

PLATONIC AUTONOMY

This volume highlights Plato's relevance for the notion of personal autonomy. By offering discussions of self-legislation, self-determination, self-rule, law, preference, and freedom from a wide range of perspectives, it shows how deeply they are intertwined with Plato's more familiar inquiries into knowledge, moral psychology, ethics, politics, and metaphysics. The book also reveals how some of the Platonic worries about self- and other-determination become interpreted and are given explicit expression by the Neoplatonists. Many chapters question an exclusively individualistic account of autonomy. The autonomous subject, for Plato, is not primarily the possessor of individual preferences, nor someone with a personally unique take on the world, but, rather, a unified agent who in both collaborative and personal activities originates her own motions and reasons and commits in a profound sense to her own actions. It is this understanding of personal autonomy that is labeled Platonic.

OLOF PETTERSSON is Associate Professor (Docent) in Philosophy at Uppsala University. He has published extensively on Plato and ancient philosophy and also edited several books in this field, including *Plato's Protagoras: Essays on the Confrontation of Philosophy and Sophistry* (2017) and *Defending a Philosophical Life: Readings of Plato's Apology* (2018).

PAULIINA REMES is Professor in Philosophy at Uppsala University. She is the author of *Plotinus on Self* (2007) and *Neoplatonism* (2008), and the coeditor, together with Svetla Slaveva-Griffin, of the award-winning *Routledge Handbook of Neoplatonism* (2014). She also works on Plato, particularly his methodology.

PLATONIC AUTONOMY

Self-Determination, Unity, and Cooperation

EDITED BY

OLOF PETTERSSON

Uppsala University

PAULIINA REMES

Uppsala University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-009-52048-5 — Platonic Autonomy
 Edited by Olof Pettersson, Pauliina Remes
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009520485

DOI: 10.1017/9781009520461

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009520461

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Pettersson, Olof, editor. | Remes, Pauliina, editor.

TITLE: Platonic autonomy : self-determination, unity, and cooperation / edited by Olof
 Pettersson, Uppsala Universitet, Sweden, Pauliina Remes, Uppsala Universitet, Sweden.

DESCRIPTION: I. | Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University
 Press, 2025. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2025004735 | ISBN 9781009520485 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009520447
 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009520461 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Plato. | Autonomy (Philosophy)

CLASSIFICATION: LCC B395 .P3755 2025 | DDC 184–dc23/eng/20250303

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2025004735>

ISBN 978-1-009-52048-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
 accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xii
 Introduction	 I
<i>Pauliina Remes and Olof Pettersson</i>	
 PART I SELF-DETERMINATION: FROM LEGISLATION TO GIVING RATIONAL ACCOUNTS	
 1 Accounts and Accountability: The Importance of Being <i>Autologizomenos</i>	 19
<i>Amber D. Carpenter</i>	
 PART II MOTIVATIONAL CHALLENGES TO SELF-RULE	
 2 Plato’s Problems with Aversion	 45
<i>Nicholas D. Smith</i>	
 3 A Complex Model of Action: What Is Ruling?	 58
<i>Oda E. W. Tvedt</i>	
 PART III INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL AUTHORITIES	
 4 Dialectic and Rational Agency: Establishing Self-Rule in the <i>Republic</i> and <i>Hippias Major</i>	 83
<i>Franco V. Trivigno</i>	
 5 Socrates and Conflicting Epistemic Requirements: Autonomy and Authority	 106
<i>Toomas Lott</i>	

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
6	Awakening Autonomy: Olympiodorus' Commentary on Plato's <i>Gorgias</i> <i>James M. Ambury</i>	128
PART IV THE LIMITS OF AUTONOMY AND SELF-RULE		
7	Vulnerability, Dialogue, and the Limits of Autonomy <i>Marina Berzins McCoy</i>	149
8	Plato, Dialogue, and Epistemic Autonomy <i>Olof Pettersson</i>	169
PART V RECONCILING BETWEEN FREEDOM, EXTERNAL AUTHORITY, AND NATURE		
9	Self-Government and Law in the <i>Crito</i> and the <i>Statesman</i> <i>Charlotta Weigelt</i>	193
10	Freedom, Willing Servitude, and the Limits to Autonomy in Plato's <i>Laws</i> <i>Susan Sauvé Meyer</i>	216
11	The Natural Preconditions of Political Freedom <i>Andy German</i>	235
	<i>Bibliography</i>	256
	<i>Index</i>	267

Tables

3.1	Reason rules (preliminary)	<i>page</i> 70
3.2	Reason rules (RR)	71
3.3	Appetite rules (AR)	74
3.4	Spirit rules (SR)	74
10.1	Classification of servitude	220

Contributors

JAMES M. AMBURY is Associate Professor of Philosophy at King's College, Pennsylvania. In addition to several articles on Plato and the Platonic tradition, he is the author of *Neoplatonic Pedagogy and the Alcibiades I: Crafting the Contemplative* (Cambridge University Press 2024) and coeditor of *Knowledge and Ignorance of Self in Platonic Philosophy* (Cambridge University Press 2018).

AMBER D. CARPENTER is Visiting Professor at King's College London and Senior Research Fellow at the Einstein Forum (Potsdam). She is the coeditor of *Crossing the Stream, Leaving the Cave: Buddhist-Platonist Philosophical Inquiries*, with Pierre-Julien Harter (Oxford University Press 2024); recent publications on ancient philosophy include 'Separation Anxieties: Parmenides 133a–35c,' in *Plato's Parmenides*, edited by L. Brisson, A. Macé, and O. Renault (Brill, 2021), and 'Function and the Function of the Taxonomy of Skills' in *Plato's Statesman*, edited by P. Dimas, M. Lane, and S. S. Meyer (Oxford University Press 2021).

ANDY GERMAN is the Chair of the Philosophy Department at Ben-Gurion University of the Negev. He coedited the volume of essays titled *Knowledge and Ignorance of Self in Platonic Philosophy* (Cambridge University Press 2019) and has published on the Greeks and the Germans in various journals such as the *Review of Metaphysics*, the *British Journal of the History of Philosophy*, *Ancient Philosophy*, and the *International Philosophical Quarterly*.

TOOMAS LOTT is Research Fellow at the University of Tartu and at Uppsala University. His work explores the connections between Platonic and contemporary epistemology, and his publications center especially on the topics of rationality of belief and of disagreement.

List of Contributors

ix

MARINA BERZINS MCCOY is Professor of Philosophy at Boston College. She is the author of *Image and Argument in Plato's Republic* (SUNY 2020), *Wounded Heroes: Vulnerability as a Virtue in Greek Tragedy and Philosophy* (Oxford University Press 2013), and *Plato on the Rhetoric of Philosophers and Sophists* (Cambridge University Press 2008).

SUSAN SAUVÉ MEYER is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pennsylvania. She is the author of *Ancient Ethics* (Routledge 2008), *Aristotle on Moral Responsibility* (Oxford University Press 2011), and numerous articles on Plato, Aristotle, and the Stoics. Her most recent book, *How to Flourish* (Princeton University Press 2022), is an abridged translation of Aristotle's *Nicomachean Ethics* aimed at a general audience and her open-access online courses, 'Plato and his Predecessors' and 'Aristotle and his Successors' (COURSERA), have enrolled over 100,000 students across the globe.

OLOF PETTERSSON is Associate Professor (Docent) in Theoretical Philosophy at Uppsala University and Chair of the Södertörn Center for Ancient Philosophy. His recent publications include 'Power and Person in Plato's *Alcibiades I*' (*Ancient Philosophy* 2021) and 'Herdsman and Stargazers: The Science of Philosophy in Plato's *Statesman*' (*Polis* 2020). He is also the coeditor of *Defending a Philosophical Life: Readings of Plato's Apology* (Rowman and Littlefield 2018) and of *Plato's Protagoras: Essays on the Confrontation of Philosophy and Sophistry* (Springer 2017).

PAULIINA REMES is Professor in Theoretical Philosophy at Uppsala University. She is the author of *Plotinus on Self: The Philosophy of the "We"* (Cambridge University Press 2007) and *Neoplatonism* (Acumen, 2008) as well as the coeditor of the Routledge series *Rewriting History of Philosophy* and the *Routledge Handbook of Neoplatonism* (2014). She currently works, besides various articles on Plotinus, on the norms of inquiry and conversation in Plato's dialogues.

NICHOLAS D. SMITH is James F. Miller Professor of Humanities in Philosophy and Classics (Emeritus) at Lewis & Clark College. He won the 'Outstanding Academic Book for 1994' award for his book *Plato's Socrates* (with T. C. Brickhouse, Oxford University Press 1996). His recent books include *Socrates on Self-Improvement: Knowledge, Virtue, and Happiness* (Cambridge University Press 2021), *Summoning Knowledge in Plato's Republic* (Oxford University Press 2019), and *What the Ancients Offer to Contemporary Epistemology*, edited together with Stephen Hetherington (Routledge 2019).

FRANCO V. TRIVIGNO is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Oslo. He is the author of *Plato on Tragedy and Comedy: The Role of Drama in the Pursuit of Happiness* (Cambridge University Press, in press) and *Plato's Ion: Poetry, Expertise and Inspiration* (Cambridge University Press 2020), and coeditor of *Laughter, Humor and Comedy in Ancient Philosophy* (Oxford University Press 2019) and *The Philosophy and Psychology of Character and Happiness* (Routledge 2014). His current research is focused on happiness and well-being in ancient Stoicism and contemporary eudaimonism.

ODA E. W. TVEDT is Assistant Professor in the Department of Philosophy and Religious Studies at the Norwegian University of Science and Technology. She is the coeditor of *Defending a Philosophical Life: Readings of Plato's Apology*, together with Vivil Valvik Haraldsen and Olof Pettersson (Rowman and Littlefield 2018). She has published a number of articles on Plato and ancient philosophy and defended her PhD on Plato's critique of democracy at Uppsala University in 2021.

CHARLOTTA WEIGELT is Professor in Philosophy at Södertörn University. She is the author of *Socrates and the Possibility of Political Craft* (Axl Books 2015), *Socrates: The Philosopher's Many Faces* (Faethon 2023), and numerous articles on Plato and ancient philosophy. Weigelt has translated both Aristotle's *Physics* and *Nicomachean Ethics* to Swedish and is working on the *Metaphysics*.

Acknowledgements

This book is a result of a project, Platonic Autonomy, funded between 2016 and 2019 by Riksbankens Jubileumsfond, Sweden, and conducted at the Philosophy Department, Uppsala University. The editors wish, first, to express their gratitude for the generous support of both parties. Second, during that time, we had the fortune of hosting, in 2019, a highly interesting final conference of the project, with excellent contributions and friendly, cooperative discussions. That conference turned, albeit with a fair bit of thinking and toil both from the editors and the contributors, into this volume. We wish to express our gratitude to all the participants (including especially Mary Margaret McCabe), as well as, at a later phase, to Cambridge University Press commentators and editors.

On the cover of this book, we have chosen Otto Greiner's (1869–1916) painting *Odysseus and the Sirens*. Odysseus, tied to the mast of his ship, is depicted as a man fighting against the alluring songs of the Sirens. His decision to bind himself to the mast demonstrates his awareness of the limitations of self-control, and his conscious choice to regulate his own actions, to take rational control of his fate, and to resist the temptations that could lead to his downfall. The painting serves as a powerful metaphor for the importance and challenges of self-government, personal autonomy, as well as the ability to navigate life's challenges without succumbing to external pressures.

Abbreviations

LSJ	Liddell, H. G., Scott, R. <i>A Greek–English Lexicon</i> , revised and augmented by H. S. Jones, with supplement (Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1968)
OCT	Oxford Classical Texts Series

Plato’s Dialogues

<i>Alc. I</i>	<i>Alcibiades I (or Major)</i>
<i>Ap.</i>	<i>Apology of Socrates</i>
<i>Charm.</i>	<i>Charmides</i>
<i>Cl.</i>	<i>Clitophon</i>
<i>Crat.</i>	<i>Cratylus</i>
<i>Cri.</i>	<i>Crito</i>
<i>Crit.</i>	<i>Critias</i>
<i>Euthyd.</i>	<i>Euthydemus</i>
<i>Euthyph.</i>	<i>Euthyphro</i>
<i>Grg.</i>	<i>Gorgias</i>
<i>Hi. Ma.</i>	<i>Hippias Major</i>
<i>Hi. Mi.</i>	<i>Hippias Minor</i>
<i>La.</i>	<i>Laches</i>
<i>Leg.</i>	<i>Laws (or Leges)</i>
<i>Lys.</i>	<i>Lysis</i>
<i>Men.</i>	<i>Meno</i>
<i>Phd.</i>	<i>Phaedo</i>
<i>Phdr.</i>	<i>Phaedrus</i>
<i>Phlb.</i>	<i>Philebus</i>
<i>Plt.</i>	<i>Statesman (or Politicus)</i>
<i>Prt.</i>	<i>Protagoras</i>

List of Abbreviations

xiii

<i>Rep.</i>	<i>Republic</i>
<i>Soph.</i>	<i>Sophist</i>
<i>Symp.</i>	<i>Symposium</i>
<i>Tht.</i>	<i>Theaetetus</i>

Other References to Ancient Works

We follow the LSJ abbreviation and reference system unless otherwise indicated.

Anon. Proleg. *Anonymous Prolegomena to Platonic Philosophy*