Guilt by Location

Population displacement is a devastating feature of armed conflict with far-reaching political and humanitarian consequences. This book demonstrates the extent to which displacement is a deliberate strategy of war, not just a consequence of it. Adam Lichtenheld draws on field research in Uganda and Syria; case studies from Burundi, Indonesia, and Vietnam; and an original dataset of strategic displacement in 166 civil wars to show that armed groups often uproot civilians to sort the targeted population, not to get rid of it. When combatants lack information about opponents' identities and civilians' loyalties, they can use human mobility to infer wartime affiliations through "guilt by location." Different displacement strategies occur in different types of civil wars, with some relying on spatial profiling rather than ethnic profiling. As displacement reaches record highs, Lichtenheld's findings have important implications for the study of forced migration and policy responses to it.

Adam Lichtenheld is Executive Director of the Immigration Policy Lab at Stanford University. He has previously worked as a senior researcher at Mercy Corps and a consultant for the United Nations Refugee Agency, the World Bank, and the United States Agency for International Development. He has designed and evaluated policies and programs on migration and displacement, violence prevention, and conflict resolution with governments, donor agencies, and nongovernmental organizations around the world. His articles have appeared in a number of academic and policy journals, as well as the *Washington Post*, and *Foreign Policy*, and the Conversation.

# Guilt by Location

Forced Displacement and Population Sorting in Civil Wars

Adam Lichtenheld Stanford University







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009523479

DOI: 10.1017/9781009523462

© Adam Lichtenheld 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009523462

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Lichtenheld, Adam, author.

Title: Guilt by location : forced displacement and population sorting in civil wars / Adam Lichtenheld, Stanford University.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY :

Cambridge University Press, 2025.  $\mid$  Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2024021479 | ISBN 9781009523479 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009523424 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009523462 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Refugees. | Civil wars.

Classification: LCC HV640 .L47 2025 | DDC 362.87–dc23/eng/20240918 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2024021479

ISBN 978-1-009-52347-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-52342-4 Paperback

Additional resources for this publication at www.cambridge.org/Lichtenheld

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For Andrea, حبيبتي

> We are witnessing a paradigm change, an unchecked slide into an era in which the scale of global forced displacement as well as the response required is now clearly dwarfing anything seen before.

#### António Guterres, UN Secretary General

I could never understand those that left, how they could just leave like that, leave everything behind, all that life, all that living ... how were we supposed to go when we had so many commitments, so many responsibilities?

### Paul Lynch, Prophet Song<sup>1</sup>

The doctors of this neighborhood might also be informers who would consider Abdel Latif a terrorist if they knew where he'd been these last few years – stubbornly clinging on inside that besieged village ...

Suspicions alone were enough to lead to corpses lining the streets. Suspicions alone were enough to cause someone to disappear without a trace.

Khaled Khalifa, Death Is Hard Work<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Excerpt from Prophet Song copyright © by Paul Lynch. Used by permission of Grove/ Atlantic, Inc. Any third-party use of this material, outside of this publication, is prohibited.

<sup>2</sup> Excerpts from *Death Is Hard Work* by Khaled Khalifa; Translated from the Arabic by Leri Price. Copyright © 2016 by Hachette-Antoine. Translation copyright © 2019 by Leri Price. Reprinted by permission of Farrar, Straus and Giroux. All Rights Reserved.

### Contents

List of Figures		<i>page</i> ix	
List of Tables			
Acknowledgments		xi	
List of Abbreviations			
1	<ul> <li>Weaponizing Displacement in Civil Wars</li> <li>1.1 The Argument</li> <li>1.2 Clarifying Terms and Scope</li> <li>1.3 What We Know about Displacement</li> <li>1.4 The Evidence</li> </ul>	1 4 6 11 17	
2	<ul> <li>Conceptualizing and Describing Strategic Displacement</li> <li>2.1 Displacement in Civil War</li> <li>2.2 Types of Strategic Displacement</li> <li>2.3 A New Dataset on Population Displacement Strategies</li> <li>2.4 Cross-National Trends in Strategic Displacement</li> <li>2.5 Conclusion</li> </ul>	26 28 31 36 44 50	
3	<ul> <li>A Sorting Theory of Strategic Displacement</li> <li>3.1 The Assortative Logic of Displacement</li> <li>3.2 Observable Implications</li> <li>3.3 Conclusion</li> </ul>	51 53 71 85	
4	<ul> <li>Cross-National Evidence, 1945–2017</li> <li>4.1 Description of Quantitative Data</li> <li>4.2 Statistical Results</li> <li>4.3 Conclusion</li> </ul>	88 89 96 116	
5	Forced Relocation in Uganda 5.1 Rebellions in Uganda, 1986–2006 5.2 Methods and Data Sources 5.3 Evidence for the Sorting Logic 5.4 Alternative Explanations 5.5 Conclusion	119 120 125 128 158 163	
6	Comparative Evidence of the Sorting Logic: Burundi, Vietnam, and Indonesia 6.1 From Cleansing to Regroupment in Burundi	165 166 vii	

vii	i Contents	
	6.2 Strategic Hamlets in Vietnam	177
	6.3 Relocating the Acehnese in Indonesia	191
	6.4 Conclusion	202
7	Depopulation in Syria	204
	7.1 The Syrian Civil War	206
	7.2 Methods and Data Sources	209
	7.3 Displacement by Pro-government Forces	212
	7.4 Explaining Depopulation in Syria	223
	7.5 Conclusion	237
8	The Politics of Wartime Displacement	238
	8.1 Theoretical Implications	242
	8.2 Policy Implications	250
A1	opendix A: SDCC Dataset	261
11	A.1 Previous Data Collection Efforts	261
	A.2 List of Cases	263
		269
Appendix B: A Multivariate Analysis of Strategic Displacement		
References		276
Index		312

# Figures

2.1	Wartime displacement framework	page 29
2.2	Magnitude of state-induced strategic displacement	45
2.3	Population displacement strategies and identity conflicts	47
2.4	Population displacement strategies and conflict aim	48
2.5	Prevalence of strategic displacement, by decade	49
4.1	Predicted probability of state cleansing and forced relocatio	n 99
4.2	State capacity in irregular wars	102
4.3	Predicted probability of forced relocation in irregular wars	103
4.4	Strategic displacement and whether states	
	mobilized CDFs	106
4.5	War duration, battle deaths, and state strategic	
	displacement	110
	State strategic displacement and mass killing, by decade	112
	Forced displacement in Uganda, 1987–2007	124
5.2	Sketched logic of forced relocation policy	137
	IDP camp identification letter	140
5.4	LRA violence in Uganda, 1990–2008	145
5.5	UPDF personnel and rebel groups, 1987–2008	152
7.1	Forced displacement in Syria, 2010–2022	208
7.2	Scorched earth massacres in Syria, 2011–2013	214
7.3	Monthly deaths from violence by pro-regime forces,	
	2012–2018	217
7.4	Deaths due to violence by pro-regime forces, 2011–2018	218
8.1	Experimental results on acceptance of returnees	
	in Sinjar, Iraq	245
B.1	Predicted probability of state strategic displacement	275

# Tables

A typology of strategic wartime displacement	page 35
Frequency of population displacement strategies,	
by perpetrator	46
Arguments, hypotheses, and variables	91
Technology of rebellion, border conflict, and state	
displacement	97
Elections, rebel claim, and state displacement	100
Parallel conflict, border conflict, and state displacement	
in irregular wars	101
Civilian aid and state displacement	107
Inclusive government, rebel strength, and state displacemen	t 109
Mass killing and state displacement	111
Sorting logic: hypotheses and micro-level implications	128
Insurgencies in Uganda, 1986–2006	131
Survey responses of members of war-affected communities	149
Regime airstrikes accompanied by ground forces,	
2012–2016	219
Civilian killings in Syria, January 2016–December 2018	222
State strategic displacement: multinomial logit results	270
State forced relocation: logit results (irregular wars only)	274
	Frequency of population displacement strategies, by perpetrator Arguments, hypotheses, and variables Technology of rebellion, border conflict, and state displacement Elections, rebel claim, and state displacement Parallel conflict, border conflict, and state displacement in irregular wars Civilian aid and state displacement Inclusive government, rebel strength, and state displacement Mass killing and state displacement Sorting logic: hypotheses and micro-level implications Insurgencies in Uganda, 1986–2006 Survey responses of members of war-affected communities Regime airstrikes accompanied by ground forces, 2012–2016 Civilian killings in Syria, January 2016–December 2018 State strategic displacement: multinomial logit results

### Acknowledgments

This book is a work of scholarship: clinical, analytical, data-driven. But ultimately it is a deeply human story. During the decade I spent working on this project, I met extraordinary people who had endured unimaginable hardship. They welcomed me to their neighborhoods and villages, They opened up their homes and allowed me to trespass on their lives. The difficulty of being a social scientist studying conflict and displacement is knowing that your work will never adequately convey the anguish, courage, and resilience of those who participate in your research. The search for explanations can seem futile (as my grandfather liked to quote from a Gertrude Stein poem: "There ain't no answer") or ethically dubious (by explaining mass violence, one can be accused of rationalizing it). Still, I hope the following pages do some justice to the experiences of the dozens of refugees, displaced people, ex-combatants, and other war survivors whom I interviewed during my time in the field. While I fear they do not, I am deeply grateful for the willingness of these individuals to share their stories. So I must first and foremost express my gratitude to them.

This project also benefitted from the assistance and encouragement of numerous friends, colleagues, mentors, and students. First, I am indebted to the faculty and graduate students in the Department of Political Science at the University of California, Berkeley, for giving me the tools and courage to pursue this project. I was fortunate to be trained in a department that pushed its students to ask big, bold, interesting research questions, even at a time when there are growing pressures to do the opposite. Ron Hassner taught me much about the substance and the style of being a scholar and showed me that the best in our profession excel as much in their teaching and advising as in their research. Aila Matanock and Leo Arriola read various drafts of my work and provided healthy doses of constructive criticism, thoughtful suggestions, and much needed reassurance. My fellow graduate students were also instrumental in strengthening my arguments and ideas - and helping me maintain my sanity - particularly Rachel Bernhard, Gabrielle Elul, Jake Grumbach, Jason Klocek, Deirdre Martin, and Paul Thissen.

xi

### xii Acknowledgments

Beyond Berkeley, Abbey Steele at the University of Amsterdam took me under her wing and provided sagacious guidance and regular encouragement, and I am grateful for her friendship. Aili Mari Tripp was an early steward of my intellectual interests when I was an undergraduate at the University of Wisconsin–Madison. She nurtured my interest in the issue of forced displacement and enabled me to take my first fateful trip to Uganda in 2006, where, under the guise of doing "fieldwork," I started to learn what I needed to learn to eventually make it a central case study of this book. I am thankful to many others who offered comments and feedback on my work throughout the years, including Ariel Ahram, Alexander Betts, Alex Braithwaite, Allison Carnegie, Tiffany Chu, Ruth Collier, Kim Howe, Rana Khoury, Marc Lynch, Lama Mourad, Michaela Mattes, Saira Mohammed, Dipali Mukhopadhyay, Justin Schon, Rifaie Tammas, Monica Toft, and Kai Thaler. I beg forgiveness from those whose names I have omitted.

I started turning my doctoral dissertation into this book while I was a postdoctoral associate at the MacMillan Center for International and Area Studies at Yale University. David Simon, Stathis Kalyvas, Kate Baldwin, Liz Nugent, Nick Lotito, Sophia Dawkins, and Hilary Matfess were generous, incisive, and uplifting in providing feedback and guidance as I worked, often clumsily, through the process. I am grateful to the MacMillan Center for funding my book conference at Yale and to Hira Jafri for organizing it, which Alex Downs, Kelly Greenhill, Jessica Stanton, and Scott Straus attended. Their careful and critical reading of the initial manuscript, brutally honest yet constructive suggestions for reframing and revisions, and ideas for how to make the project better all serve as a stark reminder that you do not really write a book - others pull it out of you. I owe a particular debt to Scott, who served as my undergraduate thesis advisor and persuaded me to pursue graduate study at Berkeley - and was still willing to review and help me improve my work all those years later.

I finished this book at Stanford University, where Jens Hainmueller, David Laitin, Jeremy Weinstein, and other colleagues at the Immigration Policy Lab (IPL) provided the motivation, space, and intellectual support to bring it across the finish line. I am proud to work with a deeply passionate, fiercely intelligent, and wildly fun team at IPL that spends each day trying to generate the evidence and innovations needed to help governments and practitioners make better migration policies. At Cambridge University Press, John Haslam and Carrie Parkinson were outstanding to work with, and I am grateful to two anonymous reviewers for their thoughtful and astute feedback. Dan Harding's commitment to editing excellence ensured the clarity and coherence of the final product.

### Acknowledgments

This project was also supported by excellent research assistants across multiple universities. Thank you to Gohar Abrahamyan, Harshil Bansal, Morgan Ivanoff, Kevin Klyman, Vincent Tran, and Angelica Zocchi at Berkeley; and Linda Fawaz and Courtland Vogeding at Georgetown for their diligence, organization, and courteousness while working on a difficult project. My field research in Uganda was facilitated by Stephen Oola from the Refugee Law Project at Makerere University, James Latigo from the nongovernmental organization Trocaire, and Phil Wilmot. I had the opportunity to work with brilliant, energetic research assistants who helped with data collection and translation during my fieldwork and made indispensable contributions to the book's empirical foundations. They included Francis Abonga, Hellen Akongo, Monica Aol, Josephine Auma, Martin Atyera, Wilson Bwambale, Daniel Ebong, Barbara Kagwiria, Ark Kyaligamba, Kikora Masereka, Philip Odiambo, Kenneth Odong, Denis Okello, Isaac Okwera, Gerald Otim, and Kabayo Zakayo. Karam Shoumali provided similarly valuable research assistance in Turkey. Webale and Shukrun.

My friend Karam Alhamad – one of the most courageous, creative, and caring individuals I have had the pleasure of knowing – taught me most of what I know about Syria (and much more) during hours of conversation over shisha and drinks in Istanbul and Berlin. In addition to being a brilliant analyst and practitioner, Karam is a talented artist, as is evident in the cover art he created for this book.

I received generous financial support from various institutions for this project, including the National Science Foundation Doctoral Dissertation Improvement Grant (No. 1746447); the United States Institute of Peace; the Harry Frank Guggenheim Foundation; the Phi Beta Kappa Northern California Association; the University of California Institute on Global Conflict and Cooperation; and the Center for African Studies, Center for Middle Eastern Studies, Institute of International Studies, and the Human Rights Center at the University of California, Berkeley. I also give thanks to the underappreciated staff at University of California, Berkeley's Institutional Review Board, who helped me ensure that I conducted field research on such a sensitive topic in the most ethical, transparent, and protective manner possible.

Earlier versions of some of the material in this book were previously published in "Explaining population displacement strategies in civil war: A cross-national analysis," *International Organization* 74(2), 2020: 253–294; "The consequences of internal displacement on civil war violence: Evidence from Syria," *Political Geography* 86, 2021: 102346 (with Justin Schon); and "Guilt by location," *Foreign Policy*, 10 July 2020, https://foreignpolicy.com/2020/07/10/idps-forced-displacement-sorting-populations-guilt-by-location/. I am also grateful to Ryan Sheely and

### xiv Acknowledgments

other former colleagues at Mercy Corps for allowing me to reproduce some of the findings from *Toward Durable Solutions to Displacement: Understanding Social Acceptance of Returnees in Post-ISIS Iraq*, Washington, DC: Mercy Corps, 2021 (with Saad Saadi).

I never would have finished this project without the support of my family, who provided emotional sustenance and kept me rooted as I wandered the globe, writing different parts of this book in Turkey, Uganda, Germany, Washington, DC, and California. My grandmother, Scotti, encouraged my interest in politics, while my grandfather, Jack, reminded me not to take myself too seriously. Both of them passed away during the process of writing this book, and I am thankful for the imprint they left on my life. I owe a debt of gratitude to my parents, John and Connie, for instilling in me a deep curiosity and a love of learning, and for exposing me to the big, beautiful world beyond my small hometown. They gave me everything, and any success I have had is also theirs. My older sister, Johanna, is the real intellectual of the family, having become an Anglophile and avid PBS viewer at the ripe age of ten (which explains why she was such a bad babysitter). She and my brother-in-law, Tony, encouraged and comforted me as I contended with the perils of academia and the years of low-wage labor. For this I am grateful.

To my son, Jack, who has brought me a joy that is inexpressible, while also giving me a new perspective on the human experiences underlying this book. His privilege, and my own, stands in stark contrast to what many of those featured in this book have endured. But I now truly understand how far a parent will go - how far many of those whom I interviewed for this project were willing to go - to give their child a better life.

I reserve my final and biggest thanks to my wife, Andrea. Her patience, grit, and understanding know no bounds, and her love inspires and grounds me. She has read countless drafts; listened to endless complaints; engaged in long, lofty conversations late into the night; pushed back against my gnawing self-doubt; tolerated my prolonged absences; helped me address my struggles with mental health; and served as counselor, confidant, chef, cheerleader, copyeditor, co-conspirator, and travel companion. I asked far too much of her, and yet she was always there to give me refuge and a home.

# Abbreviations

ACLED	Armed Conflict Location and Event Data Project
ADF	Allied Democratic Forces (Uganda)
CDF	civil defense force
CNDD	National Council for the Defense of Democracy
CINDD	(Burundi)
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
FMLN	Farabundo Martí National Liberation Front
	(El Salvador)
FNL	National Liberation Forces (Burundi)
FSA	Free Syrian Army
GAM	Gerakan Aceh Merdek (Indonesia)
GDP	gross domestic product
HSM	Holy Spirit Movement (Uganda)
ICC	International Criminal Court
IDMC	Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre
IDP	internally displaced person
IGO	intergovernmental organizations
ISIS	Islamic State of Iraq and Syria
JAN	Jabhat al-Nusra (Syria)
LC	Local Council (Uganda)
LDU	Local Defense Unit (Uganda)
LRA	Lord's Resistance Army (Uganda)
LTTE	Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam (Sri Lanka)
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NLF	National Liberation Front (Vietnam)
NRM	National Resistance Movement (Uganda)
OLF	Oromo Liberation Front (Ethiopia)
PITF	Political Instability Task Force
PKK	Kurdistan Workers' Party (Turkey)
RPF	Rwandan Patriotic Front
RUF	Revolutionary United Front (Sierra Leone)
SAA	Syrian Arab Army

xv

xvi List of Abbreviations

Strategic Displacement in Civil Conflict Dataset symmetric nonconventional Sudanese People's Liberation Army Syrian Democratic Forces Tentara Nasional Indonesia (Indonesia)
Uppsala Conflict Data Program
United Nations
United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
(UN Refugee Agency)
National Union for the Total Independence of Angola
UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian
Affairs
Uganda National Rescue Front
Uganda People's Army
Uganda People's Democratic Army
Ugandan People's Defense Forces
United States Agency for International Development
Vietcong (Vietnam)
Violations Documentation Centre (Syria)
People's Protection Units (Syria)
West Nile Bank Front (Uganda)