

KILLING THE MESSENGER

Killing the Messenger is a highly readable survey of the current political and legal wars over social media platforms. The book carefully parses attacks against social media coming from both the political left and right to demonstrate how most of these critiques are overblown or without empirical support. The work analyzes regulations directed at social media in the United States and European Union, including efforts to amend Section 230 of the Communications Decency Act. It argues that many of these proposals not only raise serious free-speech concerns but also likely have unintended and perverse public policy consequences. *Killing the Messenger* concludes by identifying specific regulations of social media that are justified by serious, demonstrated harms and that can be implemented without jeopardizing the profoundly democratizing impact social media platforms have had on public discourse. This title is also available as open access on Cambridge Core.

Ashutosh Bhagwat is a Distinguished Professor and the Boochever and Bird Endowed Chair at the University of California, Davis School of Law. Professor Bhagwat is the author of *Our Democratic First Amendment* (2020) and *The Myth of Rights* (2010). He is also a member of the American Law Institute.

Killing the Messenger

THE WAR ON SOCIAL MEDIA

ASHUTOSH BHAGWAT

University of California, Davis



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-009-54768-0 — Killing the Messenger
 Ashutosh Bhagwat
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009547680

DOI: 10.1017/9781009547703

© Ashutosh Bhagwat 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, with the exception of the Creative Commons
 version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781009547703 under a
 Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC 4.0 which permits re-use,
 distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing
 appropriate credit to the original work is given and any changes made are indicated.
 To view a copy of this license visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0>

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009547703

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Bhagwat, Ashutosh, author.

TITLE: Killing the messenger : the war on social media / Ashutosh Bhagwat,
 University of California, Davis

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge
 University Press, 2025. | Includes bibliographical references and index. |

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2025011542 | ISBN 9781009547680 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009547703 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Social media – Law and legislation. | Online social
 networks – Law and legislation. | Social media – Government policy. |
 Public policy (Law) | Privacy, Right of. | Big data. | Freedom of speech.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC K4345 .B44 2025 | DDC 343.09/944–dc23/eng/20250317

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2025011542>

ISBN 978-1-009-54768-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-54765-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

For EU product safety concerns, contact us at Calle de José Abascal, 56, 1º, 28003 Madrid,
 Spain, or email eugpsr@cambridge.org

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page vii</i>
Introduction: Social Media as the Mirror of Our Times	1
1 The Conservative War: Social Media as Censors	9
2 The Progressive War: Social Media as Enablers	26
3 The Data War: Social Media Kills Privacy	51
4 Social Media Platforms as Common Carriers	62
5 Social Media as the New Gatekeepers	92
6 Making Social Media Pay for Its Sins: Repealing or Amending Section 230	118
7 Privacy, Big Data, and Free Speech	146
8 Some Ways Forward	164
Conclusion: Embracing the Unknown	191
<i>Index</i>	<i>195</i>

Acknowledgments

As my thoughts about the role of social media in society have evolved and sharpened over the past five years over which I wrote this book, I benefited from conversations, feedback, and guidance from a huge number of people, all of whom I cannot possibly name here. But thanks are due in particular to Enrique Armijo, Jane Bambauer, Joseph Blocher, Alan Chen, Erin Carroll, Chris Elmendorf, Greg Magarian, Helen Norton, Alex Tsesis, and Jim Weinstein for guidance, feedback, and excellent conversations which deeply shaped this book. Special thanks to Eugene Volokh not only for feedback throughout the time I wrote this book but also for inviting me to become an Executive Editor for a new journal he created, *The Journal of Free Speech Law*, which has provided a key venue for me to work out my thoughts on the subject of social media. Thanks also to Jose Ayala-Artiga and Christine Hanon for exemplary research assistance that helped shape this project. Thanks to my colleagues at the UC Davis School of Law and to Deans Afra Afsharipour, Jessica Berg, Kevin Johnson, and Donna Shestowsky for their support and kindness, and for creating an almost perfect environment in which to do creative work. Finally, thanks to my family – Shannon, Uma, and Declan – for tolerating me even when writing made me close to unbearable.

This book is dedicated to them and to my broader family, including the family we have chosen over the years (you know who you are). You are the people who make everything that I do not only possible but worth doing.

Portions of this book, before revisions, appeared in the following articles and chapters. I would like to thank the journals and editors I have worked with over the years for helping to make my work better.

The New Gatekeepers?: Social Media and the “Search for Truth,” 3 J. FREE SPEECH L. 41 (2023), *reprinted in* MEDIA AND SOCIETY AFTER TECHNOLOGICAL DISRUPTION (Kyle Langvardt and Justin (Gus) Hurwitz, eds., 2024)

Why Social Media Platforms Are Not Common Carriers, 2 J. FREE SPEECH L. 127 (2022)

Do Platforms Have Editorial Rights?, 1 J. FREE SPEECH L. 97 (2021)

The Law of Facebook, 54 U.C. DAVIS L. REV. 2353 (2021)