CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-55678-1 — Discourse on Social Planning under Uncertainty
Charles F. Manski
Table of Contents
More Information

Contents

Preface *page* xiii

1 Credible Planning under Uncertainty 1
Organization of the Book 2
1.1 The Prevalent Study of Planning with Incredible Certitude 4
1.2 Uncertainty in Decision Theory 6
1.2.1 Consequentialist Decision Theory 7
1.2.2 Axiomatic Decision Theory 8
Representation Theorems 10
Is Axiomatic Theory Relevant to Planning? 11
1.2.3 The Institutional Separation of Research on Planning and Actual Planning 13
1.3 The Structure of Consequentialist Decision Theory 14
1.3.1 The Choice Set, State Space, and Welfare Function 14
1.3.2 Decision Criteria 15
Complete Class Theorems 17
1.3.3 Statistical Decision Theory 17
Robust Decisions 18
1.3.4 Minimax Regret Planning 19
1.4 Uncertainty in Empirical Research 21
1.4.1 Identification Analysis 21
Research on Partial Identification 22
1.4.2 Statistical Imprecision 23
1.5 Perspectives on Social Welfare 24
1.5.1 The New Welfare Economics 25
1.5.2 Utilitarian Welfare 25
Willingness to Pay and Kaldor–Hicks Efficiency 26
1.5.3 Maximin Welfare 27
The "Initial Position" Arguments of Harsanyi and Rawls 27
1.5.4 Optimal Paternalism in Populations with Bounded Rationality 29

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-55678-1 — Discourse on Social Planning under Uncertainty
Charles F. Manski
Table of Contents
More Information

1.5.5 Nonpersonalist Welfare Functions 30
1.5.6 Pragmatic Welfare 31

PART I CHARACTERIZING UNCERTAINTY

2 Incredible Certitude 35
2.1 Certitude in Religion and Philosophy 36
2.2 Conventional Certitude in Official Economic Statistics 38
2.2.1 Congressional Budget Office Scoring of Legislation 38
2.2.2 Economic Statistics Reported by Federal Statistical Agencies 39
2.2.3 Transitory Uncertainty: Revisions in National Income Accounts 40
2.2.4 Permanent Uncertainty: Nonresponse in Surveys 41
2.2.5 Conceptual Uncertainty: Seasonal Adjustment of Official Statistics 43
2.2.6 Why Do Statistical Agencies Practice Incredible Certitude? 45
2.3 Dueling Certitudes in Criminal Justice Research 46
2.3.1 The RAND and IDA Studies of Cocaine-Control Policy 46
2.3.2 The Deterrent Effect of the Death Penalty 48
2.3.3 How Do Right-to-Carry Laws Affect Crime Rates? 50
2.4 Wishful Extrapolation from Medical Research to Patient Care 52
2.4.1 Extrapolation from Study Populations to Patient Populations 52
2.4.2 Extrapolation from Experimental Treatments to Clinical Treatments 53
2.4.3 Wishful Meta-analyses of Disparate Studies 54
2.5 Sacrificing Relevance for Certitude 55
2.5.1 The Odds Ratio and Public Health 56
2.5.2 Randomized Trials and the Primacy of Internal Validity 58
2.6 Psychological Rationales for Incredible Certitude 59
2.6.1 Intolerance of Uncertainty 59
2.6.2 Motivated Reasoning Regarding Uncertainty 60
2.6.3 Expression of Uncertainty in Probability Judgments 61
2.7 As-If Optimization with Incredible Certitude 62
2.7.1 Using As-If Consensus to Coordinate Collective Decisions: Financial Accounting 63

3 Identification of Treatment Response 65
3.1 Partial Identification of Mean Treatment Response with Observational Data 67
3.1.1 Bounding Mean Response with No Knowledge of Counterfactual Outcomes 67
3.1.2 Sentencing and Recidivism 69
3.1.3 Instrumental Variables 72
The Mortality Effects of Swan–Ganz Catheterization 74
3.1.4 Monotone Instrumental Variables 75

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-55678-1 — Discourse on Social Planning under Uncertainty
Charles F. Manski
Table of Contents
More Information

3.1.5 Monotone Treatment Response 77
3.2 Partial Identification of Mean Treatment Response with Data from Trials with Limited Internal Validity 78
3.2.1 Missing Outcome or Covariate Data 78
Missing Data in a Trial Comparing Treatments for Hypertension 79
3.2.2 Partial Compliance 81
The Illinois Unemployment Insurance Experiment 82
Intention-to-Treat 83
3.2.3 Identification of Personalized Treatment Response with Trial-Reported Findings on Binary Subgroups 84
Identification of Long Mean Outcomes Using Short Trial Findings 85
Bounded-Variation Assumptions 86
3.3 Identification of Treatment Response with Social Interactions 88
3.3.1 Basic Concepts and Notation 88
3.3.2 Constant and Semi-monotone Treatment Response 89
3.4 Credible Meta-analysis 91
4 Identification of Choice Behavior and Personal Welfare 93
4.1 Revealed Preference Analysis 94
4.1.1 Revealing the Preferences of a Classical Consumer 94
Observation of One Choice Setting 94
Observation of Several Choice Settings 95
4.1.2 Random Utility Models of Heterogeneous Decision Makers 96
Consistency with Utility Theory 97
Prediction Using Attributes of Alternatives and Decision Makers 98
Incomplete Data and Conditional Choice Probabilities 98
4.2 Identification of Income-Leisure Preferences for Evaluation of Income Tax Policy 100
4.2.1 Taxation and Labor Supply 100
4.2.2 Basic Revealed Preference Analysis 103
Predicting Labor Supply under a Proposed Tax Schedule 104
4.2.3 Restrictions on the Preference Distribution 105
4.2.4 Implications for Utilitarian Policy Evaluation 107
4.3 Revealed Preference Analysis of Choices Maximizing Expected Utility 107
4.3.1 Basic Analysis 108
4.3.2 Random Expected-Utility Models 108
Rational Expectations Assumptions 109
How Do Youth Infer Their Returns to Schooling? 109
4.4 Analysis of Subjective Data 110
4.4.1 Measuring Probabilistic Expectations 110
Using Expectations and Choice Data to Estimate Random Expected-Utility Models 111

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-55678-1 — Discourse on Social Planning under Uncertainty
Charles F. Manski
Table of Contents
More Information

4.4.2 Measuring Imprecise Probabilities 112
4.4.3 Elicitation of Potential Behavior in Hypothetical Choice Scenarios 113

PART II ANALYSES OF PLANNING PROBLEMS

5 Diversified Treatment under Ambiguity 117
5.1 Treating X-Pox 118
5.2 Utilitarian Allocation to Two Treatments 120
5.2.1 Bayesian Planning 121
5.2.2 Maximin Planning 122
5.2.3 Minimax Regret Planning 122
Choosing Sentences for Convicted Juvenile Offenders 122
5.2.4 Welfare Increasing in Mean Personal Welfare 123
5.3 Diversification and Equal Treatment of Equals 124
5.3.1 Ex Ante and Ex Post Equal Treatment 124
5.3.2 Planning Combining Consequentialism and Deontological Ethics 125
5.4 Adaptive Diversification 126
5.4.1 Adaptive Treatment of a Life-Threatening Disease 127
5.4.2 Adaptive Diversification of Regulatory Approval 129

6 Treatment with Data from Statistically Imprecise Trials 131
6.1 Using Hypothesis Tests to Compare Treatments 132
6.2 Using Statistical Decision Theory to Compare Treatments 133
6.2.1 Bayes Decisions 134
6.2.2 Maximin and Minimax Regret Decisions 135
6.3 Treatment Choice with Trial Data 137
6.3.1 Choice between a Status Quo Treatment and an Innovation When Outcomes Are Binary 138
6.4 Setting Sample Size to Enable Near-Optimal Treatment Choice 141
6.5 Treatment with Primary and Secondary Outcomes 142
6.5.1 Reconsidering Choice of Sample Size in the MSLT-II Trial 143
6.6 Covid-19 Treatment with Data from an Imprecise Trial 145
6.7 Managing Uncertainty in FDA Drug Approval 147
6.7.1 The FDA Approval Process 147
6.7.2 FDA Rejection of Formal Decision Analysis 148
6.7.3 Adaptive Partial Drug Approval 150

7 Personalized Treatment 151
7.1 Optimal Treatment with Personalized Risk 152
7.1.1 Optimal Choice between Two Treatments 153
7.1.2 The Value of Covariate Information 154
7.1.3 Surveillance or Aggressive Treatment 156
7.1.4 Finding a Defendant Guilty or Not Guilty of a Crime 157
Optimal Conviction Decisions with Frequentist Risk Assessment 159
Legal Precedents 159

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-55678-1 — Discourse on Social Planning under Uncertainty
Charles F. Manski
Table of Contents
More Information

7.1.5 Nonutilitarian Arguments to Exclude Race as a Covariate in Medical Risk Prediction 161
7.1.6 Assessing Benefits, Costs, and Disparate Racial Impacts of Confrontational Proactive Policing 163
Model 164
7.2 Separability of Treatment Choice by Covariates under Uncertainty 167
7.2.1 Treatment Allocation with Partial Identification of Mean Treatment Response 167
Bayesian Planning 168
Maximin Planning 168
MMR Planning 169
7.2.2 Should a Planner Condition on All Observed Covariates? 170
7.2.3 Treatment Allocation with Sample Data 171
7.3 Surveillance or Aggressive Treatment with Partial Knowledge of Personalized Risk 172
7.4 Diagnostic Testing and Treatment 173
7.4.1 The Two-Stage Optimization Problem 174
Optimization with Utilitarian Welfare 175
Threshold Risk Assessments 177
7.4.2 Testing and Treatment under Ambiguity 178
Piecemeal MMR Decision Making 179
8 Vaccination with Unknown Indirect Effects 181
8.1 Background 181
8.1.1 Differentiating Epidemic Suppression from Social Cost Minimization 185
8.2 Choice between Decentralization and a Universal Mandate with a Representative Agent 186
8.2.1 The Optimization Problem 187
8.2.2 Policy Choice without Knowledge of the Indirect Effect of a Mandate 188
Optimization with Partial Knowledge 189
Planning When the Optimal Policy Is Indeterminate 190
8.3 Choice between Decentralization and a Universal Mandate in a Heterogeneous Population 191
8.3.1 The Optimization Problem 192
8.3.2 Policy Choice without Knowledge of Indirect Effects, Redux 193
Optimization with Partial Knowledge 193
Planning When the Optimal Policy Is Indeterminate 193
8.4 Discussion 195
9 Climate Planning with Uncertainty in Climate Modeling and Intergenerational Discounting 196
9.1 The Policy Problem 196
9.2 Prevalent Approaches to Climate and Discount-Rate Uncertainty 198

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-55678-1 — Discourse on Social Planning under Uncertainty
Charles F. Manski
Table of Contents
More Information

9.2.1 Averaging Outputs of Multi-model Ensembles of Climate Models 198
9.2.2 Uncertainties and Disagreements Regarding the Discount Rate 200
9.3 Minimax Regret Policy Evaluation 202
9.3.1 The Optimal-Control Problem 202
9.3.2 The Minimax Regret Decision Rule 203
9.3.3 Use of Δ to Express Empirical and Normative Uncertainty 204
9.4 Analysis with a Computational Model 205
9.4.1 Model Details 206
9.4.2 Findings 209
9.5 Discussion 209
10 Looking Ahead 212
10.1 Strengthening the Foundations for Planning under Uncertainty 213
10.1.1 Communicating Uncertainty 213
10.1.2 Specifying Planning Problems 214
10.1.3 Enhancing the Tractability of Decision Criteria 215
10.2 Pandemic Planning 216
10.2.1 Incredible Certitude in Epidemiological Modeling of the Covid-19 Pandemic 217
The March 2020 Imperial College Report 217
Combining Epidemiological and Macroeconomic Modeling 219
10.2.2 Adaptive Diversification of Covid-19 Policy 219
10.2.3 The Pressing Need for Credible Integrated Assessment of Pandemic Impacts 220
10.3 Planning to Boldly Go 221
References 225
Index 245

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org