

CONSTITUTION-BUILDING AFTER THE ARAB SPRING

How were post-Arab Spring constitutions drafted? What are the most significant elements of continuity and change within the new constitutional texts? What purposes are these texts designed to serve? To what extent have constitutional provisions been enforced? Have the principles of constitutionalism been strengthened compared to the past? These are some of the key questions Francesco Biagi addresses. *Constitution-Building After the Arab Spring: A Comparative Perspective* examines seven national experiences of constitution-building in the Arab world following the 2011 uprisings, namely those of Morocco, Algeria, Tunisia, Libya, Egypt, Syria, and Jordan. This interdisciplinary book, based largely on the author's own work and research in the region, compares these seven national experiences through four analytical frameworks: constitution-drafting and constitutional reform processes; separation of powers and forms of government; constitutional justice; and religion, women, and non-Muslims within the framework of citizenship.

Francesco Biagi is Associate Professor of Comparative Public Law in the Department of Legal Studies of the University of Bologna, Deputy Secretary General of the International Association of Constitutional Law (IACL-AIDC), Research Fellow at the Center for Constitutional Studies and Democratic Development, and Legal Consultant at the Max Planck Foundation for International Peace and the Rule of Law (Heidelberg). He is the author of *European Constitutional Courts and Transitions to Democracy* (Cambridge University Press 2020).

The best constitutional scholarship requires multiple skills. Francesco Biagi combines expert political analysis, legal acumen, and a regional focus to guide readers through the most tumultuous period in Arab politics.

Nathan J. Brown, Professor of Political Science and
International Affairs, George Washington University

In this impressive and indispensable volume, Professor Biagi provides a comprehensive, richly theorized account of the myriad constitutional developments that took place in the Arab World from the start of the so-called “Arab Spring” in 2011 through the 2023 Tunisian parliamentary elections. Providing indispensable historical background to the events of this period and judiciously drawing upon theories of comparative law and comparative politics, Biagi insightfully identifies and explains connections between the experiences of different countries during this extraordinary decade of constitutional creation and implementation. He also explains cogently and convincingly why the process of constitution-building after the Arab Spring unfolded differently in different Arab countries and led to different results for their citizens. *A tour de force.*

Clark B. Lombardi, Dan Fenno Henderson Professor of Law and
Director of Islamic Legal Studies, University of
Washington School of Law

A must-read for anyone seeking to understand what went wrong after the “Arab Spring” and how constitutions are used by illiberal ruling regimes as an instrument of government. Seven constitution-building processes and political systems compared in 300 pages – a remarkable contribution to the study of comparative constitutional law and politics.

Nathalie Bernard-Maugiron, Senior Researcher,
Université Paris Cité/IRD/Ceped

ASCL STUDIES IN COMPARATIVE LAW

ASCL Studies in Comparative Law publishes monographs and collections that broaden theoretical and practical knowledge of the world's many legal systems. Published under the direction of the American Society of Comparative Law, the *ASCL Studies* examine legal problems in a comparative light to advance legal science, develop technical insights, and promote greater cooperation across jurisdictional and cultural boundaries. This book series serves legal practitioners and those seeking to improve law and justice by publishing in-depth comparative studies of specific legal problems in every area of law.

The series has two general editors. David Gerber is Distinguished Professor of Law and Co-Director of the Program in International and Comparative Law at Chicago-Kent College of Law, Illinois Institute of Technology. He is past President of the American Society of Comparative Law. Mortimer Sellers is Regents Professor of the University System of Maryland and Director of the Baltimore Center for International and Comparative Law. He is past President of the Internationale Vereinigung für Rechts-und Sozialphilosophie.

Series Editors

David Gerber *Chicago-Kent College of Law*
 Mortimer Sellers *University of Baltimore*

Editorial Board

Richard Albert *University of Texas*
 David Clark *Willamette University*
 Helge Dedek *McGill University*
 James Feinerman *Georgetown University*
 Richard Kay *University of Connecticut*
 Maximo Langer *University of California Los Angeles*
 Ralf Michaels *Max Planck Institute for Comparative and International Private Law*
 Fernanda Nicola *American University*
 Jacqueline Ross *University of Illinois*
 Kim Lane Scheppelle *Princeton University*
 Franz Werro *Georgetown University*

External Advisory Board

Josef Drexler *University of Munich*
 Diego Fernandez Arroyo *Institut d'etudes politiques de Paris*
 Hongjun Gao *Tsinghua University*
 Michele Graziadei *University of Turin*

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-53364-5 — Constitution-Building After the Arab Spring
Francesco Biagi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Ko Hasegawa *University of Hokkaido*
Hisashi Harata *University of Tokyo*
Andreas Heinemann *University of Zurich*
Christophe Jamin *Institut d'études politiques de Paris*
Yong-Sun Kang *Yonsei University*
Claudia Lima Marques *Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul*
Bertil Emrah Oder *Koc University*
Amr Shalakany *American University of Cairo*

Constitution-Building After the Arab Spring

A COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

FRANCESCO BIAGI

University of Bologna



Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-009-53364-5 — Constitution-Building After the Arab Spring
 Francesco Biagi
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009533645

DOI: 10.1017/9781009533669

© Francesco Biagi 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009533669

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Biagi, Francesco, author.

TITLE: Constitution building after the Arab Spring : a comparative perspective / Francesco Biagi.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2025. | Series: ASCL studies in comparative law | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2024011582 (print) | LCCN 2024011583 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781009533645 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009533669 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Constitutional law – Arab countries. | Constitutional history – Arab countries. | Constitutional amendments – Arab countries. | Separation of powers – Arab countries. | Legislative power – Arab countries. | Arab Spring, 2010– | Revolutions – Arab countries.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KMC522 .B53 2025 (print) | LCC KMC522 (ebook) |

DDC 342/.17492703–dc23/eng/20240317

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024011582>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024011583>

ISBN 978-1-009-53364-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-53364-5 — Constitution-Building After the Arab Spring
Francesco Biagi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Ai miei genitori, Marina e Marco, e a mio fratello Lorenzo

A mia moglie Elena e alle mie figlie Arianna e Martina

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page xi</i>
Introduction	1
1.1 Focus of the Book	2
1.2 Methodology	4
1.3 Plan of the Book	5
1 We the People or We the Rulers? Constitution-Making and Constitutional Reform Processes	9
1.1 Four Waves of Constitution-Drafting in the Arab World	9
1.2 Constitution-Making after the 2011 Uprisings	13
1.3 A Comparative Assessment	59
2 Systems of Government and Distribution of Powers: More Concentration than Separation	63
2.1 The Concentration of Authority at the Horizontal Level	63
2.2 Tunisia: From a Semi-Presidential System to a Hyper-Presidential Regime	87
2.3 Emergency Frameworks: Still a Paradigm of Government?	103
2.4 Greater but Still Very Weak: The Vertical Separation of Powers	111
2.5 Reasons for the Concentration of Powers	120
2.6 A Popular and Governmental Sovereignty	137
3 Counter-majoritarian Institutions? The Role of Constitutional Courts and Councils	140
3.1 The Origins of Constitutional Review of Legislation in the Arab World	140
3.2 Constitutional Review Bodies Prior to the Arab Spring	144
3.3 Constitutional Review in post-2011 Constitutions	155
3.4 The Role of Constitutional Courts and Councils in the Transition Processes	172
3.5 Challenges and Perspectives	186

4	Religion, Non-Muslims, and Women: The Challenges of Citizenship(s)	189
4.1	The Problematic Notion of Citizenship in the Arab World	189
4.2	Non-Muslims’ Rights under Post-2011 Constitutional Systems	196
4.3	Women’s Rights and Gender Equality after 2011	225
4.4	Calling for Full and Inclusive Citizenship for Non-Muslims and Women	243
4.5	From Differentiated Citizenships to One Full and Inclusive Citizenship?	265
	Conclusions: Constitutional Dissonances	268
C.1	Constitutional Dichotomies	268
C.2	Constitutional Enforcement	273
C.3	Constitutional Wishful Thinking?	278
	<i>Bibliography</i>	281
	<i>Index</i>	317

Acknowledgments

There are many people I would like to thank. First and foremost, I wish to express my gratitude to my *maestri*, Giuseppe de Vergottini and Susanna Mancini, for their extraordinarily important teachings on comparative methodology and for their constant guidance and support in my research projects.

This book is the result of my activities in the Arab region over the past decade. In addition to conducting research and academic projects in a variety of Arab countries, I have provided training and consultancy (on various projects related to constitution-building and the rule of law) to governmental and judicial institutions in the Arab region (especially in Morocco, Jordan, and Palestine). Most of these activities have been organized by the Max Planck Foundation for International Peace and the Rule of Law (Heidelberg). I would like to thank Kathrin Maria Scherr and Johannes Krusemark-Camin, the directors of the Max Planck Foundation: These years at the Foundation, in which I served first as a senior research fellow and now as a legal consultant, have been of the utmost importance in allowing me to better understand, especially from a practical point of view, the main challenges of constitution-building processes in the Arab world and beyond.

I wish to thank Justin O. Frosini (the director of the Center for Constitutional Studies and Democratic Development [CCSDD], a research partnership between the University of Bologna and the Johns Hopkins University SAIS Europe) who has always supported my research projects at the CCSDD on constitutional transitions following the Arab Spring. Some of these projects have also been conducted within the framework of the activities of the Research Group on “Constitutionalism in Illiberal Democracies” of the International Association of Constitutional Law (IACL-AIDC). Moreover, it is thanks to the generous funding from the George Lawrence Abernethy Endowment for Research and Publications of the CCSDD that some of the editing costs of this book have been covered.

I am particularly grateful to Nathan J. Brown: I cannot thank him enough for all the support and help he gave me, especially in the latest stages of the drafting of this volume. Special thanks go also to Fadi Daou and Nayla Tabbara, with whom I

share the passion for interfaith dialogue. Thanks to their precious advice, I was able to improve the chapter on citizenship, women, and non-Muslims.

Over the past few years, I have had the honor to regularly teach as a visiting professor at the University of Illinois College of Law, a place that I now consider my second home university. I am very grateful to Jason Mazzone for inviting me to Illinois, where I often have the chance to present to faculty members and students my work on the Arab world.

I wish to thank Siraj Khan and Islam Mohammed for their help: Our “Amman dialogues” are among the most intellectually stimulating conversations I have ever had. I will never stop learning from them. I would also like to thank Sana Alsarghali for her support: I have always benefited enormously from our meetings in Palestine and elsewhere.

I wish to thank my Italian colleagues, especially Tania Groppi, Luca Mezzetti, Andrea Pin, and Ciro Sbailò, with whom I have had the opportunity over the years to discuss the recent constitutional transformations in the Arab world. I would also like to thank Massimo Papa, my professor of Islamic law and my bachelor’s thesis supervisor, for passing on to me his passion for Islamic legal studies.

I am also grateful to all other colleagues who, at various times and in various ways, gave me precious advice during the research and the drafting of this volume: Brahim Belguith, Nathalie Bernard-Maugiron, Philipp Bremer, Numan A. Elkhatib, Tamara El Khoury, Tom Ginsburg, Rainer Grote, Clark B. Lombardi, Karim Mezran, Laith K. Nasrawin, Tilmann J. Röder, Paul Saadeh, Anja Schoeller-Schletter, Adel Omar Sherif, and Arianna Vendaschi.

I must stress that I have been able to write this book because I have an amazing law school behind me, from which I graduated and where I now have the privilege to teach – the Department of Legal Studies of the University of Bologna. Thank you to the head of department, Michele Caianiello, and the deputy head of department, Federico Casolari. And thank you to Lidia Bonifati, Francesco Lucherini, Alessandro Martinuzzi and Leonardo Pierdominici.

I wish to extend my sincere thanks to David Gerber and Mortimer Sellers, the editors of the book series *ASCL Studies in Comparative Law*, for their support of this study. I would also like to thank Marianne Nield, Biju Singh, and the editorial staff at Cambridge University Press for their hard work.

Some sections of Chapters 1 and 3 were originally published, respectively, in “Constitution Drafting after the Arab Spring: A Comparative Overview” (2022) 29 *Indiana Journal of Global Legal Studies*, 1–57, and in “Constitutional Review after the Arab Spring: Reforms, Challenges and Perspectives” in Anja Schoeller-Schletter (ed.), *Constitutional Review in the Middle East and North Africa* (Nomos 2021), 161–187. Thanks to the editors and publishers for granting me the permission to incorporate these materials into the book.

Needless to say, any opinions expressed in this volume are solely my own. I am also solely responsible for any errors and omissions.