From Frontiers to Borders

How did modern territoriality emerge and what are its consequences? This book examines these key questions with a unique global perspective. Kerry Goettlich argues that linear boundaries are products of particular colonial encounters, rather than being essentially an intra-European practice artificially imposed on colonized regions. He reconceptualizes modern territoriality as a phenomenon separate from sovereignty and the state, based on expert practices of delimitation and demarcation. Its history stems from the social production of expertise oriented towards these practices. Employing both primary and secondary sources, *From Frontiers to Borders* examines how this expertise emerged in settler colonies in North America and in British India – cases which illuminate a range of different types of colonial rule and influence. It also explores some of the consequences of the globalization of modern territoriality, exposing the colonial origins of boundary studies and the impact of boundary experts on the Paris Peace Conference of 1919–20.

KERRY GOETTLICH is Lecturer in International Security at the University of Reading. His research has appeared in journals including the *American Political Science Review*, the *European Journal of International Relations*, and *International Political Sociology*. He has received numerous awards for his work including the Mary Parker Follett Prize from the American Political Science Association, the Merze Tate Prize from the International Studies Association, and the Best Dissertation Award from the European International Studies Association.

LSE INTERNATIONAL STUDIES

SERIES EDITORS

Stephen Humphreys (Lead Editor) Department of Law, London School of Economics Kirsten Ainley Department of International Relations, Australian National University Ayça Çubukçu Department of Sociology, London School of Economics George Lawson Department of International Relations, Australian National University Imaobong Umoren Department of International History, London School of Economics

This series, published in association with the Centre for International Studies at the London School of Economics, is centred on three main themes. First, the series is oriented around work that is transdisciplinary, which challenges disciplinary conventions and develops arguments that cannot be grasped within existing disciplines. It will include work combining a wide range of fields, including international relations, international law, political theory, history, sociology and ethics. Second, it comprises books that contain an overtly international or transnational dimension, but not necessarily focused simply within the discipline of International Relations. Finally, the series will publish books that use scholarly inquiry as a means of addressing pressing political concerns. Books in the series may be predominantly theoretical, or predominantly empirical, but all will say something of significance about political issues that exceed national boundaries.

Previous books in the series:

Culture and Order in World Politics Andrew Phillips and Christian Reus-Smit (eds.)

On Cultural Diversity: International Theory in a World of Difference Christian Reus-Smit

Socioeconomic Justice: International Intervention and Transition in Post-war Bosnia and Herzegovina Daniela Lai

The World Imagined: Collective Beliefs and Political Order in the Sinocentric, Islamic and Southeast Asian International Societies Hendrik Spruyt

How the East Was Won: Barbarian Conquerors, Universal Conquest and the Making of Modern Asia Andrew Phillips

Before the West: The Rise and Fall of Eastern World Orders Ayşe Zarakol

Capitalism, Jacobinism and International Relations: Revisiting Turkish Modernity Eren Duzgun

The Counterinsurgent Imagination: A New Intellectual History Joseph MacKay

Dying Abroad: The Political Afterlives of Migration in Europe Osman Balkan

> Resisting Racial Capitalism: An Antipolitical Theory of Refusal Ida Danewid Regional Politics in Oceania: From Colonialism and Cold War to the Pacific Century Stephanie Lawson

Fueling Sovereignty Naosuke Mukoyama

Representants and International Orders: The Staging of Political Authority Alena Drieschova

Ways of Seeing International Organisations: New Perspectives for International Institutional Law Negar Mansouri and Daniel R. Quiroga-Villamarín

From Frontiers to Borders

How Colonial Technicians Created Modern Territoriality

KERRY GOETTLICH University of Reading





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009553001

DOI: 10.1017/9781009553018

© Kerry Goettlich 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009553018

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Goettlich, Kerry author Title: From frontiers to borders : how colonial technicians created modern territoriality / Kerry Goettlich, University of Reading. Other titles: How colonial technicians created modern territoriality Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2025. | Series: LSE International Studies | Includes bibliographical references and index. Identifiers: LCCN 2024055898 | ISBN 9781009553001 hardback | ISBN 9781009553018 ebook Subjects: LCSH: Boundaries – Political aspects | Boundaries – Philosophy | Postcolonialism | Territory, National – Philosophy Classification: LCC JC323 .G46946 2025 | DDC 320.1/2–dc23/eng/20250429 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2024055898

ISBN 978-1-009-55300-1 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-55299-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of Figures	
List of Tables	
Preface	
1 The Problem of Colonial Borders: Myth and Reality	1
2 Modern Territoriality Redefined	26
3 The Settler Colonies: Property Surveying Scaled Up	61
4 British India and Beyond: The Orientalism of Direct Observation	104
5 The Origins of Boundary Studies: From Natural Law to Modern Science	144
6 The Paris Peace Conference: The Scientific Frontier in Practice	186
7 Conclusion: The Continuing Legacies of Linear Boundaries	217
Bibliography	
Index	

vii

Figures

1.1	The 1916 Sykes–Picot Agreement, along with	
	other wartime Allied agreements	page 15
3.1	Contested borders between Maryland and	
	Pennsylvania, 1700s	62
3.2	Colonial land grants, 1603–1732	79
3.3	Map illustrating the result of a 1713 bilateral	
	commission to settle the Connecticut-Massachusetts	
	boundary, labelled 'patent line'	82
4.1	India, 1797–1805	114
4.2	Close-up of map made by James Rennell	
	of 'the Provinces of Bengal, Bahar &c'	118
4.3	Map made by Colin Mackenzie in 1808 based on	
	his ongoing survey of Mysore	125
5.1	Colonel Sir Thomas Hungerford Holdich, 1902	157
5.2	Ellen Churchill Semple, Leipzig, Germany, 1895	165
5.3	George Nathaniel Curzon, 1st Marquess Curzon	
	of Kedleston, wearing the robes of Grand Master	
	of the Order of the Star of India, between c. 1910	
	and c. 1915	173
6.1	Former Austro-Hungarian Empire and surrounding	
	regions, borders before and after the Paris Peace	
	Conference, 1919–1920	187
6.2	Carinthian Plebiscite, 1920	205
6.3	Important Corridors of Central Alps	209
6.4	Italo-Yugoslav boundaries at the Paris Peace	
	Conference	210

Tables

2.1	Sixteenth-century Mughal imperial record of	
	administrative information on the Sarkár of Sirhind	page 44
2.2	Terminology of boundary construction	49
4.1	Linear boundaries on the frontiers of British India and	
	surrounding regions, 1800–1880	134

Preface

This book began its life in 2015, in two different places. One was a proposal for a PhD thesis that would have explored the trajectory of a set of historical myths about the 1916 Sykes–Picot Agreement between Britain and France regarding Ottoman territories and the political consequences of those myths. The other was an essay I wrote as part of my master's degree, in which I struggled, with varying success, to understand why International Relations scholars, with very few exceptions, spent so little time thinking about what territory is, how it has changed historically, and how it shapes international politics.

I owe it to my brilliant doctoral supervisor, Prof. Tarak Barkawi, that this book became just as much a response to the concerns motivating the essay as it is to those of the PhD proposal. Successive versions of the thesis migrated from exploring the consequences of the myth of Sykes-Picot, to exploring the history of the myth, to retracing the history of the borders themselves that the myth referred to, to analyzing the late nineteenth-century surge in colonial boundary-drawing all over Asia and Africa. Teetering dangerously on the brink of going from there to the history of all borders everywhere, I came across, by accident, an account of the 1728 Virginia-North Carolina boundary survey written by Virginia's representative which suggested what appeared to me as an entirely novel explanation for the origins of modern territoriality, at least in North America. It was in working out the relation between the transformation of North America that this opened up, on the one hand, and the late nineteenth-century boundary-drawing I had been previously interested in, on the other, that the project finally found the rationale it should have started with. All the while, I realized that Tarak had been constantly doing the exact opposite of what most people (perhaps correctly) think most PhD supervisors do: he was challenging me to think bigger, take a wider historical view, and critique more scholars.

So the project originally had two aims: first, to work through some of the limitations of attempts to understand the effects of borders left

CAMBRIDGE

xii

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-55300-1 — From Frontiers to Borders Kerry Goettlich Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

Preface

behind by colonialism; and second, to identify, with greater precision than had been done so far, what is unique about territory in modernity, how it came about, and why it matters. In the process it became clear – and the coherence of the book stands or falls on this – that these two aims pointed in the same direction. The basic argument is that modern territoriality, in global perspective, is largely (though not exclusively) a technical practice of colonialism, centring not on sovereign states and nations but instead on what practitioners call 'delimitation' and 'demarcation'.

The book uses history to make this essentially conceptual argument, which itself could not have been arrived at without a close encounter with primary and secondary historical sources of various kinds. But it is not unlikely that historians, especially historians of particular places and regions, but not only them, will find much in this book to quarrel with and even more that is omitted. The question of when - if not why – in any particular place in the world, linear boundaries began to be delimited and demarcated in a recognizably modern way, may seem to a casual reader to be an uncomplicated one, to which an answer must be already available somewhere, or at least an answer must be readily available once all the relevant evidence is compiled together. But, as many historians know well, especially historians of medieval European boundaries, the frame of reference brought to bear by the inquirer, and developed and refined in consideration of many kinds of evidence, is at least as important as the evidence itself. With this in mind, it is primarily the way in which this book attempts to shift the frame of reference with which we see modern boundaries which gives it its rationale and purpose. My best hope is that the book is judged as a first attempt to put together the pieces of a large question that has barely yet been asked.

The book has benefitted from conversations with countless people who have read earlier versions of parts of it, or otherwise shared their perspectives with me in conversations on themes related to this project. It would be impossible to name all of them here, and unfair to name only some of them. But to be slightly unfair, I would like to thank Jens Bartelson, Martin Bayly, Andreas Behnke, Sarah Bertrand, Didier Bigo, Jordan Branch, Julian Go, Mark Hoffmann, Jef Huysmans, Oliver Kessler, Jorg Kustermans, George Lawson, Jeppe Mulich, Himadeep Muppidi, Christopher Patrick Murray, Iver Neumann, Kerem Nişancioğlu, Joseph O'Mahoney, Lauren Pinson,

Preface

Hendrik Spruyt, George Steinmetz, Rob Walker, Peter Wilson, Joanne Yao, and Ayşe Zarakol. I have learned something from each of them, although perhaps not enough. In its formative stages, the project benefitted from an excellent community of PhD students at the London School of Economics International Relations Department, and I would like to thank all of them for their exemplary comradeship and for creating an exceptional intellectual environment. The book also benefitted from the help of Isha Patil as a research assistant through the University of Reading's Undergraduate Research Opportunities Programme, from the assistance of Joan C. Snellen van Vollenhoven of the Corts Foundation, and from that of Katie Carey, the Hodson Curator of the Johns Hopkins University Archives. And, of course, I could not have written this book, and would not be who I am, without the love and encouragement of my parents, who told me I could do anything I wanted, on what authority I know not.

My greatest debt of gratitude in writing this book is to Alvina Hoffmann, whose support for me and whose endurance, through thick and thin, amid interminable conversations about borders in every odd part of the world has been unshakeable. She has had no small influence on the project over the years, from introducing me to Pierre Bourdieu's notions of practice, field, and habitus, which lie in the background of the text but shaped my thinking in fundamental ways, to making possible the use of some crucial source material from the French colonialist journal *L'Asie Française*. I dedicate this book to her and to our son Leo, who has made a fine contribution to the late stages of working on this project in the form of comic relief.

xiii