplines. The procedures, aims and vocabularies that were generated will be set in the context of the alternatives available within the contemporary frameworks of ideas and institutions. Through detailed studies of the evolution of such traditions, and their modification by different audiences, it is hoped that a new picture will form of the development of ideas in their concrete contexts. By this means, artificial distinctions between the history of philosophy, of the various sciences, of society and politics, and of literature may be seen to dissolve.

A full list of titles in the series can be found at: www.cambridge.org/IdeasContext

# FREEDOM AND PERFECTION

German Political Thought from Leibniz to Marx

DOUGLAS MOGGACH

University of Ottawa/University of Sydney







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009590433

DOI: 10.1017/9781009590419

© Douglas Moggach 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009590419

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 978-1-009-59043-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For EU product safety concerns, contact us at Calle de José Abascal, 56, 1, 28003 Madrid, Spain, or email eugpsr@cambridge.org.

### Contents

Acknowledgements		<i>page</i> vi
I	Thinking Freedom	I
2	Leibniz: Spontaneity, Justice, and Perfection	29
3	Receptions of Leibniz: Wolff and Herder	58
4	The Kantian Revolution	83
5	Foundational Arguments: Humboldt and Dalberg on the Scope and Ends of the State	126
6	Friedrich Schiller: Perfection, Freedom, and Beauty	152
7	Fichte: The Labour of Spontaneity	180
8	Hegel as Post-Kantian Perfectionist	214
9	Hegelian Perfectionism before 1848	246
10	Karl Marx: Historical Perfectionism	284
	Conclusion	319
Select Bibliography Index		324 335

v

# Acknowledgements

In writing this book I have incurred numerous debts. My research has been generously funded by the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada and the University of Ottawa, and, in its early stages, by the Canada Council for the Arts and the Killam Foundation. I am grateful to King's and to St Catharine's Colleges, Cambridge, for visiting appointments in 2022–2023. During my extended residency in Cambridge, I completed most of the manuscript, profiting from discussions with Gareth Stedman Jones, Richard Bourke, Paul Cartledge, Fernanda Gallo, Ross Harrison, Miri Rubin, Martin Ruehl, Michael Sonenscher, Sylvana Tomaselli, and many other colleagues. Michael Quante and Ludwig Siep in Münster were frequent interlocutors over the years that I reflected on the theme of this book, and I collaborated with Michael and with Nadine Mooren on a collective volume on the subject in 2017–2020. In Sydney I have enjoyed regular participation in the Australian Hegel Society and illuminating discussions with Paul Redding, Charles Barbour, Bruin Christensen, Jean-Philippe Deranty, Heikki Ikäheimo, Simon Lumsden, David Macarthur, and their students. Jack Arn, Kieran Furlong, Kaan Kangal, Koula Mellos, Gabriele Schimmenti, and Gareth Stedman Jones read extensive portions of the draft manuscript and provided valuable insights, though all remaining errors are my own. Two anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press offered helpful criticisms of unclarities and omissions, which I have attempted to rectify. I delivered invited presentations in Australia, Canada, China, France, Germany, Iceland, Italy, Spain, the UK, and the US, and I thank the hosts and participants in these events. The initial outlines of this manuscript emerged from an intensive postgraduate course which I gave at Fondazione San Carlo, Modena, in 2012 and an advanced seminar which I was invited to teach at the College of Humanities, Carleton University, Ottawa, in autumn 2014. The enthusiastic reception by exceptional students and colleagues there was an incentive to pursue

#### Acknowledgements

this project further, and, eventually, to complete it. My profoundest debt is to my family, to the sustaining memory of my parents and my aunts, and to Alison, Iain, and Catriona for their love and unfailing support. To them I dedicate this book, with gratitude and appreciation.

As the fruition of many years of research, the book draws on previously published material, though in all cases the text has been reframed and extensively rewritten. I acknowledge permission to reprint this work, with revisions, from the following sources:

From Cambridge University Press: Extracts from The Philosophy and Politics of Bruno Bauer, 2003; 'Humboldt and Dalberg on the Limits of State Action', in J. Clarke and G. Gottlieb, eds., Practical Philosophy from Kant to Hegel: Freedom, Right, and Revolution, 2021, pp. 192–212; 'German Republicans and Socialists in the Prelude to 1848', in D. Moggach and G. Stedman Jones, eds., The 1848 Revolutions and European Political Thought, 2018, pp. 216–35; 'German Idealism and Marx', The Impact of Idealism – the Legacy of Post-Kantian German Thought, ed. Nicholas Boyle and J. Walker: vol. 2, 2013, pp. 82–107; 'Aesthetics and Politics', in G. Stedman Jones and G. Claeys, eds., Cambridge History of Nineteenth-Century Political Thought, 2011, pp. 479–520.

- From Routledge: 'Leibniz and Political Thought', in J. Weckend and L. Strickland eds., *Leibniz's Legacy and Impact*, 2019, pp. 268–86; 'Perfectionism, Alienation, and Freedom: From the German Idealists to Marx', in Jan Kandiyali, ed., *Reassessing Marx's Social and Political Philosophy: Freedom, Recognition, and Human Flourishing*, 2018, pp. 19–42.
- From Oxford University Press: 'Political Theories of European Romanticism', *Oxford Companion to European Romanticism*, ed. P. Hamilton, 2016, pp. 660–83.
- From University of Toronto Press: 'Unity in Multiplicity: Agency and Aesthetics in German Republicanism', in G. Kellow and N. Leddy, eds., On *Civic Republicanism: Ancient Lessons for Global Politics*, 2016, pp. 305–29.
- From Northwestern University Press: 'Post-Kantian Perfectionism', in D. Moggach, ed., *Politics, Religion, and Art: Hegelian Debates*, 2011, pp. 179–200.
- From Presses de l'Université Laval, Québec: 'Idéalisme allemand et modernité, ou la liberté réfléchie', in D. Giroux et D. Karmis, dir.,

vii

viii

Acknowledgements

*Ceci n'est pas une idée politique: Réflexions sur les approches à l'étude des idées politiques,* 2013, pp. 239–59.

- From Philosophy Documentation Centre, Bowling Green, OH: 'The Construction of Juridical Space: Kant's Analogy of Relation in *The Metaphysics of Morals*', in *Proceedings of the Twentieth World Congress* of *Philosophy*, vol. 7, *Modern Philosophy*, ed. M. Gedney, 2000, pp. 201–9.
- And from my contribution to W. Hudson, D. Moggach, M. Stamm, *Rethinking German Idealism*, Aurora, CO: Noesis Press, pp. 27–53.
- And from the following journals:
- From *History of Political Thought*: 'Schiller's Aesthetic Republicanism', vol. 28, no. 3, 2007, pp. 520–41; 'Fichte's Engagement with Machiavelli', vol. 14, no. 4, 1993, pp. 573–89.
- And from: 'Freedom and Perfection: German Debates on the State in the Eighteenth Century', *Canadian Journal of Political Science*, vol. 42, no. 4, 2009, pp. 1003–23; 'Post-Kantian Perfectionism. A Study in the Political Thought of German Idealism, from Leibniz to Marx', *Academicus International Scientific Journal*, no. 26, July 2022, pp. 128–53; 'Left-Kantian Perfectionism', *Critical Review*, vol. 33, no. 2, Sept. 2021, pp. 184–205; 'Contextualising Fichte: Leibniz, Kant, and Perfectionist Ethics', *Fichte-Studien*, no. 45, 2018, pp. 129–49; 'The Subject as Substance: Bruno Bauer's Critique of Max Stirner', *Owl of Minerva*, vol. 41, nos. 1–2, 2009-10, pp. 63–86; 'Schiller, Scots, and Germans: Freedom and Diversity in *The Aesthetic Education of Man'*, *Inquiry*, vol. 51, no. 1, 2008, pp. 16–36; 'Reciprocity, Elicitation, Recognition: The Thematics of Intersubjectivity in the Early Fichte', *Dialogue, The Canadian Philosophical Review*, vol. 38, no. 2, Spring 1999, pp. 271–96.