

Becoming Nations Again

North America's Indigenous inhabitants operated effective governments long before European arrival. Tribes built cities, developed laws, and participated in transcontinental trade networks. European arrival, however, brought many hardships for Indians. Although tribes were guaranteed the right to self-govern on reservations, the United States imposed severe restraints on tribal autonomy, resulting in socioeconomic maladies, such as poverty and crime. Today, federal policies continue to inhibit tribal self-governance. As a result, tribes continue to suffer from these social ills. *Becoming Nations Again* argues that empowering tribal governments is the key to solving tribal problems. It moves to liberate tribes from the antiquated regulations that apply only to tribal lands and allow tribes to exercise jurisdiction over all people on their land. Once this occurs, tribes will be free to implement their own laws and participate in the federalist system. This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

Adam Crepelle is an assistant professor at Loyola University Chicago School of Law. He received the Elinor Ostrom Prize in 2023 for his coauthored article "Community Policing on American Indian Reservations." He is the coauthor of the upcoming book *Reservation Capitalism: Economic Development in Indian Country* (2d ed. 2025).

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN ECONOMICS, CHOICE, AND SOCIETY

Founding Editors

Timur Kuran, *Duke University*
Peter J. Boettke, *George Mason University*

This interdisciplinary series promotes original theoretical and empirical research as well as integrative syntheses involving links between individual choice, institutions, and social outcomes. Contributions are welcome from across the social sciences, particularly in the areas where economic analysis is joined with other disciplines such as comparative political economy, new institutional economics, and behavioral economics.

Books in the Series:

PAUL DRAGOS ALIGICA, *Public Entrepreneurship, Citizenship, and Self-Governance*

TERRY L. ANDERSON AND GARY D. LIBECAP, *Environmental Markets: A Property Rights Approach*

SHELBY GROSSMAN, *The Politics of Order in Informal Markets: How the State Shapes Private Governance*

MORRIS B. HOFFMAN, *The Punisher's Brain: The Evolution of Judge and Jury*

RANDALL G. HOLCOMBE, *Political Capitalism: How Political Influence Is Made and Maintained*

ROGER KOPPL, *Expert Failure*

PETER T. LEESON, *Anarchy Unbound: Why Self-Governance Works Better Than You Think*

MICHAEL C. MUNGER, *Tomorrow 3.0: Transaction Costs and the Sharing Economy*

JENNIFER BRICK MURTAZASHVILI AND ILIA MURTAZASHVILI, *Land, the State, and War Property Institutions and Political Order in Afghanistan*

ALEX NOWRASTEH AND BENJAMIN POWELL, *Wretched Refuse?: The Political Economy of Immigration and Institutions*

BENJAMIN POWELL, *Out of Poverty: Sweatshops in the Global Economy* (First Edition)

BENJAMIN POWELL, *Out of Poverty: Sweatshops in the Global Economy*
(Second Edition)

JEAN-PHILIPPE PLATTEAU, *Islam Instrumentalized: Religion and
Politics in Historical Perspective*

JARED RUBIN, *Rulers, Religion, and Riches: Why the West Got Rich
and the Middle East Did Not*

VERNON L. SMITH AND BART J. WILSON, *Humanomics: Moral
Sentiments and the Wealth of Nations for the Twenty-First Century*

CASS R. SUNSTEIN, *The Ethics of Influence: Government in the Age of
Behavioral Science*

ANDREAS THIEL, WILLIAM A. BLOMQUIST AND DUSTIN E. GARRICK,
Governing Complexity: Analyzing and Applying Polycentricity

CAROLYN M. WARNER, RAMAZAN KILINÇ, CHRISTOPHER W. HALE
AND ADAM B. COHEN, *Generating Generosity in Catholicism and
Islam: Beliefs, Institutions, and Public Goods Provision*

TAIZU ZHANG, *The Laws and Economics of Confucianism: Kinship and
Property in Preindustrial China and England*

TAISU ZHANG, *The Ideological Foundations of Qing Taxation: Belief
Systems, Politics, and Institutions*

Becoming Nations Again

The Journey Towards Tribal Self-Determination

ADAM CREPELLE
Loyola University Chicago





CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009540896

DOI: 10.1017/9781009540902

© Adam Crepelle 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, with the exception of the Creative
Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part
may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University
Press & Assessment.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781009540902
under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC 4.0 which permits
re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes
providing appropriate credit to the original work is given and any changes made are
indicated. To view a copy of this license visit [https://creativecommons.org/licenses/](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0)
[by-nc/4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0)

When citing this work, please include a reference to the
DOI 10.1017/9781009540902

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

*A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from
the Library of Congress*

ISBN 978-1-009-54089-6 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-009-54092-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Dedicated to Ernest Sickey. A friend, mentor, and inspiration.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page xiii</i>
Introduction	I
o.1 Division of the Book	3
o.2 A Note on Terminology	3
PART I FROM SOVEREIGNS TO WARDS: THE HISTORY OF TRIBAL NATIONS AND THE LAW	
I The Original American Governments	7
1.1 The First Americans	7
1.2 Early North American Civilizations	9
1.3 Indigenous Institutions	17
2 “Discovering” and “Founding” America	23
2.1 Voyaging to America and the Law of Discovery	23
2.2 Spain and Indigenous People	26
2.3 Britain’s American Colonies	30
2.4 The Pequot War	34
2.5 King Philip’s War	35
3 Commerce and Culture	38
3.1 Indians and Guns	39
3.2 The Birth of Indian Horse Cultures	43
3.3 A New Way of Life	47
4 World War and American Revolution	52
4.1 Enter George Washington	53
4.2 The French and Indian War	54
4.3 The Seeds of Rebellion	55
4.4 The Revolution Begins	57
5 Governing the United States and Tribal Rights	61
5.1 Tribal Resistance	62

x	<i>Contents</i>	
	5.2 Indian Tribes and the United States Constitution	66
	5.3 The Creek Treaty	69
	5.4 From Treaties to Trading Posts	71
	5.5 Title to Indian Lands	74
6	Indian Removal and the Cherokee Cases	79
	6.1 The Cherokee and Georgia	80
	6.2 Andrew Jackson and Indian Removal	83
	6.3 Removal in Motion	88
	6.4 Is the Cherokee Nation a “Nation”?	89
	6.5 The Laws of Georgia Can Have No Force	94
7	Reservations and Federal Power	98
	7.1 Fading Treaties	98
	7.2 The Last of the Indian Wars	100
	7.3 Reservation Life	103
	7.4 Indian Blood and Tribal Citizenship	105
	7.5 Spotted Tail, Crow Dog, and Tribal Law	108
	7.6 Criminal Law, Assimilation, and Plenary Power	112
8	Allotment and Assimilation	117
	8.1 The General Allotment Act	118
	8.2 Tribal Consent Not Needed	120
	8.3 Accelerating Allotment	123
	8.4 The Last Arrow but Still an Indian	125
	8.5 Indian Boarding Schools	127
9	The Indian New Deal to Tribal Termination	131
	9.1 Jim Thorpe	131
	9.2 Indian Citizenship and the Great War	133
	9.3 The Indian New Deal	136
	9.4 World War II	139
	9.5 The Tribal Termination Era	141
	9.6 “Every American School Boy Knows ...”	144
10	Tribal Self-Determination	146
	10.1 Sheep and Sovereignty	146
	10.2 Buffalo Tiger and Fidel Castro	149
	10.3 Indians in the Great Society	152
	10.4 Tribal Self-Determination	154
	PART II SELF-DETERMINATION MEETS PATERNALISM	
11	An Unfit Guardian: Ongoing Federal Paternalism	161
	11.1 The Federal Government and <i>Peabody Coal v. Navajo Nation</i>	162
	11.2 The Largest Class Action in United States’ History	166
	11.3 The Supreme Court Shields the Federal Government Again	169
	11.4 Double Standard for Tribal Governments	170
12	Excessive Federal Bureaucracy	174
	12.1 Trust Land	175
	12.2 Land Fractionation	177

Contents

xi

12.3	The HEARTH Act	179
12.4	Rights-of-Way	180
12.5	Indian Trader Regulations	181
12.6	Natural Resource Development	185
12.7	Gaming	187
13	Criminal Justice Crisis	190
13.1	Indian Country's Peculiar Jurisdictional Regime	191
13.2	<i>Oliphant v. Suquamish Indian Tribe</i> : Facts and Consequences Don't Matter	192
13.3	<i>Duro v. Reina</i> : Stretching <i>Oliphant</i> Further	200
13.4	Minor Public Safety Improvements	201
13.5	The Jurisdictional Quagmire	204
14	Tribal Economic Development and Uncertain Civil Jurisdiction	210
14.1	<i>Montana v. United States</i> : A New Path	212
14.2	The Path Is Not Clear: <i>Dollar General v. Mississippi Band of Choctaw Indians</i>	216
14.3	Taxation or Theft?	221
14.4	What Is Legal?	223
14.5	Tribal Sovereignty and the Digital Frontier	225
PART III BECOMING NATIONS AGAIN		
15	Federal Recognition	231
15.1	Recognized Tribes	231
15.2	Achieving Federal Recognition	233
15.3	Problems with the Federal Acknowledgment Process	235
15.4	The Coushatta Journey	237
15.5	The Houma's Ongoing Quest	241
16	Territorial Jurisdiction	249
16.1	Sovereignty and Land	249
16.2	Replacing Trust Land with Tribal Land	251
16.3	Tribal Land and Jurisdiction	256
16.4	Jurisdiction over Noncitizens	259
16.5	Why Tribes Should Have Criminal Jurisdiction over Non-Indians	262
17	Tribal Legal Institutions	266
17.1	Tribal Law	267
17.2	Tribal Courts	271
17.3	Tribal Legal Bureaucracy	274
17.4	Strengthening Tribal Law	277
17.5	Strengthening Tribal Institutions	278
17.6	Tribal Institutions and Economic Development	279
18	Tribes as Nations	282
18.1	State Opposition	283
18.2	Tribal Self-Governance and the Federalist System	287

xii	<i>Contents</i>	
18.3	Tribal Sovereignty Can Benefit States	288
18.4	Tribes as Shields from State Protectionism	289
18.5	Tribal Self-Governance and a Mississippi Miracle	291
19	Education, Ethics, and the Law	295
19.1	The Education System	295
19.2	Recognizing a Civil Rights Trailblazer	297
19.3	Legal Education and Tribal Sovereignty	300
19.4	Legal Ethics	305
	Conclusion	309
	<i>Index</i>	311

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank the Institute for Humane Studies for awarding me a Sabbatical Research Fellowship (grant no. IHS008852), hosting a manuscript workshop, and awarding publication expenses (grant no. IHS018256). I would like to thank those who participated in the manuscript workshop: Richard Monette, N. Bruce Duthu, Ezra Rosser, Melissa Tatum, Terry Anderson, Carrie Stallings, and Dominic Parker. I would like to thank Jeremy Rabkin for his thoughtful comments. And a special thanks to Alison Geisler, my former research assistant, for her invaluable assistance in completing the manuscript.