

Cambridge Elements =

edited by
Michael L. Peterson
Asbury Theological Seminary

GOD AND THE PROBLEM OF EPISTEMIC DEFEATERS

Joshua C. Thurow The University of Texas at San Antonio







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009539029

DOI: 10.1017/9781009270649

© Joshua C. Thurow 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009270649

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-009-53902-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-27062-5 Paperback ISSN 2754-8724 (online) ISSN 2754-8716 (print)

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



God and the Problem of Epistemic Defeaters

Elements in the Problems of God

DOI: 10.1017/9781009270649 First published online: December 2024

Joshua C. Thurow The University of Texas at San Antonio

Author for correspondence: Joshua C. Thurow, Joshua.thurow@utsa.edu

Abstract: Any modern, moderately intellectually mature (MMIM) believer in God faces a variety of epistemic defeaters of their belief in God. Epistemic defeaters challenge the rationality of a belief. After explaining the notion of a defeater and discussing various ways and targets of defeat, this Element categorizes the many defeaters of belief in God into four classes: rebutting, undercutting, base defeaters, and competence defeaters. Then, several general defeaters of theistic belief are examined in some detail: the superfluity argument, the problem of unpossessed evidence, various forms of debunking arguments, and a cumulative case competence defeater. The typical MMIM believer, it is argued, has resources to resist these defeaters, although the cumulative case competence defeater has some force. The strength of its force depends on the strength of grounds for theistic belief and of various defeaters and deflectors for the competence defeater. No easy general defeater of theistic belief is found.

This Element also has a video abstract: www.cambridge.org/ EPOG Thurow Abstarct

Keywords: defeaters, rationality, justification, problems for theism, rationality of faith

© Joshua C. Thurow 2024

ISBNs: 9781009539029 (HB), 9781009270625 (PB), 9781009270649 (OC) ISSNs: 2754-8724 (online), 2754-8716 (print)



Contents

1	What Is the Problem?	1
2	Defeaters	4
3	Map of Defeaters for Belief in God	13
4	Rebutting and Undercutting Defeaters	25
5	Base Defeaters	43
6	Competence Defeaters	51
	References	64