

Legalizing the Revolution

Anticolonial movements of the twentieth century generated audacious ideas of freedom. Following decolonization, the challenge was to give an institutional form to those ideas. Through an original account of India's constitution making, *Legalizing the Revolution* explores the promises, challenges, and contradictions of that task.

In contrast to familiar liberal constitutional templates derived from the metropole, the book theorizes the distinctively postcolonial constitution through an innovative synthesis of the history of decolonization and constitutional theory.

The first half of the book traces the contentious transition from the tumult of popular anticolonial politics to the ordered calculus of postcolonial governance. The second half explains how major institutions – parliament, judiciary, civil liberties, and property – were formed by that foundational tension.

A major contribution to postcolonial political theory, the book excavates the unrealized futures imagined during decolonization. At the same time, through a critical account of the making of the postcolonial constitutional order, it offers keys to understanding the present crisis of that order, including and especially in India.

Sandipto Dasgupta is Assistant Professor of Politics at the New School for Social Research, New York. His research is in the history of modern political and social thought, especially the political theory of empire, decolonization, and postcolonial presents.

SOUTH ASIA IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

South Asia has become a laboratory for devising new institutions and practices of modern social life. Forms of capitalist enterprise, providing welfare and social services, the public role of religion, the management of ethnic conflict, popular culture and mass democracy in the countries of the region have shown a marked divergence from known patterns in other parts of the world. South Asia is now being studied for its relevance to the general theoretical understanding of modernity itself.

South Asia in the Social Sciences features books that offer innovative research on contemporary South Asia. It focuses on the place of the region in the various global disciplines of the social sciences and highlights research that uses unconventional sources of information and novel research methods. While recognising that most current research is focused on the larger countries, the series attempts to showcase research on the smaller countries of the region.

General Editor

Partha Chatterjee

Columbia University

Editorial Board

Pranab Bardhan

University of California at Berkeley

Stuart Corbridge

Durham University

Satish Deshpande

University of Delhi

Christophe Jaffrelot

Centre d'études et de recherches internationales, Paris

Nivedita Menon

Jawaharlal Nehru University

Books in the series:

Government as Practice: Democratic Left in a Transforming India

Dwaipayan Bhattacharyya

Courting the People: Public Interest Litigation in Post-Emergency India
Anuj Bhuwania

Development after Statism: Industrial Firms and the Political Economy of South Asia
Adnan Naseemullah

Politics of the Poor: Negotiating Democracy in Contemporary India
Indrajit Roy

Nationalism, Development and Ethnic Conflict in Sri Lanka
Rajesh Venugopal

South Asian Governmentalities: Michel Foucault and the Question of Postcolonial Orderings
Stephen Legg and Deana Heath (eds.)

Adivasis and the State: Subalternity and Citizenship in India's Bhil Heartland
Alf Gunvald Nilsen

Maoist People's War and the Revolution of Everyday Life in Nepal
Ina Zharkevich

New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy: State, Class and Social Change
Matthew McCartney and S. Akbar Zaidi (eds.)

Crafty Oligarchs, Savvy Voters: Democracy under Inequality in Rural Pakistan
Shandana Khan Mohmand

Dynamics of Caste and Law: Dalits, Oppression and Constitutional Democracy in India
Dag-Erik Berg

Simultaneous Identities: Language, Education and the Nepali Nation
Uma Pradhan

Deceptive Majority: Dalits, Hinduism, and Underground Religion
Joel Lee

Colossus: The Anatomy of Delhi
Sanjoy Chakravorty and Neelanjan Sircar (eds.)

When Ideas Matter: Democracy and Corruption in India
Bilal A. Baloch

In Search of Home: Citizenship, Law and the Politics of the Poor
Kaveri Haritas

Bureaucratic Archaeology: State, Science, and Past in Postcolonial India
Ashish Avikunthak

The Odds Revisited: Political Economy of the Development of Bangladesh
K. A. S. Murshid

An Uneasy Hegemony: Politics of State-building and Struggles for Justice in Sri Lanka
Shyamika Jayasundara-Smits

Founding Mothers of the Indian Republic: Gender Politics of the Framing of the Constitution
Achyut Chetan

Freedom in Captivity: Negotiations of Belonging along Kashmir's Frontier
Radhika Gupta

Memories in the Service of the Hindu Nation: The Afterlife of the Partition of India
Pranav Kohli

Sovereign Atonement: Citizenship, Territory, and the State at the Bangladesh–India Border
Md Azmeary Ferdoush

Legalizing the Revolution

India and the Constitution of the Postcolony

Sandipto Dasgupta



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-009-52524-4 — Legalizing the Revolution
 Sandipto Dasgupta
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108490481

© Sandipto Dasgupta 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Dasgupta, Sandipto, author.

Title: Legalizing the revolution : India and the constitution of the postcolony / Sandipto Dasgupta.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press & Assessment, 2024. | Series: South Asia in the social sciences; 24 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2024011924 (print) | LCCN 2024011925 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108490481 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009525244 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108781039 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Constitutional law--India. | Constitutional history--India.

| Decolonization--India--History--20th century. | Anti-imperialist movements--India--History--20th century. |

Postcolonialism--India--History. | Democracy--India.

Classification: LCC KNS1760 .D37 2024 (print) | LCC KNS1760 (ebook) | DDC 342.54--dc23/eng/20240317

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2024011924>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2024011925>

ISBN 978-1-108-49048-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-52524-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-52524-4 — Legalizing the Revolution
Sandipto Dasgupta
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To Keya and Subhendu Dasgupta

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
Introduction: Decolonization and Constitution	1
To Legalize the Revolution	4
Decolonizing Constitutions	7
Constitutions and American Hegemony	7
Constitutions of Decolonization	9
Transformational Constitutionalism: A Political Theory of the Postcolonial Constitution	10
Autonomy and Unevenness: A Social Theory of the Postcolonial Constitution	13
Constituting Decolonization	17
Revolution without a Revolution	18
Change with Continuity	20
Popular Sovereignty without Popular Politics	22
The Postcolonial Present	25
Organization of the Book	28

Part I Revolution without a Revolution

1 The Anticolonial Movement	45
Constitutional Liberalism	49
Liberalism in Empire	50
Fulfilling Empire’s Promise	51
Constitutions and Constitutional	54
Constitutional Liberals and the People	55

x	CONTENTS
Popular Sovereignty	57
War and Unrest	57
Gandhi and Mass Mobilization	58
The Revolutionaries	62
The Congress and the Social Question	64
The (Failed) Institutionalization of the Mass Movement	67
Governance	70
2 Transformations	76
Colonial Economy	78
The Anticolonial Movement and the Social Question	80
Nation as Economic Space	84
Centralization	86
Planning and the Primacy of Growth	90
Legitimacy	95
Avoiding Conflict	96
The Politics of Change	98
Part II Authors	
3 They, the People	107
The Anticolonial People	109
Outside the Palaces of Power	111
Universal Franchise	113
Social and Political Theory of the Anticolonial Masses	114
The Social Theory of the Anticolonial Masses	114
The Political Theory of the Anticolonial Masses	116
Divergences	118
The Distant Masses	118
The Undisciplined Masses	120
The People Present	122
The People Absent	125
The People in the Assembly	128
Active Absence	130
The People Partitioned	133
The People Demobilized	138

CONTENTS

xi

4 The Constituent Administrator	141
To Govern and to Constitute	143
The Colonial Administrator	146
The Administrative State in the Colonies	149
Dominion of Legality	152
Administrative Territories	154
The Constitution of Order	157
The Professionals and the Educated	159
Wisdom and Knowledge	162
The Functionalist Style	165
The Missing Sovereign	168
Against Wisdom	170

Part III Institutions

5 Democracy and Parliamentarism	175
Universal Franchise	176
The Anticolonial Parliament	181
Mass Democracy and the Plebiscitary Alternative	184
The Tensions of Liberal Parliamentarism	184
The Plebiscitary President	186
Parliament and Social Transformation	190
The Executive and Transformation	190
Accountability and Information	192
Parliamentarism and the Democratization of Development	194
Accomplice or Author	196
Political Articulation of Social Conflict	197
6 Rights and Repression	203
Rights and the Anticolonial Movement	207
Permissible Limits	209
Curating Participation	211
Rights and Participation	213
Administrators of Participation	214
Horizontal Rights	215
Reveries of Order	218
The Persistence of Repression	220

‘Bloody Methods of Revolution’	224
The Spectres of Communism	224
Communist Defence of Civil Rights	226
Patel and the Hindu Right	228
Editing Anticolonial Multiplicity	229
7 Property and Labour	232
The Empire of Property	236
Revenue Settlements	236
Conservatism of Colonial Rule	238
Colonized Labour	241
The Landlords	242
The Colonial State and the Landlords	242
Gandhi on Landlords	244
Anticolonial Movement and the Landlords	246
Land Reforms	248
Constitution against Property	249
Free Labour	252
Property in the Constitution	256
Compensation	258
The Liberal Case for Compensation	259
Economic Dependency and the Pragmatic Case for Compensation	261
The Fiscal Case against Compensation	263
The Administration of Property	264
The Sovereignty of Property	266
8 Judiciary and Lawyers	270
Lawyers in a Colonized World	274
The Tocquevillian Conflict	276
Lawyers versus Administrators in the Constituent Assembly	280
The First Amendment	284
Purloined by Lawyers	285
Lawyers’ Decolonization	287
Privatizing Social Transformation	289
Rigidity of the Written Word	292
The End of Transformational Constitutionalism	293

CONTENTS	xiii
Conclusion: Postcolonial Afterlives of Law and Revolution	296
Foreboding and Hope	296
The Dictatorship of Property	299
Obituaries of Transformation	303
The Gentle Betrayer of the Masses	306
To Make the Postcolony Anticolonial	310
Epilogue: The Biographies of the Indian Constitution	314
The Time of the Nation State	314
The Time of Crisis	316
The Time of Globalization	317
The Time of the Ethnos	319
<i>Notes</i>	322
<i>Index</i>	480

Acknowledgements

This book was written in four cities across three continents. In that long journey, the debt it gathered cannot be fully represented within the constraints of an academic acknowledgement. Intellectual work, like most work, only makes sense as a collective endeavour. The people mentioned here were my collective.

I discovered the joys of thinking about politics in a class of Partha Chatterjee that I sat in, more by chance than design. It made a lawyer into a political theorist. He remains a dear teacher, whose influence on this book is not hard to see. Unorthodox beginnings demand a rigorous training in how to think in a new language. Jean Cohen was the person who ensured that, while never pushing me to conform. My academic life would have been very different if I had not met Karuna Mantena. From her I learnt how to speak of empires and peripheries in the language of political thought, how to be careful in arguments, and, most importantly, how to build an intellectual community. I never came away from a meeting with Sudipta Kaviraj – inevitably lasting far longer than planned – without a new idea or argument. I am only the latest in a long line of scholars indebted to his extraordinary intellectual generosity. Mahmood Mamdani and Andrew Arato read the dissertation, which was the first iteration of this book, and pushed me to think comparatively and beyond India.

In the first weeks of graduate school, I met Carlo Invernizzi Accetti, Alex Gourevitch, and Ian Zuckerman. The conversation and collective reading that started then still has not ended, though perhaps it does not go as late into the night. So valuable has Dwaipayan Banerjee been as a pillar of support that it is easy to overlook how brilliant an interlocutor and (at times unwitting) audience he was for the ideas in this book. Jeffrey Lenowitz, more than anyone else, was the reason a stranger like me could feel at home in the bewildering lands of the American university and New York City. Marina Avia, Pablo Bustinduy, and

James Fontanella Khan taught me that families are not inherited, but made. These were the people who made academia a place worth belonging to.

David Grewal, in his remarkable kindness, took the trouble to organize a workshop for the book. He, along with Rohit De, Jason Frank, Alex Gourevitch, Samuel Moyn, and Giulia Oskian, spent an entire day helping me work through my still underdeveloped ideas. Aziz Rana could not join but sent his comments separately. The final shape of the book, including the organization of the chapters, is owed to those extensive dialogues.

Over the course of the years, I have had the opportunity to share and talk about this work with scholars across continents and disciplines. The ideas of this book are products of such conversations. For their insights and inspirations, questions and criticisms, I am immensely grateful to Cemil Aydin, Rochana Bajpai, Udit Bhatia, Arudra Burra, Aparna Chandra, Adom Getachew, Manu Goswami, Jeffrey Isaacs, Turkuler Isiksel, Humeira Iqtidar, Christophe Jaffrelot, Niraja Gopal Jayal, Leigh Jenco, Stefan Jonsson, Sitharamam Kakarala, Anush Kapadia, Sunil Khilnani, Atul Kohli, Lawrence Liang, Pratap Bhanu Mehta, Uday Singh Mehta, Nivedita Menon, Suresh Naidu, Vatsal Naresh, Alf Gunwald Nielsen, Aditya Nigam, Gyan Prakash, Mahesh Rangarajan, Anupama Rao, Corey Robin, Srirupa Roy, Maria Paula Saffon Sanin, Melissa Schwartzberg, Mira Siegelberg, Joshua Simon, Anurag Sinha, Mrinalini Sinha, Neelanjan Sircar, Ajay Skaria, Ajantha Subramanian, Nazmul Sultan, Louis Tillin, Richard Tuck, Nadia Urbinati, Adaner Usmani, and Jon Wilson. The (many) hours spent with Srinath Raghavan taught me more about Indian politics and history than any book. I should specifically mention, again, Rohit De and Karuna Mantena, for being constant interlocutors and audience for the arguments of this book as they evolved over the years. I also benefitted from the knowledge and generosity of librarians, archivists, and staff at the National Library in Calcutta, Columbia University Libraries in New York, the British Library in London, and the Bibliothèque Nationale de France in Paris.

My colleagues at the New School for Social Research, New York, provided me with a professional home uncommon in its warmth and camaraderie. I could not have asked for better people than Quentin Bruneau, Victoria Hattam, Carlos Forment, Nancy Fraser, Mark Frazier, Anne McNevin, Jim Miller, Jessica Pisano, David Plotke, Deva Woodly, and Rafi Youatt to work with. Alex Aleinikoff, Benoit Challand, Carlos Forment, Emma Park, and Sanjay Reddy have demonstrated that disciplinary boundaries are there to be crossed. Andreas Kalyvas has not only been the most generous friend who helped me settle into this home, but also a brilliant comrade whose work has shaped my own thinking.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

xvii

I have always been incredibly fortunate with friends. For their time, their solidarity, and their love, I am grateful to Amana Fontanella Khan, Mohsen Ghanefar, Jennifer Hudson, Sumayya Kassamali, Robin Lenowitz, Durba Mitra, Soumitro Mukerji, Debashree Mukherjee, Dina Omar, Poulami Roychowdhury, Aditi Saraf, Anisha Sharma, Bhaskar Sunkara, Nishita Trisal, Anand Vaidya, and Sri Devi Venkatasamy. Over two decades now, Vinay Sitapati has never failed to be there for me when needed.

My family, Kumkum Bannerjee, Koeli Deb, Ranjana, Ranesh, and Koninika Ray, provided the oft-invisible infrastructures of care that make any work possible.

My editors Qudsiya Ahmed, Anwesha Rana, and Priyanka Das, along with their brilliant colleagues at Cambridge University Press, patiently supported me in writing the book that I wanted and made sure that there are far fewer errors than there otherwise would be. Polina Godz gave my very abstract ideas about the book a concrete visual life in the cover.

And then Raphaëlle, for the poetry.

My parents gave me the world and taught me, by example, the value of ethically and politically engaging with it. This book is dedicated to them.